Technische Universität Dresden
Fakultät für Sprach-, Literatur- und Kulturwissenschaften
Institut für Anglistik und Amerikanistik

Wissenschaftliche Arbeit zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades Dr. phil.

Chance or Crisis?

Migrants and the Irish Print Media 1997 - 2010

vorgelegt von

Andreas Damm

geb. 07.10.1978 in Dresden

Tag der Verteidigung	05. Juni 2015
Gutachter	Prof. Dr. Thomas Kühn
	Prof. Dr. Brigitte Georgi-Findlay
	PD Dr. Monika Albrecht

Content

0 Foreword 1

1 Introduction 2

1.1 Literature survey 5

1.2 What does this study do? 8

1.3 Structure 11

2 Methodology 13

2.1 Content analysis 13

2.2 Discourse analysis 16

2.2.1 Critical Discourse Analysis 16

2.2.2 Foucault and the question of power 18

3 Research design 26

3.1 Research questions and hypotheses 26

3.2 Operationalisation 28

3.2.1 Categorial system 28

3.2.2 Definition of indicators 28

3.2.3 Keywords 29

3.2.4 Definition of migrant, asylum seeker and refugee 30

3.3 Analysis at macro and micro level 31

3.3.1 Analysis at contextual level 32

3.3.2 Analysis at textual level 33

3.3.3 Analysis at sentence and word level 35

4 Newspapers as one form of the mass media 38

4.1 Effects of reporting in the media 40

4.2 Newspapers matter! 45

4.3 Irish newspapers: Historical context 48

4.4 Irish print media 50

5 Corpus compilation 55

5.1 Newspapers 55

5.2 Immigrant groups 59

5.2.1 Polish Immigrants 61

5.2.2 Nigerian Immigrants 66

5.2.3 Chinese Immigrants 71

5.3 Selected periods 76

5.4 Sample selection 78

6 Immigration and immigration policy: Past and present ... 80
6.1 Conquests and migration to Ireland ... 81
6.2 Huguenots, Palatines and Jews ... 86
6.3 Immigration to Ireland 1922-1945 ... 90
6.4 Immigration to Ireland 1945-1995 ... 91
6.5 Immigration to Ireland 1995-present ... 95
6.6 Immigration and racism in Ireland ... 103
7 Media content ... 106
7.1.1 Frequency of coverage in the individual newspapers ... 106
7.1.2 Frequency of coverage of individual immigrant groups ... 108
7.1.3 Periods of peak coverage ... 108
7.1.4 Salient roles and topics ... 110
8 Shared role allocations ... 113
8.1 Framing immigrants in criminal roles ... 113
8.1.1 Introduction ... 113
8.1.2 Over-representation of immigrants in crime statistics, prisons and the media ... 113
8.1.3 Nigerians, Poles and Chinese in criminal roles ... 118
8.2 Immigrants in resident roles ... 129
8.2.1 Introduction ... 129
8.2.2 Immigrants as fellow residents? ... 130
8.2.3 Non-national residents as a control category ... 135
8.3 Racism in the media ... 146
8.3.1 Racism in Ireland today ... 146
8.3.2 Theoretical conceptualisation of racism (in Ireland) ... 148
8.3.3 Racism and discrimination in Ireland and in the media ... 151
8.3.4 Media portrayals of racism in society ... 155
8.3.5 Case study: Racism and the coverage of the death of Toyosi Shittabey ... 158
8.4 Victimisation of minority groups ... 169
8.4.1 Introduction ... 169
8.4.2 Discussion ... 170
9 Individual role allocations ... 178
9.1 Polish crime victims: The murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos ... 178
9.1.1 Introduction ... 178
9.1.2 Early coverage ... 179
9.1.3 Subsequent development ... 192

9.2 Nigerian asylum seekers 200
9.2.1 Introduction 200
9.2.2 Frequency and connotation across years and papers 201
9.2.3 Nigerian asylum seekers: posing a threat? 203
9.2.4 "Nigerians are happy people" – Letters to the editor 214
9.3 Chinese students 220
9.3.1 Introduction 220
9.3.2 'Chinese migrants are also big business' – the framing of Chinese students as a source of income 221
9.3.3 Coverage of Falun Gong members 228
9.4 Chinese immigrants – a model minority? 231
10 Conclusion 239
10.1 Portrayal of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in the Irish media 239
10.2 Newspapers 241
10.3 Outlook 242
11 Code book and coding instructions 245
11.1 Code book 245
11.2 Coding instructions 249
11.3 Amendments 268
Appendix 275
Hypotheses 275
Tables of results 277
Bibliography 303

List of abbreviations and terms

CSO – Central Statistics Office

DJELR – Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform

DP – Direct Provision

EC – European Community

EEA – European Economic Area

EU – European Union

HEA – Higher Education Authority

ICI – Immigrant Council of Ireland

II – *The Irish Independent* newspaper

IS – *The Irish Sun* newspaper

IT – *The Irish Times* newspaper

NCCRI – National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism

Garda (pl. Gardai) – police officer(s)

An Garda Síochána – Irish Police Service

Taoiseach – Prime Minister

The media – Unless otherwise stated the media in this paper refers to *The Irish Times*, *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun* newspapers

UNHCR – United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees / the UN Refugee Agency

List of tables

Table 1 – Immigrant numbers by country of origin 60

Table 2: Test run constructed week sampling 79

Table 3 Number of immigrants in Ireland 95

Table 4: Peak coverage 109

Table 5: Most frequent primary roles 110

Table 6: Most frequent primary topics 111

Table 7: Immigrant prison population 118

Table 8: Primary role by Group 277

Table 9: Secondary role by Group 278

Table 10: Primary topic by Group 279

Table 11: Secondary topic by Group 280

Table 12: Year by Newspaper by Group 281

Table 13: Year by Group 281

Table 14: Victim (primary and secondary roles) - Primary topic by Group 282

Table 15: Victim (primary and secondary roles) and Court case - Secondary topic by Group 282

Table 16: Victims only (primary roles) - Year by Group 283

Table 17: Victims only (secondary roles) - Year by Group 283

Table 18: Victims only - Length by Group by Newspaper 283

Table 19: Victims only (primary roles) - Group by Newspaper 283

Table 20: Polish victims and Peak 2010 - Event by Newspaper 284

Table 21: Nigerian victims only and Peak 2010 - Event by Newspaper 284

Table 22: Polish perpetrators / suspects (Poles only / primary roles) - Year by Newspaper 284

Table 23: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (Nigerians only /primary roles) - Year by Newspaper 284

Table 24: Chinese perpetrators / suspects (Chinese only / primary roles) - Year by Newspaper 284

Table 25: Victim roles only - Primary topic by Newspaper 285

Table 26: Victim roles only and Court case - Secondary topic by Newspaper 286

Table 27: Polish victims only (primary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper 286

Table 28: Polish victims only (secondary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper 286

Table 29: Nigerian victims only (primary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper 287

Table 30: Nigerian victims only (secondary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper 287

Table 31: Chinese victims only (primary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper 287
Table 32: Chinese victims only (secondary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper..... 287
Table 33: Polish victims only (primary roles) - Event by Newspaper 287
Table 34: Perpetrator / Suspect (primary roles) - Year by Newspaper..... 288
Table 35: Perpetrator / Suspects (primary roles) - Year by Group..... 288
Table 36: Perpetrator / Suspect (primary roles) 2004 - Type of crime by Newspaper by Group..... 288
Table 37: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) 2004 - Event by Newspaper..... 289
Table 38: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) 2004 - Type of fraud by Newspaper 289
Table 39: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) - Secondary role by Newspaper 289
Table 40: Nigerian perpetrator / suspect (primary roles) 2004 - Month by Newspaper..... 289
Table 41: Polish perpetrators / suspects 2010 - Type of crime by Newspaper..... 289
Table 42: Polish perpetrators / suspects 2010 in Person crimes - Event by Newspaper 290
Table 43: Chinese perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) 2004 - Type of crime by Newspaper..... 290
Table 44: Resident (immigrant group only) - Focus by Newspaper 290
Table 45: Residents - Triviality by Group..... 290
Table 46: Residents - Year by Group..... 290
Table 47: Residents - Connotation by Group..... 290
Table 48: Newspaper by Racism..... 291
Table 49: Racist articles - Primary role by Newspaper..... 291
Table 50: Racist articles - Newspaper by Group..... 291
Table 51: Racist articles - Newspaper by Year 291
Table 52: Racist articles 2004 - Newspaper by Reference to event 292
Table 53: Racist articles 2004 - Newspaper by Type of article..... 292
Table 54: 2004 - Newspaper by Type of article 292
Table 55: Racism (primary, secondary, tertiary topic) - Newspaper by Year* 292
Table 56: Racism (primary, secondary, tertiary topic) - Newspaper by Category of racism 293
Table 57: Racism (primary, secondary, tertiary topic) - Newspaper by Extent of racism 293
Table 58: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Connotation by Year*..... 293
Table 59: Asylum seekers (primary roles) - Flood metaphor by Group*..... 294
Table 60: Flood metaphor by Group* 294
Table 61: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Year by Flood by Newspaper* 294

Table 62: Nigerian asylum seekers - Flood metaphor by Year by Newspaper 295

Table 63: Nigerian asylum seekers only - Flood metaphor by Year by Newspaper 295

Table 64: Nigerian - Primary roles by Newspaper 295

Table 65: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Primary topic by Newspaper 296

Table 66: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Secondary topic by Newspaper 296

Table 67: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Secondary role by Newspaper 297

Table 68: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Court case by Secondary topics 297

Table 69: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Immigration policy - Connotation by Newspaper 297

Table 70: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Connotation by Newspaper... 297

Table 71: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Connotation by Group..... 297

Table 72: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Individual case by Newspaper 298

Table 73: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Subtopic A by Individual case 298

Table 74: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Subtopic A by Newspaper 298

Table 75: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Subtopic B by Newspaper..... 298

Table 76: Chinese - Primary role by Newspaper..... 299

Table 77: Chinese - Secondary role by Newspaper..... 299

Table 78: Chinese - Primary role by Group 300

Table 79: Chinese students - Primary topic by Newspaper..... 300

Table 80: Chinese students and Third level education - Secondary topic by Newspaper 301

Table 81: Chinese students and Contribution to economy - Revenue frame by Newspaper by Group 301

Table 82: Chinese students and Revenue frame - Newspaper by Year..... 301

Table 83: Chinese experts (primary role) - Year by Newspaper..... 301

Table 84: Connotation by Year by Newspaper 302

Table 85: Connotation by Group..... 302

0 Foreword

This research project has been my companion for the better part of the last seven years. Due to the responsibilities of family life – both my children were born while I was working on this study – and obligations at work, the final steps of completion took much longer than originally anticipated. In fact, I had almost lost hope that the results would be of much relevance by the date of publication.

However, in light of Europe's attitude to and the media coverage of the people who have sought refuge in Europe after fleeing from persecution and civil wars, the findings of this study are all but irrelevant. Although the patterns of inclusionary and exclusionary practices in the coverage of migration to Ireland brought to light by this study are based on data reaching back to 2010, they have not lost in significance. Starting in the late 1990s, Ireland experienced a long decade that saw the change of a country with very few immigrants to a state whose immigrant population made up a significant part of society. Snapshot impressions of the media coverage of recent migration experiences in several European countries bear an astounding resemblance to the reaction in the Irish media before 2010. I therefore hope that both the methodological approach and the findings of the study presented here can act as a source of discussion, adacemic debate or inspiration to conduct further research on a topic that will presumably change the face of Europe.

I want to take the opportunity to thank my children and wife, whose ongoing support and patience allowed me to complete this project at last. I would also like to express my sincerest gratitude to Thomas Kühn, whose advice I highly valued and who constantly encouraged me to keep working. My thanks is also extended to Monika Albrecht, a sincere friend and valued critic, as well as to Brigitte Georgi-Findlay, from whose support I benefitted particularly in the final stages of this study.

Andreas Damm
Lahr, February 2016

1 Introduction

Migration has been known since Homo sapiens left East Africa around 50,000 years ago. Large migration movements included the Greeks, the Romans, Mongolians or the Völkerwanderung. Slavery and bonded labour migration satisfied the demand for cheap manpower in the Americas and other parts of the world. From the early 19th century, about 55 million people left Europe in search for a better future predominantly in North America and Australasia, but emigration was not limited to Europe. For example, approximately 3 million Chinese started a new life in south-east Asia between 1860 and 1915. Until the 1920s to 1930s, when receiving countries such as the United States or Canada started to restrict in-migration, migrants could enter relatively freely. After World War II, the concept of guest workers emerged. From the 1950s to the oil crisis in 1973, booming European economies recruited workers from Southern Europe, North Africa and Turkey, expecting that they would return after a certain period of time. Germany, which had received around 2.6 million *Gastarbeiter*, is probably the best known example of a no-policy approach to immigration. Migration, however, did not stop with the oil crisis. Since the 1980s international migration has increased considerably, albeit the reasons for migration have changed. Apart from economic considerations, family reunion, search for refuge on grounds of persecution or natural catastrophes as well as adventurous spirits have influenced migration decisions. Today, almost 3 per cent of the world's population or around 190 million people are migrants.[1]

Ireland, traditionally known as a classic example of an emigration country, became one of the new immigration countries alongside Denmark, Spain or Greece, to name a few. It experienced an unprecedented arrival of immigrants during the years of economic prosperity, known as The Celtic Tiger.[2] The percentage of non-Irish nationals living in Ireland increased from very low numbers in the mid-1990s to more than half a million or 12 per cent by 2011.[3] Between 1995 and 2000 Ireland received approximately 250,000 immigrants. About half of this number consisted of returning Irish and the majority of the other half came from the United States or the European Union. To a lesser extent there was immigration of highly skilled workers from non-EEA countries and about 10 per cent were asylum seekers, many from

[1] Cf. for example KEELEY (2010), pp. 20-9 and pp. 29-30; SEIFERT (2012)
[2] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008a); CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008b) NEUMAYER (2005a); LENTIN (1998); CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[3] A question of nationality was first asked in the Census 2002 questionnaires. In that year the share of non-Irish nationals in the population was 5.8 per cent. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 7

Romania and Nigeria.[4] Following the EU enlargement in 2004 and a more restrictive immigration policy, Eastern Europe became the main source of immigrants, dominated by Poles.[5] Although immigration to Ireland was comparatively small in absolute numbers, the country experienced large scale immigration in a relatively short period of time. The number of asylum seekers per annum rose from virtually none in the early 1990s to 11,634 in 2002.[6] Moreover, when measured against existing population, Ireland by far received the largest stream of long term immigrants in OECD countries in 2006.[7]

Against the background of rising numbers of immigrants, Ireland followed an increasingly restrictive and more selective immigration policy. In 2004, Irish voters passed the Referendum on Citizenship with a staggering majority of more than 79 per cent. The subsequent 27th Amendment to the Constitution of Ireland provided that children born to non-national parents would no longer enjoy a constitutional right to citizenship. The referendum result was perhaps the most pronounced expression of how a covert fear of immigration had turned into collective, overt anti-immigrant behaviour. The overwhelming support for the referendum forms a paradox in respect of Ireland's long emigration legacy[8] and the Irish government's continuing lobbying for the regularisation of undocumented Irish in the United States of America.[9] Several authors suggested, though, that the referendum was preceded by a large scale othering campaign by the Irish government, which allegedly construed a desired – undesired dichotomy.[10]

The media, as a main contributor to public discourse, play an important role in the construction of such images. During a conference on the media and interculturalism, the Task Force on the Traveller Community, arguably one of the most disadvantaged groups in Ireland, discussed the role of the media as a source of information for the majority group.

> The media is a prime source of information for people and therefore has an important role to play in addressing relationships within a culturally diverse society. The media can challenge or reinforce racist images, attitudes and behaviour. In a situation of minimal contact "settled" people obtain most of their information about Travellers from the media.[11]

[4] MAC ÉINRÍ 2001
[5] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[6] For figures until 1999 cf. United Nations High Commissioner For Refugees Geneva (2001); for 2000-2002 cf. UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES (2003); from 2003 cf. Office of the Refugee Applications Commissioner. Only new applications, not re-applications; Refugee Applications Commissioner (2013)
[7] KEELEY (2010), p. 33
[8] Cf. for example O'SULLIVAN (1992); FITZPATRICK (1985)
[9] Cf. for example Nasc - The Irish Immigrant Support Centre (c)
[10] Cf. for example LENTIN (2003) or BRANDI (2007)
[11] CONNOLLY (2002)

That this can be transferred to the context of immigrants to Ireland is shown by Curry and Keogh according to whom "Irish media have played a formative role in shaping public opinion about refugees and asylum seekers".[12] In broader terms, van Dijk explains that the media play "a vital role in public communication" and are better remembered than news on television, are perceived as superior in quality,[13] and are seen as the "primary source of 'ethnic' knowledge and opinion in society"[14]. What is more, the media have become the most important sub-system in today's media society – "What is not in the media is irrelevant"[15].

Taking these functions of the media as a point of departure, the present study investigates the role of the media in the construction of migrant images. With recourse to Foucault's notion of the discursive construction of society and the media as a key contributor in shaping public opinion, it examines whether different immigrant groups have the same chance of favourable or unfavourable portrayal in three national newspapers, including two broadsheets and one tabloid. Moreover, the longitudinal design traces representations from the early years of net-immigration to the times of recession. In its endeavour to reveal cultural practices and power relations, this study draws from a combination of content and discourse analysis. This research design permits qualitative analysis based on the frequency of immigrant related roles, topics and characterisations, thus avoiding "cherry picking"[16] – the process of focusing on articles that suit the author's argument. In other words, this study examines whether expressions such as the fear that the Irish become a minority in their own country,"[17] are once-off utterances or whether they are typical patterns in the portrayal of immigrants. However, before I present the outline of this study in further detail, attention shall be directed to immigration related literature published so far.

[12] GUERIN (2002), p. 93
[13] DIJK (2008), p. 55
[14] DIJK (2008), p.111
[15] MERTEN (2007), p. 21
[16] WODAK and MEYER (2009)
[17] Cf. KEELEY (2010), p. 14

1.1 Literature survey

In an Irish context, with few exceptions,[18] migration studies long remained in the realm of emigration and post-colonial studies.[19] Emigration studies are insofar relevant for this project as the collective experience of large scale emigration in the 19th and 20th century could lead one to conclude that the Irish may have a favourable attitude towards people who find themselves in similar situations today. On the other hand, post-colonial theory is highly relevant for this study as it explores how the colonial past has shaped contemporary Irish culture and identity. Whelan, for example, sees the Gaelic revival as a classic example of the invention of tradition and the invention of an artificial identity that excludes everything non-Irish.[20] For Said, the question of whether Ireland was a colony is crucial since

> what is at stake is nothing less than the whole question of Irish identity, the present course of Irish culture and politics, and above all, the interpretation of Ireland, its people, and the course of its history.[21]

The notion of what constitutes Ireland and its people, what is included in making them Irish is imperative in evaluating immigrants' position(s) in Irish society and thus power relations.

The arrival of a relatively high number of immigrants in a short time span sparked a great deal of interest in the academic world with 244 studies conducted at the outset of this one. According to Mac Éinrí, these studies focused on immigration, asylum seekers and refugees (103), immigration in general (43), racism, xenophobia and discrimination (36), minorities (29), integration and interculturalism (22) and labour immigration (11).[22] In the years during which this project was completed, many more publications complemented the list. Notable ones on immigrants in general include the work by Brian Fanning, Ronaldo Munck and Steven Loyal.

In two monographs Fanning investigated immigration and social change as well as racism and social change in the Republic of Ireland. In terms of Irish identity, he found that the Gaelic

[18] Some of these exceptions include Gisela Holfter's research work on German speaking refugees during the reign of the Nazi regime in Germany, cf. for example HOLFTER (2006a). Dermot Keogh's work focuses on Jews in 20th century Ireland; cf. KEOGH (1998) and Herman Rasche investigates the history of the Palatines in Ireland, cf. RASCHE (1998). The 11th Limerick Conference in Irish-German Studies on The Irish Palatines in Context held in September 2009 was testament to current research work in this area. Raymond Hylton's book investigated the impact of Huguenots in Ireland, cf. HYLTON (2005). Also cf. the chapter on immigration to Ireland past and present below.
[19] Cf. for example HOWE (2000); FLANNERY (2009) or CARROLL and KING (2003)
[20] Cf. WHELAN (2003)
[21] SAID (2003), p. 177
[22] MAC ÉINRÍ (2005)

revival was incomplete and that Ireland had been subject to a modernisation of belonging although rather economically motivated than a rejection of ethnocentrism. Therefore, he expressed doubts whether liberal Ireland would prevail in post boom Ireland. The fragile nature of liberal attitudes was also expressed in his warning of the development of parallel societies because immigrants experienced

> deliberate initial exclusion compounded, by subsequent indifference to the barriers many of them encounter. Other first-generation immigrants will have stories of hardship and discrimination to pass on to their children, though the dangers are that some of these will experience at first hand the intergenerational transmission of social exclusion.[23]

He also demonstrated the existence of racism and exclusionary practices in Ireland which were particularly directed against asylum seekers. His considerations included some references to the portrayal of asylum seekers in the media but these appeared to be snapshot impressions rather than the result of systematic media analysis.[24] This ad-hoc, non-systematic approach to the representation of immigrants in the media suggests a repeated pattern in literature. Fanning's edited volume *Immigration and social change in the Republic of Ireland* (2007) does not contain a single chapter that is concerned with the role of the media, and they are not mentioned in the register of the book. *Globalization, Migration and Social Transformation* (2011), edited by Fanning and Munck, contains two chapters on *Polish Migrants and Media Transnationalism* and *Media Perspectives on Chinese Migrants in Ireland*, and notes a strong focus on media reception *by* immigrants rather than the portrayal of Poles and Chinese. However, the latter does contain a sub-section (pp. 210-3) in which King-O'Riain found that the Chinese were predominantly portrayed as hard-working, deserving migrants.[25] Yet, it was unclear how she arrived at this general conclusion. The confirmation of the model minority myth appears to be based upon one article that appeared in the *Sunday Tribune* in 2004, and in-depth media analysis did not seem to be the basis for her findings. Ronit Lentin has contributed valuable ideas in suggesting that Ireland as a racist state cast immigrants as undeserving, but her discussion focused on institutional and policy analysis rather than media portrayals.[26]

As these examples of academic work on immigrants in Ireland illustrate, it seems fair to say that the topic of representation of immigrants in Irish newspapers is still under-researched many years after immigration to Ireland became a reality. This observation is in line with King

[23] FANNING (2011), p. 148
[24] Cf. FANNING (2012), particularly the chapter on asylum seekers and refugees, pp. 84-113
[25] KING-O'RIAIN (2011), p. 211
[26] Cf. for example LENTIN (2003); LENTIN and MCVEIGH (2002); LENTIN and MCVEIGH (2006)

and Wood who found that "namely [...] migration studies literature is often 'curiously silent on the role of the media'".[27] However, there are some notable exceptions, including in-depth studies by Mac Éinrí (2001, 2005), Prieto Ramos (2004) and research by Haynes and Devereux.

Mac Éinrí followed the coverage of immigration in *The Irish Times* over the course of the year 2000, and his study provided valuable insights and called attention to the 'disproportionate' emphasis on asylum seekers and refugees.[28] *The Irish Times*, not so surprisingly, was considered to report in a fair and balanced yet critical manner although the author conceded that this broadsheet's readership was rather elitist and liberal-leftish, making generalisations about media representations difficult. Moreover, this study did not provide an opportunity for the comparison of different newspapers.

Such a comparison was provided in Prieto Ramos's study of 2004[29] in which he analysed the portrayal of immigrants in the Irish and Spanish press throughout the 1990s. He confirmed Mac Éinrí's findings that immigrant coverage focused predominantly on asylum seekers and that despite a more liberal stance in *The Irish Times*, immigrants were predominantly depicted in an unfavourable light. Out of the four Spanish and Irish newspapers, the *Irish Independent* emerged to express the least favourable views on immigrants. In both countries

> it is especially when the number of migrants arriving in the host country grows to significant proportions that the perception of foreign ethnic alterity as problematic and threatening implicitly prevails in how they are represented in news reports.[30]

Moreover, this study was particularly interesting for its methodological approach. Prieto Ramos arrived at these results by employing a combination of quantitative and qualitative analysis, arguing that quantitative analysis was more suitable to illustrate the unambiguous surface meaning of a text, whereas qualitative analysis revealed concealed meanings of a text that are overlooked by counts of frequency.[31] The results of Prieto Ramos's study and particularly the combined methodological approach, greatly informed the basis of this research design.

Haynes, Deveroux and Breen undertook an equally extensive research project aimed at revealing "how the media industry have facilitated a process of othering the inward migrant".

[27] Cited in KENNY (2010), p. 311
[28] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a); HAUGHEY (2001); GUERIN (2002)
[29] PRIETO RAMOS (2004)
[30] PRIETO RAMOS (2004), p. 207
[31] PRIETO RAMOS (2004)

Their methodological approach differed from the one employed in this study insofar as they also considered processes of production and reception. The time frame spanned from January 2000 to December 2004 and in total they collected over 5,000 samples drawn from two national dailies and two tabloid papers as well as radio and television programmes.[32] Their studies in the print media focused on the representation of asylum seekers, and they concluded that a major share of the media represented immigrants in a negative fashion, portraying them as a threat to society, a burden on the welfare system and linking them to rising crime levels. They concluded that "[w]hat we are witnessing within media coverage is a public exercise in othering." However, they also found that some immigrant groups, including Poles, were usually portrayed in a favourable light.[33]

Considering the enormous growth of Ireland's migrant community in the last two decades, the academic world – notwithstanding the aforementioned contributions – has remained surprisingly quiet about media representations of immigrants. The agenda of the Parnell Society Summer School (August 2010) was illustrative for this lack in academic interest: although the general topic was the role of the media in politics and society, a slot on media and immigrants was not reserved.[34] The present study aims to narrow this gap.

1.2 What does this study do?

Building upon the research carried out so far, this project sets out to reveal cultural practices in Irish society through the analysis of the representation of immigrants in the Irish print media. However, in contrast to the studies mentioned above, it is not based on the legal and economic status of immigrants (i.e. asylum seekers or labour migrants) but takes immigrants' nationality as the point of departure. For this endeavour three groups, Poles, Nigerians and Chinese have been selected. In the 2006 Census, these groups belonged to the top 7 immigrant groups in terms of size, and when traditional immigrant groups (British, US nationals) and other East Europeans (Latvians, Lithuanians) were excluded, they represented the three largest immigrant groups. Therefore, this study comprises migrants with different cultural backgrounds, different motives for migration as well as members of visible and non-visible minorities from both within and outside the European Economic Area (EEA).[35] This

[32] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006), pp. 2-4; citation p. 4
[33] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006); citation p. 17; HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2009)
[34] Parnell Society (2010)
[35] For a more detailed explanation of the selection process and some background on Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in Ireland, cf. ch. 5.2.

study hopes to establish whether the varying backgrounds and characteristics result in differential portrayals in the media and possibly a hierarchy of races.

Apart from investigating differences in the representation of individual immigrant groups, the question of whether differences in the coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese can also be established between newspaper genres (broadsheet and tabloid) as well as within one genre (broadsheets) shall be pursued. Based on circulation figures, three newspapers, *The Irish Times* and the *Irish Independent*, representing broadsheets, and one tabloid, *The Irish Sun*, have been chosen. Although television is arguably the more popular medium in terms of audience, news items are often presented in a rather perfunctory manner. Newspapers, on the other hand, have the potential to provide carefully researched, in-depth coverage. They therefore play a crucial role in forming public opinion. This study will also investigate whether various newspapers exploit the potential for in-depth coverage to the same extent.[36]

The time frame spans four periods, 1997, 2000, 2004 and 2010, from the early years of net-immigration to times of recession. The early periods in this project overlap with those in Prieto Ramos's and Mac Éinrí's studies whereas the latter two periods add to existing research. By selecting these periods, this study aims to draw conclusions based upon whether the portrayal of immigrants has changed in these 14 years against the backdrop of changing economic and social parameters. The year 1997 saw the continuation of a booming Irish economy and confirmed earlier trends that migration patterns had changed from net-emigration to net-immigration. This year also recorded a considerable rise in the number of asylum seekers arriving in Ireland. By 2000, immigration had risen further but the share of return migrants had started to fall, indicating that more non-nationals were coming to the Republic. 2004 was a decisive year as the Referendum on Citizenship marked a change from the jus soli to the jus sanguinis principle and alongside the EU enlargement Ireland's immigration policy turned increasingly restrictive towards non-EEA immigrants. By 2010, Ireland was in a recession and its effects were felt by many in everyday life as exemplified in a high unemployment rate and wage cuts for public sector workers.

The nature of coverage is established in a process combining quantitative and qualitative elements. In a first step, the likelihood of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese to be represented in specific predefined roles and to be linked to specific predefined topics is established through

[36] For more information on the role of newspapers and a characterisation of the publications considered in this study, cf. chs. 0 and 5.1.

content analysis before the most frequent roles and topics are investigated more closely. Although all quantitative analysis is necessarily also informed by qualitative work, I concur with Prieto Ramos that content analysis cannot expose concealed or latent meanings to the same extent as discourse analysis can.[37] Yet, the combination of both can produce meaningful results because one approach can make up for the drawbacks of the other. Most importantly, as mentioned above the process of only discussing those articles that suit an author's argument is avoided.[38] By basing in-depth analysis on frequency, this study can reveal latent meanings in articles on roles and topics with which readers are most frequently confronted and which therefore are most influential in shaping readers' opinions. Moreover, the design of this study also allows for the investigation of non-immigrant related roles such as expert, ordinary citizen or politician and can therefore establish whether Poles, Nigerians or Chinese have a chance of being represented in a wide range of topics without being reduced to immigrant roles. A comprehensive set of predefined topics complements the analysis so as to ascertain which members of the individual groups are likely to be portrayed in a diverse fashion.[39] In addition, this study explores the potential to be linked to the creation of a crisis (flood metaphor), to racist coverage or articles with a positive, negative, neutral or critical connotation as well as the irrelevant reference to nationality and further aims to establish which immigrant group has the highest chance of favourable and unfavourable portrayal.

The definition of roles, topics and other categories borrows from Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) which provides a valuable set of tools for analysis. However, whereas authors like van Dijk define the *critical* in this approach to discourse analysis as specifically focusing on power abuse, in this study, *critical* shall be understood as being critical of received ideas. Although it is hoped that this study, in line with CDA's aims, will have an effect in the non-academic world, it is not reduced to a position in left-wing political views as CDA usually is. Rejecting the idea of power being exercised from top-down,[40] this study calls on a more nuanced approach, similar to that found in Michel Foucault's work. According to Foucault, power does not work uni-directionally from top-down as Marxists argue, but power is decentralised and operates multi-directionally. It is exercised through a multitude of functionaries in institutions, including the media. This notion also shows in Foucault's approach to the construction of truth. Each society, he argues, has a régime of truth, which is constituted

[37] PRIETO RAMOS (2004), p. 25
[38] Cf. *cherry picking* in WODAK and MEYER (2009)
[39] Cf. ch. 3.2 and Code Book for details.
[40] Cf. ch. 2.2.1

by the discourses that a society accepts as true. Moreover, in contrast to the static social identities that affect the way language is used, Foucault argues that the constitutive nature of discourse shapes social identities.[41] Therefore, the media, playing a vital role in discourse, are a major stakeholder in the construction of truth, and consequently decidedly contribute to the perception of immigrants in a society and their social identities.

1.3 Structure

Chapter 2 provides the background to the methodological approach in this study. In reference to the trans-disciplinary nature of Cultural Studies it will first investigate content analysis before moving on to aspects of Critical Discourse Analysis and introducing Foucault's approach to discourse. Chapter 3 furnishes this study with the groundwork for the development of hypotheses, categories and indicators. In conjunction with the code book, it gives instructions on how categories and indicators are to be applied in content analysis. Chapter 4 gives a definition of what is understood by the broad term media and positions newspapers in the (Irish) mediascape before delivering arguments to address why newspapers are the subject of analysis, particularly against the backdrop of the high popularity of television. It also delivers an overview of the effects of reporting in the media and explores the historical and present context of the Irish print media. Chapter 5 sheds light on the corpus compilation, explaining why specific newspapers and immigrant groups have found entry in this study as well as setting the time frame for the periods to be analysed. A more detailed characterisation of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in a migration context is also given.

Chapter 6 gives an overview of immigration to Ireland from the age of the Vikings to the modern day and its effects on the country, the definition of Irishness and immigration policy. This chapter should not be reduced to merely providing historical background but demonstrates that colonisation and immigration have always played a major role in shaping today's Ireland and in the construction of Irishness despite at times low numbers of immigrants.

Chapter 7 demonstrates the results of the content analysis and provides details on the frequency of coverage in the individual newspapers, the frequency of coverage of the individual immigrant groups and identifies periods of peak coverage and salient roles and topics. Chapters 8 and 9 are devoted to the in-depth analysis of the most frequent shared and individual roles. In conjunction with the investigation of frequencies, sample articles are subjected to close scrutiny and reveal which immigrant groups are portrayed as deserving or undeserving immigrants.

[41] Cf. ch. 2.2.2

Thus, differences in the portrayal of the three migrant groups and differences in the reporting style of the individual newspapers are established. Chapter 10 provides a summary of the main findings of this study and gives an outlook for potential further research.

The position of the code book towards the end of the study shall not serve as an indicator for lesser importance. The code book defines the categories that were developed for the content analysis and delineates indicators for each of the categories. In providing the very basis for the analysis, it plays an essential role in the study and must be considered an integral part of the methodology chapter. Finally, hypotheses and statistical tables can be found in the appendix for the same reason.

2 Methodology

The central question of this study is the investigation of the construction of image(s) of immigrants in Irish newspapers. In other words, it aims at revealing cultural practices and power relations in Irish society. By resorting to a combined approach of content and discourse analysis, both quantitative and qualitative aspects are considered. Whereas content analysis can illustrate the general meanings of a text and, most of all, illustrates how frequently certain characteristics can be found in discourse, it cannot always map the more complex aspects of meaning. Despite the fact that content analysis as a quantitative method is also informed by qualitative considerations, only in-depth analysis can uncover the nuances of meaning. Discourse analysis, on the other hand, is a method that can expose such hidden meanings. Hence, both analyses complement each other and make up for their respective drawbacks. The combination of both approaches also allows analysing large corpora of newspaper articles, which is an impossible task to manage if only discourse analysis was applied and when "cherry picking" is to be avoided. The trans-disciplinary nature of Cultural Studies[42] delivers a well suited framework for this endeavour, mainly for two reasons. First, the very task of Cultural Studies is to investigate the relationship of power and rule since power relations are "established, legitimized but also questioned" in culture.[43] Second, Cultural Studies are strictly speaking not a discipline, but better characterised as a trans-disciplinary approach, which allows for a combination of various methodological concepts. In summary, this study rejects a clear-cut differentiation of quantitative and qualitative elements as both are inter-linked in such a way that only a combination of both can produce meaningful results.

2.1 Content analysis

Content analysis is an empirical method for the systematic description of the content of communication with reproducible and valid results. It is an empirical method because it relies on the condition that there are observable indicators for objects of analysis in reality, which are measured in the process of analysis. However, the method can only produce valid results when the criteria of how the researcher arrived at indicators are made transparent so that any other

[42] What Grossberg called the *Cross Road Blues of Cultural Studies*, was the demand that cultural studies be disciplined enough to utilize established theoretical – and I shall add methodological – resources while daring to be interdisciplinary at the same time. Cf. GROSSBERG (2008), p. 25 Also see Stuart Hall's paper given at the "Cultural Studies Now and in the Future" paper at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign in April 1990 in which he explains that cultural studies "was constructed by a number of different methodologies and theoretical positions". LEITCH (2010), p. 1784

[43] GROSSBERG (2008) and HEPP and WINTER (2008), citation p. 9

researcher employing the same definitions for indicators has the chance of arriving at the same result.[44] This is what qualifies the method as systematic and hence capable of reproducible results.[45]

Früh is adamant that measuring as opposed to simple allocation processes takes a central role in content analysis. Measuring is the process of ascribing numbers (or other symbols) to certain characteristic, which is used synonymously with quantifying by him. Yet, quantifying does not necessarily mean counting since it is important to consider that the numerical relative, which represents the empirical relative, cannot be subject to all mathematical operations. For example, whereas numbers representing the weight of people can be added, numbers representing the intelligence of people cannot. Therefore, the analyst must check that the operation is suitable for the characteristics that the numerical relative represents. Furthermore, the process of measuring also demands that the quantities of certain categories have been established.[46]

In this research project the statistical software packages SPSS and PSPP are employed to evaluate results. Originating in sociology, these programmes provide a host of statistical calculations. The two most important for this study are counts of frequencies and cross-tabulations. Whereas the count of frequencies establishes how often a category could be found in a set of texts, cross tabulations show how often a category could be found in another category. For example, they can provide information on how often the category *racist coverage* could be found in a newspaper. This assures both that there is no discrepancy in the result of mathematical operations and that measuring takes place.

Put in simpler words, content analysis measures how often certain criteria can be found in a set of texts. The method is a descriptive and pragmatic approach as it reduces the complexity of large numbers of texts. Furthermore, it allows the analysis of large amounts of (long) texts from various periods thereby also giving the chance to compare these. Moreover, unlike in surveys or interviews, analysts do not depend on the cooperation of participants, and the representation of events is not subject to alteration over time.[47]

[44] For a discussion of objectivity in content analysis refer to the qualitative-quantitative section in this chapter.
[45] Cf. FRÜH (2007), pp. 27-41; BURZAN (2005), pp. 39-42; KRIPPENDORFF (2004)
[46] Cf. in particular FRÜH (2007), pp. 27-41
[47] Cf. BURZAN (2005), p. 41

The quantitative – qualitative debate

Academics generally agree that content analysis as a method of empirical social sciences needs to be reliable, replicable and produce valid results.[48] However, there is a great deal of controversy over the question of qualitative elements in content analysis. On the one hand, there are scholars such as Neuendorf, who defend what appears as a strictly quantitative approach and are adamant that content analysis should be restricted to focusing on "*counts* of key categories and measurements of the *amount* of other variables" producing "less in-depth and less detailed" results.[49] This narrow interpretation of content analysis dates back to Berelson's definition of 1952, which put a great deal of emphasis on the objective and quantitative nature of content analysis.[50] On the other hand, Früh rejects the very idea of differentiating between quantitative and qualitative (content) analysis and promotes a combined approach.[51] He points out that in quantitative analysis not quantities per se but their meaning is the focus of interest and that qualitative analysis is a prerequisite for quantifying.[52]

Like Früh, Krippendorff questions the "validity and usefulness of the distinction between quantitative and qualitative content analysis" as "all reading of text is qualitative".[53] Against the backdrop of his constructivist approach, Krippendorff identifies six features in support of a combination of quantitative and qualitative elements in content analysis. First, a text does only reveal its meaning through interpretation by the reader – there is no inherent 'reader-independent' quality to a text. Second, there is no single meaning to a text. One must accept that there can be multiple meanings to a text and the result of a particular analysis cannot yield all possible meanings. Krippendorff even calls the claim to have found *the* meaning of a text 'naive'. Third, he points out that a meaning of a text does not have to be shared by everyone. He demands that analysts be allowed to deviate from a commonly shared meaning as otherwise we would be deprived of critical thinking. He goes on to explain that analysts must be able to "look outside the physicality of texts" and to identify the concepts that are invoked in the reader. It follows that it is essential for the analyst to define this context. Doing so will confine possible interpretations "to a manageable number, sometimes one". The sixth feature is that the analyst

[48] Cf. for example KRIPPENDORFF (2004), NEUENDORF (2002), FRÜH (2007)
[49] NEUENDORF (2002), pp. 14-5
[50] KRIPPENDORFF (2004), p. 20; NEUENDORF (2002), p. 10. For a reference to Berelson cf. FRÜH (2007), p. 27
[51] „Dabei können qualifizierende und quantifizierende Aspekte in verschiedenen Phasen des Forschungsprozesses mit unterschiedlichem Stellenwert einfließen, fast immer wird es aber eine Kombination beider Vorgehensweisen sein." FRÜH (2007), p. 67
[52] FRÜH (2007), pp. 38 and 67
[53] KRIPPENDORFF (2004), p. 16

is obliged to "draw specific inferences from a body of texts to their chosen context" thus allowing for the limitation of possible interpretations.[54] Früh summarises these ideas by postulating that the basis for the interpretation of texts in the process of quantifying is the researcher's own interpretation. Therefore, he or she must be transparent and clear in the definition of indicators in the code book so that other researchers understand how an indicator is to be employed and can arrive at the same result.[55]

Following Früh and Krippendorff, this study takes such a combined approach. This becomes particularly clear in three points. First, much importance is attributed to Critical Discourse Analysis in the definition of indicators in the code book (cf. next chapter). Second, without content analysis the large number of articles identified for analysis (cf. p. 44) cannot be processed. Third, this method provides a reliable way of establishing the most frequent roles and topics in the representation of immigrant groups in the media, and these salient roles and topics will be discussed in further detail in the second part of this study.[56]

2.2 Discourse analysis

2.2.1 Critical Discourse Analysis

My approach in respect of discourse analysis serves as further evidence of the intersection of quantitative and qualitative approaches at various points. Like Früh, Mayring, a qualitative researcher, argues that the first step in every quantitative analysis is of a qualitative nature in that categories need to be defined and tested.[57] For this endeavour, Critical Discourse Analysis[58] (CDA) will be my point of departure, mainly because of the invaluable contributions to the discussion of the representation of immigrants in the media by van Dijk, Fairclough or Bloor and Bloor. CDA provides an excellent set of practical tools for the analysis of the representation of immigrants in the media.[59] The definition of indicators in the code book in the appendix is based on the work of Critical Discourse analysts although their ideas were subject to critical review and amendments (see discussion there). However, CDA has also attracted considerable criticism in respect of methodological inconsistencies and flaws.[60]

[54] KRIPPENDORFF (2004), pp. 22-5
[55] FRÜH (2007), p. 47
[56] Other essential steps to be taken in devising a project based on content analysis shall not be discussed at this point. They will be put into practice at various points later in this study.
[57] MAYRING (2008),
[58] Van Dijk uses the term Critical Discourse Studies. For reasons of coherence, when I refer to CDA, this includes van Dijk's approach of CDS.
[59] Cf. for example DIJK (2008); FAIRCLOUGH (1995); FAIRCLOUGH (2001); BLOOR and BLOOR (2007)
[60] For a critique of CDA cf. for example BREEZE (2011)

As Breeze points out,

> [...] CDA differed from the other approaches in its particular interest in power, and its underlying assumption that the social relations reflected in language phenomena were part of a larger pattern characterised by unequal power relations.[61]

There are, of course, variations of this definition for example by Bloor & Bloor who argue that CDA reveals how language and discourse are employed to achieve social goals.[62] In a much more radical manner, van Dijk claims that Critical Discourse Studies (as he terms CDA) "is not merely interested in any kind of power but it specifically focuses on abuse of power".[63] The different opinions in respect of what CDA does are illustrative of the variety of streams that are united under the umbrella term CDA. While some authors claim that the eclectic nature of CDA leads to a lack of coherence and methodological inconsistencies, I tend to side with those who see it as an amalgamation of tools.[64] After all, the methodology adopted in this study is to a certain extent of an eclectic nature as it draws from different disciplines and theories.

The reference to social wrongs and power abuse in the aforementioned definitions are also indicators of Critical Discourse analysts' general agreement that the *critical* in CDA requires the researcher to take a stand against the social wrongs in society with the ultimate aim of overcoming them. The social wrongs "in a broad sense [are] injustice, inequality, lack of freedom etc."[65] Jäger justifies taking a stand by stating that scholarly critique does not take place outside of discourse but that its norms are discursively constructed,[66] and van Dijk states that "*not* committing oneself politically is also a political choice".[67] Yet, the *critical* in CDA requires some further consideration as it is not solely employed by this approach.

In its simplest guise, as Breeze maintains, it refers to the rather general critical thinking in classic liberal education. In the critical theory à la Frankfurt school it meant being critical of received ideas,[68] something that can generally not be said of critical discourse analysts. Their endeavour to point out social wrongs is usually informed by a left-wing, and in the case of van Dijk by an almost orthodox Marxist, political stance. The a priori fixation on the social wrongs in this left-wing tradition anticipates the results of analysis and reflects the Marxist view on

[61] BREEZE (2011), p. 496
[62] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 2
[63] DIJK (2008), p. 1
[64] BREEZE (2011), pp. 501-2
[65] FAIRCLOUGH (2009), p. 163
[66] JÄGER and MAIER (2009), p. 36
[67] DIJK (2008), p. 7
[68] BREEZE (2011), p. 499

power as working from top down and resulting in oppression. It thus reveals a perpetual focus on negativity.[69] Both aspects can be addressed with recourse to Foucault.

Without denouncing Marx, Foucault "develops a model of power relations, a network or force field of influences which is never the unique preserve of the dominator over the dominated."[70] Moreover, Foucault's political stance was never solely positioned in left ideas. To address the issue of negativity, the design of indicators in the code book specifically allows for positive representations of immigrants in the press, which provides for the production of a more comprehensive picture of immigrants in Ireland.

Another frequent point of critique of CDA raised by Breeze is analytical bias.[71] Although the question of how data for analysis are obtained persists in some CDA works, the issue has also been addressed from within CDA. By coining the term "cherry picking", the selection of articles to suit the researcher's argument, Meyer and Wodak call for a sound data basis.[72] Adopting this request, this study is informed by CDA particularly in the definition of categories and indicators in content analysis. However, because of the drawbacks of CDA as outlined above, the in-depth analysis is based on Foucault, whose ideas seem better suited than resorting to CDA alone.

2.2.2 Foucault and the question of power

As noted above, the discussion of power and discourse in CDA has limitations. Therefore, this chapter will first delineate alternative conceptualisations of power and power relations before turning to Foucault, whose ideas form the base of this study's approach to power. The *Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*[73] introduces in excess of one hundred theorists, all of whom discuss questions of power and society. Naturally, this study cannot deliver an all embracing discussion of this contested field. Borrowing from Gaventa's considerations on civil society and power, the division of actor-based approaches and those which emphasise the role of discourse, knowledge and culture shall be introduced briefly.[74]

Weber's classic definition of power is the ability to realise one's will even against the resistance of others. Similar to Marx, Weber suggests that people belong to a status group when

[69] For a discussion of negativity in CDA cf. BREEZE (2011), pp. 516-7. Examples are Bloor & Bloor's discussion of national identity BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 86-7. Van Dijk concedes that power can be positive too but in analysing social relations, he assumes power abuse. DIJK (2008), pp. 17-20
[70] DOWNING (2008), p. 5
[71] BREEZE (2011), pp. 503-4
[72] WODAK and MEYER (2009), p. 11
[73] Cf. LEITCH (2010)
[74] Cf. GAVENTA (2011)

they share the same life chances based on those peoples' economic disposition. In contrast to Marx, he does not limit the economic dimension to the question of ownership of the means of production but bases them on one's consumption patterns. However, he also argues that status groups "are held together by notions of proper life-styles and by the social esteem and honor accorded to them by others." Therefore, Weber extends the notion of belonging to a group beyond the economic dimension and introduces an understanding of society as pluralistic long before other theorists did so in the latter half of the 20th century.[75] In the scope of this study, Weber should be understood as a scholar who laid the groundwork for the analysis of pluralistic societies but whose theory does not necessarily reflect the multitude of facets in modern society.

Bourdieu, who is interesting for this study because of the interdisciplinarity of his approach and the acceptance of everything trivial (or more precisely what is considered trivial by others) as an object of research, emphasises the importance of culture while not rejecting the economic dimension in his conception of habitus "or socialised norms or tendencies that guide behaviour and thinking".[76] Habitus results from the interplay of free will and structures but is not the product of deliberate, conscious acting in society. It is also not permanent and can change over time. Bourdieu argues that one's social position is determined by distinction through aesthetic taste. Although his understanding of capital includes the economic dimension, it is what he calls cultural capital that "provides the means for a non-economic form of domination and hierarchy, as classes distinguish themselves through taste".[77] Taste is decisive because the economic position alone does not grant access to upper classes in society, which "is no level playing field"[78] in the first place. An individual's success heavily depends on the socioeconomic status of his or her parents and success in school. At the same time, Bourdieu deconstructs the dichotomy of individual versus society by focusing on the social rather than society. An individual's actions must be interpreted against the societal structures in which this individual operates. He refers to these structures as 'the field'.

Bourdieu argued that the social space is constituted by relatively autonomous fields such as politics, academia or art[79] whereas the approach to power relations in this study is based on the assumption that such fields in modern society cannot be autonomous and are interlinked at various levels. Gaventa adds that the clear distinctions of high and low in society have

[75] Cf. for example ZÖLLER (2001) or Cardiff University. Quotation taken from latter source
[76] Powercube
[77] GAVENTA (2003)
[78] LEITCH (2010), p. 1807
[79] Cf. JURT (2004), p. 211

disappeared.[80] However, although Bourdieu's understanding of agency is different to Foucault's, who rejects the very idea of agency (see below), there are certain similarities between the two theories as in the agonistic character of Bourdieu's field.[81] Likewise, interdisciplinarity and the investigation of the allegedly trivial are important elements in this study.

Before I turn to a detailed discussion of Foucault, Gramsci's ideas on power relations shall be considered in brief. Gramsci's concept of hegemony suggests a constant struggle of active social beings who are "[not] dupes of the ruling powers" [82]. The ruling group usually reigns with the consent of the majority of its subalterns;[83] it does not simply dominate others, but it is itself subject to constant change and re-definition:

> Although every party is the expression of a social group, and of one social group only, nevertheless in certain given conditions certain parties represent a single social group precisely in so far as they exercise a balancing and arbitrating function between the interests of their group and those of other groups, and succeed in securing the development of the group which they represent with the consent and assistance of allied groups-if not out and out with that of groups which are definitely hostile.[84]

Redefinition is thus achieved by incorporating subalterns' world-views into that of the ruling group. Moreover, Gramsci's approach to power relations is not reduced to the economic dimension because a ruling group must take cultural practices of those whom it aims to rule seriously.[85] He gives considerable thought to the role of culture and how culture is important in shaping identity. Laura E. Ruberto has shown how immigrant domestic servants in Italy make possible "the construction of a bourgeois, middle class Italian culture and sometimes alter [...] or challenge [...] that same middle class culture".[86] She also cites Landy, whose thoughts shall be repeated here, as they seem of fundamental importance when grasping Gramsci's conception of culture:

> The Gramscian conception of folklore and common sense and its relation to hegemony has implications for rethinking the nature and meaning of subalternity, a repositioning of it away from melodramatic notions of oppressor and oppressed and toward a more complex understanding of how subalternity is implicated in existing social and cultural formations through mechanisms of coercion and [...] mechanisms of consent.[87]

[80] For a synopsis of Bourdieu's work cf. LEITCH (2010), pp. 1806-14, GAVENTA (2013) or Powercube
[81] Cf. JURT (2004), p. 211
[82] JONES (2008), p.48
[83] LEITCH (2010), p. 1000
[84] HOARE and NOWELL SMITH (1982), p. 148
[85] JONES (2008), p. 46
[86] RUBERTO (2007), p. 54
[87] RUBERTO (2007), p. 16

In summary, Gramsci's legacy is the further development of the orthodox Marxist dichotomy of dominator – dominated into a more complex field of power relations, taking into consideration the fundamental role of culture. Yet, there are academics who sound a note of caution not to rely on culture alone and demand that economic circumstances be considered alongside culture.[88] This is one of the reasons why Foucault is thought to be so well fitting in the scope of this study. He presents a theory in which power is ubiquitous, multidirectional and non-exclusive. Various fields, such as science, academia, education, the media, the economy and others are interdependent and, most of all, determined by discourse. Although Foucault rejects the idea of agency, he incorporates many of the ideas presented by Weber, Bourdieu, Gramsci and others.

With discourse taking such a central role in Foucault's concept, a discussion of whether discourse is simply conversation or whether it "put[s] everything in its place" is due.[89] In his later works Foucault's concept of discourse had become "a much more specific concept, describing the intersection of knowledge and power, and the forms of expression and articulation they take in different discursive fields."[90] The notion of 'putting everything in its place' refers to the constitutive nature of discourse in Foucault's conceptualisation, but the definition of discourse offered here also contains a number of key terms that call for closer investigation.

Discourse, according to Foucault, is an "ensemble of discursive events;"[91] that, in the way they are linked, form discursive formations. But how do statements relate to each other in such formations? Foucault suggests, and discards, four hypotheses. First, he investigates reference to the same object. However, he realises that due to an internal discontinuity, objects may not be the same over a period of time. Therefore, a reference to one and the same object can only be valid at a certain point in time.[92] Second, he considers common style, which does not withstand closer scrutiny because of the multiplicity of statements. Third, he investigates whether unity can be established through coherent concepts but arrives at the conclusion that there are constant transformations resulting in the need "to analyse the interplay of their appearances and dispersion."[93] Last, he discusses grouping by theme, which fails too since an

[88] Cf. ALBRECHT (2008), p. 268
[89] LEITCH (2010), p. 1472
[90] BREEZE (2011), p. 9
[91] FOUCAULT (1991a), p. 37 (my translation)
[92] FOUCAULT (1972), pp. 32-3
[93] FOUCAULT (1972), p. 35

overarching theme can cover several discourses.[94] He arrives at what at first glance sounds like a paradox by stating that the unifying element of discourse is a system of dispersion:

> Whenever one can describe, between a number of statements, such a system of dispersion, whenever, between objects, types of statements, concepts, or thematic choices, one can define a regularity (an order, correlations, positions and functionings, transformations), we will say, for the sake of convenience, that we are dealing with a discursive formation […] The conditions to which the elements of this division (objects, mode of statement, concepts, thematic choices) are subjected we shall call the rules of formation. The rules of formation are conditions of existence (but also of coexistence, maintenance, modification, and disappearance) in a given discursive division.[95]

This approach to discourse seems particularly suitable for this study since it goes beyond the sphere of linguistics and shows that the representation of immigrants in the Irish media can only be grasped by considering various discourses by various actors within the context of societal, legislative, judicative and executive powers. This, of course, includes looking beyond the textual level at the context within which media discourse takes place, and which is shaped by media discourse because, as Fairclough has pointed out, Foucault's archaeological work shows that "a discursive formation does not define a unitary set of stable concepts in well-defined relations to each other" but that the relationships "within and between" texts need to be taken into account.[96]

Foucault goes on to explain the constitutive nature of discourse by calling into question received concepts of the signified, suggesting that discourse shapes and transforms objects and subjects. In contrast to the assumption that social identity is static and only affects the way language is used, Foucault argues that discursive practices shape social identities. If subjects, or the self, are shaped by discourse, the role of social agency of subjects remains dubious, though. In fact, for a long time Foucault remained rather silent on the paradox of the subject as agent and the objectified subject. Only in 1982 did he refer to active social agency in his essay *The Subject and Power*:

> [Power] is a total structure of actions brought to bear upon possible actions; it incites, it induces, it seduces, it makes easier or more difficult; in the extreme it constrains or forbids absolutely; it is nevertheless always a way of acting upon an acting subject or acting subjects by virtue of their acting or being capable of action. A set of actions upon other actions.[97]

Not only does Foucault refer to acting subjects, he further explains that power can only be exercised over free subjects. This means that those who are acted upon must have a set of

[94] FOUCAULT (1972), pp. 35-6
[95] FOUCAULT (1972), p. 38
[96] FAIRCLOUGH (1995), pp. 45-8. Quotes p. 45 and 46
[97] FOUCAULT (1982), p. 789

opportunities at their disposal to be able to react on being acted upon. If those who are acted upon are unfree, however, this constitutes different types of relationships as, for example, a physical relationship constraint in the case of slavery.[98] The notion of the subject is interesting for this study since it can reveal whether immigrants are represented as acting subjects or whether there is a hierarchy of immigrants with different degrees of freedom.

Foucault's later work is marked by a shift from archaeology to genealogy, which rejects mono-causal explanations for historic changes but is rather a "history of small and multiple changes that lead to alterations in trends of thinking and operating in any given epoch."[99] The shift from archaeology to genealogy also entailed a novel way of looking at power and the construction of truth through discourse. Power, according to Foucault's revised conception, does not work uni-directionally from top-down as Marxists argue, but power is decentralised and operates multi-directionally. It is exercised through a multitude of functionaries in institutions, for example a teacher exercising power over students in a school. Foucault places much emphasis on the creation of "docile bodies" since the 17th and 18th century through disciplinary measures in state institutions. As a model of these disciplinary measures the organisation of the army is mirrored in schools, prisons or hospitals. Bodies are formed in such a way that forces to serve modern society are increased, yet bodies are subjected to a dominant power. Subjection, though, does not mean domination by force, rather incorporation to serve power.[100] Power is accepted because it is seen as a productive force rather than a repressive one; power "traverses and produces things, it induces pleasure, forms knowledge, produces discourse."[101] Yet, "modern power operates through continual classification, surveillance, and interventions."[102]

> [Modern society] produces the very desires and behaviours it claims to abhor, relying largely on discourse. Power can operate physically on bodies, but discursively it carves up the world. Through language various bodies are assigned to various categories (race, gender, IQ, etc.), and various actions are designated in relation to norms as praiseworthy, deviant, punishable, or criminal.[103]

[98] FOUCAULT (1982), p. 790 For an earlier discussion of the subject cf. FOUCAULT (1972), pp. 40-9 and pp. 92-6; FAIRCLOUGH (1993), pp. 41-3.
[99] DOWNING (2008), p. 15
[100] FOUCAULT (1991b), pp. 135-41; FAIRCLOUGH (1993), p. 50
[101] FOUCAULT (1980), p. 119
[102] LEITCH (2010), p. 1472; Also see DOWNING (2008), pp.18-9
[103] LEITCH (2010), p. 1472

Thus, discourse has a normative function singling out those who deviate from the norm, alongside a system of judging and punishing such deviance. In accordance with the idea of power being dispersed amongst a system of functionaries,

> [t]he judges of normality are present everywhere. We are in the society of the teacher-judge, the doctor-judge, the educator-judge, the 'social-worker'-judge; it is on them that the universal reign of the normative is based; and each individual, wherever he may find himself, subjects it his body, his gestures, his behaviour, his aptitude, his achievements.[104]

In the context of this study, this list needs to be extended by the media-judge. By informing and forming public opinion, the media have a normative function. Hence, media analysis can be a tool in investigating, in a Foucauldian sense, the rules of formation of discourse in and through the media. The 'universal reign of the normative' was published in 1975, the year in which he gave his lecture series *Society Must Be Defended* at the Collège De France. In this lecture series he elaborated on the concept of biopolitics, a process of defending society by singling out and killing (in a metaphorical sense) the abnormal and the deviant, establishing a new form of state racism. This concept is discussed in greater detail in the chapter on racism in Ireland (p. 146).

The discussion of power in a Foucauldian sense cannot be complete without considering the notion of knowledge or, more precisely, the "power-knowledge nexus."[105] In *The West And The Rest*, Stuart Hall, referring to Foucault, explains that "[d]iscourse is about the production of knowledge through language."[106] Truth, as an outcome of knowledge, is not absolute; it is produced in scientific discourse and under the control of dominant institutions.[107] It is not important whether discourse is true or false; whether it has an effect in practice is decisive:[108]

> [T]ruth isn't outside power, or lacking in power: contrary to a myth whose history and functions would repay further study, truth isn't the reward of free spirits, the child of protracted solitude, nor the privilege of those who have succeeded in liberating themselves. Truth is a thing of this world: it is produced only by virtue of multiple forms of constraint. And it induces regular effects of power. Each society has its régime of truth, its 'general politics' of truth: that is, the types of discourse which it accepts and makes function as true; the mechanisms and instances which enable one to distinguish true and false statements, the means by which each is sanctioned; the techniques and procedures accorded value in the acquisition of truth; the status of those who are charged with saying what counts as true.[109]

[104] FOUCAULT (1991b), p. 304
[105] LEITCH (2010), p. 1473
[106] HALL (1992), p. 291
[107] FOUCAULT (1980), pp. 131-2
[108] HALL (1992), p. 295
[109] FOUCAULT (1980), p. 131

This view of discourse / power ultimately explains why there is struggle with and for discourse, why discourse is "the power to be seized."[110] The discursive nature of power explains why Foucault is relevant for media analysis. As I have shown above, the media, as a place where discourse is produced, play a formative role in producing power and truth and in forming objects and subjects.

The multi-dimensional aspect of Cultural Studies is particularly appealing to this study as it supports the attempt to obtain an inclusive picture of Polish, Nigerian and Chinese immigrants to Ireland. As explained above, context analysis need not be restricted to the sheer accumulation of numbers and frequencies. In fact, media analysis as understood in this study calls for an interpretive approach, taking into consideration cultural practices beyond the textual dimension. Quoting van Dijk, media discourse is only the "tip of an iceberg" as "only some of the propositions needed to understand a discourse are actually expressed, most other propositions remain *implicit*, and must be inferred from the *explicit* propositions."[111] Fairclough goes on to explain that recontextualisation helps us to unveil the "strategies pursued by particular groups of social agents,"[112] an idea that surely shows familiarity with Foucault's conception of the rules of formation. A quote by Stuart Hall summarising the link between CDA and Foucault within the context of Cultural Studies shall conclude this section:

> If a literary critic believes that any interpretation of a literary text must consider both the social forces that contribute to the text's production and the hegemonic work it does, then he or she has taken up the concerns and questions that characterize cultural studies.[113]

[110] FOUCAULT (1991a), p. 11
[111] DIJK (2009), p. 77
[112] FAIRCLOUGH (2009), p. 165
[113] LEITCH (2010), p. 1781

3 Research design

3.1 Research questions and hypotheses

The underlying research question of this study is how frequent roles and topics in which immigrants are represented in the Irish print media reveal power relations in Irish society between 1997 and 2010. This section shall clarify some of the key terms in this research question and explain which hypotheses have been derived from it.

The print media in this study refer to *The Irish Times*, the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun:* a quality paper, a quality paper with some tabloid tendencies and a tabloid paper, respectively. Because of their distinct characteristics (cf. p. 32 for details), sub-hypotheses must be formed for each individual paper where necessary. Since this study endeavours to reveal power relations in Irish society based on the frequency of roles and topics, the assumption that such roles and topics exist is obvious. Therefore, the first and second hypotheses are:

A) There is a set of roles to which immigrants are predominantly linked in the coverage of the Irish print media.

B) There is a set of topics to which immigrants are predominantly linked in the coverage of the Irish print media.

The selection of three newspapers covering both the broadsheet and tabloid sections already suggests that it is assumed that these newspapers report in different ways. As noted in the chapter on newspapers in context (p. 50), *The Irish Times* (*IT*) is supposedly the daily newspaper with the highest standard of reporting in Ireland. Despite sensationalist elements in its coverage, it is also expected that the *Irish Independent's* (*II*) standard[114] of coverage is high, yet not as high as *The Irish Times'*. As a tabloid paper, *The Irish Sun* (*IS*) is expected to focus on entertainment, resulting in a lower overall quality of coverage. Hence, I expect to find a hierarchy of coverage with the *IT* at the top, the *II* taking a middle position and the *IS* covering the other end of the spectrum. This can be extended to the frequency of coverage, where a similar hierarchy is expected.[115] The following hypotheses result from these considerations:

[114] The standard and/or quality of coverage considers to what extent an article reports in a sensationalist manner, expresses negative views on immigrants, uses a flood metaphor or expresses racist views etc.
[115] Piaras Mac Éinríí has argued that "[t]he *Irish Times* consistently carries more extensive coverage on immigration and related matters than either of the other two broadsheet dailies, the *Irish Independent* and the *Irish Examiner*." MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a)

C) There is a hierarchy of frequency of coverage of immigrants in the Irish print media.

D) There is a hierarchy of the quality of coverage of immigrants in the Irish print media.

In addition to the discussion of the quality of coverage across newspapers and years, it is further expected to find more positive coverage in recent years within a newspaper. Whereas in 1997 large scale immigration to Ireland was a new phenomenon, it is probably safe to say that it was more commonplace in later years despite increased emigration rates during the time of economic hardship.[116] With immigration having lost its novelty, I expect journalists to adhere to the NUJ code of conduct[117] resulting in fewer articles that single immigrants out by representing them in negative roles and topics. Hence I arrive at the following hypothesis:

E) The quality of coverage of immigrants in Ireland improved on a period-by-period basis.

Last, a hypothesis shall be introduced that is not directly derived from the research question but which is nevertheless closely linked to immigration with various academics agreeing that racism is (frequently) found in Irish society. With the media being part of a multitude of functionaries that exercise power in society and shaping public opinion,[118] it must be assumed that their coverage contains some racist elements, irrespective of whether this is in a conscious or subconscious manner. In line with the earlier hypothesis that there is a hierarchy of the quality of coverage of immigrants in Irish newspapers, I expect this to be reflected in a hierarchy of racist elements. Furthermore, the distinctive cultural backgrounds of the three immigrant groups considered here suggest that Poles, Nigerians and Chinese are not affected by racism to the same extent. Borrowing from Foucault, a hierarchy of races is expected.[119] Therefore, the following hypotheses shall be tested.

F) The coverage of immigrants in Irish newspapers contains racist elements at varying levels.

G) A hierarchy of races can be shown in the coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese.

For reasons of continuity and spatial restrictions, please refer to the appendix for the full list of hypotheses and sub-hypotheses (p. 275).

[116] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (b)
[117] National Union of Journalists (2009)
[118] FOUCAULT (1991b), pp. 135-41
[119] For the idea of hierarchies of races cf. FOUCAULT (2003a), pp. 255-6. This concept is further discussed in the chapter on racism in Ireland from p. 114

3.2 Operationalisation

3.2.1 Categorial system

In order to test the hypotheses defined above, an exhaustive categorical system is required. Exhaustive means that all relevant dimensions are described and represented by their respective sub-categories.[120] Apart from technical categories like *Identification number*, *Newspaper* and *Date*, I was interested in the *Type of article*, its *Length* and which *Group* was discussed in the sample. Hypothesis A expects that individual immigrant groups (hence the *Group* category) are represented in specific sets of roles. Consequently, there must be a category that records these roles (*Primary and Secondary roles*). In a similar manner, the *Primary, Secondary* and *Tertiary topic* categories have been derived from hypothesis B. Hypothesis C (frequency of coverage) can be derived from the frequencies in the *Newspaper* category. The main categories could be developed from the hypotheses in a relatively direct manner. On the other hand, hypotheses D and E, and to a certain extent hypothesis G, are concerned with the quality of coverage. Quality is, of course, a more ambiguous concept than roles and topics. Yet, it is believed that the nature of the *Headline,* the frequency of racist coverage (*Racism*), the use of *Flood Metaphor(s)*, the *Quotation Pattern*, the general *Connotation* of an article and the irrelevant mentioning of *Nationality* can, in combination, adequately reflect the quality of coverage.

At this point, not all categories can be discussed in detail. Therefore, please refer to the appendix for details.

3.2.2 Definition of indicators

Apart from categories, the coding process further requires a set of indicators that allow the researcher to transfer linguistic expressions into data. These indicators help to determine concepts that are not explicitly named in the text but need to be interpreted. In analogy to the definition of categories, Früh demands that indicators need to be exclusive, differentiated and exhaustive. However, since it is impossible to define all indicators that could reflect a category in a text, the list of indicators must be defined in a such a fashion that it enables the encoder to amend the list as intended by the researcher i.e. the list needs to be semantically exhaustive in contrast to explicit linguistic completeness. On the other hand, the list also serves to limit the

[120] The degree of exhaustion will be put to a test during a trial run of the analysis, which will allow for an adjustment of categories afterwards. Cf. Früh (2007), pp. 82-7

encoder so that he or she does not exceed the boundaries that have been defined by the analyst.[121]

These intentions and boundaries are laid out in the coding rules in whose definition this study adopts a semantic approach. This means, for example, that the term *Pole*, which at the beginning of a sentence could either refer to the technical term a long shaft or a Polish national is only coded when it refers to a Polish national. Hence, the context in which an indicator is used is crucial.[122] Furthermore, the coding unit is the article so that synonymous terms will only be recorded once, regardless of how often they appear in an article. Since there is only one coder, the danger of misinterpretation can be narrowed. Moreover, a sound definition ensures that the coding process is consistent i.e. that the same criteria are used for the first and the last article to be coded, and that the coding habit does not change over time.[123] The code book and the definition of indicators can be found in the appendix from p. 245.

3.2.3 Keywords

In order to arrive at a corpus of articles for analysis, a set of search terms that gives every article relating to the research question the same chance of being included in the study is required. Apart from this inclusive function, search terms should also be exclusive so that articles that are not of interest are not considered. Depending on the research interest, such a definition is not always easy to arrive at. If, for example, the analyst is interested in the representation of Romanian asylum seekers, the combination of the country of origin (*Romania*), the adjective describing a citizen of that country (*Romanian*) and the search term *Asylum Seeker* should suffice. Hence, the search terms *Romania* OR *Romanian* AND *Asylum Seeker* should yield a small margin of error i.e. only few articles that are not of interest to the analyst should appear in the population. Whereas in such a case it is possible to define quite narrow search terms, such a precise definition was not possible in this study. As shown above, it was expected that the media present members of each immigrant group in specific roles. However, if these roles had been transformed into search terms, the content analysis would only have produced very limited results as it would have excluded all other potential roles in which these immigrants were represented. The explicit aim of this study, though, is to arrive at a comprehensive picture of immigrant representations that allows for investigating both migrant and non-migrant roles. As a result, the inclusive characteristics of search terms had to be

[121] Cf. FRÜH (2007), p. 88-103
[122] Cf. FRÜH (2007), p. 91
[123] For formal and semantic definition of coding units cf. Früh, pp. 92-4.

strengthened at the expense of exclusive ones. In order to do this, keywords for this study were selected in such a way that the country of origin, the term for nationals and the respective adjective formed the search terms:

- *Poland* OR *Polish* OR *Pole* for members of the Polish community,
- *Nigeria* OR *Nigerian* for members of the Nigerian community and
- *China* OR *Chinese* for members of the Chinese community.

As it is expected that these search term will generate a very high number of articles, only samples from *articles, letters to the editor, editorial articles* and *front page* shall be considered. Samples from *sports*, *birth notice, classified ad, comic, display ad, editorial cartoon, fire loss, legal notice, lottery numbers, marriage, obituary, photo standalone, real estate transaction, review, stock quote, table of contents and weather* are to be ignored.

3.2.4 Definition of migrant, asylum seeker and refugee

Although non-immigrant roles are explicitly part of the research design, the terms migrant, asylum seeker and refugee have to be defined in order to be able to ascertain which articles are to be included in the evaluation process.

The official definition of a migrant in Ireland goes back to the 1935 Aliens Act, which states, "[…] the word "alien" means a person who is not a citizen of Saorstát Eireann."[124] As this definition of immigrant is too general for the purpose of this study, a more suitable, yet easily manageable one needs to be agreed. Adapting the definition of *migrant worker* by the National Youth Council of Ireland, an immigrant in this study is to be understood as "a person who is working or living in the Republic of Ireland but is not an Irish national".[125] In addition,

> [t]he term 'migrant' […] should be understood as covering all cases where the decision to migrate is taken freely by the individual concerned, for reasons of 'personal convenience' and without intervention of an external compelling factor.[126]

For the definition of refugees, Ireland follows the 1951 Geneva Convention and its subsequent amendment in the 1967 Protocol. Under this definition

[124] The definition of immigrant in the Immigration Act 2004 refers to the Immigration Act 1999, which in turn refers to the definition of alien in the 1935 Aliens Act. REPUBLIC OF IRELAND
[125] NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL OF IRELAND
[126] UNITED NATIONS ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL (1998)

> "a refugee" means a person who, owing to a well founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the country of his or her nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself or herself of the protection of that country; or who, not having a nationality and being outside the country of his or her former habitual residence, is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to return to it […].[127]

In contrast, a programme refugee in Ireland does not need fulfil all the criteria described in the Geneva Convention but enjoys the protection of the Irish state upon the acceptance by the Minister for Foreign Affairs.[128] In this study, both refugees and programme refugees are considered as refugees and combined in the same category.

Under Irish legislation, if a person enters the state seeking asylum "for fear of persecution", he or she is not refused the right to enter the state but has the right to apply to the Minister of Foreign Affairs to be recognised as a refugee.[129]

Hence, if an article establishes a clear connection between Polish, Nigerian or Chinese nationals and immigration to Ireland[130] be it as a migrant in general, an asylum seeker or a refugee, it has to be selected for analysis. Thus, an article is not to be considered when it refers to Polish, Nigerian or Chinese tourists, business people, politicians, artists etc. who are evidently on a short-term visit to Ireland. Students, in contrast, are to be considered as they usually live in Ireland for an extended period of time.[131] In addition, all articles discussing Polish, Nigerian or Chinese nationals in their home country or in any country other than Ireland have to be disregarded. The final decision whether an article is to be recorded lies with the analyst and has to be based on his interpretative skills.[132]

3.3 Analysis at macro and micro level

Whereas the sections above provided the theoretical framework for defining rules according to which object characteristics are transferred into data, the following one concentrates on how an article shall be approached at a more practical level. Based on the work

[127] UNHCR (2007); REPUBLIC OF IRELAND (1996). The complete text excludes persons who a) receive protection or assistance from the UN b) enjoy the "rights and obligations which are attached to the possession of the nationality of that country" c) are guilty of war crimes etc. d) have committed serious crimes and e) act in breach of UN conventions.
[128] REPUBLIC OF IRELAND (1996)
[129] REPUBLIC OF IRELAND (1996)
[130] Ireland means the Republic of Ireland and not Northern Ireland, which is part of the United Kingdom.
[131] There is of course no universally agreed definition of the term migrant. In an Irish context Paula Fagan in a 1998 study on migrant women and domestic violence in Ireland chose to include "those who have temporary status as visitors (tourists, temporary workers, students and undocumented migrants)". FAGAN (1998)
[132] KRIPPENDORFF (2004)

of Critical Discourse analysts and in particular on adaptions of indicators used by van Dijk, the following considerations trace how analysis moves from the textual level to sentence level and eventually word level.

For some categories (e.g. *Topic* or *Role*) the decision on how to interpret a text should not pose a great problem since usually there are explicit indicators. In other categories such as *Flood* or *Racist*, indicators are less explicit and need to be deduced from the text. In these cases, the use of indicators at sentence and word level in particular support the analyst in making the decision about whether a category needs to be recorded or not. This helps in agreeing the heavy reliance on the coder's interpretive skills and the definition of the coding instructions in the code book in such a way that the results are reproducible. Therefore, qualitative considerations, which are expressed in the indicators, are essential in informing the quantitative elements of content analysis (cf. p. 13). Furthermore, the definitions of indicators also provide a blueprint for the detailed analysis of articles that have been selected on the basis of most frequent roles and topics.

3.3.1 Analysis at contextual level

According to van Dijk, "topics and themes [...] are what discourses are (globally) about" because they are often consciously controlled and best remembered by most readers.[133] In addition to these considerations, Fairclough argues that stable discursive practices are typical of settled i.e. conservative societies, and that discursive practices that discuss ideological differences and cater for niche audiences are typical of unsettled societies.[134] Therefore, in this study unsettled shall be interpreted as open-minded, aiming for integration, non-racist and willing to change etc. Although these instructions find entry in a number of categories, *Topic A / B / C* are particularly informed by them.

The analysis of topics alone, however, is not an exhaustive means of evaluating an article since the examination of context may shed more light on a topic.[135] Bloor and Bloor suggest the following questions to determine context: "Who is talking to whom about what? Why? What is their purpose? What effect do they have (or trying to have)?" [136] I may add 'Why is the topic brought up at this point in time?' By asking these questions, we relate to participant identities, roles and relations but also to the ideational notion of the participants. Whereas

[133] DIJK (2009), p. 68
[134] FAIRCLOUGH (1995), pp. 65-6
[135] DIJK (2008), p. 237
[136] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 27-9

participant identities and relations are a matter of interpretation and are acknowledged in categories such as *Racist* or *Connotation*, participant roles are recorded in the *Role A* and *Role B* categories.

Fairclough further introduces the idea of chain and choice relations. In chain relations he attempts to expose how *news* are transformed along the chain from what actually happened or what was said to what is reported, and how earlier texts are embedded in later ones.[137] Choice relations, on the other hand, do not necessarily relate to free choices since, according to Fairclough, they are socially conditioned. Despite temporal and logistic constraints, these chains shall nevertheless be considered in the evaluation of articles, particularly where deviations are obvious.[138]

3.3.2 Analysis at textual level

Intertextuality extends the idea of discussing context without establishing an entirely new approach. According to Bloor and Bloor, this may provide information on the "writers' strategies in reinforcing or re-formulating ideas and beliefs" and "it can reveal traces of the dominant ideology or evidence of ideological struggle and cultural change."[139] One aspect of intertextuality in media discourse is the inclusion of "other voices" into articles. This may serve the purpose of attributing ideas to their originators, of including the people who are discussed in the text, or it may have a distancing effect when the journalist is unwilling to directly express the originator's point of view or attitude. In this study, it should be revealing to subject the nature of the source and the way it is employed in the article to close scrutiny. If experts are cited, it should be established whether their expert status is challenged and whether experts from all groups in society[140] are heard; whether contradicting views are allowed in the article, whether the expert's utterance is presented in such a way that the lay reader is able to comprehend the message or whether the utterance is used in such a way that the core message remains obscure. The key consideration here is to show who has access to the media and whether journalists allow (in-group) experts to be the sole holders of information.[141] If members

[137] One possible chain could be Source >> Eye witness >> Press agency >> Report in Irish newspaper. The number of links in this chain may vary.
[138] For a discussion of chain relations cf. FAIRCLOUGH (1995), pp. 64-6
[139] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007)
[140] Bloor and Bloor challenge the idea that only dominant classes have control of all expert discourse. This view is similar to Gramsci's assumption that all social groups have their own intellectuals. Moreover, the notion of access to the media is important here. The recording of the quotation pattern may help in evaluating this point. Cf. BLOOR and BLOOR (2007); HOARE and NOWELL SMITH (1982); JONES (2008). For access to the media cf. DIJK (2008)
[141] For a discussion of intertextuality cf. for example BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 51-65

of the out-group are quoted as experts, it should be investigated whether their quote is supported by a member of the in-group, in which case the out-group member's quote would be discredited.

Therefore, the *Quotation* category counts the frequency of quotations in order to ascertain to whom preferential access is given to the media. For reasons of manageability, only the frequency of sources is recorded because, as Fairclough explains, "equity and balances cannot be assessed by merely noting which voices are represented, and, for instance, how much space is given to them".[142] Hence, once the frequency has been established, the qualitative analysis of hierarchisation and framing techniques as well as register and tone informs on how quotations are employed in relation to exclusionary or inclusionary practices.

A marker for hierarchisation is the position of the quote in an article i.e. whether it is placed in a prominent or unprominent position. Prominent positions are in the headline, the introduction and at the end of the story i.e. the summary whereas the middle of an article is considered rather unprominent. Hence, if much prominence is given to the out-group in the first part, this suggests a fair representation. However, if out-group voices are then contradicted by in-group voices at a later stage, the article only *appears* to be balanced and objective. The positioning in a main or subordinate clause can give further clues as to the prominence attributed to the voice.[143]

Framing techniques are particularly relevant in indirect quotes as these can be a source of ambivalence when it is difficult for the reader to identify whether the words used are reported or transformed. On the other hand, even direct quotes are not always as objective as they seem at first glance. Manipulation can be achieved by the choice of reporting verbs. The difference between *say* and *claim*, for example, is such that the latter implies a certain degree of discredit and doubt.[144] Newspapers may also attempt to present interpretation as fact by using non-attributed quotations. As discussed above, Bloor & Bloor support this argument by saying that readers are inclined to accept as fact what is written or spoken by an authoritative person.[145]

The use of register and tone is shown when, for example, an official discourse is transformed into colloquial tone in order to claim solidarity with the reader without giving up

[142] Fairclough defines voices as "those speaking or whose speech is represented". FAIRCLOUGH (1995), p. 80; quotation p. 81
[143] FAIRCLOUGH (1995)
[144] The choice of vocabulary belongs to the word level, of course. However, for reasons of thematic cohesion, I have decided to discuss it in this section.
[145] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 46. For the discussion of voices in media discourse cf. FAIRCLOUGH (1995), pp. 79-85

the authority of the original source. To which effect a high or low register, a formal or informal tone is used may vary as a colloquial tone may signal solidarity with the reader or simply populist coverage that focuses on entertainment rather than reporting whereas a high register and more formal tone could indicate a more unbiased approach to reporting.[146]

In addition to the analysis of quotation patterns, authorial stance can inform the *Connotation* category. In an editorial the authorial stance would often be explicit as the author is expressing her or his opinion. Since opinion articles are usually clearly marked and supported by stylistic elements like the use of the personal pronoun I, the reader is prepared to accept it as a personal comment but not necessarily as unbiased reporting or the newspaper's general position. The analysis is more complex though if the authorial stance is hidden. This would often be the case in reports, where the reader expects unbiased reporting. Such an expectation is based on socially agreed conventions, and the author, well aware of these conventions, may try to exploit them. Therefore, an apparently unbiased report may in fact be quite biased, which is more difficult for the reader to determine and therefore needs to be considered in the evaluation. A further interesting characteristic can be an unconscious authorial stance since the unconscious use of certain formulations can reveal the writer's prejudice, which may represent a society's prejudices. Unconscious authorial stance could be found when the author uses terminology that is accepted in the everyday language of a society, but when the users are not aware of the derogatory nature. Hence Bloor & Bloor's conclusion:

> Prejudice can pervade discourse and it can often go unnoticed except by those who are its target. Perhaps the most important function of CDA is to shed light on this kind of disguised attitude.[147]

3.3.3 Analysis at sentence and word level

Once the general setting of an article has been examined, the coder shall move closer to the analysis at sentence level. I will first explain to what extent lexical implications can play a role in the examination process and later move on to syntactic elements. As in the section above, these elements have been adopted from different approaches to CDA – mainly by van Dijk, Fairclough and Bloor & Bloor.

Investigating lexical items is important since words do not have a fixed meaning. One and the same lexical item can have different meanings in different contexts and their meaning can change over time. More specifically, denotation and connotation should be discussed. In relation to denotation, the evaluation of articles can, for instance, be influenced by the usage of

[146] FAIRCLOUGH (1995), p. 68-74; BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 116
[147] For a discussion of authorial stance cf. BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 33-49. Quotation p. 43

the wrong terminology. The common wrong attribution of *asylum seeker* and *refugee* is one example. Not differentiating between both terms misleads readers and can have repercussions in personal discourse and thus shape opinions. While neither term tells us anything about the personal characteristics of people who come to a country in need of protection, it seems safe to say that *asylum seeker* has increasingly adopted a negative connotation. Connotation is "a major factor in manipulating opinion" and must hence be considered in the evaluation of an article.[148]

Metaphors are widely used in everyday language and all sorts of written texts. In this context, the use of metaphors does not necessarily carry a judgment or value. The decisive question is to what effect metaphors are used – consciously or unconsciously – by the author. Frequent phenomena in the newspaper genre in relation to immigration are war and flood metaphors, both of which represent hyperboles or exaggerations. They are often used to create a sense of panic and threat with the intention of creating a negative attitude towards immigrants. The use of war (e.g. *battle* against bogus asylum seekers) and flood metaphors (e.g. *influx* of foreigners) as two examples carry negative connotations.[149] To which extend such flood metaphors are used in the representation of Poles, Nigerians or Chinese is recorded in the *Flood* category.

A special form of metaphor is the grammatical metaphor or a nominalised structure (e.g. The Irish harassed the Polish worker. vs. The harassment of the Polish worker.) Nominalised structures allow for the omission of agency, and even when the agent is mentioned in a by-construction (The harassment of the Polish worker by the Irish), it is presented as less important by backgrounding the agent. What is more, such a structure also encourages the reader to accept it as fact rather than a process. The effect of omitting or backgrounding the agent is equally true for passive constructions. In both realisations of meaning responsibility can be concealed, which is an indicator for a negative realisation. However, not all nominalised or passive structures are categorically negative. Hence, they need to be considered as one of a number of indicators, particularly when backgrounding of agency is used systematically.[150] Other realisations of metaphors are stock phrases, which often reflect the ideological position of the writer,[151] metaphorical framing i.e. representing the nation as a family or container of limited

[148] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 129-30. Quotation p. 129
[149] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 69 For the creation of a crisis cf. HALL (1981)
[150] FAIRCLOUGH (1995), p. 26
[151] Stock phrases "are short fixed expressions that become well known to an audience and evoke certain reactions of emotions usually as a result of association." BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 72-3

capacity, personifications and metonymy.[152] Not all of these realisations can be discussed in detail here since their interpretation often depends on the context. Some other commonly applied rhetorical moves are referencing, hedging, expediency arguments and euphemisms.

References are generally important for creating cohesion in a text through the use of pro-forms. In relation to this study, they carry particular importance because they are a way of realising identity. People usually identify themselves with their social group opposed to other ones; in other words, the dichotomy of *self* and *other*. The use of the inclusive *we* often signifies an identification of the writer with a group with which he or she shares common beliefs and attitudes. These beliefs and attitudes do by no means have to be negative. An NGO activist could well identify herself with the minority group using the pronoun *we*. Such a use of *we* does in turn imply an opposition to *them* – those who do not share the same beliefs and attitudes. The opposition of *us* and *them* does not always have to represent the minority group in a negative light. Van Dijk, though, does identify a typical pattern of derogation of the out-group and celebration of the in-group. This shows how important it is to investigate the position of the writer in discourse.[153]

Bloor & Bloor attribute importance to hedging, which is "a linguistic avoidance of full commitment or precision". Hedging is often realised by using approximators such as *roughly, approximately*, modals such as *may, might, could* or verbs like *think, believe* etc. Although Bloor & Bloor present hedging mainly in the context of politeness, i.e. in situations in which the speaker or writer expresses a degree of uncertainty, it should also be considered in this study. The use of hedging decreases the degree of directness; it makes statements "less bold". Hence it could also be employed by politicians or journalists to make statements about immigrants even though they do not know the full details, or they may consciously try to dilute a very harsh statement. In analogy to this interpretation of hedging, euphemisms should also be considered as a way of realising negative utterances in a more positive tone.[154]

The above excursion into rhetorical devices is by no means exhaustive. The section on racism for example shows further devices that are often found in newspaper reporting on immigrants. I include these considerations on rhetoric as an encouragement to the analyst to critically question the use of style, register, syntax etc. in the evaluation of articles.

[152] For a more detailed discussion of metaphors cf. BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 69-84; BLOOR and BLOOR (2004), pp. 126-130; FAIRCLOUGH (2001), pp. 99-100
[153] For a discussion of reference cf. DIJK (2009), p. 78-9; BLOOR and BLOOR (2004), pp. 20-3
[154] For hedging cf. BLOOR and BLOOR (2004), pp. 103-4

4 Newspapers as one form of the mass media

In the methodology chapter I explained that this study is carried out within the field of constructivist approaches to media analysis and that it attempts to delineate how the media construct images of immigrants in Ireland. A definition of what the term media comprises is owed. On the other hand, every attempt to find *the* definition of the media is bound to fail because of the manifold uses in various academic disciplines and in non-academic environments. In the following section I will very briefly give an overview of different approaches to the term media and try to arrive at *a* definition of how the media are to be understood within this study.

The Latin word *medium* denotes either *the middle, the public, an audience* or *the common good*, and *medius*, amongst other definitions, refers to *a mediator* or *middleman*. Hence, in its very basic meaning, the term media describes a mediator with the public or a means of communication.[155] The mass media (as opposed to earlier forms of media) are directed at a large unknown and fragmented audience. Therefore, face to face communication does not take place and the reciprocal model of conveying a message from the sender to the receiver through a channel or medium does no longer apply as this model suggests that there is a feedback function from the receiver to the sender.[156] In a widely accepted definition of mass communication, Maletzke differentiates between direct and indirect communication, reciprocal and uni-directional communication and between private and public communication: mass communication is public, indirect and uni-directional communication that employs technical means of distribution and is directed at a disperse audience.[157] Harry Pross differentiates between primary, secondary and tertiary media. Primary media are means of communication between people (and even animals) without technical means. Secondary media employ technical means for their production but not for their reception. Tertiary media require technical means for their production and their reception.[158] In reaction to these definitions, two points are raised.

First, as discussed earlier, the arrival of new media opens up new opportunities for receivers to give (instant) feedback to senders i.e. members of the media. Social media (Twitter, Facebook etc.) or functions of streaming apps for mobile devices allow listeners, viewers or

[155] Cf. BREITSPRECHER and HAU (1987), p. 612-3; Fernuni Hagen; MEYEN (2005)
[156] For the sender-receiver model cf. for example DITTMAR (2010), p. 20
[157] Cf. DITTMAR (2010), p. 37
[158] Cf. ifs Dortmund; DITTMAR (2010), p. 38

readers to let the sender know whether they like a song, a programme or an article, for example. Furthermore, they can express wishes of what they would like to have included in future programmes. For those consumers who access the media through a computer or a mobile device, this feedback can be given instantaneously. This new form of reciprocal communication does not replace face to face communication but it does open a return channel and therefore qualifies the uni-directionality in Maletzke's definition, albeit to a limited extent (yet).

Second, the technical means of distribution is a recurring feature of most definitions of the media. They refer to newspapers, broadcasting, cinema, and compact discs etc., which were traditionally considered the media in general following a narrow interpretation of the term. However, the limitation to technical means conceals the institutions that pursue economic and sometimes political interests.[159] Lorimer postulates that

> [i]n examining the context in which these modern technologies have developed, together with their particular properties, we gain a sense of the role of technology itself in the functioning of the various mass media.[160]

Beyond providing information and leisure to the audience,[161] the media also have a control and critique function as well as a socialising function by "mediating values, norms and patterns for social roles, they inform social principles [Leitbilder] and thus contribute to social change." When Meyen goes on to explain that the media have an integrating function by providing a sense of belonging to certain groups[162], this also means that the media can have an excluding function by contributing to a sense of not belonging to certain groups. This development of Meyen's definition seems particularly important in this study. However, I want to go even further. According to Foucault, the media are part of the multitude of societal actors through which power is exercised in a society. The media provide a place for the production of discourse, which shapes objects and forms social identities, but also produces knowledge and thereby informs truth (cf. p. 18). Consequently, the media do not only have an orientation function, they are of fundamental importance in shaping who we are and how we see the world.

Building on the above consideration on what the media are, I suggest the following definition of newspapers for this research project:

> (Print) newspapers as one form of the mass media and thus a subset of mass communication provide information, leisure and signs through public and indirect communication directed at a disperse

[159] Cf. LORIMER (1994), pp. 21-5; DITTMAR (2010), pp. 34-5; ifs Dortmund
[160] LORIMER (1994), p. 27
[161] LORIMER (1994), p. 21, MEYEN (2005)
[162] MEYEN (2005), quote p. 131, (My translation).

> audience that has very limited means of reciprocal communication. As a product of and by providing a place for discourse they are one societal actor through which power is exercised, truth is produced and through which we and our view of the world is shaped.

The very idea that discourse forms objects and shapes the world comprises some of the ideas discussed earlier. Therefore, the explicit inclusion of, for example, the role of institutions or the including / excluding function of the media is not necessary in this definition. They are rather consequences of the constitutive nature of discourse and the diffuse nature of power in Foucault's ideas. Last, a terminological comment: throughout the remainder of the study I will use the terms newspapers, the print media or the media in a synonymous way. All of these terms will refer to the print editions of newspapers as one form of the mass media unless otherwise stated.

4.1 Effects of reporting in the media

My rather simplistic and general assertion that newspapers matter (see below) is a crude generalisation of an extensive field of research that does not produce clear-cut results. Although there is no doubt that the media have effects on recipients, opinions on how far reaching these effects are vary greatly. Scholars like Elihu Katz argue that the media only have a limited effect on recipients and place a great deal of emphasis on the active reader and the role of personal influence in the opinion forming process. According to this argumentation, media effects are attenuated by very selective media reception caused by cognitive dissonance. If the reader is confronted with a media report that makes him or her uncomfortable, he or she may ignore it, relativise it or try to reinterpret it so that it becomes easier to accept. Moreover, the way the media are perceived depends on variables such as the recipient's age, family background or political orientation. In respect of personal influence it is argued that personal conversations, ideally with opinion leaders (people who are experts in a field), have a far greater influence on our opinions and actions than media reports.[163]

On the other hand, there are those academics who believe that the media have a far greater influence. As noted earlier, Foucault suggested that the media are one social unit[164] amongst others through which power is exercised and our view of the world is shaped. This, of course, attributes a quite prominent role to the media. Apart from Foucault, it seems safe to say that academics who are members of or are influenced by the Birmingham school (of Cultural

[163] Cf. LIVINGSTONE (1997); BURKART (2003)
[164] I purposely avoid the term actor as this would contradict Foucault's understanding of discourse shaping social beings.

Studies) attribute a great deal of power to the media. Stuart Hall's *Policing The Crisis: Mugging, the State and Law and Order*[165] is but one prominent example for the work carried out in this field. It comes as no surprise that this study follows the latter tradition.

The common denominator in respect of the varying views on media effects is, however, that the media have some influence on recipients. In this regard, the seminal work carried out by McCombs and Shaw showed that the media shape public opinion not by telling readers what to think, but by telling readers what to think about.[166] The idea that the media have an effect on what recipients think about originates in the Agenda Setting theory, which in turn had its origins in the Chapel Hill study by McCombs and Shaw in 1972. The researchers compared the importance that was given to certain election campaign topics by 100 registered voters to the coverage in the local media in the 1968 presidential election campaign. They concluded that "[...] the evidence in this study that voters tend to share the media's composite definition of what is important strongly suggests an agenda-setting function of the mass media."[167] Since the publication of the Chapel Hill study in 1972 the Agenda Setting theory has become an established field within communication studies, which, arguably as a result of this, is also coined by various methodological and theoretical approaches.[168] Nevertheless, three variants of the model have emerged.

The awareness model assumes that recipients notice certain issues only because the media have reported on them. Second, media salience assumes that readers base the importance that they attach to an issue on the perceived public importance, which, amongst other factors, is influenced by the frequency of coverage of a certain issue in the media. Third, the priority model assumes that the hierarchy of issues in the media is reflected in the hierarchy that recipients ascribe to the issues.[169]

In respect of this study, the second model seems to be particularly important as the frequency of topics is regarded as an indicator of its importance. The problem with this approach is that there is no ultimate proof for its validity. Eichhorn offers two alternative explanations of why the salience model seems plausible. The first is the assumption that recipients are influenced by subconscious processes. This hypothesis is supported by findings

[165] HALL (1981)
[166] Cf. for example BURKART (2003) or EICHHORN (2005), p. 3
[167] MCCOMBS and SHAW (1972), p. 184
[168] EICHHORN (2005), p. 8
[169] Cf. EICHHORN (2005), p. 15 and BURKART (2003), p. 7

in cognitive psychology that the more an assertion is reiterated the more it is assumed to be important. Alternatively, he writes, the recipient may possess a naive theory of the role of mass media and assume that an issue is more important if it is frequently covered in the media.[170] This view is further supported by Hargreaves:

> As a general rule it is far more likely that the media contribute to attitude formation by repeated patterns of representation – significant aspects of which may impact in unconscious ways – rather than through spectacular one-off impact events.[171]

Even before McCombs and Shaw established the idea that the media influence what people think about, Galtung and Ruge's seminal essay on newsworthiness of 1965 examined how events become news. They introduced a set of 12 factors that contribute to events making the news and are "nothing but common-sense perception psychology translated into radio-scanning and event-scanning activities."[172] The newsworthiness theory has been reinterpreted numerous times in the almost 50 years since its first publication. However, most recent factors are linked, more or less directly, to the original ones introduced by Galtung and Ruge, which are:[173]

1) Frequency

The underlying idea in the frequency factor is that "the more similar the frequency of the event is to the frequency of the news medium, the more probable that it will be recorded as news by that news medium". They employ the example of murder to illustrate this point. A murder takes place in a very short time, so short indeed that a meaningful story can be told between the publications of two subsequent issues of a newspaper. Events that extend over a longer period though have a slimmer chance of making it into the news unless an event presents "some kind of dramatic climax".[174]

2) Threshold (absolute intensity, intensity increase)

The threshold factor means that there is a threshold that the event will have to pass in order to be recorded in the news at all.

3) Unambiguity

An event must be unambiguous – it should be of such a nature that there is only one or a very limited number of meanings. Events with a clear interpretation are preferred to ambiguous ones which allow for a variety of inconsistent interpretations.

[170] EICHHORN (2005), pp. 15-6
[171] Hargreaves (2001), p.27. Quoted in HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2009), p.4
[172] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), quotation p. 6
[173] Cf. for example MCGREGOR or Greer's comparison in GREER (2007), p. 27
[174] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), pp. 66

4) Meaningfulness (cultural proximity, relevance)

Meaningfulness, in Galtung and Ruge's own words, relates to "some measure of ethnocentrism": Culturally close events have a higher chance of being picked up than the culturally distant ones as they carry some form of meaning for the target audience.[175]

5) Consonance (predictability, demand)

Consonance means that one expects something to happen and therefore creates "a mental matrix for easy reception and registration of the event if it does finally take place". The authors argue that in this sense news are actually olds because they merely fulfil preconceived expectations.[176]

6) Unexpectedness (unpredictability, scarcity)

This sixth hypothesis complements the fourth and fifth. Whereas meaningfulness and consonance merely define a pool of possible topics for selection, the more unexpected candidates sourced from this pool have the highest chance of being selected as news. Galtung and Ruge define unexpectedness as events that deviate from regular and institutionalised processes or are rare events.

7) Continuity

As the title suggests, continuity comprises the expectation that once an event has made it into the news, it will stay there for some time. The authors suggest a self-confirming function here. An event has to stay in the news for some time in order to justify having chosen it in the first place.

8) Composition

With the eighth hypothesis, composition, Galtung and Ruge refer to the content of a newspaper front page, for example. In order to present a balanced composition, which is carefully designed with the target audience in mind, a piece of news may have to pass a lower threshold value if no other piece of news within the same category is available. Again, they use an example to illustrate this point. If there are already a number of foreign news items, a domestic news event will have a high chance of being included even if it is below the threshold that would be applied if there were fewer international items.[177]

These eight factors, as Galtung and Ruge argue, are culture-free as they universally apply to different cultures in different places. On the other hand, there are also culture-bound factors that are particularly important in the process of events becoming news in the north-western societies: [178]

9) Reference to elite nations

10) Reference to elite people

[175] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), pp. 66-7, citation p. 67
[176] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), p. 67
[177] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), pp. 66-7
[178] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), pp. 70-1

Elite people can be used to tell stories about everybody and serve as objects of identification to such an extent that ordinary people do not have the chance to represent themselves. Galtung und Ruge's assumption is that the same applies to elite nations.

11) Reference to persons

In terms of reference to persons, the authors suggest two theses: Either news items present events as the outcome ("sentence") of a person's actions or, following structural argumentation, events are presented as the outcome of social forces, "as the outcomes of the society which produced them". Following from this, they suggest five factors that produce personification: (1) Personification as an outcome of cultural idealism is the result of an act of free will. (2) Personification serves as an object of identification, and persons can more easily serve as a field of projection for positive or negative identification. (3) Persons' actions fulfil the frequency criteria. (4) Personification can be a result of elite concentration and (5) personification goes hand in hand with modern technology. The example they use is that it is easier to take a photo of a person than of a structure.

12) Reference to something negative

The final point that Galtung and Ruge make is that negative news are preferred to positive news. Again, they support this factor with a number of arguments: (1) Negative news satisfy the frequency criterion better as the event is shorter and easier to interpret. (2) Negative news are more easily accepted, consensual and unambiguous. (3) Negative news meet the consonance criterion better as they fulfil latent or manifest needs, and (4) negative news are often more unexpected.[179]

The newsworthiness theory can generally be considered as accepted. Even critics of the theory do not disregard this approach entirely but concede that it is one factor amongst others in the news selection process.[180] In conclusion, newsworthiness helps explain why events make it into the news and why the media deem them relevant for publication. Furthermore, the model explains why such events stay in the news for a period of time. This, in turn, supports the underlying assumption in this study that the frequency of events appearing as news is fundamental in analysing how immigrants are represented.

In addition to the newsworthiness theory, Eichhorn's reference to symbolic crises, helps explain why certain topics receive particular attention at certain points in time. According to the categorisation of issues, symbolic crises are longer lasting problems that are elevated to crisis status by the media for a limited period of time.[181] At those times, public awareness is directed at these topics, and the more often they become the focus of media attention, the more important topics are regarded by readers.

In summary, the approach taken in this study is one that assumes that the media have a strong influence on recipients and society at large, but it does not aim to reveal which specific

[179] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), pp. 68-70
[180] SHOEMAKER (2006)
[181] EICHHORN (2005), p. 9

effects media coverage invokes in readers. Instead, this study sets out to identify constructed images of immigrants in the Irish print media, which, following the strong media effects approach, are expected to shape people's opinions on immigration (in some way). High frequencies of negative reporting on immigrants are expected to contribute to the formation of negative attitudes towards immigrants in society, although the possibility that the opposite effect is triggered in critical readers is not excluded – as Früh argues, context is vital.[182]

4.2 Newspapers matter!

This section will explain why newspapers were made the subject of research despite generally declining circulation figures[183] and an apparent dominance of television and online media. It will also investigate possible strategies for the survival of newspapers.

Already in 2003, a study found that the quality gap[184] between newspaper and television news was widening. While newspapers were improving in quality, television stagnated with researchers finding "glaring differences" between the two.[185] Although this study was carried out in the United States of America, it seems safe to assume that the general trend can be transferred to Europe and even more so to an English speaking country with close cultural and economic ties to the USA. Furthermore, I hold that newspapers give their readers a better chance of participating in the news process. Some TV (and radio) programmes allow call-ins by their audience but viewers' or listeners' contributions are usually limited by restricted time slots. Moreover, such contributions very rarely have the chance of sparking a debate that stretches over an extended period of time since contributors are usually asked to voice their opinion on a very specific topic that is only discussed once. Although audience input has become easier and more widespread through the use of social media sites like Facebook or Twitter, such contributions by viewers and listeners are mostly of a rather entertaining nature and hardly contribute to reflected and controversial debates on contested topics. Newspapers, on the other hand, give readers the opportunity to submit in-depth contributions in the form of letters to the editor. Whereas not all letters are of a high standard, the better ones can start a debate that extends over several newspaper issues. Particularly *The Irish Times* is frequently

[182] Cf. FRÜH (2007), p. 48
[183] Cf. for example National Newspapers of Ireland
[184] The researchers "matched more than 2,200 stories in newscasts and newspapers to core news standards derived from the Society of Professional Journalists' Code of Ethics. [...] The study did not address fundamentally important but difficult-to-quantify measures of news quality [... but ...] looked at the basic structure of news, such as the importance of the topics chosen, the level of context, the potential of a story for wide impact on local residents and fairness." MCMANUS (2003)
[185] MCMANUS (2003)

employed by academics, politicians, activists and interested citizens as a place of exchange on contested topics, and these debates are an integral part of this study.

The internet has extended participatory practices a great deal as well. A sheer endless number of blogs, opinion boards or information sites such as Twitter make 'news' accessible at the blink of an eye – a process which is accelerated by the spread of mobile devices, which make 'news' accessible very shortly after they have happened. Nevertheless, there are a number of factors that set (quality) newspapers apart – particularly within the scope of this study. First, in 1997, and to some extent in 2000, the internet existed in a different form. Facebook, for example, was only founded in 2004, and Twitter has been around since 2006. Therefore, newspapers still played a more important role in the early years of the World Wide Web although *The Irish Times* and *Irish Independent* websites have been in existence since the mid-1990s.

Second, over the time span of this study, further differences between the internet and printed newspapers emerged. Therefore, some of the arguments presented here are in hindsight, but I hold that they are valid arguments as they confirm my original stance on the potential of newspapers. The quality of information produced by Twitter etc. often leaves a lot to be desired. The authors of an article in the German weekly *Die Zeit* argued that internet participation has produced a debating culture that is characterised by hysteria. Before the digital revolution, they argue, the media acted as a filter through careful research and fact checking before articles or letters to the editor were published.[186] In a similar fashion, Edo Reents argued that real time journalism as employed even by online versions of respectable newspapers bombards readers with trivial information in the coverage of important events. The accumulation of obsolete information, he writes, is a symbol of journalists failing their obligation to filter and prioritise important information.[187] I hold that this is where print versions of newspapers are still different from information networks or even from newspapers' own web sites and the accompanying commentary sections. This view is supported by Harcup, "Newspapers may increasingly be left to provide background or analytical copy about a news event that has already broken previously on television, radio or the web."[188] On the other hand, this evaluation is only valid as long as newspapers still find buyers and / or are either able to challenge or to incorporate new media.

[186] PAUER (2013)
[187] REENTS (2013) Reents discussed the coverage of President Obama's visit to Berlin in the German media
[188] HARCUP and O'NEILL (2001), p. 277

Incorporating the internet means that most newspapers now offer part of their content online free of charge. According to analysts of Vizeum, the future success of newspapers partly depends on the differentiation of free content that is published online and in the print version. They cite the example of the *Daily Mail,* whose online version presents different content, but which nevertheless saw an increase in the readerships in 2012 of both the online and the print versions. Irish broadsheets, on the other hand, offer a great deal of their print content online. In 2012, the *Irish Independent*, for example, saw a 7 per cent decline in print readers as opposed to an increase of unique monthly users of their online content by 40 per cent.[189]

The Irish Times embraces these challenges by utilising the opportunities that digital media offer and strengthening the importance of well researched, investigative journalism with the "The story of Why" advertisement campaign: "And just when you think you have seen it all, Why can bring you somewhere beautiful, Why goes wherever the story leads, and never ever quits."[190] This paper was also the first Irish newspaper to introduce a social reader, which allows Facebook users to recommend *Irish Times* online content to their friends on the social network. Moreover, an epaper version of the newspaper for which readers have to pay is also available (the *Irish Independent* offers an epaper as well). Hence, there is potential for the survival of good-quality print versions of newspapers in a different guise. Digital pay plans are increasingly adopted even by small and mid-sized papers as early evidence from a United States review shows.[191] In Ireland too there are signs that the route adopted by *The Irish Times* may prove successful in the future. Against the backdrop of falling numbers of readers of the print version, *The Irish Times* noted a 20 per cent increase in readers of *The Irish Times ePaper* to 2,747 and another 2,200 readers accessing the newspaper through a Kindle device.[192] For both services readers have to pay a subscription fee.

Furthermore, the results of a study on media usage in Germany suggested that television is still the medium that most people rely on when looking for information. However, the study also showed that results varied when they were looking for specific information. For example, newspapers were named as the most important medium in respect of accessing regional information, and respondents were found to complement individual pieces of information through cross media usage in order to grasp the bigger picture.[193] Although the results for

[189] Vizeum (2012), pp. 17-20
[190] Taken from *Irish Times* Youtube video *The Irish Times*
[191] EDMONDS (2013)
[192] HANCOCK
[193] Cf. HASEBRINK and SCHMIDT (2012)

Germany can certainly not be transferred to an Irish context without adaption, this study confirms the view that media users do not rely on isolated information provided by one member of the media. Television's strength is "politainment"[194] – the presentation of political topics in an entertaining and engaging way – but users then resort to newspapers to obtain an in-depth view on an issue because a more structured approach to topics is taken in comparison to television, which has more of a short-term spot light effect.[195]

In summary, there can be little doubt that newspapers still offer well researched, reliable content. However, in the future,

> [...] the real winners will be the newspapers that grasp the crucial difference in how news is consumed across media and devices. Those that provide cross media news solutions, bespoke to the medium or device (that compliment rather than steal from each other) will be ahead of the game.[196]

There are good reasons why this study (still) investigates the representation of immigrants in the print versions of newspapers (see above). Future studies of this kind, however, may or will have to take into consideration these new forms of media content presentation. The challenges ahead lie in the questions of whether contents differ in form of presentation only or whether the actual content is different as well.[197] Furthermore, new participatory practices such as Facebook or Twitter may have to be taken into account. Nevertheless, in the time span considered in this study, newspapers formed an important part of Ireland's media landscape, and in terms of cultural practices, matter greatly.

4.3 Irish newspapers: Historical context

In 1737 the oldest newspaper still in existence in the English speaking world, the *Belfast News-Letter*, was first published and initially appeared twice a week.[198] The *Freeman's Journal*, Ireland's oldest nationalist paper, was published in Dublin from 1763 to 1924, when it was incorporated into the *Irish Independent*. The oldest provincial paper, the *Limerick Chronicle*, was founded in 1766[199] and is still published as a sister paper of the *Limerick Leader* today. However, only in the first half of the 19th century did newspapers become an early form of a mass medium. More than 150 periodicals were established during that time, but many did

[194] HALLENBERGER (2013), p. 73
[195] BURKART (2003), p. 7
[196] VIZEUM (2012), p. 20
[197] My own anecdotal research suggests that for example the *Irish Independent* presents some online versions of print articles in a slightly more sensationalist way i.e. by wording headlines differently.
[198] JOHNSTON
[199] Dates vary: Eddie Holt and Alan O'Day name 1766 as the year of foundation whereas the University of Limerick assumes that the first issue appeared on 11 August 1768. Cf. HOLT (2003); O'DAY (2003); GLUCKSMAN LIBRARY

not survive for long. By the middle of the century, there were about 68 provincial papers although less than half of the population aged 5 and over was literate. However, as literacy rates increased in the latter half of the 19th century and with the introduction of modern transportation systems such as the railway and later motor transport, newspapers spread across the country. By 1879 there were a number of national papers and about 120 regional papers. Most papers had strong political ties, and established Protestant papers were increasingly challenged by nationalist ones. Regional papers in particular had a strong effect on the spread of nationalism as many of their editors were prominent local politicians, and as late as 1931 Eamon de Valera would establish a national daily, the *Irish Press*, as a mouthpiece of his nationalist Fianna Fail party.[200]

After the 1916 Easter Rising the most fervent nationalist voices were muted by the Defence of the Realm Act, which introduced censorship legislation although the mainstream media remained conservative (supporting Home Rule rather than Republicanism) and generally cooperated with the censor's office until its abolishment at the time of the Anglo-Irish Treaty. After Ireland's independence, British titles continued to have a considerable market share in the new state. Censorship, either overt or in the form of self-censorship, was a familiar phenomenon in Ireland until as late as 1994. Attempting to defend Ireland's neutrality in such a way that neither of the opposing sides in World War II ('the emergency') would be favoured,

> both the Emergency Powers Act and the 1939 Offences Against the State Act, which proscribed the IRA (some of whose elements were pro-German) gave the state an extraordinary armoury of emergency powers under which many civil liberties, including the freedom of the press, could be subject to more or less arbitrary limitation.[201]

As a result, the Irish public generally remained uninformed about the proceedings of the war, in particular in relation to contested topics such as the Katyn massacre, and none of the Irish titles had war correspondents in Europe. The ban was lifted after the end of 'the emergency' in May 1945.[202] In the latter half of the 20th century, the print media became less political and broadened their repertoire in the face of competition by radio and television, which had introduced (light) entertainment, including the discussion of former taboo topics, and the coverage of sports to their audiences. The collapse of the Irish Press group in 1995, which had

[200] Cf. HOLT (2003); O'DAY (2003); HORGAN (2001)
[201] HORGAN (2001), loc. 996
[202] HORGAN (2001), loc. 1000-93

affiliations to the Fianna Fail party, is generally accepted as the end of strong newspaper links to political parties in Ireland.[203]

Later censorship acts were not directed at the print media but at broadcasting services. When the RTÉ authority as an intermediary body between the broadcasting services and the state was established in 1960, radio, and from 1961 television, were liberated from direct state control. However, the state built in a measure that would allow it to intervene directly in the operations of the RTÉ authority. Section 31 of the Broadcasting Act 1960 allowed the minister to instruct the authority "to refrain from broadcasting any particular matter or matter of any particular class."[204] Under the impression that the authority did not comply with ministerial directives, the government became increasingly dissatisfied with the way RTÉ covered the Northern Ireland conflict, and eventually the minister dismissed and replaced the authority in 1972. Furthermore, in 1976 Section 31specified:

> Where the Minister is of the opinion that the broadcasting of a particular matter or any matter of a particular class would be likely to promote, or incite to, crime [sic] or would tend to undermine the authority of the State, he may by order direct the Authority to refrain from broadcasting the matter or any matter of the particular class, and the Authority shall comply with the order.[205]

Until 1994 Section 31 was renewed annually without much debate in the Dáil, the Irish parliament, despite the serious limitation of the freedom of the press that this act presented to Irish broadcasters. Primarily aimed at members of Sinn Fein, the political wing of the IRA, this act of censorship prevented any serious investigations and analysis of the background of the 'the troubles', representing the violence "instead as a procession of inexplicable events, unmotivated and irrational." The Broadcasting Act 2001 eventually repealed Section 31 of the 1960 act.[206]

4.4 Irish print media

Considering the size of the country, Ireland (still) has a strong and competitive print media. There are separate markets for dailies and Sunday papers comprising a number of quality papers and tabloids of indigenous and British origin particularly in respect of national papers. Although protectionist measures in form of tariffs on imported newspapers impeded the sale of non-Irish publications between 1932 and 1971,[207] British publications have traditionally held a considerable share of Ireland's newspaper market. This process intensified with the

[203] FOLEY
[204] OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (a), Section 31
[205] OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (b)
[206] Cf. KELLY (2003), quotation p. 180 or HORGAN (2001) and FOLEY
[207] HORGAN (2001), loc. 827

introduction of Irish subsidiaries of British tabloids in the mid-1990s following increasingly lucrative revenues from advertisements that came with the economic boom which Ireland experienced during that time. Against the backdrop of Ireland's and the United Kingdom's shared histories, linguistic and cultural similarities, the presence of British titles in the Irish market is hardly surprising, but this nevertheless presents "a unique situation". Today, roughly one quarter of all dailies and about one third of Sunday papers are non-Irish.[208]

Amongst the indigenous quality papers, the *Irish Independent*, owned by Independent News and Media, is by far the strongest selling daily at a circulation of over 121,120 followed by the *Irish Times* (circulation: 84,201), which is owned by a trust. The *Irish Examiner* is a Cork based daily and belongs to Landmark Media Investments. It sells almost 38,000 copies a day. Since 1988 Ireland has had an indigenous tabloid, the *Irish Daily Star (*circulation: 60,707), which was traditionally the bestselling paper at this end of the market. However, latest circulation figures suggest that it has lost the top position to the Murdoch owned *Irish Sun* (circulation: 65,263), a subsidiary of the British *Sun*. With the *Evening Herald* (circulation: 58,545) Independent News and Media are the only group to offer an evening (tabloid) paper at national level. The remaining two tabloids are British papers. The *Irish Daily Mirror*, a subsidiary of the *Daily Mirror* belongs to the Trinity Mirror group and has a circulation of 54,550, and the *Irish Daily Mail*, an offshoot of the *Daily Mail* (Associated Newspapers), is the smallest tabloid at a circulation of 50,680. In a similar fashion, the Sunday market is also divided between Irish and British titles. The indigenous Sunday papers comprise the *Sunday Independent* (Independent News and Media, quality paper, circulation: 232,494), the *Sunday Business Post* (Key Capital, quality paper, circulation: 38,293) and the *Sunday World* (Independent News and Media, tabloid, circulation: 211,161). The British titles include the *Sunday Times* (News UK, quality, circulation: 98,328), *Irish Mail on Sunday* (Daily Mail and General Trust, tabloid, circulation: 98,484), *The Irish Sun on Sunday* (News Group Newspapers / Murdoch, tabloid, circulation: 58,749) and *The Irish Sunday Mirror* (Trinity Mirror, tabloid, circulation: 41,910).[209]

With five out of eight indigenous daily and Sunday papers (partly[210]) belonging to Independent News and Media (INM), the dominant position of this publishing group becomes

[208] FOLEY
[209] For Audit Bureau of Circulation figures (January to June 2013) cf. for example GUIDER or HANCOCK; Irish Mail on Sunday, Irish Sun on Sunday, Irish Sunday Mirror (July to December 2012): REILLY
[210] INM own four titles outright and hold a share in the *Irish Daily Star*.

apparent and is exemplary of increasing media concentration in the Irish print market. Formerly known as the Independent Group, INM started growing in the 1970s when it acquired interests in Britain, the United States, Germany and Mexico. In fact, more than half of its revenues were generated outside Ireland by the late 1970s.[211] With the acquisition of the *Sunday World* in 1983, the Independent group not only received a substantial share of the Sunday paper market but also bought into Newspread, one of the two major distribution companies in Ireland. By 1991, the Independent group controlled 51 per cent of the Irish market and together with the Press group, the two companies held a 75 per cent share of Ireland's newspaper market.[212] The Irish Press group's mainstay was the *Irish Press*, which was founded by Eamon de Valera in 1931, and was closely attached to the Fianna Fail political party, supporting traditional nationalist views. This group had been in difficulties for a number of years and when the final attempts to save the *Irish Press* by going tabloid failed, the group went into liquidation in 1995.[213] At the same time, the Independent group continued its expansionist strategy in the national and international markets, strengthening its position as a major operator in the domestic and global markets. By 1995, it had added ten Irish regional titles to its portfolio.[214] There are about 100 regional titles in Ireland today, 60 of which have a marked impact in their area of publication because of their circulations and often monopolist positions. The economic boom from the mid-1990s made these traditionally family owned newspapers attractive investments because of prospective revenues from advertisements so that today many of the regional titles are controlled by a handful of publishing companies, underlining the process of media concentration. However, in the wake of the economic recession and generally decreasing circulations, many titles are on the market again.[215]

The circulations of all Irish newspapers started declining from 2007. After experiencing a slight drop in the early 1990s, all indigenous morning dailies managed to increase their circulation during the economic boom. In 2006, the average daily sales of newspapers stood at 163,157 for the *Irish Independent*, 116,950 for *The Irish Times* and 56,814 for the *Examiner*.[216] In the first half of 2013, however, the situation was much bleaker. *The Irish Times* dropped by 9 per cent to 84,201 copies a day compared to the same period a year earlier, the *Irish Independent* by 3.9 per cent to 121,986 and the *Irish Examiner* sold 37,897 copies on average,

[211] HORGAN (2001), loc. 2479
[212] HORGAN (2001), loc. 3134
[213] FOLEY
[214] HORGAN (2001), loc. 3390
[215] Cf. FOLEY
[216] FINFACTS IRELAND

which represented a 5.8 per cent fall.[217] The economic situation of the media groups underlined the precarious state of the print media in Ireland. In August 2013, Independent News and Media faced a debt level of €430 million, forcing the company into a major restructuring programme and prompting the sale of its profitable South African interests. Thomas Crosbie Holdings, owner of the *Irish Examiner*, had gone into receivership, and the *Sunday Business Post* had just left examinership.[218]

Newspapers have seen competition from several sides over the last decades. The establishment of an Irish TV network, RTÉ, in 1961 heralded a new era in the Irish media landscape. Although Irish television found the majority of its viewers in urban areas in the first decade, the service proved highly popular from the start. Particularly Gay Byrne's *Late Late Show* broke taboos and discussed topics that were unheard of in public debate beforehand such as sexual matters but also politics and religion. The programme was

> about the development of a new orthodoxy, which challenged the old, Gaelic and somewhat authoritarian one, or at least constructed an alternative lens through which it might be viewed, and presented that orthodoxy attractively interleaved with a wide variety of traditional, pop and on occasion even classical music.[219]

The popularity of television also materialised in the form of higher advertisement revenues at the expense of newspapers. The print media particularly felt the heat during the first oil crisis, which plunged Ireland into a recession and caused the collapse of the media advertising market. During these economically difficult times, many companies decided to invest their restricted advertising resources in television and radio rather than in newspapers. As a consequence, *The Irish Times*, for example, had to close its *Education Times* which had only come to the market in 1973.[220] Yet, most newspapers survived the 1980s and with the economic boom from the mid-1990s, their circulations increased (see above). By then, there were two TV channels operated by RTÉ, an Irish language service (TG4), a private venture (TV3) and a number of British channels. Nevertheless, the positive prospects were not to last. The more new media became accessible to a major share of the population, the more traditional media lost, especially the print media. All traditional forms of media have felt the influence of new media in recent years and the success of individual industries seems to depend on how well they are able to adapt to and incorporate social media such as Facebook or Twitter or the online offerings of newspapers, radio stations and television such as the RTÉ player or website resources, including

[217] For Audit Bureau of Circulation figures cf. for example GUIDER
[218] GUIDER
[219] HORGAN (2001), loc. 2082
[220] HORGAN (2001), loc. 2471

those available at www.irishtimes.com. Moreover, while some members of the media industry, newspapers in particular, find this transition difficult to master, analysts like Vizeum, an agency connecting the media and companies, suggest that there is further transition underway from media usage on stationary computers to media usage on mobile devices like smartphones or tablet computers. In 2012, half of Ireland's Facebook users accessed the service through a mobile device.[221]

Although television saw a decline in revenue by 8 per cent in 2012, analysts expect that this medium will be able to employ new media in a way that will eventually benefit the industry. Viewers are increasingly using services like Twitter to share their feelings on programmes, and broadcast on-demand is also growing. The situation is similar for radio, which is a very successful medium in Ireland. Here too a switch from terrestrial to streaming is evident. The internet gives listeners a choice from thousands of international radio stations, allowing them to change their listening habits by selecting specific contents. This development presents both chance and threat. On the one hand, Irish radio services employ new media to engage with their audiences in a more direct fashion. On the other hand, internet radio opens the door for thousands of international radio stations, presenting increased competition to indigenous services. In the future, broadcasters and advertisement agencies alike will have to rethink how they can best target their audiences taking new media into consideration (although RTE is in the relatively comfortable position of generating income from a licence fee).[222] Newspapers, on the other hand, find this transition much more difficult as their core business, the provision of news, is under threat.

[221] VIZEUM (2012), p. 22
[222] Cf. VIZEUM (2012), pp. 9-16

5 Corpus compilation

5.1 Newspapers

There were a number of points to consider in the selection process of newspapers to be analysed in this study. Building on the agenda setting theory (cf. ch. 4.1), the first assumption was that those papers with the longest reach have the greatest opinion forming power in the general public as opposed to specialist publications for niche markets catering for an interested, exclusive circle of readers. Consequently, publications with the highest circulation figures should be considered.

Second, this study attempts to arrive at a comprehensive picture of the representation of immigrants in the media. Comprehensive in this context means that the opinion forming power in the largest possible share of the population should be reflected. Therefore, the corpus should extend beyond the traditional academic approach of analysing quality papers and include the tabloid end of the market as well since it seems safe to assume that a large share of working class readers of tabloids would usually refrain from reading a quality paper in addition to the tabloid so that these publications play a fundamental role in forming their opinion on immigration to Ireland. This more inclusive angle also allows for a comparison of the representation of immigrants in different media genres. So far, such an approach was only taken by Haynes, Devereux and Breen, who studied the representation of asylum seekers and refugees in two broadsheets and two tabloids whereas Prieto Ramos's and Mac Éinrí's studies focused on the quality section only.[223]

Third, newspapers have to be comparable in the frequency of their publication to yield reliable results. Although there are statistical means to weigh results if the frequencies of publications differ, this would have gone beyond the scope of this study. For this reason, regional and Sunday papers had to be excluded from the analysis.[224]

Eventually, I arrived at three national newspapers to be discussed in this study: *The Irish Times*, a national quality paper, the *Irish Independent*, a national quality paper with a populist tendency[225] and one national tabloid, *The Irish Sun*. In 1997, the first period considered in this

[223] Cf. HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006); MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a); PRIETO RAMOS (2004)
[224] Most regional Irish newspapers only appear twice or three times a week.
[225] While most academics agree that the *Irish Independent* does have a populist / tabloid tendency, there are no studies to confirm this. It is probably no coincidence that Rosie Meade describes the *Irish Independent* as a

study, the *Irish Independent* [226] and *The Irish Times* had both the highest circulation amongst quality papers and the highest circulation overall at 160,137 and 107,839 respectively.[227] Back issues of the *Irish Independent* were available in the Irish Newspaper Archive (INA) while *The Irish Times* was accessible through the ProQuest Irish Times electronic database.

At the tabloid end of the newspaper market, *The Irish Sun* was the best-selling paper in 1999 at a circulation of 103,000. It was followed by the *Irish Daily Star* (91,811) and the *Irish Daily Mirror* (62,000).[228] Because of its considerably lower circulation, the *Irish Daily Mirror* was excluded outright. In respect of the better selling tabloids the decision was not so easy. Although the *Star* sold fewer copies, it was the only indigenous title in the selection whereas *The Irish Sun* is a subsidiary of the British *Sun*. However, neither paper was available in digital databases. The Irish National Library only held microfiches, and the investigation of four full year periods on microfiche was linked to enormous temporal and financial resources. Moreover, the manual analysis of newspapers on microfiche bore a higher margin of error than the keyword search in digital databases. Consequently, only one tabloid could be selected for analysis if the project was to be feasible. Eventually, the decision was made in favour of *The Irish Sun* because of its considerably higher circulation although this meant including a British paper. On the other hand, although the early years after the introduction of this tabloid to the Irish market were characterised by a large proportion of British editorial content, the share of Irish editorial content grew considerably later. Furthermore, a decision in favour of the *Irish Daily Star* would have meant that two titles belonging to Independent News and Media would have been included in the study. This could have narrowed the spectrum of opinions, which would have compromised the validity of the results. In the following sections, the three titles selected for the study are briefly characterised in addition to the more general description in the previous chapter.

'quality' paper (inverted commas in original). In her article *Mayday, Mayday! Newspaper framing anti-globalizers!* She concludes that the *Irish Independent* framed anti-globalisers and resorted to populist images, which are usually rather associated with the tabloid press. MEADE (2008). Deveroux et al. showed in their study of a stigmatised housing estate in Limerick City that the *Irish Independent* does not generally report in a more positive fashion than tabloids and falls behind the local paper when it comes to the coverage of positive stories on that estate. DEVEREUX, HAYNES and POWER (2011). Also see Harcup and O'Neill's reference to the increasing tabloid agenda of broadsheet newspapers. HARCUP and O'NEILL (2001), p. 274, p. 277

[226] Despite the tabloid tendency the *Irish Independent* will be considered a quality papers throughout this study. Nevertheless, a tabloidisation process will be discussed where necessary.

[227] HORGAN (2001), loc. 4386

[228] HORGAN (2001), loc. 4386. 1997 figures were not available for British titles.

Founded in 1859, *The Irish Times* has a long tradition in the Irish newspaper market. Originally "the [Protestant] voice of Southern Unionism", it now caters for the urban middle class with a "high penetration of the upper socio-economic readership groups."[229] Some even refer to it as "Ireland's unofficial national newspaper of reference [... being] the newspaper of choice for opinion-formers, much of the political classes and a substantial elite readership in the public service and other key sectors."[230] This importance is underlined by academics frequently sourcing information from articles and data published in *The Irish Times* even for academic publications.[231] Its political stance is best characterised as liberal without a clear left or centre-left orientation.[232] In the 1950s, though, its circulation was considerably behind the *Irish Independent's*, the *Irish Press'* and even the *Cork Examiner's* at 35,421, and only "[t]he fact that many businesses in Dublin were Protestant-owned ensured a steady supply of commercial advertising, to an extent probably not warranted by the paper's circulation."[233] In the 1960s this situation was tackled by expanding the paper's reach beyond the Dublin metropolitan area through increased editorial coverage of more remote areas of Ireland. Sales were also boosted by the discussion of contested topics such as divorce, illegitimacy or adoption.[234] Following a policy of expansion and specification from the late 1980s to the mid-1990s, the paper gained both in terms of staff and physical size. International correspondents in the world's major cities further add to strong European and international coverage as well as the quality of coverage although, as Horgan claims, the editorial development also included some increased sensationalism to combat the rising influence of UK papers on the Irish market in the 1990s.[235] While *The Irish Times*' circulation was steadily rising up to the middle of the first decade of the new millennium, (see above), it has considerably lost in recent years, standing at 84,201 in the January to June period of 2013.[236]

Almost 50 years after the foundation of *The Irish Times*, its rival paper the *Irish Independent* was, in 1905, seen as the "voice of the increasingly wealthy, articulate and mildly nationalist Catholic middle class", but it is now serving a readership of "a wider social spectrum."[237] Against the backdrop of difficult economic circumstances in the 1980s it turned

[229] HORGAN (2001), pp. 1 and 168;
[230] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a)
[231] Cf. for example references to *The Irish Times* in LENTIN (2003); FANNING (2012) or LOYAL (2011)
[232] CONWAY (2006) or MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a)
[233] HORGAN (2001), loc. 1485
[234] HORGAN (2001), loc. 2151-66
[235] HORGAN (2001), loc. 3359 or MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a)
[236] Cf. GUIDER or HANCOCK
[237] HORGAN (2001), loc. 85 and loc. 3899

towards a "some would say ruthless – approach to news, and a determination to beat the opposition on all major stories."[238] Additionally, changes in layout and design gave it, at least partially, characteristics that were typical of tabloids. In terms of readership, this policy paid off since it managed to attract young (and female) readers who would previously have read other publications.[239] Its circulation was always above that of *The Irish Times* but in absolute numbers its advance has decreased in recent years.[240] Since Tony O'Reilly and a business partner bought 20 per cent of the shares in 1973, this paper has been part of the Independent News & Media group, which today has a strong presence on the Irish and international markets.[241] Yet, the group did not come through the recession unscathed and at the time of writing faced a heavy debt burden and difficult economic decisions (see above). Since the mid-1990s the strong presence of the group on the Irish market has raised concerns about diversity.[242] Although the paper can no longer be characterised as "a Fine Gael-supporting conservative Catholic newspaper,"[243] by and large it still has a more conservative stance than the liberal minded *Irish Times*.[244]

Originally an import paper, *The Sun* bore the bulk of the increase in the sale of British papers on the Irish market in the 1990s. During that time it contained very little domestic content[245] but this changed in the years after the introduction of *The Irish Sun* in 1996. The paper is geared towards a mass readership mainly originating in the working class.[246] Its content is primarily based on sports, human interest stories, show business and celebrities.[247] There is very limited coverage of public affairs. When the British mother paper, the *Sun*, was established in 1964 it was a broadsheet "with high aspirations and ideals" and aimed at the young and upwardly mobile reflecting lifestyle changes in that decade. Economically, however, the paper was not successful, and in 1969 it was sold to Rupert Murdoch, "who relaunched it as a brash, unashamedly downmarket tabloid." This angle proved successful and sales increased, overtaking the rival *Mirror* in 1978. In the 1980s it was an almost uncompromising supporter of Margaret Thatcher, but later also supported Tony Blair in the general elections of 1997 and

[238] HORGAN (2001), loc. 2486
[239] HORGAN (2001), loc. 2489
[240] NATIONAL NEWSPAPERS OF IRELAND
[241] INDEPENDENT NEWS & MEDIA PLC
[242] HORGAN (2001), loc. 3771
[243] HORGAN (2001), loc. 2208
[244] FOLEY
[245] HORGAN (2001), loc. 3188 and 3809
[246] HORGAN, O'CONNOR and SHEEHAN (2007), pp. 33-4
[247] HARCUP and O'NEILL (2001), pp. 276-7

2001.[248] The Irish edition of the tabloid has experienced considerably falling sales in recent years but proportionally the *Star* was more affected with the *Sun* selling just over 1,000 copies per day fewer than its rival. In the first half of 2009, the difference had been more than 5,000 copies a day.[249]

5.2 Immigrant groups

In chapter 6, I outline that immigration has always been part of Ireland's history. Nevertheless, the number of non-Irish arriving in the country increased a great deal with economic prosperity from the mid-1990s. By the time this study was devised, the number of non-nationals living in Ireland stood at 414,512, representing over 10 per cent of the country's population. As outlined above, this study aims at revealing how immigrants are represented in a society that saw itself as monocultural and homogenous before the large scale arrival of immigrants. Although Irishness defined as monocultural and homogenous is a construction in denial of its past, Irish society has had to adapt to the multicultural character of the country against the backdrop of unprecedented numbers of immigrants arriving in the late 1990s and the first decade of the 21st century. The fundamental assumption thereby was that the effect could best be investigated by analysing the representation of the largest immigrant groups.

The following table gives an overview of the top 10 non-Irish nationals living in Ireland as recorded in the Census 2002 and Census 2006 and the percental change. The Census 2006 data were the most recent ones when this study was drawn up.

[248] Cf. DOUGLAS
[249] NATIONAL NEWSPAPERS OF IRELAND

Nationality	Number		Change (%)
	2002[250]	2006[251]	
UK nationals	103,476	112,548	8.8
Poles	2,124	63,276	2,879.1
Lithuanians	2,104	24,628	1,070.5
Nigerians	8,969	16,300	81.7
Latvians	1,797	13,319	641.2
US nationals	11,384	12,475	9.6
Chinese	5,842	11,161	91
Germans	7,216	10,289	42.6
Filipinos	3,900	9,548	144.8
French	6,363	9,046	42.2

Table 1 – Immigrant numbers by country of origin

The groups in this table can roughly be divided into two categories: traditional and new immigrants. Assuming that traditional immigrants are those who have always had a sizeable representation in Ireland, the first category comprises UK nationals, US nationals, Germans and French with the remaining nationalities belonging to new immigrants. Despite a long standing presence in Ireland, Chinese nationals are categorised as new immigrants because their number was very small up to the late 1990s and because more recent arrivals showed different motives for migration (see section on Chinese immigrants below). Because of the considerably longer migration history of traditional immigrant groups and a perceived cultural closeness with Ireland, these migrant groups shall not be considered in this study.

A closer look at the new immigrant category shows that they can be grouped into regions of origin with Poles, Lithuanians and Latvians representing Eastern Europe, Chinese and Filipinos representing Asia and Nigerians representing Africa. In the introduction to his study on the representation of asylum seekers in the media in Ireland and Spain in the 1990s, Prieto Ramos writes

> [T]he advances made by EU Member States in terms of integration have implied the gradual harmonisation of immigration policies and the consolidation of common perceptions of ethnic otherness among Europeans. Intra-EU migrants have been redefined as members of a supranational 'insider group' of citizens entitled to very similar rights within the 'European social space', while

[250] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (c)
[251] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008b)

> an 'outsider group' of non-EU nationals, largely from less developed countries are perceived as 'fully foreigners' and often suffer social exclusion.[252]

In terms of this study, Prieto Ramos's proposition is interesting for a number of reasons. It should be investigated whether the definition of 'insider group' is reserved for the pre-accession members of the European Union, which are part of the traditional immigrant category as defined above, or whether new members of the European Union are included as 'insiders'. Furthermore, the differential treatment of EU and non-EU nationals could best be tested if members of various source regions are included. Therefore, it is meaningful to include Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in this study although by official statistics Lithuanians and Latvians are more numerous than Chinese nationals. Furthermore, the Census data presumably do not reflect the real number of Chinese in Ireland, which is estimated at between 30,000 and 60,000, making them the second largest immigrant group if the estimates are correct.[253] On the other hand, it is unlikely that figures for EU migrants are inaccurate in the same way as those of Chinese nationals because EU nationals are not at risk of being deported for overstaying. The inclusion of Chinese and Nigerian nationals permits further investigation of whether differences exist between non-EU immigrants and whether these differences can be established apart from the EU / non-EU divide. In the following sections the three immigrant groups to be examined in this project are introduced briefly, giving some information on the situation in the country of origin and motives for migration.

5.2.1 Polish Immigrants

Emigration from Poland has been part of the country's history for centuries for political reasons or because of more promising economic prospects outside the country. Between 1918 and 1939 the new multiethnic state pursued a policy of Polonisation and assimilation of minorities, causing ethnic Germans and ethnic Poles to leave the country. Apart from such political reasons, the poor economic situation in Poland led to an agreement with France which saw 700,000 Polish miners and workers being employed as contract workers in the French Republic. Politically and economically motivated emigration alike "were half-officially perceived as the means of solving internal economic pressure".[254] The years after World War II were coined by the expulsion of ethnic Germans and ethnic Ukrainians, whereas Jews were allowed to emigrate to Israel. Ordinary Poles, on the other hand, saw their right to the freedom of movement heavily restricted due to stringent passport and visa regulations. However, there

[252] PRIETO RAMOS (2004), p. 13
[253] KING-O'RIAIN (2011), p. 207; WANG, p. 1; FELDMAN (2008), p. 55
[254] WEINAR

were periods in which relations with the west were normalising as exemplified in the Warsaw Treaty of 1970. In exchange for the factual acceptance of the then and now western Polish – (East) German border, the Polish government allowed ethnic Germans to join their families outside Poland. Following strikes organised by the Solidarność union that eventually resulted in the declaration of martial law, political dissidents had relatively little problems leaving the country as they were seen as a means of relieving the country of troublemakers. Eventually, this spread to the masses and in total about 1 million people left the country in that period. In addition, there were also contract workers, some of whom overstayed their duration of contract.[255] Due to its lenient policy of accepting ethnic Germans, Germany was the most popular emigration country, followed by the United States "at a distant second place".[256]

Emigration after 1989 has to be differentiated into the periods before and after Poland's accession to the European Union in 2004. With the end of the Soviet Union's direct influence in Poland and the establishment of the third republic in 1989, migration patterns changed. Whereas initially destination countries for long term migration remained the same (Germany, followed by the United States and Canada), permanent migration was increasingly replaced by short term (labour) migration. Germany was still the most popular country with 200,000 documented seasonal agricultural and construction workers seeking work in Poland's western neighbour in 1998. The total number of documented migrant workers in that year was 350,000. With more Poles seeking temporary employment in secondary labour markets, EU countries became more favoured destinations than the geographically distant United States. Yet, it was the EU enlargement in 2004 that "caused one of the biggest emigration flows in Poland's post-war history".[257] Whereas prior to 2006 emigration flows had been varying between 26,300 in 1995 and 18,900 in 2004, 2006 saw this figure more than double to 46,900.[258] The majority went to the United Kingdom and Ireland as these countries (and Sweden) were the only EU15 states that had initially opened their labour markets. By 2011 Poles were Ireland's largest immigrant group ahead of the British who had traditionally taken this role.[259] As the number of Poles emigrating for Ireland and the United Kingdom dropped a great deal in the wake of the economic recession in both countries, other states saw more Poles arriving at their shores. Ongoing emigration in combination with lower return migration and a very small immigrant

[255] Cf. WEINAR
[256] IGLICKA and ZIOLEK-SKRZYPCZAK (2010)
[257] IGLICKA and ZIOLEK-SKRZYPCZAK (2010)
[258] CENTRAL STATISTICAL OFFICE (Poland) (2008)
[259] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 6

population has led to a negative migration balance for Poland.[260] Many of the Eastern European and Asian migrants who enter Poland are on their way elsewhere and regard Poland as a country of transit rather than a place of settlement. [261]

Because of the liberalisation of the political system in the post 1989 era, there have been few Poles seeking asylum in other countries. However, a lack of a proper immigration policy in Poland and ongoing discrimination has led members of the Roma community to seek refuge abroad albeit with little success. The number of Roma who left Eastern Europe between 1997 and 2005 is estimated at between 12,000 and 15,000, although Poland has one of the smallest Roma communities at about 0.05 per cent of the population of the Eastern European states.[262]

Polish migration to Ireland

In the 2006 census Poles were recorded as the largest EU / EEA immigrant group apart from the British with 63,276 living in Ireland on census night 2006.[263] By 2011, their number had almost doubled to 122,585 surpassing the British as the traditionally largest immigrant group in this country, representing a change of 5,671 per cent from 2002. Although other East Europeans arrived in considerable numbers as well, Poles outnumbered them by a great margin. In 2011, the next largest East European group was from Lithuania with 36,683 immigrants.[264]

Two of the major reasons cited by the largely young emigrant cohort are economic disillusionment and limited career prospects in their home country.[265] Despite a generally improving economy in the post 1989 period, which received a major boost by EU structural funds following the country's accession to the European Union and Poland being the only European state to avoid a recession in the 2008-9 downturn, per capita GDP and unemployment are above the EU average.[266] The unstable situation in the Polish job market was named as one of the most decisive factors in the decision making process of immigrant workers surveyed in a study in 2006.[267] Apart from an open labour market, Ireland appealed to many Poles because of an already existing network of friends and family,[268] better financial prospects, the

[260] Cf. CENTRAL STATISTICAL OFFICE (Poland) (2008); CENTRAL STATISTICAL OFFICE (Poland) (2013), p. 622
[261] For emigration from Poland post 1989 cf. WEINAR; IGLICKA and ZIOLEK-SKRZYPCZAK (2010)
[262] Cf. TANNER (2005); IGLICKA and ZIOLEK-SKRZYPCZAK (2010)
[263] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008b), pp. 28-31
[264] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 6
[265] MÜHLAU, KALISZEWSKA and RÖDER (a), pp. 5-6
[266] CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY
[267] KEELEY (2010), pp. 27-8
[268] MÜHLAU, KALISZEWSKA and RÖDER (a), pp. 5-6

opportunity to improve English language skills or because young Poles felt a sense of adventure.[269]

Unsurprisingly, the majority of Poles are working. Although, Poles are employed in a broad range of industries, manufacturing and wholesale, retail trade (including repair of motor vehicles) and accommodation and food industries are the top three fields identified in the 2011 census. While the construction industry had been a major employer of Poles in 2006, the number of Poles active in this field had dropped considerably by 2011. Besides the top three industries, administration, human health and social work activities are also important sectors of employment for Poles.[270] Polish immigrants to Ireland are generally well educated with very few having only primary education. The majority have either completed vocational training or obtained a third level degree. Due to the lack of an exact equivalent in the Irish education system, vocational training is difficult to compare. Although highly professionalised in Poland,[271] it does not qualify as a third level qualification. Therefore, evaluating Poles' educational levels by the relatively lower number of third level degrees produces an inaccurate picture.[272] The high level of education also means that many Poles are employed below their qualifications. Apart from the workforce Poles also formed the second largest group of non-Irish students aged 15 and over.[273]

Slightly more Poles are married than single, but according to a survey carried out in Dublin, not all Polish immigrants have their partner in Ireland. This is particularly true for men. However, a comparison of the census data from 2006 and 2011 reveals a significant shift towards families living with children in the latter, suggesting that family members joined their partners over the five year period. This is in line with findings by the authors of the Polonia study that the earlier gender imbalance (more men than women) is now levelling. In comparison to other nationalities, Poles are least likely to share a household with members of other nationalities. Again, these census data are confirmed by the Polonia study (only covering Poles living in the Dublin area) which finds that sharing accommodation, mostly with friends *or* family or friends *and* family, is very common in the Polish community.[274]

[269] KEELEY (2010), pp. 29-30
[270] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 50; CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008b), p. 91
[271] Cf. for example EUROPEAN UNION
[272] For educational levels cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 52
[273] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 22
[274] Cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a); MÜHLAU, KALISZEWSKA and RÖDER (a)

According to the same report, Poles generally considered their quality of life, working conditions and earnings as positive, particularly when compared to Poles living in Poland. When respondents compared themselves to Irish citizens, the perception was less positive though. Moreover, the earlier respondents had arrived in Ireland the more positive their evaluation was.[275] The generally positive evaluation was confirmed by another study. Yet, already in 2006, this study pointed out some problems that Poles experienced in Ireland. Some of the respondents stated that Irish people blamed them for taking their jobs, that they had the impression that Irish had better access to certain positions or that "when we became more familiar with the Irish reality, we found out that we were paid half of what we should have been paid. We lived in bad conditions".[276] The by and large positive perceptions found in these studies were to some extent countered by recession experiences of Polish immigrants as discussed by the Forum Polonia Convention in 2010. According to their findings, Poles increasingly find it difficult to secure employment, face worsening working conditions, have problems accessing social welfare benefits and there are still limited representations of Polish interests in politics. On the positive side, they named the good integration work delivered by "grassroot" organisations.[277]

There is a host of such organisations both at national and regional level that provide support to the Polish community outside politics ranging from integration work to delivering information on the immigrant community to offering Polish language classes to children of immigrants in weekend schools or organising cultural events. To name just two, there are the Polish Information and Culture Centre in Dublin and the Polish Social and Cultural Association in Dublin.[278] In terms of the media, there are (were) a number of Polish newspapers or Polish language supplements to established Irish newspapers to cater for the Polish community's needs. As Titley and Kerr point out, the weekly *Gazeta Polska*, as one example,

> styled its offices as an advice centre and cultural centre, where Poles can get advice on socio-economic issues, which in turn inform the content of the paper. Similarly, its website has shifted from providing an online version of the paper to a focus on providing a web portal for Polish-oriented services, and the newspaper also runs gazeta.ie, a central network node for Polish services and events in Ireland.[279]

[275] MÜHLAU, KALISZEWSKA and RÖDER (b)
[276] KROPIWIEC and KING-O'RIAIN (2006), citation p. 37
[277] MARCHELEWSKA and FORUM POLONIA
[278] Cf. IMMIGRANT COUNCIL OF IRELAND (2009); THE INTEGRATION CENTRE
[279] TITLEY and KERR (2011), pp. 196-7

Polski Express, a free sheet, on the other hand is aimed at a more exclusive readership of "young urban professionals".[280] These publications survived the recession by adapting to the new socio-economic circumstances. Polish language supplements could be found for example in the *Limerick Leader* or the *Kildare Post*, but only the *Polski Herald*, a weekly supplement of the *Evening Herald*, survived.[281] Although Polish television is available via satellite and cable, not all members of the Polish community have access to it or watch it regularly. Reasons vary from the TV set being occupied by other people sharing accommodation to rental agreements that do not provide cable TV or do not allow the erection of satellite dishes. However, as for other immigrant groups, the internet has made staying in touch with the country of origin a great deal easier than in the pre-internet and social media age. Moreover, apart from medial transnationalism, the availability of cheap air travel between Ireland and Poland and the freedom of movement within the European Union let some migrants consider themselves long distant commuters.[282] At this point, though, it is too early to say how many Poles have adopted Ireland as a permanent home and how many will either return to Poland or move elsewhere.

5.2.2 Nigerian Immigrants

Nigeria had been a British colony for almost 100 years when it gained independence in 1960. In the following nearly four decades before the first free elections were held in 1999, the country saw numerous coups, counter coups and ensuing military governments as well as ethnic and religious tensions amongst some of the more than 250 ethnic groups in the state as well as between Muslims (about 50 per cent of the population) and Christians (about 40 per cent of the population). Nigeria's political structure in federal states reflects both the variety of ethnic backgrounds and the British endeavour to hinder the former colony from growing too strong.[283] Democracy is still developing but the 2009 "elections signified substantial progress in electoral and democratic development, and were characterized by observers as the freest and fairest in the country's election history."[284] Yet, others are more critical as besides the economic situation, human rights and ethnic tensions remain to be considerable push-factors for those who wish or see themselves forced to leave the country. Because of the great number of ethnic groups and at times very different situations in individual federal states, e.g. the Sharia law which is

[280] TITLEY and KERR (2011), p. 197
[281] TITLEY and KERR (2011), p. 197
[282] Cf. TITLEY and KERR (2011); p. 193 and pp. 199-203.
[283] MÜLLNER and SVEC (2004), p. 7
[284] THE WORLD BANK

exercised in 12 northern states, the following can only give a very general overview of the situation in Nigeria.

Human rights violations had been recorded prior to the establishment of democracy in 1999 but have remained to be an issue until today. Examples are the introduction of Sharia law in the north in one third of all federal states following the end of military rule, but also torture and death of people in police custody, a judiciary sector that is only independent on paper and often holds unfair trials or the continued use of Holden Charge, the illegal extension of custody by an administrative judge. Sharia law does not only affect Muslims but also Christians living in areas where it is exercised. Depending on the region, limitations range from the ban on selling alcohol to impeded freedom of religion or girls being required to wear the hijab in school. In respect of gender inequalities, female genital mutilation, forced marriages, restricted access to education, discrimination, inheritance laws and generally patriarchal structures contribute to the discrimination of women despite its ban in the Nigerian constitution.[285] A further source of concern are repeated outbreaks of violence between ethnic and religious groups. However, the ethnic and religious background is often taken as an excuse by those who wish to extend their influence and power employing violent means. Accord lists several incidents in which Muslims and Christians alike lost their lives.[286] Moreover, since 2002 Boko Haram, a Taliban like organisation seeking to overthrow the government and to establish an Islamic state,[287] has carried out attacks against Christians claiming hundreds of lives. Increased professionalisation and the development from a small sect into a "now flexible dynamic organisation capable of changing tactics and targets," prevent the Nigerian government from protecting the people effectively.[288]

The economic situation in Nigeria has improved over the last decade but an insecure investment climate, poor infrastructure and poor governance at state level keep the country from exploiting its position as Africa's biggest oil exporter and holder of the continent's largest natural gas reserves. Despite the oil industry and an ambitious reform agenda that saw strong economic growth between 2003 and 2010, poverty and unemployment remain high and continue to be push factors in the country's migration pattern.[289]

[285] Cf. MÜLLNER and SVEC (2004), pp. 76-87
[286] Accord = Austrian Centre for Country of Origin and Asylum Research and Documentation. Cf. MÜLLNER and SVEC (2004), pp. 51-3
[287] Cf. BBC NEWS AFRICA
[288] FISHER
[289] Cf. THE WORLD BANK

Migration has been a regular feature in Nigeria for many decades. Before independence the "emerging elites" migrated mainly to the United Kingdom and later returned to take up jobs in the oil industry. After independence high skilled migration to the UK and then also the USA continued, but emigrants tended not to return because of the rise of political tensions throughout the 1970s and 1980s. This led to the emergence of a culture of professional migration. In more recent years, however, less educated youths have joined the migration stream. Between 1996 and 2005 Ireland was the most popular country for Nigerian asylum seekers (21,378) followed by South Africa (14,107), Austria (8,244) and France (6,510). During the same time, however, neighbouring Cameroon received 60,380 refugees. Following renewed conflicts, the number of people wishing to seek asylum outside Nigeria rose by 71 per cent from 2007 to 2008. Recognition rates, though, varied greatly. Whereas Canada accepted 62 per cent of applications, Ireland marked the other end of the spectrum at a recognition rate of 0.5 per cent.[290] The number of so called economic migrants cannot be established for certain, because they often take clandestine routes, trusting their lives in the hands of unscrupulous traffickers. The number of Nigerians in North Africa who were found without valid travel documents in 2008 stood at 59,000 and gives an indication for the scope of the diaspora, which also results in large scale brain drain. The World Bank expects that 36 per cent of Nigerians with tertiary education choose to leave the country for higher wages, better job security and generally better career chances. The exact scale of the diaspora is unknown with figures ranging from 3 to 20 million. The United Nations assumes the number of Nigerians living outside the country to stand at 1.13 million with more than 6 out of 10 resettling in other African countries. Although the Nigerian government tries to attract return migrants, it has had little success to date.[291]

Nigerians in Ireland

Before 1996, the number of Nigerians migrating to Ireland was very small but numbers started rising from the mid-1990s.[292] From 2002 Nigerians were the biggest non-European immigrant group in Ireland (apart from US citizens in 2002). In 2006, there were 16,300 Nigerians living in the country and by 2011 this number had increased moderately to 17,642.[293] Nigerians have long topped the list of asylum seekers, but due to increasingly restrictive asylum legislation, the absolute number of applicants has dropped considerably in recent years.[294]

[290] Cf. MBERU and PONGOU (2010)
[291] Cf. MBERU and PONGOU (2010)
[292] INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), p. 6
[293] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 6
[294] Data available at OFFICE OF THE REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER

Reasons for Nigerians seeking refuge in Ireland include English as a shared language and long standing ties between the countries with Irish missionaries, teachers, NGOs and religious run schools having a long history in Nigeria, shaping the perception of Ireland as a welcoming country.[295] The acceptance rate of Nigerian asylum seekers has recently been pronouncedly low at 0.6 per cent. However, more than 6000 Nigerians were granted leave to remain in the state under the 2005 IBC scheme.[296] Nigerians' chance to obtain work permits remained very slim throughout the time span of this study, reflecting stricter regulations in recent years. In 2002 there were 54 new permits issued and 33 renewals, but this had dropped to 20 new permits and 39 renewals by 2010.[297]

Most Nigerians are Christians but there is also a not insignificant number of Muslims, and Nigeria's main ethnic groups are also represented in Ireland's Nigerian immigrant community (Yoruba, Igbo, Edo).[298] There is a dominance of Nigerians in their thirties and one of the highest marriage rates of immigrant groups in Ireland. Therefore, it comes as no surprise that a very clear majority of Nigerians live as family with children. Despite their good education,[299] the unemployment rates of Nigerians were high both in 2006 and 2011.[300] For every 1.8 Nigerians at work, there was one unemployed Nigerian. For Poles and non-Irish in general the ratio was 3.9 to 1. In contrast to the high unemployment rate, the allocation to socioeconomic group reveals that only 2 per cent of Nigerians are unskilled. This compares to 8.6 per cent for Poles and 2.3 per cent for Chinese. In fact, almost one third of Nigerians indicated that they belonged to non-manual or professional sectors, which is not far off the figures for Poles and Chinese. The top three industrial groups amongst Nigerians are human health and social work activities, wholesale and resale trade and construction. In 2006, one in five was a professional with 6 per cent being doctors.[301] Nigerians also formed the fourth largest group of non-national students aged 15 years and over.[302] On the other hand, this figure masks the fact that asylum seekers, which many Nigerians are, have no access to post-second level education (also see ch. 9.1).

[295] FELDMAN (2008); LOYAL (2011), p. 30
[296] INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), p. 9
[297] DEPARTMENT OF JOBS
[298] INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), pp. 12-3
[299] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 108
[300] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (i), p. 17
[301] Cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008b); CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[302] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (b), p. 21

The living conditions of Nigerians greatly depend on their legal status as the following quote by a Nigerian professional illustrates:

> One Nigerian health professional noted that his experience of arrival and settlement could not have been more different from that of asylum seekers, and commented that settling is almost impossible if one does not arrive as a professional.[303]

Asylum seekers in the direct provision system are accommodated in reception centres and eligible to a small weekly allowance.[304] As a consequence of the extremely limited financial resources and the design of the direct provision scheme, studies have shown that asylum seekers suffer from boredom, social exclusion, and, in the case of children in particular, under material deprivation and poverty.[305]

The very clear majority of Nigerians in Ireland live in towns and cities with only four per cent living in rural areas.[306] According to a report by the Organisation for Migration, the Nigerian community is one of the best established immigrant communities in Ireland. Nigerians engage in migrant community organisations, have established churches, and are active in academia and journalism but also in business and medicine.[307] In 2013 founder and editor in chief of Metro Eireann, Chinedu Onyejelem, was awarded the David Manley Media Award[308], and Nigerians are also active in (local) politics. Although immigrants generally rarely represent the Irish people at local and national level, there are some notable exceptions with Rotimi Adebari, for example, being elected as Mayor of Portlaoise in 2007.[309] There is also early evidence that Nigerians are starting to establish themselves in professions such as banking, accountancy and legal professions.[310]

There are a number of immigrant led organisations representing either the interests of Africans in Ireland generally or of Nigerian immigrants specifically (e.g. Africa Centre, African Cultural Awareness Project, AkiDwA or Nigeria Association Network Ireland). These organisations offer a host of services ranging from the provision of information, to the planning of community events or education and challenging stereotypes.[311] Nigerian churches in Ireland

[303] FELDMAN (2008), p. 66
[304] € 19.10 per adult per week and € 9.60 per child per week
[305] Cf. NWAGWUAGWU (2011), pp. 4-5
[306] INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), p. 10
[307] Cf. INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), pp. 7-8
[308] Cf. BUSINESS & LEADERSHIP
[309] Cf. for example DEFAOITE
[310] INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), p. 8
[311] Cf. IMMIGRANT COUNCIL OF IRELAND (2009)

provide similar services but overcome ethnic divisions. Churches and migrant led groups as well as friends and family have replaced the traditionally important specialist NGOs as sources for information for Nigerians.[312]

The media play an important role in Nigerians' lives in Ireland. The best known newspaper is probably the weekly multicultural *Metro Eireann*, catering for various immigrant groups. The *African Voice* is a monthly multicultural paper that also caters for various immigrant groups. However, respondents in the IOM study stated that they were more aware of Nigerian and African media not produced in Ireland. This explains the popularity of Nigerian TV programmes that are widely available. However, Feldman et al. found that 99 per cent of respondents in a study stated that they watch Irish or British TV on a daily basis.[313] Social media and the internet in general help stay in touch with friends and family and keep informed about the situation in Nigeria.[314] In comparison to other immigrant groups, Nigerians were particularly likely to use the telephone, text messages, e-mail more than 7 times a month to stay in touch with friends and family in Nigeria. At the same time, Nigerian respondents were most likely to never have visited relatives in the home country since their arrival in Ireland.[315] That there are no direct flights between Ireland and Nigeria, and that flights are usually more expensive than within the European Union might be contributing reasons.

5.2.3 Chinese Immigrants

From the late 1950s, China saw the Great Leap, Mao Zedong's unsuccessful attempt to modernise China's economy between 1958 and 1960, and the Cultural Revolution, Zedong's struggle to revive the revolutionary spirit in China. But only after his death in 1976 did economic reforms start to come into effect. Today, China is the world's most populous country and has its fastest growing economy, representing "a second industrial revolution".[316] Despite and because of China's economic development there are a number of factors encouraging migration, particularly among the young and educated adult population aged 16-34.[317] Human rights violations are still a major issue in modern China, an emerging middle class seeks international education for their offspring, the young and educated see better prospects outside

[312] INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), p. 15
[313] FELDMAN (2008), p. 153
[314] INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION (2010), pp. 16-8
[315] FELDMAN (2008), pp. 150-2
[316] Cf. BBC NEWS ASIA
[317] Cf. LATHAM and WU (2013)

China and a massive shortage of labour in the industrial centres has led to enormous internal migration.

Although there have been legal reforms, those advocating human rights still fear police harassment, detention, imprisonment or forcible commitment to psychiatric facilities. China is leading the world in the number of annual executions estimated at between 5,000 and 8,000, and confessions under torture are not unknown. For the population at large, the freedom of expression is heavily restricted with the internet being censored and social media such as *Facebook* or Y*ouTube* being unavailable in China. On the other hand, "Sina Weibo, the largest of China's social media microblog services, gives 300 million subscribers space to express opinions and discontent to an extent previously unavailable."[318] At the same time, there is press censorship and journalists reporting on contentious issues have to fear violent reprisals. There are at least 27 known cases of journalists serving prison sentences. Additionally, the freedom of religion is not guaranteed and members of unregistered religious groups or religious activities in ethnic minorities are heavily restricted or deemed unlawful and prosecuted. The discussion of Chinese students in Ireland who were persecuted because of their membership in Falun Gong serves as one example for violations of religious freedom (cf. ch. 9.3.3).[319] Consequently, a relatively high number of people leave the country every year either as asylum seekers or refugees. The main destination countries are India, the US, Canada, Germany and the Netherlands.[320]

However, the new millennium has also seen increasing numbers of emigrants with different motives. The rapid economic development has brought material wealth to an emerging middle class, which values education abroad. Throughout the last 15 years, the number of Chinese students abroad has increased a great deal. In the 2010-11 period, the main destination countries were the United States (93,672) followed by Japan (80,231), Australia (50,418), the United Kingdom (49,594) and Germany (23,791). In comparison to earlier periods, these figures were relatively stable, but the US and Australia gained at the cost of European countries.[321] Apart from education, brighter economic prospects abroad are also factors that influence emigration decisions. Europe, for example, saw a rapid increase in Chinese immigration in the first decade of this millennium, which was fuelled by a demand for skilled

[318] HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH (2013)
[319] For violations of human rights in China cf. HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH
[320] In 2005 there were 124,101 refugees and asylum seekers. Cf. UNHCR
[321] PROJECT ATLAS

labour and "de facto" acceptance of undocumented migrants in southern Europe.[322] Chinese migration to Italy, for instance, grew from 1,000 in 1975 to 60,000 in 1995 and 330,000 in 2011. Chinese in Italy are mainly employed in the textile and leather industry, in restaurants, import-export and retail.[323]

Emigration from China, however, is dwarfed by internal migration in the country. A growing income gap between urban and rural earners in combination with constant demand for labour in the industrial centres along the east coast of China has encouraged many Chinese to attempt escaping rural poverty by moving into the cities. According to focus Migration, the total number of internal migrants almost doubled from 117 million in 2000 to 221 million in 2010, three quarters of which represent labour migration. Although internal migration contributes to rising household incomes in China's rural regions, dangerous working conditions, informal employment arrangements, and high accident rates in combination with inadequate insurance and separated families illustrate the drawbacks experienced by internal migrants.[324]

Chinese migration to Ireland

At the start of this study, the 11,161 Chinese[325] living in Ireland formed the biggest Asian group in the country and the seventh biggest group overall. This represented an increase of 91% in comparison to 2002. By the end of this study, the data of the Census 2011 had become available. According to official statistics, Indians had surpassed Chinese as the biggest Asian group in Ireland.[326] However, academics estimate that the real figure of Chinese in Ireland is closer to between 30,000 and 60,000 as it is assumed that about one in three Chinese did not fill in the census form. Some may have overstayed their student visas and others may have had different reasons for not filling in the form.[327] If these figures are considered, it is safe to assume that the Chinese still form the biggest Asian group in the country today. In 2006, they had the highest number of students of any group at 43 per cent. This figure had reduced by 2011 but still almost one third of Chinese in Ireland were students.[328] For comparison, in the same year the US received 93,672 students from China and Japan 80,231. In Europe, the main destination

[322] Cf. LACZKO (2003)
[323] LATHAM and WU (2013), pp. 34-5
[324] For internal migration in China cf. FOCUS MIGRATION (2012)
[325] Excluding Asian Irish
[326] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[327] KING-O'RIAIN (2011), p. 207; WANG, p. 1; FELDMAN (2008), p. 55
[328] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)

countries were the United Kingdom (49,594) and Germany (23,791).[329] Hence, although the number of Chinese students in Europe, and Ireland, has grown in the past 15 years, the clear majority opts for non-European destinations. Moreover, the focus on students masks the fact that the Chinese belong to "one of the longest established migrant groups in Ireland" with some arriving as early as in the 1950s. Yet, their number remained small until the 1990s.[330]

Those who decided to come to Ireland named the perceived lower cost of living than in the UK or US, the fact that student visas are relatively easily obtainable, the chance to improve their English or saving some money as well as the experience of going abroad as motivational factors for their migration decisions. Access to part-time work may also have acted as a pull factor for Chinese students.[331] Unsurprisingly, more than half of Chinese aged 15 and over were single, which is considerably higher than the figure for non-Irish nationals in general. About 40 per cent lived in a household with at least one Irish national, about twice as many as Polish nationals but about half of Nigerians in the same constellation. About 50 per cent of Chinese in Ireland were at work with just over a quarter in the non-manual sector. 9 per cent of Chinese were employers and managers, which is higher than the figure for both Nigerians and Poles. At 2.3 per cent the share of unskilled Chinese was slightly higher than the share of Nigerians but considerably lower than the share of Poles. Chinese are mainly active in the accommodation and food service industry and the low paid sector. All of the student interviewees surveyed in a study in 2006 had a job with some having two.[332] Such double job situations are testament to the economically less stable situation compared to those Chinese who arrived in Ireland from the 1950s. The more restrictive work permit policy following the EU enlargement in 2004 saw many Chinese overstay their student visas and becoming undocumented immigrants. As no statistics are available as to how many Chinese students overstayed their visa and have become undocumented, the use of *many* needs to be understood with a note of caution. Whereas the estimates of undocumented Chinese in Ireland certainly support this assumption, King-O'Riain has pointed out that the return rate of Chinese students in Europe is much higher than in the US, and "[p]erhaps this will be true for Ireland".[333] She went on to say that

> [i]n fact, many of the migrants in Ireland, as in other parts of Europe, are from the most economically advanced provinces in China and from families who can afford to send and support studying abroad.

[329] PROJECT ATLAS
[330] WANG, p. 1
[331] WANG, p. 3 and FELDMAN (2008), 64
[332] Cf. FELDMAN (2008); WANG (2006). For statistical data cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[333] KING-O'RIAIN (2011), pp. 208-9

> As such, they come … from higher educational backgrounds even though they may work in low wage service industries.[334]

Again, it is unclear how King-O'Riain uses *many*. A possible explanation of what presents itself as a paradox could be that a proportion of Chinese students in Ireland belong to China's prospering middle class whereas others may have been attracted by the opportunity to work part time as a means of supporting themselves and their studies financially.

Chinese tend to live in cities and large towns with 56 per cent living in Dublin city and suburbs and another 19 per cent living in towns with 10,000 residents or more. There are a number of organisations that support Chinese nationals in Ireland. Amongst them, the Chinese Society in Ireland and the Irish-Chinese Information Centre were founded in reaction to the rapidly rising number of Chinese nationals arriving in Ireland in the early 2000s. According to the Information Centre's first chairwoman, the first generation immigrants did well on their own, but it was felt that the large number of predominantly young language students needed support after their arrival in the country. Wang argued that the establishment of the Earthquake Appeal Committee in response to the 2008 Sichuan earthquake marked the beginning of the cooperation of different Chinese organisations in Ireland.[335]

When it comes to media use, Feldman found that Chinese immigrants were least likely to watch British or Irish television; yet, 39 per cent watched it on a daily basis.[336] Wang established that they were more likely to resort to internet based services such as *Chinese BBS*[337] or the *Sun Emerald Chinese News*, which has a readership of up to 80,000 and is available all over Ireland.[338] As with other immigrant groups, social media play an important role in staying in contact with the home country. Unlike Nigerians, Chinese were more likely to have travelled home since their arrival with only just over 22 per cent not having done so. This high number may be a sign that those jobbing in the low paid sector save particularly diligently in order to be able to afford a flight home or of the fact that more Chinese students than assumed belong to the well-off middle class in China.[339]

[334] KING-O'RIAIN (2011), p. 208
[335] Cf. WANG
[336] FELDMAN (2008)
[337] WANG (2006)
[338] C&N YOUR COMMUNITY PLATFORM
[339] Cf. FELDMAN (2008), p. 154; KING-O'RIAIN (2011), p. 208

5.3 Selected periods

Since "[t]he universe of available texts is too large to be examined as a whole, […] content analysts need to limit their research to a manageable body of texts".[340] The selection of periods covered in this study is informed by economic development and a changing immigration policy as these are closely linked to the number of migrants arriving in Ireland. Eventually, four full year periods ranging from 1997 to 2010 were selected to map the representation of immigrants in the Irish media.

Exactly when the Irish economy started blossoming is a source of controversy. Murphy argues that 1994 marked a turning point with "sustained growth in GNP and employment," public sector deficit moving into a surplus, national debt significantly falling and strong domestic demand emerging.[341] From 1996, the economic boom was accompanied by net in-migration, fuelled by a large number of return migrants.[342] However, 1996 cannot be considered as a research period for the very simple reason that the National Library in Dublin only holds complete records for *The Irish Sun* from 1997. Furthermore, in that year, Ireland's GDP reached a growth rate of 11.3 per cent, which was to remain the highest in the entire decade.[343] The positive trend of in-migration was confirmed with figures more than doubling in comparison to the previous year.[344] The same tendency could be observed in respect of asylum seekers. Whereas the number of people seeking asylum in Ireland had almost trebled from 420 in 1995 to 1,180 in 1996, it had more than trebled by the end of 1997 to 3,880.[345] Hence, 1997 confirmed trends that had previously only been indicated, making it a suitable year for discussion in this study.

In 2000, GDP growth dropped slightly to 10.6 per cent from 11 per cent in the previous year,[346] but it still marked the highest growth rate in the OECD area and was more than twice as high as in any other OECD member state.[347] As in the previous years, economic prosperity attracted a great deal of immigrants, resulting in a migration surplus of 26,000. Of these, return migrants still formed a substantial part, but their share had fallen to 44 per cent from 65 per

[340] KRIPPENDORFF (2004), p. 111
[341] MURPHY (2000), p. 6
[342] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (d); MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)
[343] COUNTRYECONOMY.COM
[344] Net migration 1996: 8,000; 1997: 19,200. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (d)
[345] EUROSTAT (2007)
[346] COUNTRYECONOMY.COM
[347] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)

cent in the late 1980s.[348] Another indicator for the country's economic success and need for labour was the markedly rising number of work permits. Whereas in 1999 4,328 new work permits had been issued, the figure was 15,434 in 2000.[349] The seemingly liberal approach to labour migrants was also illustrated by the introduction of the work authorisation / working visa scheme in June of that year, which gave holders more freedom than holders of work permits as these were not bound to a specific employer (also see ch. 6.5).[350] About 125,000 non-Irish migrants had come to Ireland by that time.[351] The number of asylum seekers had grown to the second highest figure ever at 10,940,[352] which was perceived as an insurmountable burden by members of the public and (some) officials alike.[353] However, although they "are small in number they do represent the cutting edge of social innovation in the construction of new identities which contest the traditional, implicitly assimilationist, model.[354]

The selective policy towards different immigrant groups had been copper-fastened by the time of the EU enlargement in 2004, marking a turning point in immigration patterns to Ireland. The economy was still thriving,[355] but the government had opted for a new route to satisfy the continued demand for labour.[356] Together with the UK and Sweden, Ireland decided to open its labour markets to citizens of the new EU member states, and within a year almost 85,000 Personal Public Service Numbers were issued to migrants from that region with Poles forming the largest group by far.[357]. At the same time, this decision was accompanied by measures restricting the opportunities of non-EEA migrants severely. The number of work permits for non-EEA migrants dropped significantly from 21,965 new permits in 2003 to 10,020 new ones in 2004.[358] Eventually, the decision for this period was also informed by the 2003 Supreme Court ruling on residency rights, and a more restrictive asylum legislation culminating in the Referendum on Citizenship (cf. ch. 6.5).

[348] RUHS (2009)
[349] DEPARTMENT OF JOBS
[350] The scheme was in operation from June 2000 to 31 December 2006. Cf. IRISH NATURALISATION AND IMMIGRATION SCHEME
[351] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)
[352] EUROSTAT (2007)
[353] Cf. FANNING (2012), p. 97
[354] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)
[355] GDP = 4.2%. COUNTRYECONOMY.COM
[356] Cf. for example BARRETT or O'CONNELL and MCGINNITY (2008)
[357] Eastern Europe includes citizens of Poland, Lithuania, Latvia, Slovakia, Czech Republic, Hungary, Estonia and Slovenia. EU migrants who seek employment in Ireland need to apply for a PPS number. For figures cf. MAC ÉINRÍ (2005), p. 5
[358] DEPARTMENT OF JOBS

Whereas the decision for the first three periods to be investigated was relatively straightforward for the reasons outlined above, the last one is the outcome of a decision making process in which further, partly non-immigrant related, factors had to be considered. 2008 was the first year in which GDP growth was negative;[359] yet, net in-migration reached new heights with an unprecedented peak of 104,800 in 2007 and still considerable 64,300 in 2008.[360] On the other hand, although the Irish government saw itself forced to introduce a blanket guarantee of bank liabilities in September 2008 in order to stabilise the inflated financial sector,[361] the effects of an economy going into recession had not yet impacted all aspects of everyday life. Unemployment, for example was only to rise significantly from 2009. Moreover, in 2009 net-immigration was still positive and only became negative in 2010. In that year unemployment was twice as high as in 2008 at 13.8 per cent on average.[362] In respect of non-EEA migrants, 2010 also showed a clearer picture than 2008. While Ireland had still issued 8,481 new work permits in 2008, this figure fell to 3,394 in 2010,[363] and the number of asylum seekers decreased to 1,940 in the latter period.[364] In the same year, talks with the International Monetary Fund and The European Financial Stability Fund (later European Stability Mechanism) were under way after the Irish bank guarantee had brought the country to the brink of financial collapse. In September 2010, Ireland accepted loans to alleviate its financial difficulties.[365] Taking into account that this study investigates the representation of various immigrant groups set against the parameters discussed above, 2010 was selected as the final period.

5.4 Sample selection

The foremost aim in approaching a body of texts is to select a technique that ensures that every article has an equal chance of being selected. Second, the sample must be large enough to deliver reliable results while it should be small enough as not to cause an unnecessary work load.[366] To achieve this, the constructed week method seemed promising.[367] Constructed means that all editions of a day of the week are enlisted and one is selected randomly. This would be done for Mondays, Tuesdays etc. until a full week is constructed. According to the authors, two

[359] DEPARTMENT OF JOBS
[360] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (d)
[361] CENTRAL BANK OF IRELAND
[362] For unemployment statistics cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (e). For migration figures cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (d)
[363] DEPARTMENT OF JOBS
[364] UNHCR (2011)
[365] CITIZENS INFORMATION
[366] RIFFE (2009); NEUENDORF (2002); KRIPPENDORFF (2004); FRÜH (2007)
[367] RIFFE (2009), p. 57

constructed weeks in a one-year period should produce representative results.[368] Therefore, the constructed week was tested and, in order to test the reliability of this result, I decided to compare the results of two constructed weeks and two four constructed week periods.[369] The results were as follows:

		Polish / Poland	**Nigerian / Nigeria**	**Chinese / China**
2 constructed weeks		**2**	**4**	**7**
4 constructed weeks (I)	Weeks 1-4	**3**	**14**	**18**
	Weeks 1-2	0	7	3
	Weeks 3-4	3	7	15
4 constructed weeks (II)	Weeks 1-4	**1**	**15**	**7**
	Weeks 1-2	0	8	3
	Weeks 3-4	1	7	4

Table 2: Test run constructed week sampling

While the hits for Nigeria / Nigerian did not differ substantially, the picture looked very different for Chinese immigrants particularly considering that there was a murder of a Chinese student in Dublin in 2002 sparked a media debate which should have been reflected in the results. The figures suggested that individual articles on the immigrant groups in question were unevenly distributed in the population so that the constructed week was not a reliable means of obtaining representative data for an entire year. Hence, there was no alternative but to conduct full-year analyses.

[368] RIFFE (2009), p. 58
[369] Search period: 01/01/02 to 31/12/02; Newspaper: *Irish Times*; Search terms: Polish or Poland, Nigeria or Nigerian, China or Chinese; Database: *Proquest Historical Irish Times* online archive

6 Immigration and immigration policy: Past and present

At this point, an excursus into the immigration history of Ireland shall be included in order to position the period covered in this study in Ireland's migration experience, and to show that immigration has always been an important aspect in shaping Irish identity notwithstanding the fact that emigration took a heavy toll in certain periods, which are now predominant in the collective memory of migration patterns in Ireland.

Before the turn to net-immigration in the mid-1990s,[370] Ireland was often referred to as a classic example of an emigration country. And indeed, emigration had a long history in this country – be it Irish soldiers serving in European armies from the late 16th century,[371] the active recruitment of Irish servants in England as early as 1559[372] or assisted and unassisted emigration to all parts of the world throughout the 19th century with a peak of 2.5 million emigrants during the famine years. Until the decline of the population after the famine years, emigration was seen as a safety valve, a 'good thing'. Landlords and, intermittently and localised, the state financially assisted many families in their emigration efforts although these were rather attempts to free landlords of small holders and surplus children than acts of benevolence.[373] Emigration did not stop in the 20th century and many more left in search of a better life and work elsewhere.

However, despite at times staggering figures of emigration,[374] particularly from the middle of the 19th century, immigration that came with conquest and colonisation has shaped the country's economic and social structure and contributed to an exclusionary definition of Irishness. Lentin points out that

> despite political protestations to the contrary, it has been argued that neither in–migration nor Ireland's multi-ethnicity, and the ensuing multi-racisms, are new phenomena, and that theorizing them as such ignores Ireland's historical multi-ethnicity, as well as indigenous ethnic groups such as Travellers, black Irish people and earlier migrants including Jewish, Italian, South-east Asian and Chinese people.[375]

[370] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2003); CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (h); LENTIN (1998)
[371] MCGURK (1992)
[372] MCGRATH (1996)
[373] FITZPATRICK (1985)
[374] FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008); DUFFY and MORAN (2004)
[375] LENTIN (2003), p. 304

Vikings left their mark in shaping Ireland's urban social structure, Normans introduced the centralised government, established peace and order, founded towns and introduced systematic agriculture and trade.[376] Resistance or protest to British rule shaped both a distinct Irish identity based on Catholicism and non-Brutishness in the late 16th century but also an Irish Protestant identity during the emancipation of English settlers, the Protestant ascendency, in the 18th century. In the 19th century, recurrence to an imagined Irish history defined Irishness as exclusionary and non-British.

This chapter traces this history of immigration to Ireland but also refers to sometimes overlooked groups of migrants who came to this country as refugees for political, economic or religious reasons before the topic of foreigners in Ireland came to much more prominence in the 1990s. Their numbers were small, but their influence was considerable.[377]

6.1 Conquests and migration to Ireland

Originally arriving as raiders of monasteries in the 8th century, the influence of the Vikings' modern Scandinavian social structure on the archaic Irish society cannot be underestimated.[378] The development of existing settlements into and the founding of new trading towns introduced the "hitherto unknown urban social structure and its likewise previously unknown economic power and amalgamation",[379] eventually resulting in the "shift [of] the social and political centre of gravity once and for all from the midlands to the east coast – indeed, one might say to the Irish Sea."[380]

Following the Vikings, early Norman rule introduced an active government and a centralised administration to the country. The jury system, the appointment of Sheriffs and the formation of counties contributed to the establishment of "peace and order," ending frequent fights and raids amongst the Gaelic families. Systematic agriculture and estate management were introduced and more towns were founded. With the towns came trade and with trade came the "general use of coins" in the country. The friars brought with them the continental wisdom and learning, and most of Ireland's medieval cathedrals can be traced to Norman times. [381] Despite these arguably beneficial developments, colonial rule also brought a multitude of restrictions. Poyning's law, to name but one example, effectively crippled the Irish parliament

[376] MARTIN (2001), pp. 108-9
[377] Cf. for example DALY (2000)
[378] Cf. ELVERT (1999), pp. 68-9
[379] ELVERT (1999), p. 72 (My translation)
[380] DE PAOR (2001), p. 80
[381] For the influence of the Normans on Ireland cf. for example MARTIN (2001), pp 106-12

for almost 300 years until its amendment in 1782 by making it dependent on the English monarch's consent thus introducing direct rule from England.[382] The reign of Tudor monarchs changed England's rule of Ireland fundamentally culminating in the complete conquest of the island.[383] This had profound consequences for life in Ireland since Irish customs increasingly had to compete against strategies of Anglicisation, which, in turn, contributed to the formation of a distinct Irish identity.

After Henry VIII became king of Ireland, his system of surrender and regrant[384] forced Anglo-Irish lords "to abandon the old ways and, by learning English and ceasing to wear distinctively Irish garments, to establish uniformity of language throughout the king's dominions."[385] These measures led to the introduction of the "concept of an English-speaking Irishman […], and Irishness was increasingly identified with Catholicism."[386] This new Irish identity also led to a cut of the links with Scottish Gaeldom, which for a long time had formed a part of the 'pan-Gaelic' context.[387] In terms of religion, more than half of the monasteries and about 40 per cent of the mendicant communities fell victim to the dissolution of the monasteries.[388]

In the middle of the 16th century after the successful plantation of Laois and Offaly, the English influence in Ireland reached a new dimension with "military conquest and plantation as part of a general anglicizing policy".[389] This was illustrated in the aim of the plantation of Munster, the establishment of "microcosm[s] of English society".[390] Although the plantation scheme was never a full success, it was "comparable with the more successful of European colonisation ventures" and certainly had an impact on the economy as the planters imported both sheep and ploughs in "considerable quantities" and started the export of timber from the area.[391]

[382] COSGROVE (2001) p. 135
[383] HAYES-MCCOY (2001), p. 139
[384] Irish lords surrendered their land to Henry VIII who then re-granted it. This attempt to secure loyalty in Ireland entitled Henry's new subjects to his protection and access to English courts.
[385] HAYES-MCCOY (2001), p. 143
[386] ELLIS (1998), p. 254
[387] For the pan-Gaelic concept and the links between Irish and Scottish Gaelic see ELLIS (1998), pp. 252-4
[388] ELLIS (1998), pp. 190-242; HAYES-MCCOY (2001), pp 144-5
[389] ELLIS (1998), p. 228
[390] CANNY (2003), p. 132
[391] ELLIS (1998), p. 330

In the north, one of the last strongholds of Gaelic-Irish nobility, the earl of Tyrone attempted to overthrow English rule introducing a 'common fatherland and common faith' ideology:

> Tyrone had […] managed to inspire a remarkable degree of unity and support for an independent catholic [sic] Ireland and, despite his failure to win over the catholic but traditionally loyal Old English, the confederacy had effectively become a nationalist uprising against a foreign and protestant [sic] power.[392]

Yet, Tyrone's efforts proved futile and in the aftermath of his defeat English law and administration were extended to the formerly Gaelic areas. In 1607, the flight of the earls marked the end of Gaelic rule in Ireland[393] and led to widespread confiscation and "virtually all of the rest of Ulster was now escheated and available for plantation."[394] With British and Scottish settlers came improved agrarian practices. The resulting greater productivity led to a shift from dairy to cattle and arable farming. To provide for the exchange of goods and access to individual townlands, the road system was developed into a very dense network of roads and bridges, along which inns were established. Only the Irish in remote areas of the marginal lands managed to preserve a distinct Irish identity; those living in densely populated areas were subjected to assimilation and their partaking in the market-economy forced many to adopt English as their first language.[395] By 1641, the share of non-Irish in the population had risen to about 20 per cent. Virtually all of these settlers came from England, Scotland and Wales although there was evidence of individual immigrants from the continent particularly in the port towns.[396]

After a rebellion in the north, Oliver Cromwell came to Ireland on a mission of conquest and revenge, which was of such a brutal nature that it "became indelibly impressed upon the folk memory of the Irish."[397] Noetzel described the consequences as "the central pattern of the newer history of Ireland: Every uprising worsened the social and political situation of the Celtic Irish and Old English population."[398] Catholic landowners who had been engaged in the rebellion lost both land and political influence while virtually all others were removed to less fertile and more hostile areas in Connaught and Clare, where they were only entitled to a

[392] ELLIS (1998), p. 347
[393] CLARKE (2001), pp. 152-3. There are considerations that the earls' flight was a strategic retreat to recover their powers abroad. For the flight of the Earls cf. MCGURK (2007)
[394] ROBINSON (2000), p. 67
[395] ROBINSON (2000); MOODY (1938); CLARKE (2001)
[396] FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008), pp. 74-81
[397] CLARKE (2001), p. 162
[398] NOETZEL (2003), p. 20 (My translation)

fraction of their previous property.[399] By the time of Cromwell's death, English, Welsh and Scottish immigrants accounted for about one quarter of the Irish population.[400] The structure of land ownership had fundamentally changed with a Protestant upper class and greatly reduced Catholic landownership, which was virtually extinguished in Ulster, Munster and Leinster.[401] Furthermore, "the Cromwellian period marked a decisive shift in political control [to Protestants] in Ireland."[402]

The situation of Catholics in Ireland improved a great deal when Charles II reclaimed the throne after Cromwell's death in 1658. Their share in land ownership increased again,[403] new bishops were appointed and foreign education of priests contributed to the creation of a Catholic elite that "inhabited an intellectual world that was European in nature and not particularly English at all."[404] The restoration period also saw further immigration from Scotland[405], the introduction of Quakers and Huguenots from the continent.[406] Catholic influence was further extended under reign of the last Catholic king of England, James II. Soon, two thirds of the Irish army, the majority of judges and privy councillors and the attorney general were Catholic. However, when the birth of a son to James II posed the threat of a Catholic dynasty in England, he was forced to flee to France. James II's attempt to regain his throne from Ireland "offered catholics [sic] an unusually favourable prospect of establishing their predominance" but ended in defeat at the Battle of the Boyne in 1690. Despite concession made in the Treaty of Limerick,[407] Catholics "were under no illusions about the bleak prospect that lay before them."[408]

During the subsequent period of Protestant ascendency, English settlers, faced with decreasing numbers of immigrants,[409] secured their interests by establishing a "virtual monopoly of political, social, and territorial power". It was "also the period in which the

[399] CORISH (2009), p. 373
[400] FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008), p. 96
[401] For the 1641 rebellion and its consequences cf. CLARKE (2001), pp. 152-64; NOETZEL (2003), pp. 16-21
[402] GILLESPIE (2006), p. 206 Also cf. CORISH (2009), pp. 373-4; GILLESPIE (2006), pp.182-214
[403] SIMMS (2009a), p. 428 and HARRIS (2008), pp. 6-10
[404] HARRIS (2008), p. 6
[405] FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008), p. 96
[406] SIMMS (2009a), pp. 433-8
[407] SIMMS (2001b), p. 175
[408] SIMMS (2009b), p. 508
[409] Other than the notable immigration of Huguenots and Palatines there was little immigration to Ireland in the 18th century. Apart from about 10,000 immigrants from England there are some accounts of craftsmen and artists in the major towns and a decreasing number of traders in the port towns. Due to Ireland's involvement in the slave trade there were even some black people in Ireland although the presence of coloured people is regarded as exceptional. FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008), pp. 129-34

'protestant nation' established its identity [and] developed a sense of colonial nationalism,"[410] culminating in the penal legislation, which inhibited Catholics in almost every aspect of life, first and foremost barring them from political offices, the legal professions and land ownership. Only in the last quarter of the 18th century did long term consultations result in the gradual repeal of some of the penal restrictions.[411] At the close of the century, the Catholic Committee was a symbol of the rise of the Catholic middle class into political life,[412] albeit the barriers built into Irish society gave them little actual power.[413]

The United Irishmen under the leadership of the Protestant lawyer Wolfe Tone believed the only way to lessen British influence was by parliamentary reform and inclusion of Catholics. A planned French invasion and the subsequent rebellion failed and ultimately resulted in the Act of Union, through which Ireland officially became part of the United Kingdom in 1801.[414]

Ireland under the Union was shaped by Catholic emancipation and the construction of Irishness defined as non-British, united by an imagined Gaelic past and a dominant role of the Catholic Church. Although there was a small but steady trickle of immigration,[415] the construction of this perceived distinct Irish identity was much more informed by events inside Ireland. In the second quarter of the century, there was Daniel O'Connell's Catholic Association and his success in securing a "steady trickle of reforms for Ireland" at Westiminster.[416]

Later, a failed rising by the radical Young Irelanders, who had portrayed the events of the famine as genocide and mass emigration as forced exile, was soon seen as "a pathetic farce as

[410] SIMMS (2009c), p. 1
[411] For the penal legislation cf. SIMMS (2009c) MCGRATH (1996); WALL (2001); O'FLAHERTY (1988)
[412] MCDOWELL (2001), p. 190-2
[413] For example, there were only very few Catholic lawyers, only 7 per cent of entrants at Trinity College were Catholic and the guilds in practice remained closed to most Catholics. For a more detailed account cf. for example MCDOWELL (1979)
[414] MCDOWELL (2001), pp. 198-203
[415] 19th century Ireland saw some British immigration mainly from three sources: civil servants, military personnel and domestic servants. This flow of immigration even continued throughout the famine, which decimated the Irish population by 2 million due to emigration and deaths. Towards the end of the famine, minor immigration took place when absentee landlords returned to settle on their estates, and some new arrivals hoped for bargains on the land market. In the post famine years, skilled workers from Britain were required in Belfast's linen and shipbuilding industry, and Jews from Eastern Europe (see below) as well as a miniscule proportion of the exodus from southern Italy arrived. Cf. GREEN (2001); FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008), pp. 150-2, 166-7, 182-5
[416] The 1829 relief act, a prerequisite for O'Connell taking his seat without taking the Oath of Supremacy, permitted religious services in churches and private houses, and Catholics could now become members of parliament and hold almost any civil or military office. Cf. Connoly (2010), pp. 105-6; WHYTE (2001), pp. 209-210

a revolution but grand as revolutionary theatre [that] enshrined the defeated leaders in the pantheon of Irish martyrs."[417]

Towards the end of the century, the literary revival was carried by writers who considered Irish intellectual life as a means of preserving Irish culture. This movement was supported by the more popular Gaelic League, promoting the revival of the Irish language and ideas of self-reliance and self-respect as well as the Gaelic Athletic Association, aiming for the "preservation and cultivation of national pastimes".[418] By rejecting everything British, particularly the Gaelic League attempted establishing Ireland as a distinct cultural nation, which in turn would call for its acceptance as a nation state. Following the 1916 Easter rising and the subsequent War of Independence, British rule effectively ended with the Anglo-Irish Treaty signed on 06 December 1921.

6.2 Huguenots, Palatines and Jews

Huguenots

In total about 10,000 Huguenots arrived in Ireland in the 17th and 18th century as a consequence of the *Act for Encouraging Protestant Strangers and Others To Establish themselves in Ireland* by the Irish parliament under Lord-Lieutenant Ormond, who envisaged urbanisation and economic growth for Ireland.

Most of the early Ormondite refugees settled in Dublin but there were also settlements in Waterford, Clonmel, Carrick-on-Suir and Chapelizod. In Chapelizod, a colony was set up where up to 300 Huguenots and Flemish artisans were provided with government subsidies to engage in the textile industry. However, the early Ormondite Huguenots did not leave a lasting impression on Ireland as the number of French Protestant families in Dublin had almost diminished by 1672 and the Chapelizod colony ceased its existence litter later.[419]

The impact of the late Ormondite Huguenotes was more significant, though. They arrived as a consequence of the 1681 dragonnades, doubling the Huguenot population of Dublin by the end of that year and steadily rising to about 650 by 1686. Their influence was "in the context of variety and intensity, anything but negligible."[420] Two members of the Desminières family were aldermen and served as Lord Mayors of Dublin, while Dr. Jacques Du Brois Desfontaines-

[417] MILLER (1999), p. 187
[418] GAELIC ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION
[419] For the early Huguenot settlement refer to HYLTON (2005), pp. 4-31; HYLTON (2001); GWYNN (1987)
[420] HYLTON (2005), p. 78

Voutron was the Physician-General of the Army in Ireland. Other families engaged in property development or became affluent merchants.[421]

In terms of numbers, the Ruvignac Huguenots, who arrived after being expelled from the Swiss canton of Zurich, were the biggest group. Furthermore, the 1692 *Act For Encouraging Protestant Strangers and Others to settle and plant in Ireland* invited Huguenot veterans to Ireland, whose excellent knowledge of Louis XIV's forces should stop or delay a feared French invasion. Nearly half of the about 10,000 Huguenots who came to Ireland settled in Dublin where they made up about 5 per cent of the population in the 1720s. Probably because of their prominence, Huguenot property developers, inn keepers and brewers were the best known of the group.

Besides Dublin, Portarlington is regarded as the most successful settlement outside of the capital. Although Portarlington preserved the French language and customs longer than other Huguenot settlements, they had assimilated by the third and fourth generation.[422] Less well documented yet well established communities were found at Cork, Lisburn and Waterford.[423]

Palatines

Whereas the Ruvignac Huguenots had an impact at least on Dublin through their businesses, another group of immigrants preserved its customs and did not integrate well. The Palatines left the south-west of Germany in 1709 because of a harsh winter and the following crop failure, a heavy tax burden and to a much lesser extent religious persecution. Hoping that they would strengthen the Protestant interest and develop agriculture and the linen industry, 500 families were invited to Ireland.[424] However, despite subsidies and preferential treatment, the initial settlement was a failure as two thirds of the families had already left a year later. After additional support had been granted, around 100 families settled around Rathkeale in County Limerick. Initially successful, the "most vital and energetic" of the community moved on to the new world when preferential land conditions were no longer granted. Others were invited by improving landlords as model farmers.[425]

[421] For a more detailed description of individual families' achievements cf. HYLTON (2005), pp. 64-72 For a more detailed account of the late Ormondite Huguenots in Ireland refer to HYLTON (2005), pp. 32-79; GWYNN (1987); HYLTON (2001)
[422] For the Portarlington settlement project cf. HYLTON (1987), pp. 297-314; HYLTON (2005), pp. 90-110; GWYNN (1987)
[423] For a more detailed account of Huguenot settlements in Ireland cf. HYLTON (2001)
[424] O'CONNOR (1989), pp. 9-14;
[425] O'CONNOR (1989); RENZING (1989)

In the early years they formed a "homogeneous ethnic-confessional" group whose major cultural divide was the German language. The Palatines identification with the crown and their preferential treatment by the king and landlords as well as their defence of colonial interests by forming militia groups and their success and prosperity as farmers were not always welcomed by the native Irish population. Although there were few conflicts in general, Palatines did occasionally become victims of arson and violent attacks. Other obvious features were the women's straw hats and petticoats that distinguished them from their Irish counterparts. Visitors to the country in the late 18th century commended the Palatines' diligence, well-kept houses and fruit gardens and noticed German customs. The Palatines showed much solidarity amongst each other and only started marrying out around 1760 when congestion forced the first landless to abandon this custom.[426] Thereafter, the Palatines went down the path of assimilation and in the 20th century some were not even aware of their origin.[427]

Jews in Ireland

The Boyne campaign brought the arrival of the first considerable group of Jews in Dublin. They were Sephardi Jews from London's Bevis Marks community, who, Hyman assumes, may have helped finance the provision of troops in Ireland. At the end of the 17th century they were joined by Ashkenazi Jews from Germany and Poland. Presumably, both communities worshipped together in a synagogue in Dublin's Crane Lane and were even big enough to attract a rabbi by 1700.[428] In the second half of the 18th century the Dublin Jews were active in a range of professions from wholesale jewellers, pencil makers, merchants, musicians to bill brokers and pedlars. However, by the 1790s political unrest, trade depression, intermarriage and conversion had contributed to the disintegration of the community and the synagogue needed to be closed.[429]

Jewish life in Ireland saw a revival after the repeal of the Irish Naturalisation Act in 1816 when Polish and German Jews arrived again. Although there were never more than 350 Jews in Dublin before 1880,[430] some of them came to prominence. In 1843 the first Jew with a degree in medicine graduated from Trinity College and in 1874, Lewis Harris, a German born Jew, was elected as alderman for Dublin. He was later meant to become lord mayor of Dublin but

[426] Cf. RENZING (1989); RASCHE (1998)
[427] Cf. RENZING (1989); RASCHE (1998)
[428] Cf. HYMAN (1972), pp. 1-26
[429] Cf. HYMAN (1972), pp. 49-78. Quotation p. 53
[430] KEOGH (1998), p. 6

died before he could take office.[431] Otto Jaffe, "Belfast's most shrewd businessman" served twice as lord mayor of Belfast.[432]

Whereas the number of Jews in Ireland was just scratching the 400 mark in the 1881 census, this figure had risen significantly to 1,506 by 1891[433] because of the arrival of Jews from Eastern Europe.[434] The newcomers were often looked at with suspicion and considered uncouth since, unlike the old Jewish families, who lived dispersed over the city, they moved into a quarter that was to become known as Little Jerusalem.

A distinct number of first generation Litvak Jews engaged in peddling, which increased the choice of products for the rural population and "[was] apparently welcomed in rural areas".[435] More controversial were money lending activities because of high interest rates and the bad reputation of the business.[436] However, economic success soon allowed Litvak Jews to climb the social ladder. They moved into newly built homes at higher rents and were able to pay the fees for some of the best of Ireland's schools such as Wesley College or Alexandra College. Their often outstanding academic performance also raised the schools' reputation. A good education paved the way to success and only very few followed in their parents' footsteps as pedlars or moneylenders but belonged to the "most brilliant of their time in law, medicine, and the academic world"[437] or formed the "anomaly of Dublin's immigrants" who were heavily entrepreneurial in a not so entrepreneurial city.[438]

Economic success did not necessarily translate into social acceptance among the native population. The close-knit Jewish community, Jewish shops, Jewish cultural societies, their different lifestyles and a certain wariness of the gentile lifestyle as well as their support of the king did not promote close relationships with the native Irish.[439] In 1904, the arguably most severe Anti-Semitic campaign called for a boycott of Jewish pedlars and merchants in the city of Limerick, resulting in the departure of some Jewish families.[440] Although "[i]n that time it

[431] KEOGH (1998), p. 7; HYMAN (1972)
[432] KEOGH (1998), p. 8
[433] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2007)
[434] Cf. for example KEOGH (1998), p. 8
[435] For the peddler activities cf. Ó GRÁDA (2006), pp. 48-60; Quotation p. 54
[436] For the moneylending business cf. Ó GRÁDA (2006), pp. 61-93
[437] Fort the upward mobility of the newly arrived Jews cf. Ó GRÁDA (2006), pp. 73-4; KEOGH (1998), pp. 65-9. Keogh also gives a detailed account of successful Dublin Jews from p. 69
[438] Ó GRÁDA (2006), p. 87
[439] KEOGH (1998), pp. 60-8; Ó GRÁDA (2006), pp. 102-15
[440] For a more detailed account of the Limerick 'pogrom' cf. KEOGH (1998), pp. 27-59

was not unfashionable to allow stereotypes of the Jew to influence popular discussion,[441] the Jewish solicitor Michael Noyk became active in the War of Independence and Robert Briscoe became the first Jew to be elected to Dáil Éireann.[442]

Because of Ireland's closed door policy, only very few Jews arrived before and during World War II (see below), and in the post war period the Jewish community in Ireland was steadily declining to little more than one and a half thousand in 1991.[443] The area around Lower Clanbrassil Street had long before lost its character as Little Jerusalem due to suburbanization and, with some delay, the closure of Jewish shops.

6.3 Immigration to Ireland 1922-1945

After Ireland had gained independence, the Irish Free State constitution provided for the free exercise of religion,[444] but immigration control remained to be dominated by British law until as late as 1941.[445] Yet, the economically weak Irish Free State never proved highly attractive to potential immigrants so that immigration was not a top priority on the government's agenda throughout the 1920s.[446]

This changed drastically in the 1930s. The arrival of refugees from Germany or German occupied countries coincided with a difficult economic situation in Ireland accompanied by high rates of unemployment and emigration. As a consequence, Ireland was not prepared to receive refugees and increasingly pursued a 'closed doors' policy. This policy became manifest in the 1935 *Aliens Act* that conferred a great deal of powers to the Minister of Justice[447] and was intended to avoid rather than to regulate immigration.[448] Irish delegates to the Evian conference in 1938, where the European Intergovernmental Committee on Refugees met, reiterated that Ireland was unable to contribute to refugee resettlement on the grounds of being a small country, not having enough land to satisfy the needs of the Irish people, its own people having to emigrate and an overabundance of professional people already in the country.[449] The Irish Military Intelligence even kept a file for almost every German male in the country.[450] In

[441] KEOGH (1998), p. 75
[442] KEOGH (1998), p. 72
[443] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2007). The reason attributed is the immigration of white collar worker from the United States and Israel. Ó GRÁDA (2006), p. 209
[444] Office of the Attorney General (Ireland), Article 8
[445] FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008), pp. 204-5
[446] FITZGERALD and LAMBKIN (2008), p. 205
[447] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)
[448] GIELER and FRICKE (2004), p. 99-100
[449] SIEV (2006), p. 115 or WARD (1996), p. 132
[450] HOLFTER (2006b), p. 8 or KEOGH (2006), p. 40

an environment of high unemployment and a struggling economy, Ireland was afraid of allowing refugees into the country that could not support themselves and would possibly desire permanent residency. These regulations applied foremost to Jews, who were amongst the main targets of the persecution on religious and political grounds in Germany, as the German government did not allow Jews emigrating from Germany to transfer money out of the country and tended to revoke citizenship of Jews who had left the country, rendering them stateless persons.[451]

Ireland's closed door policy and the efforts of the anti-Semitic envoy to Berlin, Charles Bewley,[452] limited the number of refugees who came to Ireland to about 350. Contrary to the official restrictive policy of the Irish government, there are accounts of individuals who committed themselves to helping refugees from Nazi Germany,[453] and Gisela Holfter remarks that although "numbers [were] small in any event [...] the impact of these exiles on Ireland was greater than the numbers alone would suggest."[454] Scholars like the Austrian physicist and Nobel Prize winner Erwin Schrödinger, for whom the School of Theoretical Physics was set up at the Institute of Advanced Studies in 1940,[455] Robert Weil, who greatly contributed to the advancement of modern languages in Northern Ireland[456] and lesser known scholars like Ernst Schleyer, who, working at Trinity College from 1947-58, was a great contributor to Irish-German relations,[457] had a marked impact on academia in Ireland. At the end of World War II most of them stayed in Ireland.[458]

6.4 Immigration to Ireland 1945-1995

After 1945, Ireland's immigration policy remained to be informed by the 1935 *Aliens Act*, further codified by the 1946 *Aliens Order*, "which posited an ethno-economic hierarchy of visa applicants" and "continued to be ad hoc, uncoordinated and conservative."[459] Applicants had to proof special qualifications, had to have relations in Ireland or had to apply for a course of study on the condition that they could support themselves. Generally, refugees of Catholic

[451] MUCHITSCH (2006)
[452] KEOGH (1998), p. 146; Bewley was withdrawn from Berlin in 1939
[453] KEOGH (2006), p. 50-6; MUCHITSCH (2006), 79-84; HOLFTER (2006b), pp. 8-10
[454] HOLFTER (2006b), p. 9
[455] MUCHITSCH (2006)
[456] WALKER (2006)
[457] HOLFTER (2006c)
[458] MUCHITSCH (2006), p. 84
[459] WARD (1996), pp. 132 and 134

denomination were preferred, and Jews were discouraged from settling in Ireland for a fear of opposition in the population.[460]

After successful lobbying by the International Refugee Organisation and voluntary organisations in Ireland, the Irish government accepted 107 chronically ill or incapacitated refuges between 1950 and 1952.[461] In 1951, Ireland for the first time defined the term refugee as "in essence a person who, for reasons of race, nationality or political opinion, was unable to return to the territory from which he or she came." According to Ward, there were at least 846 people living in Ireland under this definition.[462] Yet, despite these advances in the refugee policy, the state refused a request for temporary admission of 10 Czech and Hungarian families in 1953 for "clearly anti-Semitic" reasons.[463]

In the following 40 years progress was slow and the number of refugees arriving in Ireland was lower than in the 20 years before Ireland became a signatory of the 1951 Geneva Convention on Refugees. After becoming a member of the UN in December 1955, Ireland set out to show its solidarity with Hungarian refugees by agreeing to accept a group of refugees. However, a strict pre-selection process was put in place to ensure that only desired Hungarians were admitted to the country. Desired meant of Christian faith, of good health and not posing a security threat.[464] Once the refugees had arrived, they were accommodated in a disused army barracks and responsibility for the Hungarians was deferred to voluntary organisations. Poor conditions in the camp, a fundamental misunderstanding as to the status of the refugees in Ireland (while the refugees believed they were to be re-settled to a third country, the Irish authorities assumed that they would stay) and difficulties in securing work soon lead to discontent amongst the residents of the camp. Eventually, they went on a hunger strike to support their demands for the passing of information on their status. Only then did the Irish government start to take the issue seriously, but found it difficult to accept responsibility for the refugees. The government's aim was to get rid of the Hungarians as soon as possible. In the months to come, the refugees either left Ireland for the UK on their own initiative or were assisted in resettling in Canada by the National Catholic Welfare Conference and the United States Escape Programme. Only 61 refugees stayed in Ireland and the camp was closed in

[460] WARD (1996), pp. 133-4 or MAC ÉINRÍ (2005)
[461] WARD (1996), p. 135
[462] WARD (1996), p. 135
[463] WARD (1996), pp. 135-6
[464] FANNING (2012), pp. 86-7 or WARD (1996), p. 136

December 1958. Ireland's ill-informed acceptance and handling of the Hungarian refugees was described as "a big show-off to show what we could do."[465]

In the following decades Ireland accepted very small numbers of programme refugees, but was slow at creating a proper refugee policy. The government continued relying heavily on the voluntary sector, and the refugees' UN-granted entitlements to welfare provisions "were extended in a piecemeal fashion". The 120 Chileans, who arrived in 1973, and the 582 Vietnamese arriving between 1979 and 1998 received very limited support in respect of training, children's schooling and language classes. In 1985 a group of 25 Iranians was accepted, who were accommodated by the Baha'is community. Only pressure by the EU brought about a more coordinated approach to refugees, culminating in the establishment of the government-funded Refugee Agency in 1991. In 1992, a group of Bosnians arrived and enjoyed a reception and resettlement programme funded by the state although not all aspects of the programme went smoothly. The Refugee Agency learnt from mistakes made in the reception of Bosnians and devised a successful programme for the Kosovars who arrived little later.[466] As Fanning points out, this could have been a blue print for handling the greater number of asylum seekers arriving little later:

> Agency officials visited local communities in advance to pave the way for the refugees. They coordinated the efforts of local groups, schools health boards [sic] to plan for the integration of the Kosovars into local communities from the outset.[467]

Non-refugee migrants, who were not seen as burden to the state, found it considerably easier to secure visas or enjoyed a general right to reside in Ireland. As Table 3 below demonstrates, the largest number of non-refugee immigrants came from countries that were culturally closest to Ireland. Migrants from Great Britain, Northern Ireland and the Unites States headed immigrant tables for decades (Poles only drew ahead of the British in the 2011 census). These migration patterns were supported by the constitutional inclusion of the Irish Diaspora in the definition of Irishness including a right to citizenship for descendants of Irish emigrants and citizens of Northern Ireland as well as the right for UK citizens to reside in Ireland.[468]

[465] For details of the Hungarian refugees cf. WARD (1996) or FANNING (2012), pp. 84-91. Quote by Deputy McQuillan quoted in Ward (1996), p. 141
[466] Cf. FANNING (2012), pp. 91-5. Quote p. 93
[467] FANNING (2012), pp. 94-5
[468] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b) or GIELER and FRICKE (2004)

Particularly in the 1970s, a decade of economic recovery, these rights were enjoyed by around 100,000 immigrant Irish workers and their families.[469]

Amongst other European immigrants, Germans, who were either attracted by German companies such as Liebherr in Kerry or came for counter-cultural reasons,[470] formed one of the biggest groups. Italians, French and Dutch arrived in smaller, yet not insignificant numbers. From 1973, when Ireland joined the European Community, the migration of EC citizens was further eased by the agreed freedom of movement of workers, which was extended to all EU citizens by the 1993 Maastricht Treaty. Of non-European immigrants Chinese, who first arrived in the 1950s, had formed a community of about 1,000 members by 1986.[471]

Despite these trickles of immigration, the total number of immigrants remained small and the topic was never high on the political agenda. This only changed from the mid-1990s with a turn to net-immigration and the arrival of larger numbers of non-European immigrants, return migrants and, later, labour migrants.

[469] EUROPEAN COMMISSION (2011)
[470] KOCKEL (1991)
[471] Cf. for example Table 33; GIELER and FRICKE (2004); MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b) or MAC ÉINRÍ (2007); WANG, p. 1

	1971	1981	1986	1991
Ireland	2,840,952	3,211,020	3,540,643	3,525,719
NI	26,183	40,557	36,538	35,986
England + Wales	75,189	133,831	128,668	126,487
Scotland	8,849	12,577	12,586	11,378
France	701	1,997	2,460	4,512
Germany	2,066	3,482	3,853	5,792
Italy	1,022	1,350	1,314	1,507
Netherlands	712	1,710	1,888	1,985
Belgium	240	490	497	600
Denmark	205	410	366	463
Greece	--	109	124	197
Luxembourg	--	20	30	44
Spain	--	--	1,113	1,801
Portugal	--	--	124	147
USA	11,145	16,591	15,350	14,533
Other	10,984	19,261	19,089	23,293

Table 3 Number of immigrants in Ireland[472]

6.5 Immigration to Ireland 1995-present

With the economic success of Celtic Tiger Ireland, the country started attracting immigrants at a considerably larger scale from the mid-1990s, and at the time of the 2011 census the number of non-nationals living in Ireland stood at well over half a million or 12 per cent of the population.[473] This was at about the same level as the United States with arguably one of the longest immigration histories.[474] Germany, in comparison, with an immigration history of more than 50 years had a non-German population of just 7.7 per cent in 2011.[475] Until the early 2000s immigrant streams mainly consisted of return migrants, asylum seekers, labour migrants and students, but increasingly restrictive immigration legislation resulted in a considerable drop in asylum seekers after 2004 and preferred treatment of labour migrants from the EU, who were seen as beneficial to the state's economy. Policy making remained to be in an ad-hoc fashion,[476] an issue addressed in the 2010 Immigration, Residence and Protection Bill.

[472] Table collated from 1971, 1981, 1986 and 1991 Census data. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (f)
[473] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 7
[474] BATALOVA and TERRAZAS (2010)
[475] STATISTISCHES BUNDESAMT (2013)
[476] Cf. for example ALLEN (2007) or MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)

Asylum seekers

Up to the end of the 1980s, Ireland had received virtually no applications for asylum from individuals, but numbers started rising in the 1990s. From very modest 31 applications in 1991, the figure rose to 424 in 1995 and 3,883 in the following year. By the end of the decade, 7,724 had sought refuge in the Republic. This trend in Ireland was generally concurrent with the development in other industrialised countries. However, whereas globally applications reached a peak in 1992 already, Ireland saw steadily rising numbers only from the middle of the decade. The top three source countries in Ireland in the 1995-99 period were Romania (4,687), Nigeria (4,299) and the Democratic Republic of the Congo (1,348).[477]

Initially, the early 2000s saw a continuation of rising levels up to a peak of 11,634 applications in 2002 before dropping to 4,766 in 2003 and eventually 2,689 in 2009. By 2012, applications had dropped to 1997 levels of less than 1,000.[478] From 2000, most applications came from Nigeria and Romania (until 2007) but also from China (2010: 11.8%), Pakistan (2010: 10.3 %), the Democratic Republic of the Congo and Afghanistan (both 3.6%).[479] In contrast to the rising numbers in Ireland, 2000-2002 saw declining numbers of asylum seekers globally (down 5.4 per cent). Although absolute numbers in Ireland were comparatively small, the country's share as a receiver of applications for asylum was better illustrated when the number of applications per 1,000 inhabitants was considered. During this period, Ireland received 3.1 applications per 1,000 inhabitants at a European average of 1 claim per 1,000. In comparison, the United Kingdom, which was the largest receiver in this period received 1.9 claims per 1,000 inhabitants. Only Austria, Norway, Sweden and Switzerland received more claims for protection in relative terms.[480] In the latter half of the decade, the downward trend at both global and European levels was particularly sharp in the Republic of Ireland. [481] Arguably, one of the main reasons was the shift from one of the more liberal systems to one of the most restrictive.

[477] For the 1990 to 1999 period cf. UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES GENEVA (2001), pp. vii-ix, 105, 153 in particular
[478] For figures until 1999 cf. UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES GENEVA (2001); for 2000-2002 cf. UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES (2003); from 2003 cf. Office of the Refugee Applications Commissioner. Only new applications, not re-applications; REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER (2013)
[479] Cf. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE AND EQUALITY (2011); REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER (2013)
[480] UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES (2003), pp. 5-6 and 7
[481] UNHCR (2011), p. 3

Irish asylum policy was originally outlined in the 1996 *Refugee Act,*[482] which, as some authors argued, was only apparently liberal because it mainly served business interests.[483] Moreover, precisely because of the liberal character of the 1996 act, many parts were not implemented against the backdrop of rising numbers of asylum seekers in the latter half of the 1990s (see above). Most importantly, ad-hoc policy making was copper-fastened by basing it on administrative guidelines devised by the Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform.[484] From the late 1990s further acts kept restricting the rights of asylum seekers in Ireland such as the revocation of the right to work for new arrivals from April 2000 and the introduction of the direct provision system.[485] Moreover, new acts regularised and increased the number of deportations, introduced carrier liability, which effectively deferred part of the state's responsibility for border control to airlines, ferry companies or coach operators, and made provisions for quicker processing of asylum applications.[486] In a landmark decision in 2003, the Supreme Court removed the up to then common practice of granting residency rights to parents of children who were born in Ireland and had received Irish citizenship based on the jus soli principle. Exclusionary practices culminated in the 2004 Referendum on Citizenship, which – passed by the large majority of the population – replaced jus soli with jus sanguinis. Fanning argues that official state policy played a major role in the passing of the referendum:

> The DJELR presided over the development of a patently coercive asylum system whereby punitive measures were promoted as a means of discouraging refugees from exercising their rights under UN conventions ratified by the Irish state. The DJELR was a key actor in orchestrating the 2004 Referendum on Citizenship.[487]

Under the above mentioned direct provision system inhabitants receive free hostel or camp like accommodation, free meals, basic health care and a weekly allowance of €19.10 per adult and €9.60 per child.[488] Although intended as a temporary solution with a maximum stay of six months, two thirds stay longer than three years, more than one third longer than five years and more than 5 per cent longer than 7 years. In an investigation ombudsman Emily O'Reilly called the system

> a blind spot [in Ireland's] self appraisal as a liberal democracy with a commitment to the rule of law and the protection of human rights [...and...] I was struck by the almost universal acceptance that

[482] Cf. RUHS (2009); FANNING (2002), p. 95
[483] ALLEN (2007)
[484] FANNING (2012), pp. 95-6, quote p. 96
[485] ALLEN (2007), pp. 85-6
[486] For Ireland's immigration policy cf. STANLEY (2011), UGBA, GIELER and FRICKE (2004), RUHS (2004)
[487] FANNING (2012), p. 197
[488] From 07 January 2016 the weekly allowance for a child is €15.60. Cf. CITIZENS INFORMATION (2016)

> these arrangements are damaging to the health, welfare and life-chances of those who must endure them.[489]

In her report, O'Reilly put particular emphasis on the damaging effect the system had on children, who were forced to live in poverty and alienated from society. At the time of writing there were 1,820 children living in DP centres with an average stay of 4 years. Asylum seekers do not have access to the labour market, the social welfare system or social housing. Because of the conditions in these centres inhabitants have no control over the most basic human needs. Interviewees in a study carried out by the Irish Immigrant Support Centre pointed out that exclusion, both physically and psychologically, put a great deal of stress on inhabitants. The study also showed that many asylum seekers felt that they had not had a fair hearing during their interviews with the Department of Justice upon their arrival in the state. Most poignantly though, O'Reilly argued that

> [i]t is easy to explain away our failures on the basis that the issues are complex, that drafting the legislation is very difficult and that parliament in any case is ineffective. All of this is true. But, ultimately, it comes back to priorities and to ethics and values. We have known for a decade and more that our treatment of asylum seekers is unacceptable and we have failed, mostly, to do anything about it. With some honourable exceptions, that failure is a collective failure of a republic which needs to re-engage with what ought to be its core values.[490]

The increasingly restrictive asylum policy was reflected in severely falling recognition rates. While 5 per cent of claims for asylum were granted in the second half of the 1990s, Ireland had the lowest recognition rate in the EU in 2010 at 1.3 per cent. In contrast, the figures for the UK were 24 per cent, for the Netherlands 46 per cent and for Malta 70 per cent.[491] In respect of their overall small numbers, asylum seekers received disproportionately high attention both in the media and in public and official discourse.[492] Rather than seeing people in need of protection as a valuable addition to society (that was economically booming until 2007), asylum seekers were cast as a burden to the state and psychologically and physically displaced.[493]

Labour migrants

In contrast to asylum seekers, other groups of immigrants met fewer restrictions, and some were even encouraged to come to Ireland, but not all labour migrants enjoyed the same rights.

---

[489] O'REILLY (2013)
[490] O'REILLY (2013)
[491] Cf. FANNING (2002), p. 99; EUROSTAT (2010)
[492] This argument was first made by Mac Éinrí in a study of T*he Irish Times* coverage of immigrants in 2000 and could be confirmed in my study. MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a)
[493] OFFICE OF THE REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER
[493] For the situation of asylum seekers in Ireland cf. for example O'REILLY (2013) or Nasc - THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE (a); NASC - THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE (b)

Which rights labour migrants enjoyed mainly depended on whether they were European Economic Area (EEA) or non-EEA migrants and whether they sought employment in Ireland before or after the EU enlargement in 2004.

The unprecedented economic boom resulted in a shortage of labour that was met with the immigration of labour migrants. Traditionally, citizens of EEA countries were free to work in Ireland whereas citizens of non-EEA countries needed to secure work permits, which heavily restricted their freedom in the labour market. Before 2003, the employers, often from the low skilled and low pay sector, applied for and held the permit, effectively resulting in a "system of bonded labour."[494] The work permit system made no provisions for permanent residence, made no assumptions of family reunification and permits could not be applied for from outside Ireland. Work permit holders also had no right to free medical care and social welfare entitlements.[495] Allen argued that "the work permit system created an institutionalised form of abuse that cannot be explained by the actions of a few 'unscrupulous employers'". He further demonstrated that there was ample evidence of pay below minimum wage, non-payment of overtime or unfair dismissals.[496] In 2000, the government introduced a work authorisation scheme that allowed for changing jobs in the same skills category, bringing the family of holders to Ireland and free education of dependants under 18 years of age. However, this scheme was limited to occupations with labour shortages such as quantity surveyors, construction engineers or nurses.[497]

Some work permit conditions have been improved, but other restrictions have stayed in place and new ones have been introduced, clearly preferring EEA citizens and high skilled workers. The Employment Permits Act 2003 ruled that citizens of the 10 accession states did not need to apply for a work permit. For non-EEA applicants this meant further restrictions as employers were encouraged to prefer workers from within the EEA.[498] This resulted in a drop of work permits for employees from outside the EEA of 17 per cent in 2003 and 32 per cent after 01 May 2004.[499] At a requirement of a minimum pay of 30,000 € annually and an extensive list of occupations that are not eligible for work permits, low skilled workers and craftsmen from outside the EEA are effectively barred from taking up employment in Ireland today.

[494] ALLEN (2007), p. 86
[495] For work permits cf. for example ALLEN (2007), RUHS (2004), MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)
[496] ALLEN (2007), p. 88
[497] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)
[498] REPUBLIC OF IRELAND (2003)
[499] RUHS (2004)

Furthermore, holders of work permits are expected to stay with their employer for the initial 12 months before they can change employment on the condition that they apply for a new permit. Family reunification is now generally possible after a year if the permit holder can prove that he or she is able to support his or her family.[500]

Conditions are more relaxed for holders of Green Card permits, that are issued to high skilled workers in almost any occupation with an annual remuneration of at least 60,000 €, or occupations in sectors such as ICT, health, academia etc. with an annual pay between 30,000 and 59,999 €. Regulations for the renewal of the permit are also more simplified.[501] The number of Indian nationals in Ireland more than doubled between 2006 and 2011, surpassing the official number of Chinese as the (formerly) biggest Asian immigrant group in the country. With Indians predominantly being employed in the human health and social work sectors, they were presumably exemplary of the government's campaign to attract high skilled workers to Ireland.[502] The question of permanent residency was addressed in the Immigration, Residence and Protection Bill 2010, but the ICI criticised that such permits were only intended to be issued for a period of five years and that eligibility criteria were vague and subjective.[503] Apart from Indians, Chinese, Filipinos, Brazilians, Pakistanis and South Africans belonged to the largest non-EEA communities in Ireland.[504]

Apart from the UK and Sweden, Ireland was the only country that opened its labour markets to citizens of EU accession states. However, at the same time it restricted social welfare entitlements for immigrants by introducing the habitual residence clause, which meant that migrants had to be habitually resident in the state (usually for a period of 2 years) before qualifying for state assistance. The prospect of work in Ireland attracted a great number of migrants from accession states and by 2007 they represented almost half of all immigrants to Ireland.[505] Desperately needed by a booming economy, they filled positions in the wholesale and retail sector, in accommodation and food services, manufacturing and agriculture, often in lower skilled positions than they were qualified for, and they were unlikely to take up highly

[500] The Green Card scheme has replaced the work authorisation scheme and working visa. CITIZENS INFORMATION (2013a); CITIZENS INFORMATION BOARD (2009)
[501] CITIZENS INFORMATION (2013b)
[502] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[503] IMMIGRANT COUNCIL OF IRELAND (2010), pp. 6-7
[504] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[505] From 2002 to 2006 the number of Poles increased from 2,124 to 63,276, Lithuanians increased from 2,104 to 24,628, Latvians from 1,797 to 13,319, Slovaks from 297 to 8,111 and Czechs from 1,103 to 5,159 CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008b), p. 7

skilled or professional positions.[506] Moreover, whereas immigrants in general earned 18 per cent less than their Irish counterparts, the gap widened to 32 per cent for migrants from the new EU member states.[507]

In respect of the impact of EU10 migrants on the Irish labour market and economy, there are no clear results. One model suggests that EU10 labour migrants contributed to wage reductions of 7.8 per cent and GNP increase of almost 6 per cent, but an alternative method could not confirm these findings. Nevertheless, Barrett concludes, perhaps in a provocative manner, that

> [t]he Irish economy was experiencing rapid growth around 2004 and so demand for labour was strong. In the absence of a large inflow, wages would have risen. This would have choked off the increased labour demand and so employment growth, and hence GNP growth, would have been constrained. At one point, this was considered a great advantage to the Irish economy but now the question must be raised of whether the boom was prolonged, in an undesirable way, in part by the labour inflow.[508]

In the recession though, immigrants from the new EU member states had a lower chance of being in employment than Irish nationals and non-EU immigrants in 2009. Moreover, while the number of immigrants in employment fell by 90,000 between 2008 and 2009, the figure for unemployed and inactive immigrants did not increase at the same rate. Barrett evaluates this findings as an indicator for outward migration taking place.[509] On the other hand, although CSO data show that the migration balance for EU12[510] nationals has been negative since 2010, fewer EU12 nationals left the country in 2011 and 2012 than in 2010 (in 2009 the balance was still positive). Overall, the balance was -3,800 in 2011 and -4,400 in 2012.[511] The statistics do not reveal, though, whether all of the EU12 nationals arriving sought employment or whether they came for other reasons such as family reunification.

A different group of economic migrants (in the widest sense) comprised those who either spent their retirement in the Republic of Ireland after spending their work life in the country or moved there after retiring in a different country. British citizens were by far the largest group of retired non-nationals followed, at a great distance, by German, US, Dutch and Polish nationals.[512]

---

[506] Cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a); RUHS (2009); GURDGIEV (2007); O'CONNELL and MCGINNITY (2008)
[507] BARRETT, pp. 109-11
[508] BARRETT, p. 112
[509] BARRETT, pp. 114-15
[510] Including citizens of Romania and Bulgaria since 2007.
[511] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (b), pp. 1-4
[512] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 19

Students

International students are a major business sector in Irish education. Statistical data vary, but the 2011/12 table of international students in universities and colleges gives a figure of more than 7,000 non-European Economic Area (EEA) students in Higher Education Authority (HEA) funded degree courses.[513] In his review of immigration to Ireland in 2012, Minister for Justice, Equality and Defence, Alan Shatter, set the figure of international students at 31,400, representing one quarter of all non-EEA nationals in the state (with permission to be in the country). 38 per cent engaged in higher education, 26 per cent in further education, 28 per cent in language courses and 9 per cent in other sectors e.g. secondary schools.[514] Regardless of the varying numbers, a look at the fees for a course in higher education reveals the scale of the business. At the National University Galway, to take one example, the course fees for non-EU undergraduate students stood at € 12,750 in Arts, Business and Law and € 13,750 in Science and Engineering for the academic year 2013/14. On top of that the NUIG website estimates a further € 1,000 per month in cost of living.[515] Assuming that course fees are similar across higher education institutions, 7,000 non-EEA students generate a turnover of at least € 89,250,000 annually and spend a further 7 million in cost of living. These figures can only present an absolute minimum as 7,000 students are a conservative take and course fees for language courses are not even considered. The dimension of business opportunities explains why earlier governments actively recruited international students abroad. Further down in this paper I refer to the efforts made in the early 2000s to attract Chinese students to Ireland. According to HEA data, these endeavours resulted in Chinese students forming the biggest Asian group in 2011/12 at 1,412 students. Compared to 2,255 students from the USA, arguably one of the more traditional source countries of students from outside the European Economic Area, this figure proved to be substantial.[516] It also shows that Irish authorities had recognised the economic potential of desired in-migration at an early stage.

Irish nationals

From the late 1980s, Irish migrants returning to Ireland presented a considerable immigrant group. At that time their relative share was 65 per cent of total immigration, which fell in subsequent years with the arrival of more varied immigrant groups. In the period from 2000 to

[513] HIGHER EDUCATION AUTHORITY (2012)
[514] SHATTER
[515] NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF IRELAND (2013)
[516] HIGHER EDUCATION AUTHORITY (2012)

2002 they accounted for 44 per cent, but thereafter their share decreased both in absolute and relative numbers to 27 per cent between 2003 and 2005 and further to 18 per cent in the period from 2006 to 2008. The absolute number, though, remained constant after 2003.[517] Ireland's economic success in the latter half of the 1990s and the first half of the 2000s acted as a strong pull factor for returning migrants. However, the transition from living abroad, at times for extended periods, to life in a much changed Ireland was not always smooth. The Task Force on policy regarding emigrants noted in a report that return migrants could potentially experience isolation and loneliness, may have difficulty in securing suitable employment and obtaining affordable housing. The report put particular emphasis on the elderly who might find "that the Ireland they left has changed out of all recognition".[518] However, although return migration has been the subject of extensive research, the topic shall not be elaborated here for reasons of spatial and temporal constraints.[519]

In the post economic boom years net-emigration has returned to Ireland, but a combined effect of immigration and natural increase resulted in a small increase in the population in 2012 although the increase was about twice as high in the previous year. Both nationals and non-nationals are leaving Ireland although in absolute numbers more than half of those leaving were Irish.[520] A qualitative study by the National Youth Council of Ireland indicated that many young Irish had a positive view on their situation, saw "their journey so far as both a necessity and an adventure " and had plans to return home when the economic situation permitted so.[521] It is too early to evaluate the effect of emigration from Ireland, and a hint of a silver lining at Ireland's economic horizon may see fewer people leaving its shores in the near future.

6.6 Immigration and racism in Ireland

There can be no denial that racism exists in Ireland today although it is by no means a new phenomenon. Anti-Semitism was ripe from the 19th well into the middle of the 20th century casting Jews as an economic threat and immigrants who do not to assimilate well into Irish communal life. The Limerick pogrom of 1904 and the restrictive immigration policy before and after World War II bear witness to this.[522] Another group, the Travellers, have experienced discrimination to date, particularly since the economic modernisation of Ireland deprived them

[517] Data taken from RUHS (2009)
[518] Cf. TASK FORCE ON POLICY REGARDING EMIGRANTS (2002), pp. 52-6, quote p. 54
[519] Cf. UNIVERSITY COLLEGE CORK for an overview of research carried out on the subject.
[520] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (b)
[521] MCALEER (2013). Quote p. 8
[522] Cf. WARD (1996), KEOGH (1998)

of their traditional rural trades and lifestyle resulting in a spatial displacement to the fringes of towns and cities where they often make camp next to roads or in so-called halting sites. Social exclusion is experienced in fields such as education, and their general health and life expectancy is well below the Irish average.[523] A further group to suffer under exclusion were Protestants, which after independence was a result of Ireland's "post-colonial emphasis on economic and cultural isolation", evident in a school and health system dominated by the Catholic Church. Moreover, Protestants suffered under IRA campaigns to a much greater extent than other members of the civilian society.[524]

Such forms of racism found its origin in the dominant role of the Catholic Church in the construction of Irish identity. In the 19th century Daniel O'Connell's Catholic Association mobilised not only elites but also social classes that had been excluded from policy making before. The Gaelic revival was fuelled by the establishment of organisations promoting an imagined history of Irish literature (National Literary Society), the Irish language (Gaelic League) and Irish sports (Gaelic Athletic Association). Irish identity and Catholic nationalism became based on distinctiveness from the British and "provided an ideological context within which various forms of exclusion and discrimination became institutionalised within Irish society."[525]

***

This chapter illustrated that immigration has always been present in Ireland albeit at relatively low numbers. Vikings, Normans and later the English / British left their mark, and many features of today's Ireland can be traced to these immigrant groups. Towns and cities, infrastructure, the legal framework or the English language are all closely linked to Ireland's colonial history. Palatines, Huguenots and Jews belonged to the bigger immigrant groups in pre-independence Ireland, and miniscule groups of (programme) refugees as well as immigrants from culturally close countries never seriously challenged an exclusionary definition of Irishness throughout the 20th century. Only in the last two decades did an unprecedented economic boom see the arrival of various groups of immigrants in Ireland. Of those "asylum seekers presented the cutting edge of social innovation", but this challenge to the "traditional assimilationist model"[526] was answered with increasingly restrictive legislation designed to

[523] For traveller dicrimination cf. PAVEE POINT, Pavee Point Traveller's Centre (2010), FANNING (2012), p. 49
[524] FANNING (2012), pp. 34-41. Quote p. 38
[525] FANNING (2012), pp. 30-56. Quote p. 34
[526] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001b)

prevent immigrants from non-EEA countries from settling in Ireland. An economically motivated immigration policy preferred EEA-migrants and highly skilled immigrants in industries with labour shortages. Those in need of political refuge and low-skilled labourers were effectively excluded, more recently against a backdrop of rising emigration figures.

7 Media content[527]

As outlined in chapter 3.2.3 the research terms were far reaching and intended to include all possible roles linked to these three immigrant groups. Therefore, it came as no surprise that the search yielded a very high number of articles in excess of 10,000 entries of which 1,471[528] were deemed relevant for this research project. Based on the articles thus extracted, the subsequent chapters endeavour to expose the most frequent roles and topics in the individual immigrant groups, to establish which newspapers reported most frequently on immigrant issues, whether one group was portrayed more often than others, whether peak periods of coverage could be shown and, finally, to discuss reasons for differential immigrant representations.

7.1.1 Frequency of coverage in the individual newspapers

According to the Census data 2006 and 2011, the number of non-nationals living in Ireland had grown by over 195,000 from 2002 to 2006 and again by almost 125,000 in the period from 2006 to 2011.[529] Based on the steep increase, the underlying assumption was that the growing number of immigrants would be reflected in a higher number of media reports in general, and particularly in relation to the three immigrant groups discussed here because of their outstanding sizes in comparison to other immigrant groups. The combined analysis of all three papers confirmed my hypothesis but at a very small margin and by far not as clearly as anticipated. The coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in Ireland trebled from 1997 to 2000 (80 vs. 255) and more than doubled from 2000 to 2004 (255 vs. 563), but remained at almost the same level between 2004 and 2010. When the results were broken down into the individual newspapers, a different picture emerged.

The Irish Times confirmed my hypothesis of rising interest with growing numbers of immigrants. Yet, after a steep rise from 1997 to 2000, the rate of growth distinctly declined in the two later periods, perhaps reflecting a normalising effect of immigration and a turn towards other topics against the backdrop of the collapse of the Irish banking and building industries

[527] At the outset of the analysis chapters, the shift to the past tense shall be addressed. This is a reflection of the fact that researchers invariably can only present results that refer to the past, even if it is the immediate past. At the same time, discourse is constantly changing so that the findings discussed here cannot include the media coverage of the present day. If the present tense were used, this would imply that results claim validity to the present day. However, discourse formations are also shaped by ruptures and inconsistencies, which, of course, cannot be foreseen. In simpler words, a newspaper's style of coverage can change over time. Therefore, there is no alternative but to use the past tense.
[528] An article was counted more than once if more than one group was discussed. If, for example, an article discussed Nigerians and Chinese, this article was counted twice (Group = Nigerians and others and group = Chinese and others).
[529] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 7

and the subsequently ensuing financial and political turmoil in the Republic. This development could also reflect a turn towards other immigrant groups, but only further research can shed light on this question. The pattern of less intense frequencies was resembled in the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun* to the point of falling numbers from 2004 to 2010, and although the drop was much less pronounced than the earlier increase, a process of stagnating interest was clearly evident. The development in the tabloid differed from the other two newspapers in so far as its coverage of Poles, Chinese and Nigerians remained at a negligible level in the first two periods and only rose by more than 1,200 per cent in 2004.

Already in 2001, Mac Éinrí noted that *The Irish Times* covered immigration related matters more extensively than the *Irish Independent.*[530] Building up on his research, I assumed that this would be the case in the coverage of specific immigrant groups as well. Furthermore, the authors of a pilot project by the EU Agency For Fundamental Rights found that the coverage of minority related issues in the UK as well as in other European countries was significantly lower in tabloids than in quality papers, and that minorities were most likely mentioned in the sports sections.[531] Since the sports sections were excluded from analysis in this study, it was expected that the coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in *The Irish Sun* would be lower than in both quality dailies. Consequently, my hypotheses in terms of frequencies was that the three papers would rank as follows: 1) *Irish Times*, 2) *Irish Independent* and 3) *Irish Sun*. This hierarchy reflects the assumptions made in hypotheses C 1 and C 2. Both hypotheses could be confirmed with one exception (cf. Table 12).

720 samples covering the three immigrant groups were found in *The Irish Times* with the *Irish Independent* following at 625 articles. While there were marked differences in 1997 (*IT* = 44, *II* = 33) and 2000 (*IT* = 151, *II* = 99), a tendency of the *Irish Independent* catching up was noted in the two later periods. In 2004 both dailies devoted 251 articles to Poles, Nigerians and Chinese, and in 2010 there was a relatively small difference of 32 articles (*IT* = 274, *II* = 242). Further research must show whether this was a temporary effect or whether the *Irish Independent* will draw level or even surpass *The Irish Times*' coverage of immigrants in terms of quantity. As expected, *The Irish Sun's* coverage was distinctly less pronounced at 126 articles overall with negligible reporting in 1997 and 2000 (3 and 5) and about the same number of articles in 2004 and 2010 (61, 57). A contributing factor to the exceptionally low numbers in the first two periods may have been that in the first years after its introduction to the Irish market

[530] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a)
[531] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2011) – preliminary results

in 1996, *The Irish Sun* drew large parts of its content from the British mother paper *The Sun*. Only later did Irish matters feature more strongly, which could explain the steep increase – albeit at an overall low level – from 2000 to 2004 (Table 12).

7.1.2 Frequency of coverage of individual immigrant groups

At the time when this study was planned, the latest statistical data available were taken from the Census 2006. All three immigrant groups discussed here had significantly grown in comparison to the Census 2002 data. While Nigerians and Chinese had about doubled, the Polish community had grown from just over 2,100 to well over 63,000. By 2011, the number of Poles in Ireland had further increased to over 120,000, making them the largest immigrant group even ahead of the British, who had traditionally held that position. Nigerians had grown by about 1,300, but the official number of Chinese nationals had dropped.[532] However, as outlined above, the number of Chinese living in Ireland was assumed to be much higher (cf. p. 71). Considering that the correlation of the media's interest and growing numbers of immigrants produced ambivalent results, I was sceptical that the relative sizes of immigrant groups would translate to the frequencies of their coverage. If so, the descending order of frequency should have been Poles, Chinese[533] and Nigerians. My scepticism proved right. In fact, the smallest group, Nigerians, received the greatest interest by far and the difference between Chinese and Poles was much less pronounced than the difference between Poles and Nigerians (Table 12). Taking into account the newsworthiness theory (cf. p. 42), this result hardly came as a surprise. Yet, it did emphasise the point that different immigrant groups were perceived in different ways in the media, and that they therefore had to be discussed individually.

7.1.3 Periods of peak coverage

In order to identify periods in which the coverage of the individual immigrant groups was extraordinarily high, all articles outside the standard deviation were extracted.[534] However, it had to be considered that each immigrant group had the chance of being recorded as just the one group (Group = x) or together with other immigrant groups (Group = xx). Therefore, the standard deviation was calculated for both cases. In the first one, the statistical population was formed by reports focusing on an immigrant group (Group = x + Focus = 1); in the second one, all articles were taken into consideration (Group = x and Group = xx). Because of the uneven distribution of articles across the individual periods and papers, there were separate calculations

[532] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 7
[533] I assume the number of Chinese to be higher than official statistics. For the test of this hypothesis, a conservative number of 30,000 was assumed. Cf. p. 71
[534] Using the STDEVP formula in Microsoft Excel

for each individual year in each of the publications. The outcome showed that the very clear majority of peaks agreed in both sets of results, justifying the decision to concentrate on those articles that only represented one immigrant group and focused on that group.

In total, 30 peaks[535] could be identified, but this figure also included periods with very low total numbers such as the coverage of Chinese in the *Irish Independent* in April 2000 (3 articles) or periods in which the co-occurrence of articles was coincidental. In order to receive more meaningful and manageable results, I investigated whether articles in a period were linked either by a common topic, an overarching topic or an external event. This process resulted in the following eight peaks (by date):

Peak	When	Who	Topic / event	Newspapers
1	06/97	Nigerians	Series of letters to the editor on Nigerian refugees	IT, II
2	05/00	Nigerians	Immigration Policy	IT, II
3	11/00	Chinese	Falun Gong arrests in China	IT
4	12/00	Nigerians	Deportations / Ebi Ojoh appeal	IT
5	08/04	Nigerians	Deportations	IT, II, IS
6	10/04	Nigerians	Crimes	II
7	04/10	Nigerians	Murder of Nigerian youth	IT, IS
8	04/10+05/10	Poles	Murder trial	IT, II, IS

Table 4: Peak coverage

The remaining peak periods did not appear to be linked by either topic or event, leading to their exclusion from the analysis. As the table above illustrates, the media's disproportionate focus on Nigerian nationals was emphasised again with 6 out of 8 peak periods focusing on this community. What is more, as the next paragraph will show, the subjects of the individual peaks fitted a set of salient roles and topics which were typically linked to the three immigrant groups. It follows that a separate discussion of peaks is obsolete, and the integration into the chapters outlined below is a reasonable choice. Therefore, peaks 1, 2, 4 and 5 are discussed in *Nigerian asylum seekers* (ch. 9.2), peak 3 forms a paragraph in *Chinese students* (ch. 9.3), peak 6 in chapter 8.1, and peaks 7 and 8 find entry in the discussion of racism (ch. 8.3.5). The Polish murder trial is discussed in the case study of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos in the chapter on victimisation (ch. 9.1).

[535] Out of a total of 432 periods (12 months by 3 groups by 3 papers by 4 years). Periods in which both Mean and STDEVP were = 0 were ignored.

7.1.4 Salient roles and topics

Having established the periods in which immigrants were portrayed most frequently, the question of how they were represented shall be turned to next. In hypotheses A and B it was assumed that the quantitative analysis would yield sets of roles and topics that were predominantly ascribed to specific immigrant groups. Table 5 below presents a collation of the three most frequent roles allocated to each immigrant group across all four periods:

Most frequent roles	**Group = x + Group = xx (N / %)**	**Group = x (N / %)**	**Group = x + Focus = 1 (N / %)**
Poles	Victim (154/35.7)	Victim (149/49.3)	Victim (130/56.5)
	Employee (53/12.3)	P/S (41/13.6)	P/S (40/17.4)
	P/S (48/11.2)	Resident (36/11.9)	Resident (20/8.7)
Nigerians	A/S (288/40)	A/S (136/35.3)	A/S (125/39.6)
	P/S (94/13)	P/S (66/17.1)	P/S (53/16.7)
	Imm. General (62/8.6)	Resident (37/9.6)	Victim (30/9.5)
Chinese	Immigrant (56/17.5)	Student (37/22.3)	Student (28/25.0)
	Student (53/16.6)	Victim (36/21.7)	Victim (25/22.3)
	Resident (47/14.7)	Resident (20/12.0)	P/S (17/15.2)

Table 5: Most frequent primary roles[536]

The table generally confirms hypotheses A 1 to A 3 and shows that there were indeed sets of roles that were frequently linked to individual immigrant groups. This table also shows that some of these role allocations were shared (e.g. *Perpetrator* / *Suspect*) whereas others were predominantly linked to individual immigrant groups. The *Asylum seeker* role, for example, was exclusively linked to Nigerians whereas the *Victim* role was predominantly ascribed to Poles and only to a lesser extent to Chinese. In a further step it was assumed that the cross-tabulation of most frequent topics and most frequent roles would confirm the results in Table 5, thereby supporting the definition of a set of core roles and topics that were repeatedly found in the representation of the individual immigrant groups:

Most frequent topics	**Group=x + Group =xx (N / %)**	**Group=x (N / %)**	**Group=x + Focus =1 (N / %)**
Poles	**Court Case (127)** Victim (80/63.0) P/S (39/30.7)	***Court Case* (120)** Victim (79/65.8) P/S (34/28.3))	***Court Case* (112)** Victim (65.2) P/S (30.4)

[536] A/S = asylum seeker; P/S = perpetrator or suspect; im.= immigration; mig.= migration

	Crime (49) Victim (42/85.7) P/S (5/10.2)	**Crime (48)** Victim (41/85.4) P/S (5/10.4))	**Crime (42)** Victim (35/83.3) P/S (5/11.9)
	Other (58) Resident (34/58.6)	**Other (44)** Resident (27/61.4)	**Accident (23)** Victim (22/95.7)
Nigerians	**Court (152)** A/S (55/36.2) P/S (53/34.9)	**Court (140)** A/S (53/37.9) P/S (48/34.3)	**Court (121)** A/S (49/40.5) P/S (41/33.9)
	Deportation (81) A/S (71/87.7)	**Crime (42)** Victim (18/42.9) P/S (16/38.1)	**Deportation (51)** A/S (46/90.2)
	Crime (77) P/S (34/44.2) Victim (23/29.9)	**Cult.contr. (35)** Politician (16/45.7) Artist (8/22.9)	**Crime (34)** Victim (16/47.1) P/S (11/32.4)
Chinese	**Court (59)** Victim (17/28.8) P/S (14/23.8)	**Court (44)** Victim (16/36.4) P/S (11/25.0))	**Court (35)** Victim (11/31.4) P/S (11/31.4)
	Immigr. Pol (38) Resident (21/55.3)	**Crime (22)** Victim (12/54.5) P/S (7/31.8))	**Crime (17)** Victim (9/52.9) P/S (6/35.2)
	Crime (32) Victim (13/40.6) P/S (13/40.7))	**Education (14)** Student (11/78.6)	**Education (12)** Student (9/75.0)

Table 6: Most frequent primary topics[537]

Table 6 confirms hypotheses B 1 to B3 stating that there were certain topics that were repeatedly linked to the individual immigrant groups. Yet, it also reveals that shared topics carried different connotations. For example, although all three groups shared the *Crime* category, Poles and Chinese were more likely to be linked to *Victim* roles whereas Nigerians were more likely to be linked to *Perpetrator / Suspect* roles within this category. Yet, *Perpetrator / Suspect* also belonged to the three most frequent role allocations in Poles and Chinese. This exemplary result from the cross-tabulation in Table 5 demonstrates that the detailed analysis further down in this study must be based on both shared and individual role allocations.

Based on the findings in Tables 4 and 5, Chapter 7 is devoted to the discussion of the shared role allocations of immigrants in criminal roles (from p. 113), immigrants as fellow residents (from p. 129) and the victimisation of immigrants (from p. 169). In addition, a section

[537] A/S = asylum seeker; P/S = perpetrator or suspect; im.= immigration; mig.= migration

on racism in the media has been included (from p. 146). Chapter 8, focuses on role allocations that were typically found in one immigrant group but not in others. For Nigerians this was *Asylum seeker* at a great margin, emphasised by topics such as *Deportation* or *Court Case* (again focusing on deportations). Nigerians seeking refuge in Ireland are discussed from p. 178. The *Student* role and *Third Level Education* were decisive in the representation of the Chinese community (from p. 220). For Poles, however, the differentiation was slightly more ambiguous. Very clearly, the *Victim* role was found most frequently in the media representation of this immigrant group. Yet, this role was also common for Nigerians and Chinese. The victimisation of immigrant groups is discussed from page 169, but a case study of the murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos pays special attention to the victimisation of Poles (from p. 178).

8 Shared role allocations

8.1 Framing immigrants in criminal roles

8.1.1 Introduction

Primary *Perpetrator* and *Suspect* roles belong to the most frequent primary role allocations in this study. In fact, the aggregate number[538] is third most frequent in all primary roles (Table 8). When broken down into a cross-analysis of the most frequent roles and topics, this result was generally confirmed. It also emerged that there was little difference between articles that only discussed one immigrant group and those that discussed several immigrant groups (cf. Table 5, Table 6). Furthermore, *Perpetrator* and *Suspect* role allocations were insignificant in comparison to other secondary role allocations (Table 9).

Across all four periods, Nigerians were more than three times as likely as Chinese to be portrayed as (potential) criminals with Poles about in the middle of the two groups (Table 8). However, such a comparison is quite general, and a breakdown into the individual years yields more meaningful results. All but one articles on *Poles* were found in 2010 (Table 22), revealing an enormous jump following the large scale arrival of Poles after 2004. *Nigerians*, on the other hand, were by far most likely to be represented in these roles in 2004. This was the case for all three newspapers albeit at varying levels (Table 23). About the same proportional representations were found for Chinese but at a distinctly lower overall level (Table 24).

In the sections below these figures will first be set against official crime statistics and the likelihood of immigrants to commit crimes, and then those periods with most intense *Perpetrator / Suspect* role allocations in *Nigerians* and *Poles* will be investigated.

8.1.2 Over-representation of immigrants in crime statistics, prisons and the media

In order to set the figures above into context, the likelihood of members of an immigrant group to be represented as a suspect or perpetrator in the media was compared with their likelihood to commit a crime and the likelihood to be sent to prison for having committed a crime. Literature on immigrants and crime is scarce. An overview of current publications on immigrants to Ireland suggests that none of the most recent (and older) publications on immigration to Ireland contained a chapter on immigrants committing crimes and the representation of which in the media. Moreover, the word crime did not even appear in the

[538] Because of their similar nature *Perpetrator* and *Suspect* roles have been aggregated for analysis.

indexes.[539] Haynes, Power & Devereux discussed crime under the general question of how politicians construct transnational migrants. However, they drew conclusions from 6 articles appearing in the *Irish Independent* between 01/01/08 and 31/12/09 so that their results were based on a very limited number of samples.[540] At an international level, there is very limited research too[541] with studies by Bell and colleagues and Papadopoulos investigating the link of immigrants and crime in England and Wales offering the (culturally) closest results to Ireland.[542]

In a first step, the percentage of perpetrator / suspect representations in relation to all articles referring to an individual group in a year were extracted. It emerged that Nigerians were most likely to be represented in such a negative role in the first three periods but least likely in 2010. The aggregate figure for this group was around 25 per cent in 1997 and 2000 but had dropped to 20 per cent in 2004 and further to 5 per cent in 2010. In contrast, Chinese had no such role allocation in 1997, only one in 2000 but had risen to over 14 and 17 per cent by 2004 and 2010 respectively. For Poles, in analogy with their later arrival, this process was even further delayed with no such allocations in the first two periods, only one in 2004 but 40 in 2010 (15.4 %).

Arguably, the role of suspect could be interpreted as less negative than perpetrator because suspects still had the chance of being acquitted (although this was still a role eliciting negative connotations). Therefore, the same procedure as above was repeated for perpetrator roles only. The results were modestly different but not to a degree that would have changed the overall picture. The most notable difference was in *Poles*, who were represented as perpetrators in less than half of all perpetrator / suspect role allocations in 2010. Consequently, the proportion of all articles fell to just under 7 per cent compared to more than double this figure for the aggregate roles. For Nigerians, the figure had fallen to just under 12 per cent in 2004, which was considerably lower than the aggregate one but still high. The remaining results remained at around the same level as the combined ones. Hence, early evidence suggested that some immigrant groups had a higher chance of being portrayed in the negative roles of perpetrator or suspects than others at certain points in time. Whether this early indication of over-

[539] Cf. for example LOYAL (2011), FANNING (2011), FANNING (2012), FANNING (2007)
[540] HAYNES, POWER and DEVEREUX (2010), pp. 32-5.
[541] Haynes, Power and Devereux cite three sources that investigated the link between immigrants and crime but they either focused on Australia or investigated the 1990s. HAYNES, POWER and DEVEREUX (2010), p. 32
[542] Cf. BELL, FASANI and MACHIN (2010), Papadopolous (2010)

representation was of substance was then investigated by resorting to statistical evidence on immigrant crime rates in Ireland.

However, this was not a straightforward task. While the Central Statistics Office held data on the nature and frequency of crimes in Ireland, the tables did not reveal who committed them in terms of nationality. The next best bet was the Irish Prison Service that recorded the nationality of inmates, but not for 1997 and 2000. Furthermore, the nationality category only disclosed ethnic background (i.e. African, Asian, EU) but not the country of origin. Another problem was that the number of immigrants imprisoned was not a direct indicator of immigrants' affinity to criminality, as will be explained in greater detail below. Nevertheless, the percentage of members of an immigrant community in prison in Ireland compared to the share of that immigrant group in the Irish population should generally be suitable as an indicator of whether Africans, Asians and EU migrants (including Nigerians, Chinese and Poles) were overrepresented in penal institutions and whether the media reflected this.

The results for 2004 showed that both Nigerians and Chinese were overrepresented in Irish prisons, the former to a greater extent. Over 4 per cent of inmates in Irish prisons were of African origin in that year, whereas their share in the population was less than 0.5 per cent. Asian nationals formed just under 2.5 per cent of inmates but only 1.25 per cent of the entire population. Even if non-nationals detained under immigration law (more than half of all non-nationals in prison) were allowed for, there was still a clear over-representation (assuming that Nigerians as the top asylum seeking nation in that year were disproportionately affected by this effect).[543] In 2004, the media did not only mirror this over-representation, they exceeded it clearly. Only taking into account perpetrators (and not suspects), members of both groups were represented as culprits in almost 12 per cent of all articles on the respective group. It goes without saying that not all perpetrators received a prison sentence but the tendency to over-represent criminal behaviour of immigrants was clearly shown.

By 2010, the pictured had changed. Africans and Asians alike were still overrepresented in prisons, but the over-representation of Nigerians in newspapers had dropped considerably with Chinese remaining at about the same level.[544] This development was a strong indicator for the media's shift away from Nigerians with the arrival of considerably fewer asylum seekers in

[543] For prison data cf. IRISH PRISON SERVICE (2005). For population data cf. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (2008a), p. 11
[544] Africans (Chinese) in prison: 3.8% (3%); in the population: 0.92% (1.45%); in papers (perpetrator/suspect): 5% (17.6%); in papers (perpetrator): 4% (11.8%). IRISH PRISON SERVICE (2011), CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)

the country in the second half of the decade. This was in line with my findings that Nigerian asylum seekers were less often portrayed in a negative fashion in 2010 (cf. p. 201). Therefore, although there was no direct link of Nigerian asylum seekers to crime (secondary roles, topics), these findings suggest that the media frequently portrayed Nigerians as criminals as long as the number of asylum seekers arriving in the country was high. With the arrival of a large number of EU migrants after the accession of ten East European countries to the EU in 2004, their share of the prison population had risen to 10.9 per cent at a share of 8.5 per cent in the total population.[545] With Poles being the largest group of EU migrants by far, it was to be expected that the over-representation of EU-migrants in prison was tantamount to an over-representation of Poles. In the media, they were frequently seen as either suspects or perpetrators (15.5 % of all articles on *Poles*) but less often as perpetrators only (6.9%); yet, this was still an over-representation.[546]

No consistent trend emerged in the comparison of newspapers. The allocation of perpetrator / suspect roles increased in *The Irish Times* and *The Irish Sun* throughout all periods if at a slower pace from 2004 to 2010, but the number of articles in the *Irish Independent* peaked in 2004 and then fell. This was true for both aggregate perpetrator / suspect roles and individual roles. From 2004 to 2010, *The Irish Times* passed the *Irish Independent* both in absolute and relative figures (Table 34). This development came as a surprise and apparently ran counter the general hypothesis that the *IT* reported in a fairer fashion than the *II*, which would have suggested a decreasing over-representation of immigrants in perpetrator / suspect roles in *The Irish Times*. More detailed analysis in the next section may shed more light on this aspect.

Although the data above suggested an over-representation of immigrants in Irish prisons, these findings call for some attenuation. There were methodological issues that could not be resolved within the scope of this paper. In Ireland, the data for nationality as indicated by persons on committal to prison differed greatly from a snapshot profile on any day. In 2010, the share of non-nationals in Irish prisons on committal was 22.2 per cent[547], whereas only 10.7 per cent of inmates were non-nationals on 30 November 2010. The latter method was described in the report as "perhaps the most reliable indicator of the profile of prisoners we have within the system."[548] On the other hand, the 2004 report used the nationality indicated on the day of

[545] IRISH PRISON SERVICE (2011), CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[546] Poles accounted for 2.7% of the total population. CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a)
[547] IRISH PRISON SERVICE (2011), p. 15
[548] IRISH PRISON SERVICE (2011), p. 11

committal to highlight the share of other nationalities. In any case, Ireland belonged to the lower third of countries with a difference in imprisonment rates of nationals and non-nationals.[549] Notwithstanding these methodological issues, a clear tendency to over-represent immigrants was evident in the media, albeit at different levels in individual periods and newspapers.

I then wondered whether the overrepresentation of immigrants in prisons and criminal behaviour by immigrants in the media correlated with a higher inclination to commit a crime. As explained above, neither statistics nor literature were readily available for Ireland. Two studies carried out in England and Wales belonged to the few exceptions to the astounding muteness on this topic amongst academics. Because of the cultural proximity and similar immigration patterns after the EU enlargement (both countries opened their labour markets to immigrants from the accession states), the results of these studies should be comparable to the Irish situation at least at a general level.

Investigating the effect of post-2004 immigration of EU citizens and asylum seekers in England and Wales on crime rates, Bell and colleagues found that areas where EU-migrants settled tended to show falling property crimes with no effect on violent crimes. In respect of asylum seekers they noted a modest increase in property crimes but not in violent ones.[550] The higher likelihood of asylum seekers to engage in property crimes was explained by their reduced ability to participate in the labour market, whereas EU-migrants came with the specific intention and opportunity to work. These findings could be traced to the economic model of crime, in which

> individuals choose between crime and legal labour market work depending on the potential returns each sector offers. The 'returns' from crime are calculated relative to the probability of getting caught and the expected sanction if caught and this is then compared to the labour market earnings from employment.[551]

Using a different approach, Papadopoulos confirmed these findings. Like Bell et al., he found out that immigrants were generally slightly less likely to commit a crime than natives.[552] Against the backdrop of these studies, newspapers investigated in this study contributed to presenting a distorted image of immigrants' likelihood to commit a crime. Through the over-representation of criminal roles they provided a field of projection for negative attitudes towards migrants, as the following table illustrates:

[549] BELL and MACHIN (2011), p. 83
[550] BELL, FASANI and MACHIN (2010)
[551] BELL and MACHIN (2011), p. 11
[552] PAPADOPOULOS (2010)

Year	Group	Prison (percentage of total prison population)	Population (percentage of total population)	In papers *Perpetrator* and *Suspect* (percentage of group)	In papers *Perpetrator* only (percentage of group)
1997	African			6/24 (25)	4/24 (16,7)
	Asian			0/28	0/28
	EU			0/5	0/5
2000	African			16/61 (26.2)	13/61 (21.3)
	Asian			1/27 (3.7)	0/27
	EU			0/8	0/8
2004	African	374 (4.24)	19,744 (0.47)	42/204 (20.5)	24/204 (11,76)
	Asian	217 (2.46)	52,345 (1.25)	11/77 (14,3)	9/77 (11.68)
	EU			1/29 (3.4)	0/29
2010	African	3.8%	41642 (0.92)	5/99 (5.05)	4/99 (4.04)
	Asian	3.0%	65579 (1.45)	6/34 (17.6)	4/34 (11.76)
	EU	10.9%	386764 (8.55)	40/260 (15.4)	18/260 (6,9)

Table 7: Immigrant prison population

8.1.3 Nigerians, Poles and Chinese in criminal roles

In the discussion of criminal roles all articles were taken into consideration irrespective of whether they referred to one immigrant group or one group and others. This decision was made because if a perpetrator or suspect was identified, this identification usually referred to one specific person or a small number of persons, and the articles in this study suggested that these people were often of the same nationality. Not infrequently the victim was of a different nationality (cf. the murder of a Malawian national below), which meant that the article discussed several immigrant groups but the perpetrator / suspect role was still allocated to people of one nationality only.

Perpetrator and suspect role allocations were at a relatively low level in 1997 and 2000 (6 and 25) but rose to 75 in 2004 before falling to 66 in 2010. In 2004, almost three quarters of these role allocations concerned Nigerians (54) with Chinese reaching 20. Presumably because of their recent arrival, Poles played virtually no role in that year. This, however, had changed by 2010 when 47 out of 66 perpetrator or suspect roles identified Polish nationals with Nigerians and Chinese sharing the remainder at 10 and 9 role allocations respectively (Table 35). Therefore, this section will have a closer look at the representation of Nigerians and Chinese in 2004 and Poles in 2010. Particular attention was paid to the question whether a negative campaign against Nigerians could be shown against the backdrop of the Citizenship referendum in June of that year.

Based on the studies by Bell and colleagues and Papadopoulos in England and Wales, and assuming that these results could generally be transferred to the Irish situation (see above), I expected that the media linked Nigerians to immigration crimes because of the Citizenship referendum and to property crimes because of their limited access to the labour market. Likewise, 2010 should show an increase in property crimes in Poles as an effect of increased unemployment after the failure of the building industry in which many Poles were employed. In respect of violent crimes, I expected a small number of high-profile cases that made it into the media based on the newsworthiness theory (cf. p. 42). In order to test these hypotheses, a further category that established the type of crime was introduced. The analysis revealed how frequently newspapers linked immigrants to person or property crimes (including fraud), drug related crimes or immigration crimes (cf. code book).

Nigerians

The analysis showed that Nigerians in 2004 were predominantly linked to violent crimes and fraud (25 and 16 cases, cf. Table 36). These two types of crime accounted for more than two thirds of articles discussing potential criminal activities of Nigerians. In respect of individual newspapers, the *Irish Independent* represented Nigerians as perpetrators or suspects most frequently with more than half of all articles (28) followed by *The Irish Times* (20) and *The Irish Sun* (5). Both broadsheets covered a range of types of crime with an emphasis on violent crimes and fraud. The tabloid, on the other hand, almost exclusively reported on violent crimes, albeit at an overall low number (Table 36).

As expected, the 25 violent cases could be traced to a small number of events with a higher profile (Table 37). At 15 out of 25, more than half of all articles covering violent crimes allegedly committed by Nigerians reported on the death of a young woman whose decomposed, decapitated body was found in a plastic bag by a river in Co. Kilkenny, and in which a number of Nigerians were represented as suspects in the media.[553]

Between 4 August 2004 and 15 October 2004, 15 articles covering the murder of Paiche Onyemaechi were identified as making a reference to Nigerian nationals with 5 articles being published in each newspaper. This case made it into the news because the circumstances surrounding it fulfilled a number of news factors (cf. ch. 4.1). Foremost, the death of this woman

[553] Another case concerned the death of a boy who died as a consequence of a botched circumcision carried out by a Nigerian couple (Table 37). This event was more ambiguous than a murder case and was not covered by *The Irish Sun*. Therefore, despite the drawbacks in the coding process, the murder of the Malawian woman was better suited.

was negative, unambiguous and fitted the frequency of the publication cycle of newspapers. The negativity factor was most pronounced in *The Irish Sun*, titling *We'll hunt down Body-In-Bag Killer* as opposed to the *Irish Times' Brother of dead woman appeals for help* or the *Irish Independent's Murdered woman was 'full of joy' says shocked brother*.[554] Whereas the *II's* headline had a more emotional appeal than the *IT's*, both did not convey the sense of crisis and the almost animalistic reference to the yet unknown perpetrator(s) in *hunt down* in *The Irish Sun's* headline. Moreover, both the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun* insinuated that the killing may have been a ritual one early in the coverage of the case[555], touching upon the imagined mystery surrounding the crime and alluding to the construction of the African continent as an exotic place where bizarre rituals were allegedly daily business.[556] Although *The Irish Times* later also mentioned that the Gardaí investigated the possibility of a ritual murder, it did not do so early in the coverage when this could have provided an easy explanation but only at a time when two weeks of interrogations had not produced results.[557] When it emerged that the victim had been the daughter of the chief justice of Malawi, a reference to elite people was added to the equation, ensuring that the event stayed in the news.

Nigerians in this case were represented as suspects who were either arrested for questioning or wanted for questioning, amongst them the victim's husband. Out of the 15 articles, 14 had received a negative connotation with only one neutral article in *The Irish Times*. However, the quantitative data yielded little information on how the suspect was represented as, according to the code book, the presence of a negative topic alone justified a negative connotation. Therefore, exemplary qualitative analysis was necessary to demonstrate varying representations that quantitative data could not map. The references to the man varied a great deal in the individual newspapers as the following sections will show, also taking into consideration the general tone of the article. The selected articles appeared between 12 August 2004 (*IS*) and 19 August 2004 (*IT*) with the shared characteristic of focussing in some way on the suspect(s) rather than the victim.

In *The Irish Sun*, the headline, the first three and the last paragraph referred to the victim whereas the less important middle section gave some background information on the victim:

[554] MURPHY (04/08/04); MCNAMARA (06/08/04); ANONYMOUS (04/08/04)
[555] MURPHY (04/08/04); MCNAMARA (06/08/04)
[556] The notion of exoticism is borrowed from Edward Said's concept of Orientalism, cf. LEITCH (2010), pp. 1991-2012
[557] LALLY (14/10/04)

> BODY-IN-BAG SUSPECT MAY STILL BE HERE
>
> Cops hunting a Nigerian pimp suspected of murdering his prostitute wife and chopping off her head believe he is still in Ireland.
>
> An alert has gone out to all airports and ferry terminals for Customs and Immigration officials to be on the lookout for missing 31-year-old Chika Onyemaechi.
>
> He failed to attend his Malawi-born wife Paiche's funeral 13 days ago, a week after her headless body was found in a bin bag at Branor Bridge in Piltown, Co. Kilkenny.
>
> […]
>
> After coming to Ireland, she [the victim] began working as a prostitute with her husband acting as her pimp.[558]

The expected sensationalist approach in *The Irish Sun* showed both in the headline and the way the crime was referred to. The death of the woman was dubbed the *Body-In-Bag* case, creating a unique characteristic title which alluded to the brutal manner in which the crime had been carried out, thereby making it more easily identifiable to *IS* readers. What is more, the information that the suspect *may still be here*, added to a sense of urgency, thereby introducing a crisis element. This atmosphere was reinforced in the opening sentence by the verb *hunt*, which had two functions. Apart from supporting urgency, it also invalidated the identification of the victim's husband as a suspect. The representation of the man as a pimp in connection with the *alert* referred to in the second paragraph characterised him as a figure at the margins of society, who had to be caught in a speedy fashion in order to protect society from further harm. The allusion to the man's Nigerian origin did not hold any informative value, and without this unnecessary reference the reader would not have learnt less about the crime. This was rather an attempt to confirm conscious or unconscious conjectures of latent racism in the readers[559] that nothing good could be expected of Nigerians, supporting a negative image of this minority group in Ireland. Through the repetition of the characterisation as a pimp, the article closed with a negative portrayal in a prominent position. Taken as a whole, this article did not represent Chika Onyemaechi as a person to whom the investigators in the crime wished to talk or as an innocent-until-proven suspect but left little doubt that he should be seen as a ruthless criminal who killed his wife in a brutal manner.

Although the representation in the *Irish Independent* also included some sensationalist elements, its characterisation of the suspect was much more balanced:

[558] McNamara (12/08/04)
[559] For a more detailed discussion of racism in the Irish media cf. ch. 8.3

> Garda plea for help in woman's death probe
>
> THE murder hunt team investigating the brutal death of a Malawi woman have appealed for help in catching her killer.
>
> [...]
>
> The woman's Nigerian husband Chika is still missing. Gardai believe he may now have left the country; inquiries have switched to the continent.
>
> [...][560]

The sensationalist elements were expressed in the *murder hunt team* and the use of *killer*, which conveyed a sense of raw violence. However, the reference to the victim's husband was much less biased than in *The Irish Sun*. The information that he was still missing and that inquiries had switched to the continent were more suitable to represent him as a person to whom the Gardaí wanted to talk. Moreover, the man was mentioned in the middle of the article and thus in a less prominent position than in the tabloid paper. In no way did the *II* article create the same sense of crisis as the tabloid one. Yet, in this case the mentioning of the nationality was irrelevant as well. It therefore unnecessarily linked Nigerians in Ireland to violent crimes although the article as a whole did not suggest a similarly negative portrayal as *The Irish Sun*.

The irrelevant mentioning of nationality was also found in *The Irish Times*, which nevertheless presented the most balanced coverage of the case. Where the *IS* and the *II* referred to a *murder hunt*, the *IT* spoke of *an investigation into the death of a Malawian woman*. The reference to the husband in the middle of the article was rather neutral:

> The two men arrested yesterday are both believed to be Nigerian nationals and gardai are investigating the possibility that one of them may be related the dead woman's Nigerian-born husband, Mr Chika Onyemaechi.[561]

Generally, the role of the suspects in this case was presented in a much more careful approach evidenced in the formulations *believed to be* and *the possibility*. The choice of words in this case clearly allowed for the possibility that the suspects were unrelated to the crime. The victim's husband's portrayal was subtly different from that in the *Irish Independent*, and the subtleties created a different, more positive, yet not definitely positive effect. In the *IT* he was introduced as *the dead woman's Nigerian-born husband, Mr Chika Onyemaechi.* At first glance, the mentioning of the nationality seemed to make sense as it created a potential link between the two men being questioned by the gardaí and the missing husband. However, it was

[560] QUINN (14/08/04)
[561] O'BRIEN (19/08/04)

as irrelevant as in the other two articles because, as before, the informative value would not have been diminished if the nationality had not been mentioned. Nevertheless, the portrayal was still more positive since the reference of *Nigerian-born* included a greater sense of inclusion in Irish society than the adjective Nigerian on its own. Although this formulation was without doubt a conscious choice that reflected the author's awareness of exclusionary practices, the attenuated, yet unnecessary reference to the Nigerian origin defeated this purpose as it did contain an exclusionary element after all. To strengthen this point, one might ask which vital information would have been lost if the author had entirely discarded the nationality. And the answer must be: none. Despite this point, the portrayal as *Mr* stood in stark contrast to the representation as *Nigerian pimp* in *The Irish Sun* or *Nigerian husband Chika* (without the family name) in the *Irish Independent*. The more positive tone was carried forward to the reason why the gardaí had expressed a wish to talk to him. Instead of a murder hunt, the *IT* stated the reasons in the following way, which presented a very different picture in comparison to the sensational creation of urgency in the *IS* and, to some degree, in the *II*:

> Gardaí, who have said they are anxious to interview Mr Onyemaechi, have expressed concern for his safety.[562]

A total of 25 articles on violent crimes and 16 on property crimes such as fraud arguably seemed relatively small numbers. There were more than 72,000 thefts and related offences in Ireland in 2004,[563] and according to Bell and colleagues in conjunction with Census 2006 data (the closest available to 2004), approximately 280 theft and related offences should have been committed by Nigerian nationals.[564] The over-representation of violent offences or cases in which Nigerians were suspected to have played a role in violent crimes had therefore to be seen in the context of the media's under-representation of property and immigration crimes to the point of not reporting them at all. This contributed to the construction of a distorted image of Nigerians based on deviant violent behaviour and stereotypical crimes such as money fraud. In 2004, the *Irish Independent* was most likely to engage in such representations but *The Irish Times*, despite its more balanced style of reporting, was not free of them either, mainly due to unnecessary references to nationality. However, judging from the distribution of articles over the months of the year, a negative campaign just before and after the referendum in June could not be shown as articles were distributed relatively evenly throughout the year (Table 40).

[562] O'BRIEN (19/08/04)
[563] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (g)
[564] Since the census data do not reveal how many Nigerians were asylum seekers, this figure assumes that the crimes committed by Nigerians were as likely as those committed by Irish.

However, the lower number of Nigerian asylum seekers arriving in the country in the latter half of the decade correlated with distinctly fewer representations as perpetrators and suspects in 2010, suggesting that at varying degrees the media at least implicitly linked negative criminal roles to the arrival of larger numbers of Nigerian asylum seekers even if the status was not clearly stated in the article (cf. Table 35). Although the focus had switched to Polish perpetrators and suspects by 2010 because of the larger number of these Eastern Europeans in the country, the number of articles had not risen at the same ratio as the number of Poles arriving.

Poles

The focus on person crimes was even more evident with Polish nationals in 2010. Out of the total of 47 articles, 29 represented Poles as perpetrators or suspects in person crimes. Property crimes and drug related offences, in comparison, featured hardly at all (Table 41). Across individual papers, the broadsheets followed the same pattern although the trend towards person crimes was more distinguished in the *Irish Independent*. *The Irish Sun* tabloid focused almost entirely on person crimes at an overall low total of 7 samples. As in the case of Nigerian perpetrators and suspects, 24 articles portraying Poles as (potential) culprits did not appear entirely out of proportion at a Polish population of over 120,000[565] in Ireland. When this figure was set against a total coverage of 260 articles on *Poles* in 2010 though, it emerged that members of the Polish community had a chance of being portrayed as a perpetrator or suspect in person crimes of almost 1 in 10 articles. In this light, perpetrator / suspect roles in person crimes were vastly over-represented. On the other hand, more than two thirds of articles on violent crimes referred to just two court cases (Table 42), and, taking context into consideration, Poles were much more likely to be represented as victims in 2010 (cf. ch. 9.1). The trouble is, though, that articles on culprits and victims do not balance each other out i.e. there is no imagined legitimacy to represent an immigrant group more often as culprits if the number of articles on victims remains high. However, although Poles were generally over-represented as victims, the portrayal of culprits varied in the individual newspapers.

A closer analysis of the most frequently covered case, the trial of a woman who had beaten her child to death and had absconded to England while on bail in 2005, illustrated these differences in the portrayal of the accused in the three newspapers well. The case first appeared in all three papers on 22 January 2010 when the woman was charged with unlawfully killing

[565] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a). The Census 2011 data were the closest available to 2010.

her daughter and ordered to remain in custody after she had been arrested and returned to Ireland a few days earlier. On 13 April 2010 only the *IT* informed that a date for the trial was set but interest returned in all papers once the trial was underway on 13 May 2010. A week later, all three newspapers reported on the verdict, and on that day the *II* report was the only one in the entire series not by the same author. This paper also published an editorial on 26 May 2010. The fact that 9 out of 11 articles were by the same author offered a unique opportunity to investigate differences in the reporting styles of the three dailies. It could be shown that either the author herself had been asked to adapt her writing to the papers' general reporting styles, or the editors had changed her original articles to that effect.

In respect of how the accused was referred to and how the crime was portrayed, there emerged differences in between the newspapers but also in temporal shifts in the representation. Apart from irrelevant references to the woman's personal background, *The Irish Times* reported in a relatively neutral fashion. The *Irish Independent* had a more sensationalist tinge to its coverage, and in *The Irish Sun* tabloid shifted from relatively neutral coverage to casting the accused as a monster. Although the reports in both broadsheets were generally almost verbatim, subtle differences demonstrated the editors' and / or author's decision to employ different styles. In this analysis it is argued that, to varying degrees, the defendant's representation as an aberrant foreigner placed her at the margins of society.

When the case first appeared in the papers, the *IT* introduced the accused as "a 34-YEAR-OLD *woman*"[566] whereas the *II* referred to her as "a 34-YEAR-OLD *mother*."[567] The *Irish Independent's* editor's decision to refer to her as *a mother* was a conscious decision to highlight the violation of family values allegedly only shared by the majority group as a *mother* killing her own child presented the crime as more severe than a *woman* killing her child. The coverage of the actual trial on 13 May 2010 was of a similar fashion than that of the defendant's first appearance before a court. As in the three reports in January, the *IT* referred to her as *woman*, the *II* as *mother*, but the *IS* added an attribute in "A HEARTLESS mum."[568] Employing the more familiar form of mother, the *IS* created a stark contrast between a person who was supposed to give all her love and care to her family and a heartless person acting in cold blood, thus highlighting the deviant behaviour of the defendant. This portrayal foreshadowed *The Irish Sun*'s casting of the mother as an evil monster upon conviction. On 20 May 2010 the convict

[566] LUCEY (22/01/10a). (My emphasis in italics)
[567] LUCEY (22/01/10b). (My emphasis in italics)
[568] LUCEY (13/05/10a); LUCEY (13/05/10b); LUCEY (13/05/10c)

was identified as a horrible monster that was *caged* rather than imprisoned.[569] It was noticeable that these monster metaphors were restricted to the first paragraphs of the article and thus in a very prominent position to which the reader paid more attention than to the middle:

> IRELAND'S most evil mum was jailed for four years yesterday for beating her three-year-old daughter to death.
>
> Brute Monika Paczkowska, 34, battered terrified Sefora Kycwak so badly after she wet the bed that the toddler was left with SEVENTY injuries.
>
> [...]
>
> Vile Paczkowska pleaded guilty to the wilful ill treatment of little Sefora in a manner likely to cause injury.
>
> And caging her at the Central Criminal Court in Tralee yesterday Judge Carroll Moran noted the "savage nature of the assault on a defenceless child of three and a half years of age."[570]

Although at a lower register than the broadsheets, the remainder of the article followed a relatively neutral style. This was a further strong indicator that the original report by Anne Lucey had been altered to this effect. The *IT* and *II*, on the other hand, generally followed their earlier styles with the *II* representing the woman in a more sensationalist tone.[571]

This sensationalist tone, geared towards negativity, could also be illustrated in the *Irish Independent's* article of 20 May 2010 by Barry Duggan, who wrote

> Sefora Kycwak died after suffering 70 separate injuries at the hands of her Roma gypsy mother, Monika Paczkowska. [...] Paczkowska, who is a Polish national, has married twice and had six children with three different fathers. The court previously heard that she was raped by four men at the age of 14. She arrived in Ireland in 2000 as an asylum seeker and was given the status of an Irish-born citizen in 2002.[572]

Such irrelevant, out of context references to the defendant's nationality, personal background and legal status could be found in all papers. Only one article[573] mentioned that her personal background and her isolated position as a foreigner (considering that the woman was reportedly awarded citizen status in 2002, this categorisation raised questions too, of course) were considered as mitigating factors in sentencing the woman. Otherwise, this information was usually presented in an out of context manner as in the example above. From the start, *The Irish Sun* had introduced her as "a POLISH woman,"[574] portraying her as a member of a

[569] LUCEY (20/05/10a)
[570] LUCEY (20/05/10a)
[571] LUCEY (20/05/10b); DUGGAN (20/05/10)
[572] DUGGAN (20/05/10)
[573] LUCEY (20/05/10b)
[574] LUCEY (22/01/10c)

minority group. This characterisation was later intensified by adding that she was also a member of the Roma community. Although both other papers identified her as *a member of the Polish Roma community* in the first articles as well, they did so in a slightly less direct manner by presenting the nationality as additional information whereas the *IS* presented it as defining information.

In any case, this identification was entirely irrelevant because it had no relation whatsoever to the nature of the crime. Whether consciously or unconsciously, this representation resulted in a triple exclusion from Irish society by representing the accused as non-Irish, a member of the Roma community and as a (former) asylum seeker. Like Ireland's Traveller community, the Roma were arguably seen as one of the minority groups most excluded from Irishness. In terms of the newsworthiness of the event, this detail was not unimportant. In addition to negativity, the fitting frequency and the innocence of the victim, there was also an element of expectedness because the negative perception of this group also included ascribing a higher likelihood to commit (serious) crimes, which was reinforced by all three papers by confirming the membership to the Roma community and, at times, her (former) status as an asylum seeker.

For a case to reach a high profile and continued coverage in newspapers, a number of factors usually coincide. The defendant's origin and legal status were not the sole factors for the media's interest in the trial, but by reinforcing the negative perception of this immigrant group in society, they certainly contributed a great deal to lifting this event into the news in all three papers. To varying degrees, most pronounced in *The Irish Sun* tabloid and least in *The Irish Times*, all three engaged in some form of othering the culprit. In a Foucauldian sense, she was classified as a person from whom society had to be protected.[575] Through the employment of various techniques she was placed at the margins of society. The reference to the number of her children and previous partners were used to this effect in the same way as Sean Keogh and David Curran were excluded from societal consensus (cf. p. 178), further reinforced by *The Irish Sun's* monster frame and the perpetual irrelevant link to her origin.

We were also presented with an apparently paradox situation. Although all three papers reported on mitigating factors that were considered in arriving at a sentence, *The Irish Sun* clearly disagreed with them by titling, *Just 4 years jail for mum who beat her bed-wetting girl to death*,[576] and so did Kevin Myers' editorial in the *Irish Independent* on 26 May 2010.[577]

[575] Cf. FOUCAULT (2003a), pp. 255-6
[576] LUCEY (20/05/10a)
[577] MYERS (26/05/10)

Hence, despite frequent references to factors that illustrated the woman's difficult situation at this point in life, the *II* and the *IS* used them against the accused. Moreover, the *Irish Independent* columnist mocked the plight of the woman in a cynical fashion.

> What are we to take from this? That foreigners who commit offences in Ireland are to be punished more lightly than Irish people, because they're isolated? (Though in Paczkowska's case, to judge from her busy obstetric habits, not all that isolated) And that the more terrible a crime, and the more opprobrium it therefore attracts, the more clemency results? […] Let me close on some good news. Paczkowska did not entirely waste her time on the run. Since Sefora's untimely death, she has had a sixth child by a fourth father.[578]

Comments like these are in crude denial of the fact that practices of social exclusion through classification (e.g. Roma, asylum seeker) place members of minority groups at the margins of society and thereby contribute to conditions that may lead members of disadvantaged groups into criminal behaviour. This is, of course, not an apologetic appeal to tolerate criminal behaviour, but a call to consider the circumstances in which crimes are committed – as the court did in this case. Most notably, the *II* and *IS* did not recognise that societal constraints were contributing factors to the defendant's exigency, and, in turn, it also meant that the frequent irrelevant references to the personal circumstances and nationality served the purpose of ousting the defendant from society. Apart from its negativity and the innocence of the victim, the representation of the culprit as an aberrant foreigner played a major role in the high profile of this event. It was therefore no coincidence that this was the most frequently covered violent crime in Polish perpetrator / suspect roles.

Chinese

Chinese nationals' representation in the Irish media differed from that of Nigerians and Poles. Although the number of Chinese arriving in Ireland had grown considerably by 2010, the interest in Chinese perpetrators and suspects peaked in 2004 albeit at a comparatively low number of 20 articles. In contrast to Poles and Nigerians, there was no clear over-emphasis of violent crimes (7 articles) although they were still more frequent than drug related crimes (5 articles) with property crimes almost not featuring at all (3 articles; cf. Table 43). The *Irish Independent* took the greatest interest in Chinese perpetrators and suspects with almost three quarters appearing in this daily whereas *The Irish Times* published five articles in that year. In both quality papers the types of crimes were relatively evenly represented with a slight emphasis on violent crimes in the *II*. In the *IT*, though, drug related crimes were covered in two articles

[578] In his clearly racist editorial of 26 May 2010 Kevin Myers argued that the sentence Ms Paczkowska received was too lenient and claimed that foreigners were less severely punished than 'indigenous' Irish. MYERS (26/05/10)

and only one violent crime was considered. At the other end of the spectrum, *The Irish Sun* only covered 2 events, one of which was a violent crime. Unlike in the other two immigrant groups, a case that reached a high profile in the media could not be identified. Hence, although Chinese nationals were most frequently covered in criminal roles in 2004, and although violent crimes were over-represented – if at a lower level than in the other immigrant groups – framing techniques could not be demonstrated in the same way as in relation to the other two immigrant groups.

***

This chapter showed that particularly from 2004 immigrant groups were over-represented as perpetrators or suspects in Irish newspapers despite the fact that immigrants were generally less likely to commit crimes than indigenous Irish with Chinese nationals being less affected than Nigerians and Poles. This mis-representation of criminal behaviour by immigrants was further fuelled by an over-emphasis of violent crimes, which generally occurred much less frequently than property crimes. *The Irish Sun* tabloid paper engaged in negative representations to the greatest extent and *The Irish Times* broadsheet to the least. Nevertheless, even this quality paper was not entirely free of casting immigrants as aberrant, psychologically displacing them to the margins of society, as the coverage of the Paczkowska case in 2010 illustrated. In 2004, when larger numbers of Nigerians were arriving in the country, this group was particularly affected by negative representations, suggesting a negative focus on this immigrant group. In respect of reporting styles, the varying intensity of sensationalist characteristics in the individual newspapers suggested that hypotheses D1 to D3 could be verified in this part of the study.

8.2 Immigrants in resident roles

8.2.1 Introduction

Similar to other roles discussed in this study, *Resident* belonged to the more frequent role allocations. At the same time, this role was more difficult to encode than most of the remaining ones. As per the code book, a resident role was to be allocated when a member of the Polish, Nigerian or Chinese communities was portrayed as a member of the general public, a resident or citizen, which can be subject to blurry boundaries despite a clear definition in the code book. A host of other roles such as *Politician, Professional* and *Clergy* etc. allowed for a relatively detailed analysis of the portrayal of immigrant groups. However, because of its broad definition, the *Resident* role had the potential to link immigrants to mundane topics, potentially trivialising

them in the same way as (some) Irish nationals. It was therefore hypothesised that if immigrants had the chance to be trivialised, this could act as an indicator for the state of integration of immigrant groups in society (if at the cost of irrelevant references to nationality). On the other hand, if such a trivialisation could not be shown, it was assumed that the *Resident* category should reflect the general results of this study, hence function as a sort of control category.

When all groups were considered, *Resident* was slightly less frequent than *Immigrant general*. However, in all three groups *Immigrant general* was more often found in general discussions of immigrants (Group + other immigrant groups) whereas *Resident* was more frequent in articles specifically discussing only one immigrant group (Table 8). Assuming that results would become more reliable the more specific articles were, the analysis here focuses on resident roles rather than *Immigrant general*. There were a total of 93 articles that had received a resident role allocation for specific immigrant groups; 54 of which focused on the member of the immigrant groups. These 54 articles form the basis of analysis here (Table 44).

8.2.2 Immigrants as fellow residents?

In respect of the assumption that the *Resident* category may offer an opportunity for trivial coverage, a clarification of what is considered trivial is due. As understood here, triviality was expressed in topics that covered everyday aspects of life in general. Such articles would by no means be essential in discussing the state of the country or the role of immigrants in Ireland. They would usually consider mundane topics, feature general interest stories or cover curious events and festivals that might be of some interest to the readership. They would not cover topics that had any serious negative consequences for the people involved. Whether such articles were necessary and whether they were a sign of good journalism did not matter in this context. The underlying idea was that when immigrant groups were trivialised by linking them to mundane topics, they were represented as ordinary members of society (although in that case the question of irrelevant reference to nationality remained). From a theoretical perspective, the assumption was that trivial coverage could potentially overcome the dissolution of nativity and sovereignty, two formerly separate spheres that became incorporated with the emergence of the nation state as suggested by Agamben.[579] In other words, if members of the out-group had the same chance of becoming the subject of trivial coverage as members of the in-group, this could be an expression of their inclusion in Irishness despite their birth outside Ireland and consequently their status as non-national residents.

[579] Cf. AGAMBEN (1998), pp. 75-9

To give an example, one such article was the story about a family's pet parrot that had flown away and only understood some Polish phrases:

> A BRISK cry of 'chodz tu' – meaning 'come here' might help reunite a Polish family with its missing pet parrot.
>
> Paula, an African grey, flew off on New Year's Eve from her Limerick home and hasn't been seen since.
>
> But the talking bird speaks only Polish, so mastering the odd phrase will be the key in helping get her back [...][580]

This story was of little informative value and whether a national broadsheet was the right place for such a kind of human interest story remains questionable. On the other hand, it was neither positive nor negative and represented the family involved as just that – an ordinary family. Mentioning the Polish origin was not necessarily irrelevant in this case as the parrot's ability to understand a number of phrases in the Polish language was of significance. One of the questions that arose from this example was whether members of the Nigerian and Chinese communities would have the same chance as members of the Polish community to be portrayed as residents in such trivial human interest stories. In other words, my research question was whether newspapers were likely to link immigrants to topics other than those defined as most frequent in the chapters above. Consequently, such a representation could potentially act not as ultimate proof but as an indicator for immigrants' integration into society.

Generally speaking, chances varied for individual immigrant groups. At 5 out of 9 articles more than half of all articles relating to Chinese were of a trivial nature. For Poles the figure was 4 out of 20, and Nigerians were least likely to be trivialised at 1 out of 25 articles (Table 48). Consequently, chances of being trivialised were rather low except for members of the Chinese community. However, the absolute number of articles relating to this community was small, and two articles were stereotypical references to Chinese New Year festivals in Dublin. In absolute numbers there were very few articles in which trivial coverage could be confirmed, indicating that immigrants in resident roles were not well integrated in society.

Furthermore, explicit references to *integration* in all 1,471 articles were not often found and much less frequent as a primary topic (17 samples) than as a secondary topic (40 samples) (Table 10, Table 11) in all three papers. This strongly suggested that newspapers did not consider the topic very important and that integration was not very high on their agendas. In

[580] DUGGAN (09/01/10)

summary, the low chance for immigrant groups to be trivialised in conjunction with the low frequency of the *Integration* category indicated that integration had not progressed far in media representations.

In a next step, I compared these findings to a study on the state of immigrant integration in Ireland. The blurry boundaries of the category were emblematic of the difficulty to define the very concept of integration:

> The concept remains a highly contested one, with continual slippages in definition, and in its normative and ideological implications. Its meaning can vary between countries, alter over time, and is frequently based on the interests, values, assumptions, and perspectives of specific groups involved in the migration process. Its usage is also inconsistent. It can be used to refer to both a process and a state, and it can be employed in contrast to assimilation and multiculturalism, and at other times as a generic concept of which the former are variants.[581]

The authors of the Annual Monitoring Report on Integration 2012 employed four key indicators in an attempt to measure integration: employment, education, social inclusion and active citizenship. Although some academics contested the very idea of creating categories for the task of measuring integration, arguing with Foucault's concept of governmentality that "integration policies reproduce migrant / non-migrant hierarchies of differences as if these existed asocially,"[582] I accepted that the use of indicators could help in evaluating the state of integration in order to prevent the development of parallel societies. The examples of failed integration policies in other European countries such as the banlieue communities in France or the consequences of Germany's long followed guest worker approach to invited economic migrants showed that the development of parallel societies was not an abstract concept but a very real threat to giving immigrants the same chances of inclusion.[583] The following section will show how immigrants are often socially and economically excluded.

The authors of the 2013 study on integration explain that,

> [e]mployment leads to financial independence, and allows a person to contribute to society and avoid the risk of poverty and social exclusion in their host country [...]. Through employment, legal residents can also build networks, develop their language skills and increase participation in society.[584]

Because of the wider implications of employment for immigrants, the disproportionate exposition of immigrants to unemployment presents a major obstacle to integration. However,

[581] LOYAL (2011), p. 250
[582] GRAY (2011), p. 104; LOYAL (2011), p. 252
[583] Cf. for example GNADE (2013) or SEIFERT (2012)
[584] MCGINNITY (2013), p. 27

not all immigrant groups are affected to the same extent. While traditional immigrants (pre-2004 EU, North America) and Asians were considerably below the unemployment rate of Irish nationals, post-2004 EU12 migrants, UK citizens and Africans in particular were hit hardest by the economic downturn.[585] Fanning ascribes their very high levels of unemployment to racism and discrimination, including an "atrophy of their capabilities or the barriers to their development experienced by some." The exclusion of asylum seekers from the Irish labour market forced Nigerians (among others) to lead "parallel lives".[586] On the other hand, those migrants who were in the workforce were often likely to suffer exploitation or unfair treatment, supported by the design of Ireland's work permit system.[587]

Immigrants' unemployment rates had to be seen against a generally high level of education amongst migrants. Except for EU12 migrants, who were just above the figure for Irish nationals, all immigrant groups had considerably higher rates of third level education. These higher education levels could be explained by the young age profile of immigrants and the fact that most migrants had received their education in their countries of origin prior to their arrival in Ireland.[588] This contrast showed nothing less than that some immigrant groups were virtually excluded from the Irish labour market despite their good education. The restrictive access policies to education particularly for non-EU migrants further underlined exclusionary practices in Ireland.

In terms of education and training upon arrival in Ireland, migrants generally enjoyed a right to education up to second level, but the dominant role of the Catholic Church and school admission policies disadvantaged immigrant children.[589] Moreover, there were considerable access barriers to post-second level education for non-EU migrants. As Fanning points out, adult asylum seekers "are, in effect, excluded from language and skills training."[590] What is more, those who were eligible faced funding cuts in the provision of English language classes despite the decisive role that language competency undoubtedly played in educational achievement. Additionally, asylum seekers were not entitled to free third level education, and

[585] McGinnity (2013), pp 28-9
[586] Fanning (2011), p. 143
[587] Allen (2007)
[588] McGinnity (2013), p. 34 or Central Statistics Office (a), p. 24
[589] McGinnity (2013), p. 36
[590] Fanning (2011), p. 143

course fees at institutes of higher education often proved prohibitive for non-EU nationals (also see the discussion of course fees below).[591]

Lower disposable incomes and a higher risk of falling into poverty amongst immigrants were further indicators of insufficient integration.[592] At an institutional level, the introduction of direct provision in 2000 meant that asylum seekers did not have the same entitlements to social welfare as Irish nationals. Labour migrants faced a similar situation within the first two years after their arrival during which the habitual residence rule heavily restricted their access to social welfare. Similar to pre-1990s Irish immigration policy, the responsibility for migrants in need was often deferred to the voluntary sector.[593] Fanning points out that such exclusionary practices often result in "damaging post-migratory legacies of disempowerment which impede integration once – perhaps several years after their arrival – they become eligible for social inclusion."[594] However, even when immigrants were eligible, they did not always receive what they were entitled to. Particularly the number of unaccompanied minors who went missing and remained unaccounted for while under the care of the Health Service Executive served as an example.[595]

In respect of active citizenship a recently higher number of naturalisations and long established electoral rights in local elections masked a bleaker reality. According to the authors of the Annual Report on Migration, the considerably increased number of naturalisations was not an effect of a more liberal naturalisation policy but rather of more immigrants being eligible because they had stayed in the country log enough. Furthermore, high application costs, the rejection of applicants on state support and no clear obligations on the minister to give reasons for refusal acted as deterrents.[596] A study by Kees Groenendijk showed that Ireland belonged to those European countries that granted immigrants rights to vote in local elections, and besides the United Kingdom it was the only country that had no residency requirement.[597] For Loyal, "allowing migrants to vote and stand in local elections has been of enormous value in providing a sense of belonging and democratic access."[598] However, there was an obligation on voters to register to vote and this requirement presented a major obstacle to political integration since

[591] McGinnity (2013), pp. 37-40
[592] McGinnity (2013), pp. 41-7
[593] Fanning (2011), p. 138
[594] Fanning (2011), pp. 142-3
[595] Cf. for example Barnados or Fanning (2011), pp. 133-4
[596] McGinnity (2013), pp. 24 and 49
[597] Groenendijk (2008)
[598] Loyal (2011), p. 249

only a minority of migrants did so or was able to do so. Hence, a theoretically progressive system fell short in practice.[599] What is more, although a number of immigrants did stand in local elections, only 0.2 per cent of local authority members were immigrants and thus disproportionally lower than the immigrants' share in the population. The coverage of Nigerians seeking local office in 2004 may have suggested that the number was actually higher.[600]

So far, I could show that the quantity of trivial coverage in resident related stories did not suggest that integration was achieved in the media, and studies showed that the same was true for society at large. The question remained whether such a broad, non-specific category like *Residents* confirmed the general pattern established in quite specific categories such as *Victim* or *Perpetrator / Suspect* or whether resident portrayals nevertheless had the chance to represent members of immigrant groups in a different light.

8.2.3 Non-national residents as a control category

In terms of frequency, my hypothesis could be confirmed. Both frequency across groups and annual distribution mirrored the general trend away from asylum seekers towards economic migrants from within the European Union after 2004. While Nigerians (25 articles) and Chinese (9 articles) featured most often as residents in 2004, Poles were most frequently covered in 2010 (20 samples) (Table 46, Table 13). However, in respect of topics and evaluation, the congruence was not immediately as clear. Only three articles were considered outright negative and most were neutral with little variation across immigrant groups (Table 47). Primary topics linked to Poles were most often coded in *Other*, whereas Nigerians were most often linked to *Court Case*, but a prevalent topic did not emerge for Chinese. It was not before attention was turned to the emotional sub-text as found in human interest stories that a difference in the portrayal of the individual groups could be exposed. I argue that Poles had the highest chance of being covered in articles that bore an emotional sub-text, although this was sometimes tinted by irrelevant references to nationality, which in turn reinforced otherness. A great deal of sympathy with this ethnic minority was expressed in a series of articles on a boy who was born without eyes or in articles on the loss experienced by Ireland's Polish community after the Polish government's jet had crashed near Smolensk in April 2010. Despite the generally balanced consideration of Nigerians and Chinese as residents, their portrayal, unlike the representation of Poles, was much less emotional. Nigerians and Chinese were often linked to

[599] GROENENDIJK (2008)
[600] There were a total of 33 articles that presented immigrants as politicians in primary roles in this study. Out of these, 25 referred to Nigerians (Table 8) For the number of immigrant representatives at local authority level cf. MCGINNITY (2013), pp. 54-5

judicial or economic topics (e.g. Assault trial of two Gardaí, Catherine Chen case or Chinese being targeted as voters or customers), and reports that showed potential for emotional exploitation were not often utilised. In the following sections, a number of samples for each immigrant group considered in this study shall further illustrate to which extent the emotional sub-text of an article can influence its perception. At the same time, these example will also show how the general patterns of representation identified in this study are reflected, in varying intensities, in the portrayal of immigrant residents as well.

Poles – Baby Jacob fund raising campaign

From March 2010, both *The Irish Times* and the *Irish Independent* started reporting on a fund raising campaign for a baby who had been born without eyes and required specialist treatment to prevent disfiguration of the skull. The Irish Health Service Executive would not pay for the treatment, but following the coverage in the two national broadsheets, the campaign was made known to a wide readership. The *IT* reported on the case on 16 March 2010, 25 March 2010 and 14 December 2010. The *II* reported on the boy twice on 10 March 2010 and 7 June 2010.[601] All articles had in common that they employed an emotional sub-text not necessarily to a sensationalist effect – although there were some sensationalist elements – but to raise awareness of the Jacob Nowak fund that raised money to pay for the boy's treatment. At the same time, all articles remained somewhat ambivalent in the juxtaposition of the parents' Polish origin and the Irish host society.

All five articles raised awareness of the fund raising campaign or reported on either the progress of the campaign or the progress of the boy's treatment. Although all articles undoubtedly resorted to an emotional sub-text, the emotional aspect was not exploited to create a solely sensationalist effect. However, a small sensationalist note could be identified in the *Irish Independent*, which became evident when the choice of words and quotes was considered. When *The Irish Times* introduced the campaign on 16 March 2010 writing about the boy's parents who "launched a fund to help raise € 300,000 for their son's treatment,"[602] the *Irish Independent* opted for a more dramatic introduction by writing that the parents launched "a desperate plea to help raise € 300,000 for his treatment".[603] *Launching a fund* was certainly a more neutral way in discussing the campaign than talking about a *desperate plea*, which dramatised the situation and reinforced the representation of the parents in a dependent position.

[601] Only articles mentioning the nationality could be considered here.
[602] ANONYMOUS (16/03/10)
[603] RIEGEL (10/03/10)

The more sensationalist tone was also evident in a quote employed by the *II* to support the nature of the boy's condition:

> Jacob was born and when they put the baby on my belly I was so happy. But after a little while I heard one of the midwives saying, 'The baby won't open his eyes. I thought his eyelids must have grown together but believed the doctors would fix it. Then I looked at the nurses' faces and I knew it was something much worse.[604]

The *IT*, on the other hand, refrained from using emotionally charged quotes and simply stated that

> Jacob suffers from an exceptionally rare condition called anophthalmia, whereby his eyes never formed in their sockets before his birth.[605]

Yet, regardless of the more developed human interest approach taken by the *Independent* paper, the degree of sensationalism arguably remained at a level that did not present the case at the boy's or his parents' expense. The wording was in line with the generally more sensationalist style of the *Irish Independent* as discussed in more detail elsewhere in this paper and shall therefore not be subject to further analysis at this point.

It would probably be unfair to claim that these articles were not genuinely directed at readers' empathy with the aim of enticing people to donate money so that funds could be made available to pay for the boy's treatment. Yet, an ambivalent nature showed in the way the parents' nationality was set against the generosity of the Irish people in the *IT* and the *II* alike. In similar ways, the parents were unnecessarily identified as Polish nationals in both papers:

> Jacob's parents, Mariusz (29) and Wiola (29) Nowak, are Polish nationals who have been living and working in Millstreet, Co Cork, since 2006.[606] [*Irish Independent*]

> Jacob Nowak was born in Millstreet, Co Cork, last August to Mariusz and Wiola Novak. The couple are Polish nationals who have been living and working in Ireland since 2006.[607] [*The Irish Times*]

At first glance, these almost verbatim characterisations of the parents may seem undisturbing, but they reveal a, perhaps unconscious, distanced attitude towards Polish nationals living in Ireland. Mentioning the parents' nationality was entirely obsolete as it had no informative value and was irrelevant to the event. Moreover, by indicating that the couple had been living and working in Ireland since 2006, the newspapers provided an explanation for their eligibility to receive the support of the Irish people, implicitly reinforcing the divide

[604] RIEGEL (10/03/10)
[605] ANONYMOUS (16/03/10)
[606] RIEGEL (10/03/10)
[607] ANONYMOUS (16/03/10)

between deserving and non-deserving immigrants and the opposition of in- and out-groups. Because the couple had worked, and therefore paid taxes and contributed to the Irish community for a period of four years they were deemed deserving. At the same time, the identification of the parents as immigrants denied them full membership in Irishness, which was further codified by apparent expressions of gratefulness to the Irish people.

> Cork-based Mariusz (29) and Wiola (29) Nowak have already paid an emotional tribute to Irish people who were so moved by the plight of their son that they have flooded the family with prayers, messages of support and donations which have now exceeded €50,000.[608]

In a similar manner, *The Irish Times* wrote:

> The couple [...] have thanked Irish people for their overwhelming generosity and support.[609] [And later, t]he couple, both 29, who also have a six-year-old daughter Paula, said they have been "flabbergasted" by the generosity of the Irish public. [...][610]

The references to the Irishness of the benefactors produced a contrast to the immigrant status of the boy's parents, and highlighting the generosity of the Irish was an element of positive self-representation. Such a representation of the family hardly allowed for the possibility that the Novak family had chosen to make Ireland their long-time home. The fact that they had decided to have their second child in the country may have served as an indicator for this. Nevertheless, irrespective of this individual family's motives, stating the nationality in such an irrelevant manner, did create a distancing effect, and in analogy to Agamben's dissolution of nativity and sovereignty, the Polish family was not awarded full membership in Irishness because of its non-Irish origin. In contrast, when newspapers reported about the Polish community's reaction to the crash of the Polish government's plane near Smolensk as did the *IT* on 12 April 2010, the reference to nationality was not irrelevant.

> POLES IN IRELAND: A SILENCE born of grief and shock gripped several hundred mourners crammed into St Audoen's Church in Dublin yesterday at the start of a Mass to mark the deaths of Polish president Lech Kaczynski and scores of other dignitaries in the weekend air crash.[611]

In this case, *Poles in Ireland* referred to a hybrid Irish-Polish identity or at least to the strong link that Poles living in Ireland had to their country of origin. The *Polish community* or the *Irish-Polish community* as used later on in the same article gave immigrants a chance to be both Irish and Polish without having to choose between the two.

---

[608] RIEGEL (07/06/10)
[609] ANONYMOUS (16/03/10)
[610] BRAMHILL and HOLLAND (14/12/10)
[611] SMYTH (12/04/10)

On the other hand, despite the irrelevant mentioning of the nationality in the representations of the Novak family, they were certainly far from "a public exercise in othering,"[612] and it could not be argued that these representations rendered the articles entirely negative as the supportive character was clearly evident. Yet, in a subtle way such representations maintained an exclusive definition of Irishness that extended only conditional, temporal membership to immigrant residents. The representation of the family was emblematic of a country trying to come to terms with its immigrant population. The ambivalence was expressed in the realisation that immigrant workers had been essential during the economic boom and the country was aware of an obligation to welcome at least the culturally closer economic migrants in some way. Their cultural proximity ensured that Polish immigrants, by and large, did not become a field of negative projections as, for example, Nigerian asylum seekers, who, by law, were excluded from the labour market (cf. below). Nevertheless, the definition of Irishness did at this stage not allow for the full inclusion of Polish immigrants. Whereas the very fact that the newspapers decided to publish articles on the case and the support given to the family were expressions of inclusionary trends, the, most likely subconsciously employed, juxtaposition of Poles and Irish presented a distancing factor. Particularly as late as in 2010, with the experience of almost 15 years of large-scale immigration to Ireland, journalists should have been aware of these implications. Omitting irrelevant references to nationality and replacing *Irish people* with *neighbours, supporters* or *contributors* would have been small changes to a great effect.

Nigerians

Nigerians were most often linked to court cases, a topic that was also very frequent in the representation of Nigerians as asylum seekers, which was the most prominent role allocation for this immigrant group (cf. ch. 9.2). In all eight court-related articles *Resident* roles were allocated because the Nigerians involved were not represented in immigrant roles and the cases heard were not immigration related as well. In all cases Nigerians were the plaintiffs rather than the defendants, and the coverage was factual, fair and balanced. As discussed elsewhere in this study, this was arguably the very nature of court coverage in Irish quality newspapers, and the argumentation here does not concern this nature of coverage but rather the fact that most articles bore little potential for emotional exploitation, and if they did, this was not utilised. For example, on 29 January 2004 the *Irish Independent* reported on a 1.5 million euro settlement

[612] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006), p. 100

between the Maternity Hospital Dublin and parents who claimed that their child was born with severe brain damage due to hospital negligence.

> A €1.5 million settlement was approved by the High Court yesterday in an action taken by a Nigerian couple who claimed their child suffered severe brain damage as a result of negligence by the National Maternity Hospital in Dublin.
>
> [...]
>
> It was alleged by the plaintiff's side that the hospital failed to record and monitor properly the fetal heart beat and failed to deliver the baby by caesarean section when they knew or ought to have known that the child was in distress.
>
> As a result of the defendant's alleged negligence it was claimed, the plaintiff developed seizures, abnormal movements and irregular breathing patterns and along with suffering injury to her kidneys. The pattern of behaviour was consistent with a period of asphyxia. The defence denied the claims.[613]

Whereas the coverage on Jacob Novak (see above) was of an emotional nature, this article remained factual and distanced. Moreover, as in the Novak case, the reference to the plaintiff's parent's nationality was entirely irrelevant, and because of the missing emotional sub-text, it was suited to represent Nigerians in an ambivalent light. The offer for settlement had been made without admission of liability, and in a prominent position at the end of the article, it was pointed out that the defendant had denied the claims. Therefore, as a last word, the doubts were reinforced and the parents' eligibility to the money was questioned. The newspaper could have arranged the article in such a way that it would have closed with a description of the effect of the alleged negligence, which would have created an entirely different effect. In that case, the plight of the child would have stood in a more prominent position and readers would perhaps more readily have been willing to admit that the child was duly awarded compensation. Although not explicitly spelt out, in the context of frequent negative portrayals of Nigerians in other articles, in a very subtle way it was insinuated that Nigerians might be of a covetous nature, thus reinforcing such negative images. Again, omitting nationality and reconsidering the way the article was arranged could have avoided this effect.

In a different article, the cynical fashion in which a settled, naturalised former Nigerian immigrant invalidated the reasons why her countrymen and countrywomen came to Ireland again proved a severe lack of emotional sub-text, thus emphasising the distinction of deserving and undeserving immigrants and consequently a negative image of Nigerian immigrants. As part of *The Irish Times' The New Irish*-series, a Nigerian family that had been living in Ireland

[613] ANONYMOUS (29/01/04)

since 1976 was introduced. In the last section, ample room was given to the family's mother's views on her fellow country people:

> Meg has no compunction about describing the movement of her countrymen and women into Ireland in the mid-1990s as a "mass entry".
>
> "They must have found a lot of loopholes in the law. An RTÉ programme showed how they seemed able to obtain visas through London, land in Belfast and get taxis to export them down. You just saw them taking advantage. And all the time we pay 42 per cent tax and PRSI – and paid even more in the 1980s.
>
> Now you see them get free accommodation and medical cards. They know their children get citizenship and that in 18 years' time, they will have free education and all the amenities. That all pains me because we are tax-payers too."
>
> Despite the poor state of Nigeria, she has little sympathy for those who find their way here, reasoning that they can hardly be poor if they have the €500 to fly from Lagos to London and the taxi fares.
>
> "If you're running from persecution, you won't have that money." Many speak perfect English, she says; some are graduates. "Why don't they apply for visas? What is right is right."
>
> What about those who are fleeing from danger, such as female circumcision? "My three sisters and I were circumcised. It was no big deal. It was a well-known and accepted tradition up 'til the 1960s, though it has stopped now. My mother paid for it, it was the culture. She would have said that it was about self-control, to prevent promiscuity through excessive pleasure."
>
> And did it work? "It does not reduce pleasure," she says empathically, with a hearty laugh. "Look, I have five children." Nonetheless, she did not subject her own girls to it. "It is no longer the practice. If any new families arriving here ask about it, I would advise them that there is no need, to point to it."
>
> She will vote yes in the citizenship referendum. "I came here like many others, looking for greener pastures. There is nothing wrong with that, on condition you do it properly. But people just come to exploit the system I don't think voters should be confused, once it is well spelt out and people know exactly what they are voting for. We are not stupid."[614]

Meg Offiah reiterated many of the, often unchecked, arguments brought forward against Nigerians in parts of society and the media from the mid-1990s up to the middle of the first decade of the 21st century. By resorting to *mass entry*, she used a flood metaphor that was more typically found in the tabloid press (cf. ch. 9.2.3). She also considered them as a burden on the state ([...] *we are tax-payers too*), as illegitimate, undeserving migrants (*Why don't they apply for visas?*), and ridiculed those who suffered from the consequences a female genital mutilation. Furthermore, she called into question, the jus soli principle, and claimed Nigerians only came to avail of free education once the children had grown up. It does not take much to refute most, if not all of these arguments. There can be no question that female genital mutilation was a

[614] SHERIDAN (08/05/04)

horrendous practice inflicting severe pain and long-time suffering on its victims. Else, free accommodation and food meant being put up in reception centres that gave its inmates hardly any control over their own lives. In this light, the claim that Nigerians arrived in Ireland because they wanted to avail of free third level education once their children reached 18 loses its validity. Most of these points are discussed in the section on Nigerian asylum seekers from page 200 and shall therefore not be elaborated at this point.

However, in respect of the *Resident* role, it was of interest how *The Irish Times* presented this view. By using quotation marks and making clear references to Meg Offiah, the *IT* certainly pointed out that these opinions were held by the interviewee and not necessarily those of the interviewer or the newspaper. Nonetheless, the editor decided to give a considerable amount of space – about one quarter of the entire article – to the negative views on more recent arrivals from Nigeria. That these were voiced by a Nigerian national now holding Irish citizenship gave them more authority because one could expect that a (former) Nigerian national would know more about the state of Nigeria than the average Irish citizen. Moreover, apart from some meagre attempts to moderate Offiah's utterances (*Despite the poor state of Nigeria, she has little sympathy* [...]), they were not seriously challenged, and her opinion on female genital mutilation remained unchallenged altogether. Not only did the editor give these thoughts a great deal of space, they were also placed at the end of the article so that the reader was left with negative representations of Nigerian newcomers upon finishing the article.

Taken on its own, this article appeared to defy the general line of usually balanced coverage in *The Irish Times*. However, on the same day as part of the same series, the *IT* also introduced Celia Otubu, a (Nigerian) solicitor practicing in Dublin, who held completely opposing view as the following extract illustrates.

> The Dublin-based solicitor is also extremely critical of the manner in which the Government is holding its referendum on citizenship to coincide with the local elections.
>
> "Every country is entitled to determine its citizenship rules. But I don't agree with Minister McDowell over the reasons for this. He said hospitals were being overrun by non-nationals, but the statistics don't show this. The Minister is stirring up racial sentiment and playing the race card. The danger is that Irish people will believe they are really are [sic] being overrun by immigrants."[615]

This shows how important it is to take context into account as discussed by scholars like van Dijk (cf. code book). Both articles being seen as varying views on the same topic let the *IT* appear in a more balanced way than if only the first article had been considered. In addition to

[615] O'BRIEN (08/05/04)

that, the paper published three letters to the editor on 24 May 2004 that strongly disagreed with the ideas as voiced by Meg Offiah:

> I am writing to express my boiling anger at your recent feature on Nigerian immigrants. My argument is not with the article but with Meg Offiah. Not only do I find Ms Offiah's lack of compassion for her compatriots extremely disturbing, but her dismissal of female genital mutilation as "no big deal" is not only despicable but downright dangerous…[616]

The paper thereby introduced further balancing elements so that, overall, the coverage of Nigerian residents in *The Irish Times* was rather balanced, if not pointing out critical aspects. Therefore, it must be concluded that Meg Offiah's negative views were part of the presentation of varying views on the arrival of Nigerians in Ireland at the time. This approach of allowing opposing opinions to be voiced in the *IT* was in line with the paper's general reporting style as noted elsewhere in the paper (cf. ch. 8.3.5) Yet, despite the coverage of Nigerians as residents, often in a fair and balanced manner, the portrayals of this immigrant group did not employ emotional sub-texts to the same extent as with Poles.

Chinese

Members of the Chinese community had small chances of being portrayed in an emotional manner. Articles on Chinese living in Ireland included the case of Catherine Chen, who was born in Belfast and therefore entitled to Irish citizenship, which, following a decision by the European Court of Justice, enabled her mother to stay in Britain. Except for a brief reference to the mother's motives for her actions in the *IT*[617], the articles rather focused on the legal implications for Ireland, enticing the *Irish Independent* to call the decision a *Residency bombshell for Europe*.[618] In other cases, the de-emotionalised coverage was more easily identifiable as in the *Irish Independent* article in which a mobile phone network operator "targets Chinese users" because "[it] estimated that the market for Chinese people calling China on their mobiles was worth around €25m".[619] This reduction of Chinese residents to economic units was another example of the revenue frame, which is elaborated in the chapter on Chinese students from p. 221.

The revenue frame could also be identified in an *Irish Times* article covering the 2004 Chinese New Year festival, which offered an unused opportunity to present the people forming

[616] OGBOGOH (24/05/04)
[617] STAUNTON (19/05/04)
[618] SWEENEY (20/10/04)
[619] LYONS (16/10/04)

the Chinese community and their culture in greater detail. The article started out negotiating trivialities like the meaning of animal signs:

> People born in the Year of the Monkey are "intelligent, well liked by everyone and successful in their chosen field.
>
> So is it monkey year for Lord Mayor Cllr Royston Brady, who launched the four-day celebration which finishes on Tuesday? Astrologically speaking, the European election candidate is no monkey, but at first coyly declines to admit what animal sign he was born under.
>
> Eventually, after some persuading, he admits that this his wife Michelle told him his was the Year of the Rat.[620]

These were hardly trademarks of quality journalism but exactly because of the trivial nature as expressed in the extract above, the article offered a chance of representing Chinese as fellow residents. Yet, in this first quarter of the article Chinese immigrants were not even mentioned and remained anonymous, and when attention turned to this group, ignorance and one-sided portrayals were presented:

> "It's the first time that the new year has been celebrated here on a scale like this," said Cllr Brady, who expressed his surprise at the estimated 35,000 to 40,000-strong Chinese community living Dublin.
>
> "They mainly keep themselves to themselves and yet make such a huge contribution to the economy, which we don't acknowledge enough," the Lord Mayor said.[621]

This quote clearly showed that integration had not been achieved. The surprise discovery that *they mainly keep themselves to themselves* was an expression of an assimilationist view on immigration that did not take into account that integration was a two way process and also meant that the receiving society had to change its attitudes and behaviour towards Chinese migrants. The utterance implicitly alluded to the Chinese community to engage in society (or business?) in a more proactive fashion but failed to suggest in which way members of the in-group could support further exchange. Moreover, the contribution of the Chinese community to Irish society was yet again reduced to economic aspects, expressing a lack of awareness of the benefits of cultural contributions. The economic perspective was further enhanced when the Chinese ambassador

> [...] highlighted the extent of trade between Ireland and China when he addressed the hundreds of people waiting for the performances to begin.

[620] O'HALLORAN (26/01/04)
[621] O'HALLORAN (26/01/04)

> Bilateral trade had risen 63 per cent last year and some 60 Irish companies had opened branches or got involved in joint ventures in China.[622]

Even though the ambassador was opening presentations of Chinese arts and culture, the link between the two countries was solely reduced to business aspects. Whereas the importance of business relationships could not be invalidated, the portrayal of the Chinese community in Ireland as economic units presented a truncated image of this immigrant group. This was particularly true against the background of an article that was to cover a festival featuring (popular) culture. The portrayal in this article hence confirmed the general representation of Chinese immigrants as shown further down in this study and showed a lack of emotional coverage despite ostensibly trivial topics. In conclusion, as this article demonstrated in an exemplary manner, despite generally positive or neutral general impressions, articles on Chinese residents were not embedded in an equally emotional sub-text as were those on Polish residents.

***

The low chance of immigrants to be covered in mundane, everyday topics suggested that the concept of integration has not reached editors' offices yet. This finding was supported by the frequency of the *Integration* category and the general pattern of frequent roles and topics. In conjunction with increasingly negative attitudes towards immigrants against the backdrop of the economic recession in recent years[623] this cast a shadow of doubt over Ireland's céad mile fáilte.[624]

The findings also showed that Poles had a higher chance of being portrayed in a sympathetic light than members of the Nigerian and Chinese communities because of the emotional sub-text in their coverage in resident roles. Nigerians and Chinese were not portrayed in a negative light, but the topics to which they were linked and the nature of reporting were less likely to attract a great deal of sympathy. Against the backdrop of the findings in other chapters, I hold that this was more than coincidence and a selective approach of newspapers towards different immigrant groups could be assumed. From a methodological point of view, although most articles had either received a neutral or positive connotation, subtle differences could be demonstrated through the introduction of the emotional character. These results

[622] O'HALLORAN (26/01/04)
[623] MCGINNITY (2013), p. 75
[624] Irish phrase: A hundred thousand welcomes.

showed that, despite careful definitions, categories in the code book were sometimes limited in helping to explain social phenomena and needed to be subjected to further analysis.

8.3 Racism in the media

There were a number of roles and topics, that were not most frequent but well worth analysing. Apart from the topics discussed here, *Cultural contribution* (85 counts in primary topic), *Living Conditions* (70 counts in primary topic) or *Contribution to the Economy* (55 counts in primary topics) would surely have contributed to complementing an inclusive picture of the representation of immigrants in the Irish media. Yet, for the reasons outlined in chapter 6, this study focuses on the most frequent roles and topics. However, a study on the representation of immigrants is incomplete without a reference to the coverage of racism. This topic was by far not leading the list of less frequent topics (49 counts in primary topics), but as it can inform on the extent of discrimination in a society and how discrimination was discussed in the media, it is too important to be left out. Moreover, not reporting about racism in society can also contribute to exclusionary practices. Hence, racism was selected for analysis regardless of its frequency. In this chapter I will first show that racism was not a new phenomenon in Ireland before I proceed to an excursus into Foucault's theoretical conceptualisations of racism. Thereafter it will be discussed how frequently articles contained a racist note and how openly the topic was addressed in individual newspapers. Finally, some results will be illustrated in a case study.

8.3.1 Racism in Ireland today

Racism in Ireland is a fact. Until its closure due to budget cuts in 2008, the NCCRI collated racist incidents that were reported to the organisation in six-monthly reports (and supported the victims in reporting assaults to the authorities).[625] Examples in its final report included a Nigerian woman being assaulted in the car park of an adult education centre, where she attended classes. A fellow student shouted at her, "Black nigger I am going to kill you, if you don't leave my country, I will kill you" and attacked her with a set of keys. A Chinese man reported that he had continuously been verbally assaulted by his neighbours, and a Polish air service employee complained that he had been verbally assaulted by his colleagues and given menial jobs that were not given to fellow Irish employees. Apart from these overt cases of racism, the example of some Irish taxi drivers sticking "100 % Irish" slogans to their cars was also cited. It was felt that this was a deliberate campaign to urge customers to avoid taking taxis driven by

[625] NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM

foreigners.[626] Loyal has pointed out that there was significant underreporting of racially motivated incidents in Ireland[627] with Sub-Saharan Africans officially reporting only 16 per cent of incidents.[628] Some of the reasons for this low figure include few formal mechanisms to report a racist crime, the dissolution of the NCCRI and a high level of discrimination experienced from Gardaí, acting as a further deterrent from reporting a racist assault.[629] Sub-Saharan Africans in Ireland were by far most likely to be stopped by Gardaí at 59 per cent in the 12 months prior to the EU-Midis study. The next highest figures were 38 per cent in France and 34 per cent in the Netherlands.[630] Considering that the same figure for Central and Eastern Europeans was 29 per cent, this was a strong indicator of institutional racism (despite the fact that the majority of Nigerians did not feel that they had been profiled).[631] Therefore, it hardly comes as a surprise that racist incidents were very reluctantly reported to the Gardaí. Furthermore, 45 per cent of respondents in Ireland did not know how or where to file a complaint.[632]

A study by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights confirmed at a more representative level that racist assaults in Ireland were anything but isolated incidents. In an EU-wide survey various immigrant groups were interviewed in respect of their experience with racism, discrimination and criminality. The two groups selected for Ireland were Sub-Saharan Africans (SSA, n = 503) and Central and East Europeans (CEE, n = 609). 98 per cent of the latter group were Poles. Particularly the rate of serious harassment of Sub-Saharan Africans was staggering at 94 incidents for every 100 respondents. More than a quarter of Sub-Saharan interviewees indicated that they had been subject to racially motivated crimes in the year prior to the study. Discrimination did not only take place in the streets with a significant number of respondents of both groups feeling that they had been discriminated against at their place of work (SSA: 26 %; CEE: 17%). With an overall discrimination prevalence rate in Ireland of 52 per cent in Sub-Saharan Africans and 26 per cent in Central and East Europeans, Sub-Saharan Africans in Ireland were in 6th position overall, and compared to all Central and East Europeans

[626] NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM (2008) Examples included people of other nationalities and Travellers as well.
[627] LOYAL (2011), p. 236
[628] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2009), p. 81
[629] LOYAL (2011), p. 236
[630] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2009), p. 82
[631] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2009), p. 103
[632] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2009), p. 93

surveyed, Poles in Ireland were most likely to become victims of serious harassment at 11 per cent.[633]

These figures underline the existence of everyday racism in Ireland at various levels and underline the need to investigate the role of the print media. As Hall argued,

> the media's main sphere of operations is the production and transformation of ideologies [and] an intervention in the media's construction of race is an intervention in the ideological terrain of struggle. […] The media are not only a powerful source of ideas about race. They are also one place where these ideas are articulated, worked on, transformed and elaborated.[634]

8.3.2 Theoretical conceptualisation of racism (in Ireland)

In the code book an article was defined to be recorded as carrying a racist tendency or being outright racist if persons were discriminated against because of their race, colour, descent and national or ethnic origin. Modelled on the United Nations view of racism, this was a sound, inclusive and workable definition for the coding process. However, for the analysis of racism in the media it proved too general. Therefore, a closer look at the theoretical conceptualisations of racism should explore the role of the state in the discussion of racism in Ireland. Fanning argued that "[v]arious Irish-based academics, most notably Ronit Lentin, have depicted Ireland as a racial state and a racist state [... and] Lentin has argued that the state is the leading actor in creating anti-immigrant sentiment in Ireland,"[635] as the following quote illustrates:

> The racial state is *a state of power*, asserting its control over those within the state and excluding others outside the state. Through constitutions, border controls, the law, policymaking, bureaucracy and governmental technologies such as census categorizations, invented histories and traditions, ceremonies and cultural imaginings, the modern state is defined by its power to exclude (and include) in racially ordered terms, to categorize hierarchically and to set aside.[636]

Fanning himself holds that racism cannot "be simply attributed to or blamed upon the state"[637] and suggested that

> nation-building can hardly be defined in terms of what the state does. [...] The rules of belonging that apply within Irish society are sociologically wider than might be encompassed by definitions of citizenship, ethnos and race.[638]

This analysis agrees with Fanning's approach without dismissing Lentin's ideas (which Fanning does not do either). The reason why an over-emphasis of the state as the sole originator

[633] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012)
[634] HALL (1996), p. 160 and p. 161
[635] FANNING (2012), p. 183 and p. 184
[636] LENTIN (2003), p. 306
[637] FANNING (2012), p. 184
[638] FANNING (2012), p. 192-3

of racism is insufficient can be explained with recourse to Foucault, on whose ideas both Lentin's and Fanning's argumentations build.

In his lecture series *Society must be defended*, Foucault introduced his concept of the racist state based on the emergence of biopolitics (Lecture given on 17/03/76). The earlier power to discipline, "to take life or let live" was complemented by a new nondisciplinary power to "make live and let die". While the disciplinary power was directed at the individual body, the latter is directed at "man-as-species". Biopolitics aims at the optimisation of life, at the protection of society through all matters relating to the birth rate, through the introduction of subtle and economic mechanisms to care for the incapacitated and through control over the relations between the human race – "[b]iopolitics deals with the population, with the population as a political problem, as a problem that is at once scientific and political, as a biological problem and as power's problem."[639] At this point, Foucault posed the question how this power could let die if its main objective was to make live. With the emergence of biopower, he argues, "racism is inscribed as the basic mechanism of power" without which "the modern State can scarcely function."[640] Racism, according to Foucault is

> [...] a way of introducing a break into the domain of life that is under power's control: the break between what must live and what must die. The appearance within the biological continuum of the human race of races, the distinction among races, the hierarchy of races, the fact that certain races are described as good and others, in contrast, are described as inferior: all this is a way of fragmenting the field of the biological that power controls.[641]

Foucault defines racism much wider than in terms of indigenous and foreigner; all individuals that are "abnormal", that are a threat – not adversaries in the political sense – must be killed in order to make society "healthier and purer". So racism alone can justify the power to kill, which, of course, must not be understood in a literal sense but comprises "political death, expulsion, rejection and so on."[642]

When Lentin argued that the Irish government cast [black] women "as potentially dangerous sexual agents jeopardizing certitudes of Irish citizenship and nationhood" prior to the 2004 Citizenship referendum,[643] this was a well fitting illustration of the state's power to

[639] FOUCAULT (2003a)
[640] FOUCAULT (2003a), p. 244
[641] FOUCAULT (2003a), pp. 255-6
[642] FOUCAULT (2003a), p. 256
[643] The 2004 Citizenship referendum was passed by a vast majority of the electorate and replaced jus soli with jus sanguinis. Various authors, amongst them Ronit Lentin, argued that the referendum was preceded by a large scale campaign by the Irish government claiming that particularly African mothers were exploiting the Irish immigration law and welfare system. Cf. for example LENTIN (2003)

kill. Yet, to further this argument that racism is not simply imposed from above, attention should be drawn to Foucault's understanding of two frequently quoted terms: the state and power. As discussed in the first part of this thesis, power in a Foucauldian sense is to be understood as relational, productive and operating multi-directionally. Power is not exercised top-down, as in Marxist readings, but operates at all levels of society: "power relations are rooted deep in the social nexus, not a supplementary structure over and above society."[644] The state, too, is not a 'thing' imposed from above, as Lemke shows:

> According to Foucault, [...] the state is not an object that is always already there, nor can it be reduced to an illusionary or ideological effect of hegemonic practice. Rather, the state is conceptualized as a "transactional reality" [réalité de transaction] (Foucault, 2004: 22), that is to say a dynamic ensemble of relations and syntheses that at the same time produces the institutional structure of the state and the knowledge of the state.[645]

O'Farrell adds that Foucault understands the state as "the codification of power at all levels across the social body." [646] In Foucault's own words, "I don't think that we should consider the "modern state" as an entity that was developed above individuals, ignoring what they are and even their very existence, but, on the contrary, as a very sophisticated structure [...]."[647]

What follows from this brief excursus into Foucault's theoretical conceptualisation of racism for my study is that the analysis must not solely focus on the reflection of the political government's[648] stand on racism but must take all levels of society into account. Furthermore, racism must not be seen as a black and white issue because, as Loyal has shown, it can also be found amongst immigrant groups. He calls this a hierarchy of racisms.[649] At the same time, I am not arguing that the state does not pursue an immigration and welfare policy that is in fact discriminating against certain immigrant groups, predominantly asylum seekers. I am stressing the point that racism can be found throughout the social body.

Rabinow and Rose have shown that Foucault's concept of biopolitics is all but obsolete today, 35 years after its introduction:

---

[644] RABINOW (2003b), p. 140. Also cf. O'FARRELL (2007)
[645] LEMKE (2007), p. 6
[646] LEMKE (2007)
[647] FOUCAULT (2003b), p. 132
[648] With political government I specifically refer to the politicians in government and not the wider sense of government in general, including conduct in the private sphere etc. For Foucault's concept of governmentality cf. LEMKE (2007), pp. 2-4
[649] LOYAL (2011), p. 244. Loyal illustrated this in a case in which a Polish interviewee cast Nigerian women as exploiting the Irish welfare and immigration systems.

> More than quarter of a century after the introduction of this concept, at the threshold of what some have plausibly termed "the biological century," this contested field of problems and strategies is ever-more crucial and enigmatic than ever. Yet surprisingly little work has been done to develop Foucault's own sketchy suggestion into an operational set of tools for critical inquiry.[650]

One of the scholars who have developed Foucault's ideas is Giorgio Agamben. In his book *Homo Sacer* he discusses how the principle of nativity and principle of sovereignty had been separate spheres in the ancient régime but became an incorporated concept with the birth of the nation state in which every citizen acquired political rights by birth. In his considerations on refugees, which can certainly be extended to immigrants more generally, he demonstrates the incapability of international organisations and nation states to overcome and resolve the divide that has been created by the dissolution of the unity of nativity and sovereignty created by immigrants not being birth members of the nation state.[651] In fact, before the Citizenship Referendum, Ireland was one of the few countries in Europe in which children born to immigrants became citizens by birth. With the subsequent switch from *ius soli* to *ius sanguinis*, this unity was dissolved. Therefore, in line with Foucault,

> [o]ne of the essential characteristics of modern biopolitics (which will continue to increase in our century) is its constant need to redefine the threshold in life that distinguishes and separates what is inside from what is outside.[652]

8.3.3 Racism and discrimination in Ireland and in the media

This paragraph is based on the results found in the *Racist* category, and this is, so to speak, its biggest drawback. Although this category may suggest that it can reveal racism in Ireland, in fact it does so only to a limited extent. By definition, this category can only reveal part of the spectrum of racism(s) there are in Ireland. As explained in the code book, this category can only show which articles contained a racist tendency or an unqualified racist quote. However, this does not reveal how racist a newspaper's stance is in general because the analysis of other categories must be taken into account to ascertain this (such as the question to which topics immigrants were linked etc.). However, the analysis allows for establishing whether overt racism and covert racism could be found in articles or parts of articles (and not in the newspaper's general stance), be it consciously or subconsciously. This category also allows for the comparison of the frequency of articles containing a form of racism in the three newspapers and can show in which type of article they were found. This chapter will show that a) the analysis confirms the concept of a hierarchy of racism, b) the type of article is decisive in the

[650] RABINOW and ROSE (2003), p. 3
[651] Cf. AGAMBEN (1998), pp. 75-9
[652] AGAMBEN (1998), p. 77

evaluation of racist articles in a newspaper and c) that there was no marked increase in racist articles in the recession.

Racist articles or articles carrying an unqualified racist tone were found in all three papers but at varying levels. In *The Irish Times* 5 per cent of articles showed some mark of racism while the figure for the *Irish Independent* was 8.3 per cent, and as high as more than 1 in five articles in *The Irish Sun* (Table 48). It also emerged that visible minorities, and in particular Nigerians, were framed in racist terms most often. *Nigerians* and *Nigerians and other groups* were discussed in about three quarters of articles in the *IT* and the *II*, but the figure was a bit lower in the *IS* at over three in five (Table 50). Moreover, in total the aggregate figure for *Asylum seeker, Economic migrant* and *Illegal immigrant* (assuming that the latter two are used as synonyms for asylum seeker) showed that more than half of all articles in the *Racist* category were directed against these groups (Table 49). This very clearly confirms Fanning's argument that racism in Ireland was primarily directed against non-European immigrant workers and asylum seekers, and supports the hypotheses that a hierarchy of races can be demonstrated in all three papers (G 1 – G 3).[653]

In *The Irish Sun*, there was a clear peak in 2004, but this was less pronounced in the *Irish Independent*, and no peak could be identified in *The Irish Times* (although the *IT* had most racist articles in that year; Table 51). Two main events took place in 2004 – the Referendum on Citizenship on 11 June and the EU enlargement on 01 May. By introducing another category, it was endeavoured to establish to what extent these events were reflected in racist articles. Somewhat surprisingly, the referendum featured less often than expected. In the *IT* half of all racist articles discussed the referendum (7/14), but this figure was considerably lower in the *II* and the *IS* at 3 and 4 articles respectively out of 21 each (Table 52). A possible explanation was that newspapers discussed the referendum in more general terms and referred to individual immigrant groups less often. Consequently, a direct link between the referendum and a racist tone in reporting could not be shown in the *II* and *IS* but in half of articles in the *IT*. Yet, an indirect link was to be apparent as discussed elsewhere in this study.

Irrespective of the link to the referendum, the aforementioned figures showed that *The Irish Sun* tabloid was most likely to report in a racist fashion, verifying hypothesis F 3. The difference between the two quality papers was much less distinct, though different on a subtler level. I hold that the *Irish Independent*'s stance in 2004 was only apparently liberal, and a closer

[653] FANNING (2012), pp. 188-9

analysis of the *Type of article* category revealed that it had the same absolute number of racist general articles as *The Irish Times*, but six times as many letters to the editor carrying a racist note. *The Irish Times* featured 3 racist editorials whereas the *II* had none (Table 53). That the *Irish Independent* featured a limited range of opinions became even more evident when these figures were compared to the overall number of editorials and letters to the editor. In *The Irish Times* 3 in 14 editorials and 2 in 10 letters carried some form of a racist note. The *II* had no racist editorial but the total number of editorials was only 4 in the entire year. More importantly, 12 out of 18 letters to the editor were racist (Table 53, Table 54). Consequently, *The Irish Times* featured a broader range of opinions, of which only some were considered racist. Hence, this range of opinions must be seen in a context of also featuring articles that critically approached racism in Ireland. I hold that *The Irish Times* placed these racist contributions in order to spark a discussion, support an exchange of opinions and to expose racist attitudes, such as in Áine Ní Chonaill's reply to a letter by Piaras Mac Éinrí, a scholar and university lecturer who welcomed refugees, of 26 August 2004 in which she aired the Immigration Control Platform's point of view on immigration:

> Piaras Mac Einri (August 17th) attempts to minimise the immigration issue. [...] he obviously means we should continue the insane asylum system in which the vast majority, being abusers of the system, are rejected but almost no one is made to leave. The Nigerian statistics say it all. We receive more Nigerian asylum-seekers than any other EU country. That is not just per capita, but in raw numbers. [...][654]

Furthermore, a clearly racist letter of 24 May 2004 supporting an article in which Nigerian asylum seekers were depicted as undeserving by the interviewee was accompanied by two letters protesting against such representations of Nigerians.[655] The *Irish Independent*, on the other hand, made a crude attempt to relieve itself of the responsibility for publishing racist articles by pretending to present its readers' views. It is, of course, the editor who eventually decides which letters are going to be published and which not. In the *Irish Independent's* case the editor made a conscious decision to publish racist letters, and at a proportion of two in three letters carrying a racist motive, the argument of contributing to a discussion could not be made in the same way as in *The Irish Times*.

[654] CHONAILL (26/08/04). The Immigration Control Platform is an NGO advocating strict immigration laws. Cf. the organisation's website for further details: IMMIGRATION CONTROL PLATFORM
[655] JORDAN (24/05/04)

In tone and topic, particularly Nigerians were depicted as illegitimate, undeserving and as a threat to Irish identity and the Irish state. On 03 May 2004 Anne Marie Dowdall's letter to the editor was published in the *Irish Independent*:

> The real war was lost years ago when Ireland was allowed to become the global Simon Community, with great freebie giveaways, and the dumping ground for all the Third World's unwanted hordes. It has changed the face of Ireland and not always favourably either. Certain areas of Dublin and other cities are now 'no-go areas' to indigenous people. Why? Because all the foreign influx have claimed these areas as 'their own'. [...] our forefathers fought for Ireland to be a decent place for their grandchildren and great-grandchildren to live in – not for every Nigerian, sub-saharan [sic] African, Asian or Roma gypsy tribe to make Ireland an oasis of bounty.[656]

Several of Foucault's ideas were at play here. Her list of unwanted, undeserving immigrants did not include who she would consider culturally closer, deserving immigrants such as Americans, British or Germans or those who were generally deemed high in a hierarchy of races. Those included were deemed low, representing threats that had to be eliminated. Moreover, the reference to Ireland's forefathers constructed an Ireland that was defined in terms of exclusivity and a definition of Irishness in ethnic terms.[657] Those who were perceived to be of a distant culture were neither deemed worthy of contributing to nor willing to contribute to Irish identity; they were reduced to parasites presenting a danger. Irishness, according to this reading, was defined as being "white, heterosexual, sedentary and Catholic."[658] Moreover, the war metaphor depicts discrimination against 'foreign bodies' as a righteous battle against invaders and enemies of the (ethnic) state. Her allusion that this war had already been lost because of the government's inability to act underlined that racism did not always originate from the state. Quite to the contrary, in her eyes, the government had not done enough to protect Irish citizens from foreign threats.

An increase in racist articles in 2010 could not be shown. The overall number of racist articles in that year was lower than in 2000 and 2004. Hence, by 2010 the recession seems to have had a lesser effect on racist reporting on the three immigrant groups included in this study than assumed (Table 51), but part of the explanation could be the overall lower interest in Nigerian asylum seekers. Obtaining statistical evidence whether more racist incidents had been reported is difficult because of the closure of the NCCRI. The EU-Midis studies of 2009 and 2012 are unsuitable for analysis here as the figures for in-person crimes with a perceived racist motive where based on 2008 data in both studies. However, the victimisation rates support my

[656] DOWDALL (03/05/04), extract
[657] For the idea of Ireland as an ethnic state cf. FANNING (2012), p. 190
[658] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006), p. 101

findings insofar that racism and racist assaults were considerably more often directed at visible minorities.[659]

8.3.4 Media portrayals of racism in society

Whereas the section above demonstrated the likelihood of newspapers to contain racist articles, the discussion from here will also take into account individual newspapers' willingness to mention racism and xenophobia in Ireland in their articles. The topic was discussed in the media at varying levels depending on time and newspaper. This subject, be it as primary, secondary or tertiary topic (49/41/28 samples; Table 55) was by a great margin most frequent in *The Irish Times* (80) followed by the *Irish Independent* (33) and negligible in *The Irish Sun* (5). With only 3 articles in 1997, the *IT* started taking the matter more seriously in 2000 at 25 articles, a level that was to be maintained until 2010. This process was somewhat delayed in the *II* at 5 articles in 2000 and 15 in 2004, followed by 13 in 2010. Hence, it could be shown that racism was increasingly discussed with rising numbers of immigrants coming to the country. *Nigerians* and *Nigerians and other immigrant groups* were most likely to be linked to the topic of racism regardless of the newspaper (Table 10), although frequencies did not reveal *how* racism was discussed. The detailed nature of how racism was discussed will be explored in the following sections.

To avoid confusion, at this point it shall be recalled that the code book provided two options for recording racism. First, in the *(Hidden) Racism* category if an article was deemed to be of a racist nature; and second, as a primary, secondary or tertiary topic if the article discussed racism or xenophobia in society. In some cases, both options, topic and category, coincided, for example when techniques of denial or a racist note were established, which was the case in 22 of the total of 118 articles that related to racism or xenophobia as a topic. However, the *(Hidden) Racism* category did not differentiate between articles that were clearly racist throughout or received a racist note because, for instance, of an unqualified racist remark. Since it made a major difference whether an article quoted a person making a racist remark or whether it was racist throughout, these 22 samples were re-coded keeping this difference in mind. The result showed that in *The Irish Times* 8 samples were considered partially racist and 5 entirely racist. The proportion was the other way around in the *Irish Independent* at 2 and 4 (Table 57).

[659] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 9 and EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2009), p. 67

A sample article shall support the assertion that a racist note did not necessarily render an article entirely racist. On 06 April 2004 *The Irish Times*[660] reported on a procession to honour Toyosi Shittabey, who had been stabbed to death, in what with all probability was a racially motivated assault (see below). Generally speaking, this article was of a balanced nature. Yet, the remarks of Dr al-Quadri of the Muslim community were uncritically quoted:

> At the school, Dr al-Qadri appealed to the Muslim community to be calm and not look on last Friday's attack as a racist one. "We consider it as just a very sad event, but not specifically a racist attack. We would urge everybody to be calm at the moment. I think it could even be a white child, it could be a child that is not coloured that got killed. On this sad occasion, it is a coloured child and that is how we should look at it," he said.

Although the existence of racism was acknowledged by other speakers, al-Quadri's denial of racism was left uncommented by the journalist. The problem here was not that the cleric's opinion was reported but that this opinion was not contrasted with disagreeing views, and reasons for this denial of racism were not explored either. Particularly the sentence introducing the quote raised the impression that the author agreed with the message, and this was also the reason why the article was recorded as carrying a racist note. The interesting aspect in this article was the denial of racism by a member of the out-group, which did not fit the denial patterns as suggested by van Dijk, who ascribes denial techniques to members of the in-group.[661] The article was nevertheless recorded in this category because of the unqualified and uncritical way in which the quote was presented. Consequently, the author as a member of the in-group supported the denial whether consciously or not. Yet, despite this ambivalent nature, the remainder of the article did not suggest that it was entirely racist, which demonstrated the difficulty in establishing the degree of racism in an article.

In an article of 10 April 2010 *The Irish Times* was much clearer in presenting Dr al-Quadri's position as one amongst others and one that was not supported by the family of the deceased:

> [Toyosi's cousin Abisoye Shitta-bey] said the rally had the approval of Toyosi's father Segun Shitta-bey despite comments from a local imam that Mr Shitta-bey did not approve of the rally. [...] Dr Al-Qadri explained that Mr Shitta-bey believed his son's death was not a racist attack and racism was not endemic in Irish society. [...] Abisoye Shitta-bey said the rally had been organised in Toyosi's family home and had the full support of the family. "Everybody is doing this for a good cause and he [Dr Al-Qadri] is the only one going against us," she said. "We don't even know this man."[662]

[660] McGreevy (06/04/10)
[661] Dijk (2008), pp. 106-28. Also cf. code book
[662] McGreevy (10/04/10)

In some other articles, the question of ambivalence did not arise. In a letter to the editor of 27 September 2009,[663] a reader trivialised racism in Ireland as "part of the Irish tradition of slagging". The denial was so clear that there was no question that the contribution was racist throughout. It was noteworthy though, that the editor had recognised the racist nature of the comment and entitled it "Only slagging?" Hence, although this letter to the editor was racist, the question mark in the headline, added by the editor, showed that such an opinion was questioned by *The Irish Times*, further supporting the argument that racist letters to the editor were consciously selected in order to present a range of opinions.

Returning to the entire population of samples discussing racism, I further examined whether an article portrayed racism as an isolated incident or as a general phenomenon in Irish society. In total, there were slightly more samples portraying racism as a general problem, but not in the *Irish Independent*. In this paper there were more articles referring to racist incidents as isolated ones. Reporting on individual cases of racism was important in highlighting violent attacks against members of immigrant communities, but there was also a risk of presenting racism as isolated incidents, thereby trivialising or entirely negating racism at a more general level in society. Therefore, the frequency of articles portraying racism as a general phenomenon also informed about a newspaper's stance. The more critical position of *The Irish Times* became even clearer when absolute numbers were considered. At 46 samples relating to racism as a general problem in society, this quality paper was far ahead of the *Irish Independent* at 14 and *The Irish Sun* at 2 (Table 56). These results act as further indicators for the verification of hypothesis D, which assumes that there is a hierarchy of quality in the coverage of immigrants in individual papers.

In summary, the *Irish Independent* did not pursue racism with the same level of critical interest as *The Irish Times*. Moreover, a higher level of reporting on individual cases indicated that the *Irish Independent* was less likely to present racism as a general phenomenon in Irish society and was more prepared to publish articles that denied racism. At the same time, this was most pronounced in *The Irish Sun* tabloid, which lacked any serious attempt to discuss racism in Ireland. When racism was made a topic, not all immigrant groups had the same chance of being included as a clear focus on Nigerians illustrated.

[663] DOWNEY (27/09/00)

8.3.5 Case study: Racism and the coverage of the death of Toyosi Shittabey

In the evening of 02 April 2010 Toyosi Shittabey and a number of friends got involved in an altercation with Paul and Michael Barry on their way home from a swimming pool in Dublin. The group then left but was followed by the two brothers in Michael Barry's car.[664] On catching up, Paul Barry approached one of the youths holding a knife. Toyosi Shittabey came to the youth's assistance but received a fatal stab wound to his heart. In the subsequent trial in December 2012, Michael Barry was acquitted of murder since, the judge ruled, he could not have known that his brother was carrying a knife, and, due to the circumstances of the trial, the interest of justice would not have been well served if it had continued. Paul Barry had died during an initial trial of the two brothers and a key witness had refused to testify.

The discussion of racism in the coverage of the murder of Toyosi Shittabey was inevitably linked to victimisation because media interest in this case was a prerequisite for racism to become a topic in the news. Therefore, the following paragraphs will first investigate why this case reached a high profile in *The Irish Times* and *The Irish Sun* before addressing how and to what extent racism was discussed. The comments made by Bobby Kuti indicate that he perceived the attack to be racially motivated[665], and so did activists and academics alike.[666] What is more, allegedly racist abuse was shouted during the initial altercation,[667] and Paul and Michael Barry decided to follow the teenagers in their car armed with a knife. Because of Paul Barry's death during the trial a judicial evaluation of the racist nature of the crime was never arrived at. However, all indicators suggested that this was indeed a race crime and as such it was discussed here.

Almost half of all articles discussing Nigerian victims were concerned with Toyosi Shittabey's death (Table 21), resulting in peaks in the coverage of Nigerian immigrants in *The Irish Times* and *The Irish Sun* at 6 articles each during the peak period and one article in the *Irish Independent* (no peak). The very low number of articles in the *Irish Independent* both, throughout the year and the peak period prompted me to investigate the matter further to ascertain that the results were reliable. A spot check in the Irish Newspaper Archive showed that the search term *Toyosi* yielded 5 articles in the month of April 2010 (peaks in the *IT* and

[664] There are media reports that Paul and Michael Barry were under the impression that the youths had taken a mobile phone during the altercation.
[665] According to a NCCRI handbook, "a racial incident is any incident which is perceived to be racially motivated by a victim, a member of An Garda Siochána, a person who was present and who witnessed the incident or a person acting on behalf of the victim." NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM (2005)
[666] FLYNN (2010) and LONDRAS (2010)
[667] LONDRAS (2010)

IS), one of which was the one considered in *Victims*. Therefore, 1 out of 5 articles on this topic was part of the population of my study. The same search criteria yielded 26 articles in *The Irish Times*, 6 of which found entry in this study. Hence, the low number of articles in the *Irish Independent* did not appear to be a distortion since in both papers the number of articles making a reference to the nationality of the victim in relation to all Toyosi-articles was about the same (*IT*: 6/26 vs. *II*: 1/5).

Despite being a member of a visible minority, Toyosi Shittabey was much quicker elevated to near ideal victim status than Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos in the coverage of the murder trial of David Curran and Sean Keogh, which started shortly after the teenager's death (cf. p. 178). The almost instantaneous recognition of near ideal victim status was achieved by the victim's youth and an idolisation based on an over-emphasis of the victim's enthusiasm for football and sports in general as this extract from an *Irish Sun* article illustrated:

> And Bola [the victim's mother] told last night how her Chelsea-mad son was destined for greatness and dreamed of one day playing for the Boys in Green with idols Keane, below, and Damien Stuff.
>
> She sobbed: "He so much wanted to become a professional footballer.
>
> "All he wanted in life was to become a star and play for Ireland with Robbie Keane, Damien Duff and the other players.
>
> "He also loved Didier Drogba for Chelsea.
>
> I miss him so much. He was my God. Why would anyone do this to him? I loved him with all my heart. What will I do without him?
>
> "*He could have been something great. He could have been the man to replace Roy Keane in the Irish team*.[668] (Italics in original article)

These references aimed at a solidarisation with the victim at two levels. On the one hand, the newspaper solidarised with the victim by acting and publishing on behalf of the victim. On the other hand, the paper aimed at evoking a feeling of solidarity with the victim in the reader, which was achieved at the levels of personalisation and sports. The promise of greatness created an object of projection at which feelings of sympathy could be directed. This personification allowed readers to identify and show solidarity with the victim at a more emotional level than with an otherwise abstract, removed and unknown victim. The grief experienced by friends and family was raised to a national level and further enhanced by highlighting the contrast of the

[668] MAY (07/04/10)

boy's innocence and youth with the harrowing nature of the crime. This was in line with Greer's argument that,

> [n]ews media portrayals of young people as victims tend to be reserved for particularly grievous incidents resulting in serious injury or death – when they can be presented as innocent, naive or vulnerable. [...]. The under-representation of young people as victims of street crime is even more pronounced for those who are non-white.[669]

In addition to the attributes listed by Greer, Toyosi Shittabey's enthusiasm for sports and in particular football served as a further point of contact between the majority group and this member of a visible minority group. Football was a widely played team game in Ireland and enjoys a large group of supporters.[670] Moreover, sports have "a wider social significance; they bring people together, help build communities and provide a focus for collective identity and belonging."[671] The constant representation of the victim as a sports idol (*promising footballer, soccer-mad, Chelsea starlet, destined for greatness*) let his death appear not only as a great loss for the family and friends but for the entire nation.

Perhaps unsurprisingly, the representation of Shittabey's death differed a great deal in *The Irish Times* and *The Irish Sun*. Although reporting in the *IT* was of a generally informative and balanced nature, there were also elements present that contributed to creating a crisis and had a sensationalist tinge. On Monday 05 April 2010 *The Irish Times* opened with a warning of social unrest in the immigrant community. The *IT's* front page titled "Garda appeal for calm following fatal stabbing of teenage boy".[672] The opening sentence reiterated the Garda spokesman's appeal for calm following the stabbing. In the next paragraph Supt John Gilligan was quoted as saying people in the area should "take a deep breath, take a step back and let the gardai do their job." In the same paragraph, this area of Dublin, Tyrrelstown, was described as "one of the most ethnically diverse in Ireland," insinuating that immigrant communities were generally more inclined to engage in violent outbreaks than the majority population in Ireland. This was underlined by the *IT* quoting Supt John Gilligan as specifically addressing "the people in the area." The headline and the position of the appeal at the beginning of the article – and therefore in a prominent position – suggest that the *IT* contributed to the creation of an (unnecessary) air of imminent social unrest. As a consequence, immigrants were placed outside the majority consensus on societal norms, which represented a form of othering immigrant communities.

[669] GREER (2007), p. 34
[670] IRISH SPORTS COUNCIL (2005), p. 13
[671] IRISH SPORTS COUNCIL (2005), p. 1
[672] MCGREEVY (05/04/10)

Because of its high-profile nature and the predominance in Nigerian *Victim*-roles, it was believed that this case could act as an initiator for the coverage of racism in Ireland. The underlying assumption was that this had been a racially motivated assault (see below) with the derived hypothesis that the high profile nature of the killing, which resulted in peaks in two newspapers, must have triggered a debate on the role of racism in Ireland. Hence, all articles that were coded as discussing racism (regardless of whether as primary, secondary of tertiary topic) in the peak period between 01 April 2010 and 31 May 2010 were extracted. Three of these were clearly unrelated to Shittabey's death and only referred to racism as an isolated incident (murder of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos). Consequently, they were excluded from the analysis here. This left a total of 12 articles discussing racism during the peak period. There were only two articles – one each – in the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun* with the remaining 10 all published in *The Irish Times*. 10 out of these 12 articles saw racism as a general issue in society, with one article each in *The Irish Times* and *The Irish Sun* portraying the event as isolated incidents.

The low number of articles discussing racism in *The Irish Sun's* coverage reflected its sensationalist nature, devoid of any attempt to investigate societal issues arising from or brought to light by the teenager's death. The sensationalist nature was evidenced in the idolisation of the victim, the over-emphasis of the emotional sub-text but also in the silence on (latent) racism in Irish society. Except for a very short random hint in a quote, racism did not feature at all in *The Irish Sun*. The tabloid merely mentioned the topic by quoting MEP Joe Higgins as saying, "The savage attack on this innocent boy is a new low and appears to be racially related."[673] There was no other reference to racism, and the use of the verb *to appear* was far from expressing certainty, supporting findings that *The Irish Sun* made no attempt to investigate racism in any serious manner. Its coverage was generally of a sensationalist nature presenting the event in such a fashion that maximum awareness was raised without investigating any issues beyond the emotional and crisis level. Moreover, the visual aspect played an important role in the *IS*. Often double paged or in full page format, its large headlines in bold print and large scale photographs of the victim

> present an idealized personification of innocence and loss […and…] humanize crime victims, adding a sense of the 'real' to that which may otherwise remain abstract and difficult to latch on to or invest in emotionality.[674]

[673] MAY (07/04/10)
[674] GREER (2007), p. 31

The *Irish Independent's* only article[675] did commit some space to racism but the Integration Minister's statement, "There will be no room for racism in this country of ours either covert or overt", although relating to racism in general, was rather a stock phrase than a discussion of the extent of racist tendencies in society. Moreover, although the article stated that the boy was laid to rest with "a blue UEFA 'Respect' banner, the organisation's anti-racism scheme", the Nigerian ambassador's appeal that the racist killing was not just an Irish issue was called into question by setting *racist killing* in inverted commas. This ambivalent treatment of the topic revealed a hesitance in approaching the issue. Minor references by members of the in-group were conceded to, but an open appeal by a member of the out-group was challenged. This could hardly be called coming to terms with racism in Ireland.

The Irish Times, on the other hand, approached racism in Ireland quite openly. Apart from *not* presenting Toyosi Shittabey's death as an isolated incident, two articles investigated racism in Ireland thoroughly. On 09 April 2010 Brid Ni Chonaill, a lecturer in humanities at Blanchardstown Institute of Technology, published an elaborate article on her research of the perception of immigrants in Blanchardstown in 2008-9 (Blanchardstown was the greater area in which Toyosi Shittabey lived). She argued that "despite descriptions of the incident as 'once off' [...] there was no room for complacency on a local and national level", hence explicitly stating that she did not want to have her results understood as a localised phenomenon. She illustrated this with her findings that

> [t]he reaction across all social classes of Irish participants I interviewed was the same: migrants were seen as contributing to the shortage of school places and as being a general drain on resources. As one local school principal told me, commenting on the cutbacks in language support teachers, 'it would take very little to be anti-immigrant.' Race and skin colour are issues we cannot ignore. In the same study I conducted, stereotypes were cited regarding Africans, with Nigerians specifically identified.[676]

This quote confirmed that the author addressed everyday, sometimes latent racism in a frank manner and confirmed that Nigerians were particularly affected. Interestingly, she showed that immigrants were seen as a drain on resources whereas such a representation could not be confirmed for media representations in this study. However, this might be due to the design of the study with search terms based on nationality rather than legal status. Although Poles, Nigerians and Chinese were not generally represented as a burden on the state, asylum

[675] HICKEY (09/04/10)
[676] CHONAILL (09/04/10)

seekers could be presented in such a negative light. The different portrayal of asylum seekers in general and specific immigrant groups has the potential for further research.

Moreover, this article did not confine racism to the working class. There was no information as to which classes were more likely to hold racist views, but the message was clear – racism was found throughout society. Her example of a school principal, who effectively blamed immigrants for shortages instead of addressing his or her complaints to the government, underlined her findings that racism was found in all social classes. The class issue was picked up again later in her observation that there was perceived "unfair treatment of white children in school settings in a disadvantaged area". This effect was also discussed by Steven Loyal who argued that racism was illustrating competition for scarce resources particularly in the cities and among the working class and socially and economically excluded[677] further demanding that

> [s]ociological analysis needs to move away from phenomenal forms of analysis that focus simply on racialisation and skin colour. The focus instead needs to be on broader underlying social and power relations including class relations. This does not mean ignoring race as a social marker but involves looking at its articulation with class conditions.[678]

Competition for scarce resources may have had less significant influence in the middle class at the height of the boom, which explains why Ni Chonaill noted views of perceived unfair treatment of white children particularly only in disadvantaged areas.

Later, an article on exploitation and racist assaults on maids in Irish middle class households, was published, presumably as a consequences of the raised awareness of everyday racism in Ireland following Shittabey's death. This article confirmed the classless aspect of racism although it left a bitter aftertaste by giving the impression that racism in the working class was more justified:

> It struck me then that most of the time when we're talking about racism, the conversation takes place within pretty narrow parameters. Mostly we mean dreadful incidents like the murder of Toyosi Shittabey in Tyrrelstown that prompt public handwringing over racial tensions in working class areas. For the commentators, politicians and experts, it really is abstract. A rise in the number of foreigners in certain localities presents major challenges for communities where the competition for resources creates tension anyway.
>
> The kind of people who exploit Filipina maids are not the kind of people who have to worry if their children's education is being compromised by the number of non-English speaking pupils in the classroom. Yet features on racism tend to focus almost exclusively on the lower end of the social spectrum. Reporters don their safari gear and head off to the Wild West of Dublin to interview community representatives who are reduced to defending the reputation of their locality while

[677] LOYAL (2011), pp. 246-47
[678] LOYAL (2011), p. 245

> politely pleading for better public services. Newspaper features or radio conversations from a posh postal address discussing how the servants of the establishment are faring are considerably rarer. Neither do we hear much about how foreigners treat their own.[679]

Whereas the author pointed out that racism in Ireland could be met in all walks of life, she fell into an apologetic tone when it came to the people at the lower end of the social spectrum. In accordance with Ni Chonaill's findings, she pointed out that people's economic disposition played a role in everyday practices of (latent) racism. Yet, the author blamed immigrants for rough conditions in schools and communities, thereby drawing from the very xenophobic practices she had attempted to expose. Despite her analysis that racism was not confined to the working class, a denial of responsibility of everyday racism, irrespective of economic motives, and the creation of a working class vs. middle class divide added a racist note to at least part of her coverage of racism.

Both articles showed that the economic disposition of immigrant workers defined power relations between members of the Irish middle class and immigrants. In this case, the maid was disadvantaged because of her status as a non-EEA migrant. With her employers holding her work permit, she had very little chances of escaping her deplorable working and living conditions. The state denied her the same economic rights which citizens of Ireland and the European Union enjoy because she was a non-citizen. This case illustrated Agamben's divide between the bare and political life and the state's incapability to address the situation in a satisfactory manner.[680] At the same time, this article also showed how power was not only exercised by the state's government but also by its individual members, as Foucault suggested. Exploited workers were only not seen as a threat as long as they remained in a subservient position in which they could be controlled by the exploiter. The moment they started demanding their rights, as did the maid in the article of 28 April 2010 when she threatened to leave for a job in which she would be paid minimum wage, her employer became dominant and, in this case, refused to forward her work permit, effectively barring her from leaving her position with the family.[681] Economic dependency forced immigrant workers into accepting dangerous working conditions and at times wages below the national minimum wage.

[679] CAREY (28/04/10)
[680] AGAMBEN (1998), pp. 75-9
[681] Work permits are obtained and held by the employer. As of 10 April 2013 non-EU immigrants are expected to stay with their employer for the first 12 months and then need to apply for a new work permit if they wish to change employment. CITIZENS INFORMATION (2013a)

In the remainder of the article Ni Chonaill reported on how the immigrant community experienced racism and made suggestions as to how racism could be tackled. Her article refuted the myth that racism was not widespread and confined to pockets of society.

Another comprehensive article, published on 10 April 2010[682], also addressed the issue of racism extensively and in a frank manner. Yet, it remained ambivalent in the portrayal of the Shittabey family and the local imam's appeal to abstain from peaceful protests, perhaps illustrating differences between academically and journalistically informed articles and the higher awareness for what constitutes racism in the former. Moreover, this article illustrated that even in *The Irish Times* not all reporting on racism was beyond doubt. The ambivalent nature of the first part of the article reinforced the differences between the Shittabey family and the majority society by quoting the local Imam as saying, "The family is not really [...] settled. When the father is looking at you, he is not seeing you." The author went on to point out that, "The father, Segun Shittabey, is doing the best to see the world we see." Their motive for coming to Ireland 11 years prior to the killing was "peace" – set in inverted commas. Presumably in a genuine attempt to provide some background to the Shittabey family, McGreevy / Sheridan supported an assimilationist view on immigration policy. In a condescending manner they commended the father's attempts to make sense of the Irish world, yet failed to acknowledge the need for the majority group to try and see the immigrants' world as well if true integration was to be achieved. In this article integration was presented as a one-way process. Despite presumably best intentions, the fault was at least implicitly put on the Shittabey family. The message this article conveyed was that if only they had changed and adapted to life in Ireland, the problem would not have arisen. Furthermore, the authors may have set *peace* in inverted commas to create a contrast between the search for peace when the family came to Ireland and the traumatising loss of a teenage child in an assault in a country where they deemed themselves in safety. In this context though, the inverted commas also allowed for a reading that questioned the family's motives, implicitly doubting the Shittabey's legitimacy to reside in Ireland.

A further source of ambivalence was the uncritical reference to the appeal for calm:

> The palpable anxiety of community leaders to maintain calm among their young men in particular, could be misconstrued as an attempt to minimise the race element. In fact, the leaders are treading on egg-shells, forever playing it down, fearful of fanning the sparks.

[682] McGreevy and Sheridan (10/04/10)

The all-embracing reference to community leaders was potentially misleading. Was the *palpable anxiety* the opinion of all community leaders or that of some, if not a minority? As discussed above, the appeals for calm were the result of an over-representation of an incident in which car windows had been smashed after a rally in honour of the dead boy and could be traced to a small number of community leaders around the local imam Dr Al-Qadri. This representation of Tyrrelstown's "young men in particular" reinforced an image that had its roots in the savage hordes of pre-civilised societies.[683] Playing down the incident and rejecting any form of peaceful (!) protest, placed immigrant communities in subservient, passive positions. As in the representation of the Shittabey family, the immigrant community was asked to change, to assimilate rather than to appeal to the majority community to take the fears and worries, the rights and disadvantagement of immigrant communities seriously.

This form of representation appeared at odds with the (longer) remainder of the article, in which the depiction of racism as a singular phenomenon was deconstructed:

> Much emphasis is being placed on the fact that the two Irish brothers charged in connection with the killing are from outside Tyrrelstown. Five of Toyosi's friends who witnessed the killing are still astonished that it should happen here, of all places.
>
> "Toy thought he was safe here," said 16-year-old Bobby Kuti, "This is where we live. It's not like we went to some mad place where we weren't supposed to go. This is where he got stabbed for whatever reason."

Whereas this presentation expressed the surprise of some of Tyrrelstown's inhabitants that racist incidents could take place in this part of Dublin, the local councillor, Ruth Coppinger, remained adamant that xenophobia was not an issue after the murder:

> There is no racial tension. This is an exceptional event. This is an aberration. It doesn't even happen nationally.

Not only did she refuse any possibility that racism might have been a problem in this part of Dublin, she extended the denial to a national level.[684] In respect of Tyrrelstown, similar comments had been made earlier for example by Garda spokesman John Gilligan.[685] The local imam even claimed that the incident was not racially motivated at all, appealing to community members to abstain from demonstrations and protests as they might have led to unrest.[686] In an indirect fashion such denials of racism contributed to the spread of xenophobic practices

[683] Cf. HALL (1996), p. 164
[684] In earlier articles she was quoted as saying there might be some racism: "what racism there is". Cf. MCGREEVY (06/04/10)
[685] MCGREEVY (05/04/10)
[686] MCGREEVY (06/04/10)

because as long as these were not openly addressed by residents and politicians alike, the problem was not recognised as one concerning society and could not be addressed. Therefore, such utterances had to be considered as contributing to racism in society.

Creating a contrast to the representation of the Tyrrelstown community as one devoid of any form of racism, which was even elevated to national level by a local politician, McGreevy / Sheridan disagreed with Coppinger's stock-phrase denial of racism:

> Despite the shock and devastation of Toyosi's death, this week Tyrrelstown felt like a calm, orderly place where people live and let live.

The verb *feel* already indicated that perception could be deceiving; they consciously did not choose a more assertive verb such as *be*, which would have had a more ultimate effect. Feel foreshadowed, that below the surface, Tyrrelstown was not what it seemed to be at first glance. They went on to challenge and contradict Coppinger's assessment of racist attitudes in this part of Dublin and at a national level.

> Dig a little deeper however, and it's hard to avoid the sense that this is only an aberration because it is extreme. Someone has died. But the daily reality for many of these people is the low rumble of racism.

From here the authors left no doubt that racism was an everyday feature in Irish society. Carefully researched they presented a balanced range of material, citing members of the public who had become victims of racist assaults, studies on racism, members of the clergy and people involved in community work and sports. In contrast to presenting racist assaults as isolated incidents, they referred to a broad range of sources attempting to show that,

> [Racism] rumbles along, the low-grade abuse, perhaps becoming such a familiar background noise that its victims almost cease to notice.

The article resorted to interviewees from both the majority and minority groups. Apart from illuminating the extent of racism, insufficient integration and a lack of facilities in the area were cited. One (Irish) interviewee, who was involved in youth coaching, was quoted as saying that all residents wanted to integrate but that Irish and non-national groups were still "a bit distanced from each other." He went on to say that, "There must be 150 nationalities here, but the strange thing is, everyone at a residents' association meeting is Irish." The lack of facilities was illustrated by quoting the (Nigerian-born) pastor who said, "I am having a meeting of the social integration sub-committee and I still don't know where it's going to take place." Furthermore, the article mentioned the work of Sport Against Racism Ireland, an organisation that promotes the integration of immigrant youth through sports and does the ground work in

defying ethnic nepotism, a term coined by Bryan Fanning.[687] Former Ireland manager Brian Kerr pointed out that

> They can become role models for children of similar backgrounds and put it up to people who think it is okay to have racist tendencies. There is consistent racism in this country despite what people might have you believe.

This quote, confirming that racism was found throughout the social body, stood in a prominent position at the very end of the article. This position underlined the authors' aim to expose racism in Ireland despite the (supposedly unintentional) negative portrayal of the Shittabey family in the beginning. Although there were issues in the article that kept it below the standard of a more academically informed contribution (such as the one by Brid in Chonaill), it nevertheless showed that *The Irish Times* was addressing racism in the country in an open fashion. Moreover, my criticism of the coverage must be seen in a context of overall low numbers on the topic of *Racism* with the *IT* being the only paper in this study to follow the subject after the death of Toyosi Shittabey in a serious manner.

***

The results of the analysis of the case study to a degree reflected the overall coverage of racism in the three papers. *The Irish Times* was least likely to hold racist views and if it did so, they were usually part of a spectrum of opinions or the result of journalists not being aware of what constitutes racism in the coverage of minorities. Despite minor sensationalist tinges, this broadsheet was also most likely to expose racism in Irish society, which only happened to a very limited extent in the *Irish Independent* and hardly at all in *The Irish Sun*. The latter tabloid paper was by far most likely to hold racist views, whereas the *Irish Independent* had a somewhat liberal appearance in its editorial content but a very clear racist undercurrent in its letters to the editor section.

Hence, in regard to Lentin's notion of the racist state (cf. above), it could be shown that while some newspapers were, in a Foucauldian sense, part of the racist state, others were not. Moreover, it could be shown that racist attitudes did not solely originate in official Ireland but also in ordinary citizens. Yet, those contributions that did hold racist views, showed that the media supported a hierarchy of races by focusing racist coverage on non-EEA migrants and asylum seekers. They thereby supported government discourse by classifying and highlighting

[687] FANNING (2012), pp. 189-90

these migrants as unwanted objects from which society had to be protected. On the other hand, *The Irish Times* in particular and the *Irish Independent* to a very limited extent approached racism very critically and revealed (latent) racist attitudes in Irish society, which was a prerequisite for addressing the issue. In conclusion, whereas there were certainly racial issues that needed to be addressed, defining Ireland as a fundamentally racist state would ignore those voices that sought to redress xenophobia.

8.4 Victimisation of minority groups

8.4.1 Introduction

As the discussion of the most frequent primary roles and topics above showed, victim roles belonged to a set of salient roles that were found in all three immigrant groups. This role allocation was most prominent amongst Poles who were portrayed as victims in more than one third of articles when all articles were considered. The victimisation of the Polish community became even more evident when articles discussing *Poles and other immigrant groups* were excluded. In that case just under every second article victimised Poles. Nigerians and Chinese were considerably less often seen as victims; yet, in relative terms, the role belonged to the most frequent role allocations in these groups. For all articles mentioning Nigerians (*Nigerians and others*), the victim role was third most frequent (7.2 %) with a similar result for *Nigerians* (only), where *Victims* was third most frequent together with *Resident* (9.5 %). In articles discussing members of the Chinese community and others, *Victims* did not make it into the top 3 (4th most frequent at 12.8 %), but it was the second most frequent for *Chinese* just after the *Student* role (21.7% / for all data cf. Table 8).

In respect of secondary role allocations, the number was very low for Poles with the clear majority in *Poles and no other immigrant groups*. In contrast, in the cases of Nigerians and Chinese, secondary victim roles were much more frequent, albeit at low relative levels. In the first group there were 27 articles, which made it the second most frequent secondary role allocation. In the latter group it was the most frequent secondary role together with *Student* (Table 9). Because of the not insignificant number of secondary *Victim* roles allocated to members of the Nigerian and Chinese communities, both primary and secondary victim roles shall be considered in the analysis. When topics linked to this role were compared, it emerged that in both primary and secondary role allocations the pattern of topics was quite similar in both groups with very few exceptions in *Nigerians* (Table 14). It was therefore decided to concentrate the discussion on *Poles*, *Nigerians* and *Chinese* only, excluding articles that also discussed other immigrant groups.

The predominance of victim roles in the representation of the Polish community was reinforced by a comparison of the frequency of victim roles across newspapers. Poles were by far the most favoured victims in all three newspapers as absolute numbers showed. Because of the low number of Poles living in Ireland prior to the EU enlargement in May 2004, the very clear majority of articles appeared in 2010. In that year alone, primary representations of Poles as victims by far outnumbered those of primary and secondary victim roles of Nigerians and Chinese in all four periods combined (Table 16; Table 17). Underlining this trend, the high profile trials of two young men accused of the murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos generated more articles than those on Nigerian or Chinese victims. The favouritism of Polish victims was further underlined by a tendency towards long articles on Poles and short ones on Chinese with Nigerians taking a middle position. This trend was most pronounced in *The Irish Sun* tabloid paper (Table 18).

Poles featured as victims most frequently in all three newspapers. However, in the *IT* Chinese and Nigerians had a much higher chance of being portrayed as victims than in the *II* and *IS*. Chinese in particular had a miniscule chance of making it into the news as victims in the tabloid paper. These figures serve as a further indicator that *The Irish Times*' hierarchy of races was less pronounced than the other two papers' indicating a higher quality of coverage in this paper (Table 19).

8.4.2 Discussion

I first endeavour investigating reasons as to why this Eastern European immigrant group had reached such an exposed position in the Irish media and why there were unequal chances for victim representation for different immigrant groups in the media. Apart from the general discussion, the trials concerning the murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos shall be discussed in a case study in a second step.

Victimisation studies have been commonplace for the past 40 years amongst criminologist. In England and Wales, for example, the British Crime Survey and The Offending, Crime and Justice Survey (2003-2006) investigate(d) cases in which people have become victims and also include the victims' personal experience of the crime in the surveys. These studies deliver statistical data that provide more information than mere police statistics and can give an indication of how crime and victimisations develops long term.[688] Apart from An Garda

[688] Cf. Office for National Statistics; UK Data Service

Síochána statistics, in Ireland Crime and Victimisation surveys "provide a useful supplement to official crime statistics because they can be used to estimate the 'dark figure' of crime i.e. those crimes which are not reported to the police".[689] There have also been a number of studies on specific victims groups such as gays and lesbians[690] or an MA thesis on victim support services as experienced by immigrants in Ireland[691] as well as a broader study on immigrants as victims of crimes conducted by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights.[692]

Against the backdrop of victimisation studies carried out so far, Davies, Francis and Greer identified a gap in researching media representations of victimisation.[693] In their attempt to close this gap, Greer proposed two concepts relating to victimisation – those of the ideal victim and the hierarchy of victimisation, which can be applied in the explanation why different immigrant groups have unequal chances of being portrayed as victims in the media. Ideal victims are

> those persons or category of individuals who – when hit by crime – most readily are given the complete and legitimate status of being a victim, including those who are perceived as vulnerable, defenceless, innocent and worthy of sympathy and compassion.

Victim hierarchy

> describes a pecking order of sorts, representing the differential status of particular types and categories of crime victims in media and official discourses, including ideal victims (for example, some child murder victims) at the top of the hierarchy, and undeserving victims (for example, youths injured in a drunken fight) near the bottom.[694]

Arguably, almost none of the victims in this study could tick all boxes in the above definition of an ideal victim. One of the few victims that could potentially be described as vulnerable, defenceless, innocent and worthy of sympathy and compassion was 15-year-old Toyosi Shittabey, who died after an assault on the way home from a swimming pool in 2010, but, as will be shown in a separate discussion, the victim role ascribed to him was not unconditional and contained limitations (cf. ch. 8.3.5). In another high-profile case,[695] murder victims Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos certainly received a great deal of sympathy and came closer to ideal victimhood than other victims surveyed in this study. Yet, further reasons contributing to

[689] NATIONAL CRIME COUNCIL
[690] SARMA (2004)
[691] HOLOHAN (2011)
[692] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012)
[693] DAVIES, FRANCIS and GREER (2007), p. 9
[694] GREER (2007), p. 22. The original definition of the ideal victim goes back Christies (1986).
[695] There were two men accused of the murders, and consequently there were two trials. However, these trials were held concurrently and the media generally referred to the trials as one trial. Therefore, henceforth both trials will be referred to as one trial.

the high profile of the case were the cultural proximity of Poles and the nature of the crimes committed.

Of the three immigrant groups discussed here, Poles were perceived as the least culturally different. First and foremost, they were, unlike Nigerians and Chinese, not a visible minority. Other cultural similarities included a no longer dominant but still important role of the Catholic Church in shaping national identity and a shared history of suffering under imperial powers. This cultural proximity contributed to a generally positive image of Poles. Similarly, Haynes and Devereux argued that "[...] positive perceptions of the Polish reproduce media discourses that have stressed the extent to which the Poles are like the Irish."[696] Such a positive image was reinforced by the stereotypical perception of the hard-working Pole. Their legal and economic statuses as EU-citizens and, in the majority of cases, labour migrants also favoured their position in Irish society. Nigerian and Chinese immigrants, on the other hand, were more removed from the core of Irish society by an emphasis of otherness such as looking different or a perceived cultural divide. Nigerian asylum seekers were usually excluded from the workforce, and those who were allowed to contribute to the Irish economy were under-represented.[697] Thus, they were deprived of even the chance of obtaining a similarly positive image as Poles. As a result, the media tended to portray visible minorities as less deserving victims, placed well below Poles in the hierarchy of victimisation.

In respect of newsworthiness (cf. p. 42), this study follows a middle of the road approach, taking newsworthiness into account as a contributory factor but also considering other approaches such as the ideas by Greer as discussed above. In fact, newsworthiness could also be employed to explain why Nigerians were predominantly seen as asylum seekers and Chinese as students (cf. ch. 9.2 and 9.3). However, I hold that these roles were much more obvious and fulfilled stereotypical role expectations, which made a discussion of why they made it into the news obsolete. The *Victim*-role, though, was arguably not a role that could be stereotypically expected. In the case of Nigerians and Chinese, the victim role was perhaps not so surprising since in total numbers it was found in well less than 1 in 10 articles (even though this role belonged to the top three role allocations). In the case of Poles though, the large number of victim roles could not be explained by stereotypical expectations. This could only be explained by resorting to the newsworthiness theory and Greer's victim hierarchies. In relation to

[696] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2009), p. 7
[697] Cf. the low number of *Employee, Expert* and *Entrepreneur* roles in comparison to *Asylum seeker* in Table 8

newsworthiness, the negativity factor (cf. ch. 4.1) played a fundamental role in events making it into the news.

Negativity and victimisation

According to Galtung and Ruge, a reference to something negative is one of the newsworthiness factors that particularly raise the chance of an event to make it into the news. In this study the assumption was that apart from Greer's suggestion of ideal victimhood (cf. above), negativity as a newsworthiness factor played an important role in the high frequency of victim roles. This assumption was reinforced by topics linked to this role. *Court Case*, *Crime* and *Accidents* featured most frequently with more than 4 in 5 accident cases found in *Poles* (Table 14). When the primary topic was *Court Case*, the cases related to *Crime* in almost all articles on Poles and Chinese, and to *Crime* and *Racism* for Nigerians (Table 15). Therefore, both the role itself and the topics confirmed a reference to something negative. However, this reference was only established in a crude fashion, calling for more in-depth investigation.

With crime playing a dominant role in the victimisation of immigrants, it was then established which categories of crime featured most often in order to produce a more detailed picture. I put under scrutiny all samples that included either a primary or secondary victim role and determined whether an article reported on a) a person crime, b) a property crime, c) no crime (e.g. accidents) or d) other cases. The analysis showed that, not unexpectedly, person crimes, which were arguably perceived as most negative, were over-represented and property crimes under-represented to the point of not featuring at all in *Poles* and *Nigerians*. Person crimes also featured considerably more often than no crimes or other cases. Across the three immigrant groups, this trend could be identified in all three newspapers, but was most pronounced in *The Irish Sun* tabloid (Table 27 to Table 32). To a very considerable extent, person crimes were of an ultimate nature, i.e. murder or manslaughter. In the case of Poles, out of 149 cases in which a victim role was allocated, 98 could be ascribed to 6 individual cases of manslaughter or murder, and 60 of these referred to one single case – the murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos. This represented well over one third of all cases. In the remaining ones, 29 were linked to accidents involving a Polish person (Table 33). In Nigerian victims, 17 out of 36 articles concerned the death of Toyosi Shittabey (Table 21).

These findings show that Galtung and Ruge's proposition that an event has a higher chance of making it into the news the more negative the nature of the crime is can be applied here. But

why is negativity so alluring to the media? Galtung and Ruge offer four explanations that take into account how negativity is linked to other news factors.

First, they argue that "[t]here is a basic asymmetry in life between the positive, which is difficult and takes time, and the negative, which is much easier and takes less time."[698] Because of the shortness, negative events fit the frequency factor much better than positive events since they usually take place between two issues of a newspaper and can therefore be considered in the next one. Positive events, on the other hand, are often a process and therefore more difficult to portray as one event. Murder and assault as well as accidents leave victims seriously harmed or dead in a matter of seconds or even a fraction of a second. A successful community integration programme, though, unfolds over months if not years, and only events marking its start or completion fit the frequency criterion.

Second, negative events are unambiguous. As part of societal consensus, assault and murder are considered heinous acts by most members of the majority and minority populations. The aforementioned integration programme, though, might not reach the same level of agreement since some people may consider it positive while others are indifferent or even opposed to it. This illustrates that positive events are more ambiguous than negative events.[699]

Third, "negative news is said to be more consonant with at least some dominant pre-images of our time."[700] Despite the positive image of Poles in Ireland, a study by Haynes and Devereux established that respondents blamed them for dangerous or reckless driving.[701] Hence, there appeared to be an expectation that Poles were involved in accidents more often than other immigrant groups. Stating the nationality of victims in accidents confirmed this latent expectation. To the best of my knowledge, there are no reliable statistics that show how Poles compare to Irish in respect of traffic offences although an anecdote that at first glance exposed the shortcomings of an Garda Síochána in an amusing fashion, reinforced the negative perception of Poles' driving skills at second glance. In 2009, the mystery about a much wanted traffic offender, who had come to the attention of the Gardaí (Irish police) was finally solved. The wanted, a Mr Prawo Jazdy, turned out to be the Polish term for driver's licence.[702]

[698] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), p. 69
[699] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), p. 69
[700] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), pp. 69-70
[701] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2009), 7
[702] This story was widely covered at national and international level. Cf. for example BBC (2009)

Fourth, negative news are less predictable or, in other words, more unexpected. As Galtung and Ruge argue, positive news is considered the norm, rendering them subject to the trivial, which is under-represented in the news.[703] Shoemaker, a critic of the importance of news factors in deciding what makes it into the news, agrees in this aspect, "If developments are negative, they are more likely to become news. Stories develop until the problems are resolved. Problem resolution is good news, which most of the time means no news."[704]

In the previous paragraphs, it could be shown that most articles on victims covered person crimes and accidents, and that they made it into the news because of their negative nature. Resorting to Galtung and Ruge, explanations were offered as to why negative news featured more frequently than positive ones, and cultural proximity explained why Poles featured more often than Nigerians and Chinese. These points will be further investigated in the case study on the coverage of the trial of the murderers of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos. At this point, the focus shall return to media content and the discussion of the representational character by investigating how the topics presented in the media related to crime statistics.

Over and under-representation of topics

Amongst academics it is generally agreed that what the media report is not an objective account of events. As will be shown in the following section, this general statement was also true for reporting on the victimisation of minority groups. The authors of the EU-Midis study found that minorities become victims of a crime, both person and property crimes, more often than the majority population. On average, every fourth member of a minority group stated that they had become a victim of a crime in the 12 months prior to the study. The survey further showed that Sub-Saharan Africans – the definition of Sub-Saharan includes Nigerians – had the highest risk of becoming a crime victim with every third respondent indicating that she or he had experienced some form of crime. Generally, visible minorities reported higher levels of victimisation than those who could not be discerned by their looks. According to this survey, Sub-Saharan Africans were more likely to become a victim of a person crime while Central and Eastern Europeans were more likely to fall victim to a property crime. However, as the authors state, these general results varied across individual EU-member states, and could therefore only serve as an indicator. The following paragraph will discuss what the study revealed about minority victimisation in Ireland.

[703] GALTUNG and RUGE (1965), p. 70
[704] SHOEMAKER (2006), pp. 107-8

Specific results for Ireland showed that 41 per cent of Sub-Saharan Africans had become a victim of a crime while the figure for Central and Eastern Europeans was considerably lower at 28 per cent[705] (though by no means low in absolute terms!). When it came to violent crimes, more than one in four Sub-Saharan Africans reported that they had become a victim of serious harassment in Ireland. This was the fourth highest figure for all European countries surveyed and well over the average of reported incidents by this group (18 %).[706] Sub-Saharan Africans were considerably more likely to experience in-person crimes in which a racist motive was suspected (26 % / 7 %).[707] Asians in Ireland did not appear in the study. However, a survey carried out by Feldman[708] showed that the victimisation rate for Chinese in Ireland was also quite high at 30 per cent.

As the findings of the two surveys show, visible minorities had a markedly higher risk of becoming a victim of a crime.[709] Yet, the media presented a different picture. Although Eastern Europeans were more likely to become a victim of a property crime, Poles were exclusively linked to person crimes, which omitted racist incidents entirely. Even taking into account that many incidents probably remained unreported, this could not explain the total muteness on these topics. At the same time, those minority groups who experienced crime more often were represented in victim roles considerably less frequently and to a lesser extent (i.e. in shorter articles). There was a distinct under-representation of Nigerian and Chinese victims in the Irish press and an over-representation of Polish victims, both in terms of nationality and nature of crime. The high frequency of victim roles in *Poles* calls for closer analysis in a case study on the representation of the trial of two men who were accused of murdering Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos in April 2008. Poles as victims was both part of shared role allocations and at the same time by far the most frequent individual role allocation in *Poles*. Therefore, the case study forms a separate chapter in the *Individual role allocation* section, following this one.

***

The analysis has shown that minorities as victims were mis-represented in the media in terms of frequency, length and nature of coverage. Visible minorities had a much lower chance of making it into the news as victims than those who were culturally closer to the majority

[705] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 8
[706] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 10
[707] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 11
[708] FELDMAN (2008)
[709] Although the EU-Midis study did not state results by nationality but only by collated groups, it seems safe to draw conclusions from the figures for Eastern and Central Europeans and Sub-Saharan Africans.

group, despite statistics showing that visible minorities are disproportionately more often affected by person crimes. If they made it above the threshold, such reports were often shorter, implying less importance. However, across all immigrant groups the coverage was subject to an over-representation of person crimes, which could usually be traced to a small number of high-profile cases that were selected as news for reasons that were not exclusively linked to the victims' representation as immigrants. Hence, articles on minorities as victims presented a distorted image of their life in Ireland in ignorance of the crimes and difficulties with which immigrants were confronted on a daily basis. This was most pronounced in the tabloid paper, but also characteristic of the quality papers albeit to a lesser extent.

9 Individual role allocations

9.1 Polish crime victims: The murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos

9.1.1 Introduction

In April 2010, the trials of David Curran and Sean Keogh, who were accused of murdering Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos on 23 February 2008, started in Dublin. David Curran pleaded not guilty to their murder but guilty to manslaughter, while Sean Keogh, who was prosecuted on the grounds of common design, pleaded not guilty to murder. In the evening of 23 February 2008 Pawel Kalite was involved in a melee with a number of teenagers outside a chip shop in Drimnagh, Dublin, but eventually left the scene and walked home. One of the teenagers then phoned David Curran, who, together with Sean Keogh and three further youths, went to Kalite's house. The events there led to the stabbing in the head with a screwdriver of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos, who had come to his housemate's help. The stabbing wounds were inflicted by David Curran, who allegedly was under the influence of alcohol and drugs. Sean Keogh kicked one of the men, who were then lying on the ground, in the head. Both victims died within a number of days in hospital. On 07 May 2010 a jury found David Curran guilty of the murders, but acquitted Sean Keogh of this charge, finding him guilty of assault. David Curran was sentenced to life in prison while Sean Keogh received a sentence of 4.5 years in prison with the last 6 months suspended.

The trial received a great deal of attention and was widely covered in the media. As mentioned in chapter 7.1.3, it resulted in peaks in all three papers in the months of April and May 2010. For the convenience of analysis, both months will be considered as one period here. In this period[710] almost two thirds of newspaper reports were devoted to the trial. Between 13 April 2010 and 20 May 2010 a total of 58 articles were published in the three papers. The case was most frequently covered in the *Irish Independent* (24 articles) and at 17 articles each to the same extent in *The Irish Times* and *The Irish Sun* (Table 20).

As shown above, when Poles were represented as victims, this was mostly done in a context of crime, accidents or court cases that dealt with a crime (cf. ch. 8.4). Two thirds of articles on Polish victims could be traced to 2 cases of serious assault and 5 cases in which Polish nationals were killed, so that the homicide of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos' was

[710] Group = Poles; Focus = Yes

one event amongst others. Yet, it was this case that received the greatest attention in 2010. Earlier I discussed why negative events such as crimes have a higher chance of making it into the news. This also applied to the coverage of the murder trial of David Curran and Sean Keogh, and I hold that the trial received exceptional attention predominantly because of the violent nature of the crime and the opportunity to frame the defendants as thugs and, to a lesser extent, because the victims' background predisposed them for a portrayal as nearly ideal victims which, however, was not instantaneously awarded and had to be won.[711]

This chapter first traces the early coverage of the trial, considering how the nature of the crime, the victims and defendants were introduced and how these introductions reflected varying reporting styles. It then follows the subsequent coverage, in which the individual newspapers' approaches to the trial emerged even clearer.

9.1.2 Early coverage

On 15 April 2010, all three papers reported on the charges brought forward against David Curran and Sean Keogh by the counsel for the state. In large black on white letters taking up half a page, *The Irish Sun* titled "Pavel [sic] was stabbed in the head twice [...] the screwdriver pierced his skull to his brain stem" and in the sub-title "TRIAL HEARS HORROR OF POLISH PALS' KILLING."[712] The identification of the tool and pointing out that the victim was stabbed twice added to the representation of the killing as a particularly violent one. This was supported by juxtaposing the *horror* (in capital letters) of the killing and the victims' friendship (*Polish pals*). Detailing the nature of the wound (*to the brain stem*) served the same purpose, underlining the sensationalist approach. The *Irish Independent* approached the trial differently. Its title "Takeaway row led to the killing of Polish men with a screwdriver, court hears"[713] also made a reference to the violent nature of the crime by mentioning the screwdriver. However, the semantics of its headline remained more ambiguous in relation to the responsibility for the crime. By suggesting that the victim(s) took part in the row, this headline insinuated that they may have actively contributed to the escalation, which ultimately resulted in the killing. *The Irish Sun*, on the other hand, used a passive construction which omitted agency but expressed that Pawel Kalite was at the receiving end of the action, representing him more clearly as the victim. *The Irish Times* only stated that a "Teenager stabbed two men in the head, trial told."[714]

[711] For a discussion of winning victim status cf. GREER (2007), p. 24
[712] MCELGUNN (15/04/10)
[713] ANDERSON (15/04/10)
[714] ANONYMOUS (15/04/10)

Not only was the weapon omitted, it also did not mention the consequences (death of victims), which presented a less sensationalist coverage.

In the next step, the opening sentence and the body of the text were investigated further. Setting the tone for the entire article, the opening sentence is in a very prominent position within an article and is of fundamental importance in informing the reader about the event that is covered by providing a general idea about what has happened. Furthermore, in conjunction with the headline, the opening sentence fulfils the purpose of enticing the reader to read on. As a consequence, editors aspire to present the event in such a way that readers make the decision to continue reading. The strategies that are employed to reach this aim, though, vary between the individual newspapers. On 15 April 2010, *The Irish Times* wrote:

> A DRIMNAGH teenager stabbed two Polish mechanics through their brains, possibly with a screwdriver outside their Dublin home on a February evening two years ago, the Central Criminal Court heard yesterday.[715]

The *IT's* opening sentence was quite detailed in providing information on the crime. It 1) made a reference to the perpetrator (*a DRIMNAGH teenager*), 2) the nature of the crime (*stabbed* [...] *through their brains, possibly with a screwdriver*), 3) the victims (*two Polish mechanics*), it informed about 4) where the crime took place (*outside their Dublin home*), when it took place (*on a February evening two years ago*), and 5) told the reader where the trial was held (*the Central Criminal Court*).

On the same day, the *Irish Independent* wrote:

> TWO Polish men suffered "devastating" brain injuries when they were stabbed with a screwdriver in a row that escalated outside a chipper.[716]

Not only was this opening sentence much shorter in count of words (31 vs. 22), it also contained less information on the event. It informed the reader about 1) the victims (*Two Polish men*), 2) the nature of the crime (*suffered "devastating" brain injuries when they were stabbed with a screwdriver*) and 3) where the crime took place (*in a row that escalated outside a chipper*). At this point, there was no reference to the perpetrators, when the trial took place or the court at which the trial was held.

[715] ANONYMOUS (15/04/10)
[716] ANDERSON (15/04/10)

Likewise, *The Irish Sun* presented an abridged version of the event:

> Two Polish pals died after they were both stabbed through the BRAIN in a horror screwdriver attack, a murder trial heard yesterday.[717]

The length of the opening sentence was the same as in the *Irish Independent* (22 words) and therefore much shorter than *The Irish Times'*. The reader learnt about 1) the victims (*Two Polish pals*), 2) what had happened (*died after they were both stabbed through the BRAIN in a horror screwdriver attack*) and 3) the nature of the trial (*a murder trial heard yesterday*). As in the *Irish Independent*, there was no reference to the perpetrators, where the trial took place and which court dealt with the crime.

The opening sentences illustrate that *The Irish Times* presented a more complex sentence structure than both the *II* and the *IS*, thereby providing more information on the crime in the opening sentence. This can be interpreted as an early indicator for more in-depth and less sensationalist reporting in the *IT*. This first impression becomes more manifest when the remainders of the articles are taken into account. In the following sections the analysis will move from textual to sentence and word level as outlined in chapter 3.2. The bodies of the articles are contrasted with the opening sentences and representations in subsequent articles in the coverage of the trial.

The Irish Times' analytical approach – as expressed in the detailed account of the opening of the trial – was reflected in a clear structure of the subsequent paragraphs in the article. Following the opening sentence, the author gave some details on the crime, then moved on to the defendants' pleas and the barrister's strategy of defines, then to testimonies that provided background on the crime, followed by the prosecutor's opening speech which included further details on the crime, and eventually culminated in the charge. Both other papers did not follow such a clear structure. The *Irish Independent* moved from the opening sentence to the consequences of the crime, then to the defendants' pleas, then referred to testimonies that provided some background on the event, which were followed by the defendants' barrister's defines. After that the prosecutor's charge was presented *before* the content of his opening speech was covered. As in the opening sentence, this newspaper put the emphasis on providing partial information that was, at times, presented out of context. The following section serves to illustrate this. Referring to the strategy of defines, the *II* quoted David Curran's barrister and the prosecutor's position followed by an illogical reference to the victims' employment:

[717] McElgunn (15/04/10)

> He said his client would plead provocation and that he had experienced a "sudden loss of control". However, counsel for the prosecution, John O'Kelly SC, said it was a clear case of "deliberate intention". Both Mr Kalite and Mr Szwajko [sic] worked as mechanics at Ace Autobody in the Robin Hood Industrial Estate. Mr O'Kelly told the court that Mr Kalite had "unfortunately taken exception to being bumped into" by the boy [who was involved in an earlier row] and he went after him.

In this section, the illogical, arbitrary structure of the article became obvious. In a pre-emptive move, the defence's position was countered by the prosecutor's evaluation of the crime *before* the author of the article gave an account of prosecutor O'Kelly's opening speech. As a consequence, this out of context juxtaposition was in effect tantamount to pre-judging one of the accused, emphasising the negative nature of the crime. The following reference to the victims' jobs as mechanics at a garage was out of place as it obscured the chain of events that led to the crime. However, the effect that was achieved here was that the victims were represented as hard-working, honest members of society, which – at a very early stage and in contrast to more neutral references elsewhere in the article – paved the way for their subsequent representation as deserving victims, forming a contrast to the representation of the perpetrators as evil killers (see below). Whether consciously or unconsciously, the arbitrary structure of the article made it difficult for the reader to follow the events leading to the double murder, and instead presented information in a piecemeal fashion to a sensationalist effect despite a seemingly overall neutral character of the article (see discussion below). As this section shows, the selective character of the opening sentence was reflected in the body of the article.

In a similar fashion, *The Irish Sun's* structure forebode what the reader could expect in the body of the article albeit in a much less subtle way than in the *Irish Independent*. The *IS's* opening sentence was much less complex than *The Irish Times'* and equally contained much less information. Moreover, 14 out of 22 words were allocated to the description of the crime, revealing a focus on negativity, which resembled an important factor in Galtung and Ruge's newsworthiness theory (cf. above), thereby suggesting a sensationalist style of reporting. The following sections of the article could roughly be described as defendants' pleas, description of nature of attack followed by strategy of defence, then O'Kelly's opening speech, testimonies, again O'Kelly's opening speech, further testimony, again O'Kelly's opening speech, culminating in the presentation of the charge, a further reference to the defendants' strategy of defence and, finally, some background on the victims. As in the *Irish Independent*, this intermittent and selective description of events made it difficult for the reader to follow the events, suggesting that *The Irish Sun's* interest focused on the presentation of the gory details of the crime rather than to inform the reader about the details of the court proceedings. As will

be shown below, recurring references to the nature of the crime and thus a dominant focus on negativity were integral parts of *The Irish Sun's* coverage.

Representation of the victims

In respect of references to the victims, the presentation in the opening sentences differed from the general representation in the bodies of articles in all three newspapers. *The Irish Times* referred to the victims as *Polish mechanics* in the opening sentence, but used exclusively neutral references in the following paragraphs (*Polish man, Polish lad* [used in a direct quote], *Pawel Kalite, Marius Szwajkos, Mr Kalite, Mr Szwajkos* and, sparingly, pronouns). Hence, the reference at the beginning of the text was different insofar as the occupation of the victims was mentioned at the very beginning of the coverage in the *IT*. As pointed out before, such a representation of the victims in a prominent position supported their portrayal as honest, hard-working people with whom readers could more easily identify than with, for example, Nigerian asylum seekers, who were perceived as culturally more distant and thus more removed from the core of society. I argued above that the inclusion of the occupations in the *Irish Independent* worked towards the portrayal of the men as deserving victims. The same line of argumentation could be applied here. This impression was further supported by the sentence structure. The *IT* was the only newspaper not to use a passive construction in the opening sentence. Through the inclusion of *a DRIMNAGH teenager* identifying a perpetrator, *two Polish mechanics* became the object of the sentence. This endorsed their status as victims, both as victims of the crime in the real event and in relation to the syntax of the sentence – they suffered the action. On the other hand, the inclusion of the occupation also created a slightly sensationalist effect because the use of *men* instead of *Polish mechanics*, for instance, would have been more neutral. However, the nature of coverage in the remainder of the article and in subsequent publications did not justify a characterisation of the *IT's* reporting style as generally sensationalist.

The *Irish Independent* introduced the victims as *TWO Polish men*, which at first glance was the most neutral reference in all three papers. However, this neutral appearance did not withstand closer analysis. The use of a passive construction omitted the agent, and the formulation *in a row that escalated outside a chipper* included the possibility that the victims may have contributed to the escalation that eventually led to their deaths. It could be established that this representation of events was factually wrong as the row outside the chipper only involved one of the victims and ended in such a way that Pawel Kalite could leave the scene physically unscathed. The murders took place at a later time outside Pawel Kalite's home. All this was clearly established on the first day of the trial so that a misinterpretation of facts by the

author was more than unlikely. Hence, despite neutral references in the remainder of the article (*Pawel Kalite, Marius Szwajkos, the man, the Polish man, Mr Kalite*, pronouns), context suggested that the *Irish Independent* reported in a more sensationalist fashion than *The Irish Times* albeit at this stage in a subtle way. My argumentation in relation to the out-of-context reference to the victims' occupation (cf. above) backed this interpretation.

The Irish Sun, in contrast, was much less subtle than the *II* in its references to the victims. In this paper, the introduction of *Two Polish pals* had to be seen in conjunction with the use of the victims' first names *Pawel* and *Marius* at the very end of the article. The use of *pals* denoted an informal use of the term friends and could reasonably be expected to be a lexical element that was used by many of *The Irish Sun's* readers. The same was true for the use of first names in an article covering court proceedings. These references created an atmosphere of solidarity with the victims so that readers could easily identify with them. The use of rather intimate references in two prominent positions within the article, at the opening and at the end, resembled a parenthesis within which neutral references to the victims in the body of the text lost their expressiveness. Moreover, the emphasis on the friendship added to the tragic element of the event because of its sudden end, and because the second victim had died coming to the first man's help. He had sacrificed his own life in an attempt to save the other – an ultimate proof of friendship. The *IS* did not miss pointing out their occupations and thus representing them as decent, hard-working people, adding to their portrayal as deserving victims. The nature of victim representation in *The Irish Sun* was generally informed by a human interest approach rather than an informed coverage of court proceedings, reflecting this paper's sensationalist reporting style.

Furthermore, in all three papers references to the victims' nationality were to become a repeated pattern in their portrayal although they were almost entirely irrelevant. They were deemed irrelevant because stating the nationality of the victims did not add any substantial information in relation to the crime. Whether the victims' nationality was Polish, Irish or indeed any other nationality was entirely irrelevant for the legal evaluation of the crime. On the other hand, mentioning the nationality could have been of importance if the murder would have been classified as a racially motivated one, but race as a contributory factor was never at the centre of medial and judicial attention. Yet, although nationality played no important role in the crime, it was constantly used as an identifying element in the portrayal of the victims. Irrespective of whether nationality as an identifier was used in a conscious or unconscious manner, it acted as a distancing element that kept the culturally distant removed from the very core of society –

even though Poles were considered culturally closer than Nigerians or Chinese. Consequently, references to nationality contributed to a covert and latent exclusion of the victims from Irishness despite their portrayal as decent, hard-working men and therefore deserving victims.

Representation of the perpetrators

Broadsheets and tabloid alike were charier in their representation of the accused. In its opening sentence *The Irish Times* introduced one of the defendants as *A Drimnagh teenager*, which formed the subject of the sentence. As discussed above, the *IT* was the only newspaper that used an active sentence at the beginning of the article. This was a more direct identification of the culprit than in the agent omitting passive constructions in the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun*. Such a clear identification was possible because the accused never denied killing the victims, and only the circumstances under which the crime had taken place had to be established in the trial.[718] Moreover, this paper linked David Curran to Drimnagh, a part of Dublin that had a reputation of social problems and anti-social behaviour, in a direct fashion.[719] However, the scene of crime, Benbulben Road, was identified in the other two articles as well so that a link to Drimnagh could be deduced. Criminal behaviour in an area with a less favourable reputation might not have triggered a great element of surprise in the reader. Quite to the contrary, it rather came expectedly. In a similar way that Poles had a higher chance of being portrayed as (ideal) victims than Nigerians and Chinese, the threshold for portraying young people from this part of Dublin as perpetrators was lower than for young people from Dublin's middle class areas.[720] In the remainder of the article references to the accused were more neutral than in the opening sentence (*David Curran, Sean Keogh*, *teenager, the 19-year-old, the co-accused, the defendants, these two young men, a number of men, including one who was about 17, this teenager, who had red hair, the red-haired teenager)*, but pointing out the young age of the perpetrators was a recurring theme throughout the article. This formed a stark contrast between the adolescent culprits and the severity of the crime.

[718] Whereas the state charged him with murder, David Curran pleaded guilty to manslaughter.
[719] I am not in a position to ascertain whether Drimnagh has more social problems than other (working class) areas in Dublin. However, searching Google (Drimnagh AND social problems) yields a number of websites and forum discussions that suggest that this area has a *reputation* for problems in at least a part of society. Comparatively lower property prices also indicate that this is a less sought after area.
[720] This is, of course, a very limited discussion of which areas are regarded as more respectable or having social problems. I am also aware that society's constant classification contributes to the creation of more troubled parts of towns. Nevertheless, this study is not the place to discuss the circumstances of the creation of reputations of such places. I assume as a construed social reality – albeit not a desired one – that there are more and less desired areas, the definition of which being based on their reputations in relation to social background, crime levels, schools etc.

Similar characterisations were found in the *Irish Independent*, whose references to the defendants were generally rather neutral (*David Curran, Sean Keogh, his client, defendant*). In comparison to the *IT*, the difference in this paper was that agency was omitted in the opening sentence through the use of a passive construction. Such a case of obscured agency in a prominent position of the article directed the readers' attention to the crime itself and only later to the culprits in the following paragraphs. In combination with the aforementioned contrast of the perpetrators' young age and the presentation of the crime as very severe, the newsworthiness of the entire article was thus raised. The reader was enticed to continue reading about the crime and less so to learn about the culprits. Nevertheless, as discussed above, the identification of the scene of crime fulfilled a latent expectation about criminal and anti-social behaviour in this part of the city. On the other hand, considering that *The Irish Times* made references to the origin of the accused too, this alone did not make a case for a more sensationalist style of reporting in the *Irish Independent*. This only emerged when other points were added to the equation and when the subsequent coverage of the trial was included (cf. below).

The characteristics identified above also applied to the portrayal of the defendants in *The Irish Sun*. However, there were subtle differences in the choice of references that reinforced the early impression that this tabloid approached the coverage of the case in a more sensationalist manner than the other two newspapers. Apart from rather neutral references (*Dubliners David Curran, 19 and Sean Keogh, 21, Curran, these two young men, his client*) the accused were also referred to as *the pair* and *the duo*. These characterisations represented the accused as organised criminals who formed a criminal partnership. Moreover, this portrayal alluded to the fascination of historical criminal duos such as Bonnie and Clyde, Butch Cassidy and Sundance Kid or, to name a more recent example, the Menendez brothers, all of whom had committed heinous crimes. The strong emphasis on negativity through repeated explicit references to the violent nature of the crime (cf. below) further supported the characterisation of David Curran and Sean Keogh as notorious criminals, which in turn raised the sensationalist profile of *The Irish Sun's* coverage.

Focus on negativity in the description of the crime and nature of attack

The categories discussed above already indicated that the three newspapers under review approached the coverage of this trial in different ways. Yet, so far the differences were of a rather subtle nature and call for further support in order to establish their validity beyond this nascent stage. I argue that references to the nature of the crime, both in quantitative and qualitative terms, are suitable indicators for measuring the degree of sensationalism and

therefore contribute to establishing a hierarchy of quality of coverage. At this early stage in the coverage of the trial, these references are perhaps the most reliable indicators. All three newspapers made references to the exceptional nature of the crime in which a screwdriver was used as a lethal weapon. Although this certainly represented a case of unexpectedness and therefore raised the newsworthiness of the trial (cf. above), this alone did not represent sensationalist reporting. However, a closer investigation of the quantity and quality of the references did reveal varying degrees of standards in reporting.

Outside prosecutor John O'Kelly's opening speech, *The Irish Times* employed descriptions of the nature of the crime sparingly (*stabbed ... through their brains, possibly with a screwdriver; were killed; the fatal injuries; blows were inflicted*), and the same was true for the *Irish Independent ("devastating" brain injuries when they were stabbed with a screwdriver; stabbed through the skull, the fatal injuries*). *The Irish Sun*, however, made frequent references to the nature of the crime at different positions throughout the entire article. A comparison of the varying approaches to covering the prosecutor's opening speech and the analysis of references to the crime within this coverage illustrate the individual reporting styles.

In *The Irish Times* newspaper, the coverage of O'Kelly's opening speech, followed by the presentation of the charge, occupied about half the article:

> John O'Kelly, prosecuting, earlier told the eight women and four men of the jury that if it all ended when Mr Kalite went home after the initial incident, they would not be in court.
>
> "One of the girls apparently rang David Curran, who was nicknamed 'Schillaci'," he said in his opening speech. "Ten minutes later, David Curran and Sean Keogh turn up outside the take-away." "David Curran had a screwdriver," he said. "Curran was angry and saying, 'Was it youse?'" He said after Mr Curran kicked the parked car he, Sean Keogh, the girls and the 15-year-old went to Mr Kalite's house.
>
> "Meanwhile, inside, Pawel Kalite was upset and angry and wanted to go outside to confront the people who'd beaten him," said Mr O'Kelly. "His housemates, including the unfortunate Marius Szwajkos, were saying no, that there was no point." However, Mr Kalite went outside, and his housemates went out to try to prevent a confrontation, he said.
>
> "The others had arrived outside and they attacked," he said of the defendants. "It was a quick fight. It involved punching, kicking, Pawel Kalite being held by the throat," he continued. "The fatal wounds were stab wounds inflicted by a screwdriver."
>
> Mr Kalite received two stab wounds to his head, one which penetrated the skull and part of his brain. "Mr Szwajkos tried to assist Mr Kalite and sustained an almost identical stab wound," he said.
>
> He also had a wound on the other side of his skull, suggesting the screwdriver might have gone right through his brain and hit the skull on the other side, he added. Mr Szwajkos died two days later, and Mr Kalite died four days later.

> He said the defence of provocation did not apply, as neither defendant was at the chipper when the fight broke out. Apparently they were drinking, he said. On the issue of guilt where more than one person was involved, but one caused the fatal blow, he said: "If two or more attack another with common intent, then one is as guilty as the other," quoting the law on common design and joint enterprise.
>
> "These two young men came along looking for trouble," he said, adding they were full of fight.[721]

In analogy to the entire article, the quoted section illustrates that the coverage of the prosecutor's opening speech also followed a clear structure and was of a detailed nature. Following a description of the events leading up to the murder, references to the violent nature of the crime were limited to three clearly identifiable paragraphs in which attributed direct and indirect quotes were used. In this case, the use of quotes suggested that the author remained at a factual level and abstained from using attributes to emphasise the nature of the attack. Despite the detailed description of the wounds that were inflicted, this was not to a sensationalist effect, but rather reflected the generally conscientious nature of the article. This was also expressed in the fact that redundant repetitions of descriptions of the attack were not employed by the author. In respect of the charge, neither of the other two papers went into so much detail as to explain why both defendants were charged with murder on the grounds of common design.

The coverage of O'Kelly's opening speech in the *Irish Independent* was not as well structured as in the *IT*. References to his speech were made at varying positions within the article, at times out of context (also cf. discussion above):

> However, counsel for the prosecution, John O'Kelly SC, said it was a clear case of "deliberate intention".
>
> [Reference to victims' place of work]
>
> Mr O'Kelly told the court that Mr Kalite had "unfortunately taken exception to being bumped into" by the boy and he went after him.
>
> [Reference to witness' testimony]
>
> "Mr Kalite was not injured but he was very upset," said Mr O'Kelly. Mr Curran, the defendant's father, drove away and told the young boy to go home.
>
> But one of the two girls rang David Curran. Shortly afterward, he and Sean Keogh arrived "full of fight".
>
> David Curran had a screwdriver, which was seen by several witnesses and he was angry, kicking a car.

[721] ANONYMOUS (15/04/10)

> He, Sean Keogh, the two girls and the young boy went up Benbulben Road to the house where Mr Kalite lived.
>
> Mr Kalite was upset and angry and wanted to go outside to confront those who had beaten him up, but his housemates, including Marius Szwajkos, tried to persuade him not to.
>
> As Mr Kalite came out, Curran and Keogh attacked him, punching, kicking and holding him by the throat, inflicting two stab wounds with the screwdriver. The second stab went right through the midsection of the brain.
>
> Marius Szwajkos came to his assistance but sustained an almost identical stab wound through the mid-section of the brain, with an additional fracture, Mr O'Kelly told the court.[722]

In comparison with *The Irish Times*, the *II* article was less detailed and used fewer direct quotes. Moreover, the source of the description of the wounds was not clearly identified. Only in the very last sentence was Mr O'Kelly mentioned as the originator. The register used in the article was also lower than that in *The Irish Times*, which was illustrated in a somewhat simpler wording of the references to the wounds that were inflicted. When the *IT* wrote: "'The fatal wounds were stab wounds inflicted by a screwdriver.' Mr Kalite received two stab wounds to his head, one which penetrated the skull and part of his brain," the *II* used a less complex version: "[…] inflicting two stab wounds with the screwdriver. The second stab went through the midsection of the brain." The combination of choice of words (penetrate vs. go right through), syntax (complex sentence vs. simple sentence) and quantity of words combined suggest that the *Irish Independent* aimed at conveying the message in a more direct way. Yet, the *II* was more detailed when it came to identifying the part of the victim's brain – here it used *midsection* of the brain when the *IT* employed the more general *part* of the brain. By referring to the midsection, the severity of the wound inflicted was transported in a more direct manner as the *midsection* carried the notion of the centre or the most important part of the brain. Moreover, in the description of the second victim's wounds, it was pointed out that he had received "an almost identical stab wound through the mid-section of the brain, with an additional fracture". This presentation included redundant information since *through the mid-section of the brain* did not add any new information to *an almost identical stab wound*, which was already described in detail when the first victim's wounds were referred to. Therefore, although in a subtle fashion, the repetition of *mid-section* directed the readers' attention towards the atrocious nature of the crime, which in turn carried a latent sensationalist note. However, it also needs to be pointed out that at this stage the *Irish Independent* refrained from explicit references to the violent nature of the crime.

[722] ANDERSON (15/04/10)

The Irish Sun, on the other hand, highlighted the atrocious nature of the murders in a much more direct fashion:

> A jury heard how the attack was both "vicious" and "intentional" with both victims suffering "devastating" brain injuries. Prosecutor John O'Kelly told the court both men received "almost identical" stab wounds, with the screwdriver penetrating the skull.
>
> […]
>
> Vicious
>
> But Mr O'Kelly told the eight woman and four man jury "This is as clear a case of deliberate intent in as vicious an attack as you can imagine." The court heard how a row outside a chipper in Drimnagh, Dublin, ended in bloodshed. At around 6.30 p.m. on February 23, Curran's 15-year old cousin bumped into Pavel Kalite as the Polish man was leaving a takeaway near his home on Benbulben Road.
>
> […]
>
> Mr O'Kelly told the court "When he came out Curran and Sean Keogh had arrived outside. Pavel Kalite got two stab wounds to the head. The first one didn't penetrate his skull. "The second one went through the skull and right through the mid section of his brain and down to the brain stem. "It was a fatal wound. He never recovered after that and no medical treatment would have been of any use.
>
> The prosecutor said evidence will also be heard that Mr Kalite may have been stabbed while being held by the throat. Mr O'Kelly told how Mr Szwajkos was also stabbed in the head and had a skull fracture – possibly caused by the screwdriver "penetrating from one side of his skull to the other."
>
> He said the killings were not manslaughter, as there was no question of self-defence, temporary loss of sanity, an accident or [?] of misadventure.
>
> He added "We are dealing here with murder. These two young men (Curran and Keogh) came along and they were looking for trouble and they had a screwdriver and it was the weapon that was used. "This was not something suddenly out of the blue."[723]

Following the afore mentioned introduction of the crime as a "*horror* screwdriver attack" (my emphasis) in the opening sentence, which already acted as a strong indicator for a sensationalist style in *The Irish Sun*'s coverage of the case, the reference to the nature of the crime in the body of the text confirmed this impression. In contrast to the factual coverage in the *IT* and the latent sensationalist note in the *II*, the tabloid employed John O'Kelly's opening speech in such a way that the crime was presented in a particularly violent way. Furthermore, quotes were not always clearly attributed so that it was not at all times clear which were O'Kelly's and which the author's words. Repetitive and therefore redundant references to the crime as *vicious* and *intentional* as well as very detailed descriptions of how the lethal wounds

[723] McElgunn (15/04/10)

were inflicted revealed the sensationalist intention of the article, particularly against the backdrop of much less detailed information on other aspects of the case. While quotes describing the violence of the crime were plentiful, details concerning other circumstances of the trial were presented in a reductionist manner. In comparison to *The Irish Times'* detailed reference to why the defendants were both charged with murder on the ground of common design (cf. above), legal matters were reduced to a minimum in *The Irish Sun*. When referring to the charge as presented by prosecutor O'Kelly, the *IS* put the emphasis on the argumentation that the crime was not manslaughter but murder, and pointed out, again, that "they [the defendants] had a screwdriver and it was the weapon that was used." The avoidance of more complex matters such as legal terminology reflected a strategy of abstaining from the inclusion of ambiguous and unexpected characteristics of the event, which would have lowered the newsworthiness of the event (cf. ch. 0). The tabloid presented the case in as simple terms as possible so that it appeared unambiguous to its readers and was easily comprehensible: two Polish pals became the victims of two ruthless killers in a heinous screwdriver attack. Even considering the possibility that the killings might have been manslaughter or that one of the defendants bore more responsibility than the other would have tarnished what the *IS* presented as an unambiguous case of most violent murder with two clearly identified culprits. This was underlined by employing the quote by O'Kelly that this murder had not taken place out of the blue, highlighting the intentional, unambiguous character of the crime. In its explicit portrayal of the crime as particularly grievous, the sensationalist style in *The Irish Sun's* reporting was clearly evident.

Supporting the earlier assumption, already at this early stage in the coverage of the trial, a hierarchy of quality of coverage began to show. If conscientious reporting and degree of sensationalism were accepted as indicators of quality, *The Irish Times* could be assumed to be the most balanced paper followed by the *Irish Independent's* sensationalist tinge and *The Irish Sun* occupying the sensationalist end of the spectrum. The following chapter will show that these early indicators were in fact reliable means of delineating the individual papers' reporting styles.

9.1.3 Subsequent development

Portrayal of the defendants

Throughout the following weeks, the papers followed the trial, initially in a similar fashion as discussed above. However, about two weeks into the trial, when more details about David Curran's problems with alcohol and drugs were made public, *The Irish Sun*, in continuation of its reference to the violent nature of the crime, began framing the defendants as thugs.

07 May 2010, the day on which David Curran's verdict was read, prompted a change of the reporting styles, leading to repercussion in the portrayal of both the former defendant, now convict, and the accused. After David Curran had been found guilty of the murders, *The Irish Sun* began pointing out the innocence of the victims, only then attributing them full victim status. Similarly, the *Irish Independent* juxtaposed the *sadistic teen* and the *peace-loving Polish victims.*[724] Only *The Irish Times* kept its generally balanced reporting style.

However, even before he was found guilty of the murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos, *The Irish Sun* tabloid started framing David Curran as a thug, titling its article on the trial "Stab teen stoned on drink & drugs – Murder accused 'out of his head' day of attack". In the opening sentence he was referred to as killer, identifying him as a member of a perceived underclass at the margins of society:

> THE killer of two Polish men told a court yesterday he was out of his head on drink and drugs on the day of the attack.[725]

There was never any question that David Curran had not killed the two men. However, at this point in time, it had not been established whether the stabbing was a case of murder or manslaughter. Yet, at a factual level, *The Irish Sun* did not contain false claims precisely because it was clear that the accused had killed, had stabbed the victims and had been intoxicated at the time. At the same time, the choice of words, the references to drinks and drugs and the layout (headline in large bold letters) left no doubt that the *IS* had started framing David Curran as a thug and used two of the most prominent positions in the article – the headline and the opening sentence – to do so. Although this frame was not used in an explicit fashion at this point in time, *stab teen* (again) presented a juxtaposition of the young age of the defendant and the severity of the crime he had committed, hence raising the negative profile of the event which in turn ensured that the case remained in the news. Moreover, through the explicit introduction

[724] Cf. ANDERSON (08/05/10a); ANDERSON (08/05/10b)
[725] REID (30/04/10)

of drugs and alcohol as indicated in the verb *stoned*, rather than a more neutral reference such as intoxicated etc., the *IS* alluded to latent expectations in its readers about perceived characteristics of members of an underclass, who allegedly depend on the social welfare state without contributing to it. The framing of David Curran in such terms was to take a much more explicit form in the articles reporting on the case from the day the verdict was read.

A week later, on the day the verdict was delivered, the thug-framing campaign emerged even clearer. Curran was now referred to as *screwdriver yob, a teenage thug, vicious David Curran, the lout*[726] or *evil savage, brute David Curran, sick thug, hideous brute, miserable excuse for a human being, ugly thug, savage and vile.*[727] The exclusionary practice was also made clear in no uncertain terms in an editorial published on the day of the verdict:

> Justice for Poles
>
> **THE brutal murder of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos in February 2008 shocked the nation.**
>
> The callous way the two innocent Poles were stabbed to death sickened many and brought great shame on the whole country.
>
> But yesterday the families of those two men received the justice they deserved for a simply heinous crime.
>
> David Curran was found guilty of the double murder and will today begin a lengthy spell behind bars.
>
> **There is no place for Curran on Irish streets and his incarceration will allow many people to sleep easy at night.**[728]

This editorial summed up, in few words, *The Irish Sun's* position in relation to the defendants and the trial in general. First, the editorial appeared under the general heading "The Irish Sun says", which was generally used to indicate editorials in this tabloid. Moreover, an author was not identified so that this opinion piece had to be seen as representing the *IS's* stance and not as that of an individual. Style and register were not very elaborate as expressed in the informal language (*sickened, lengthy spell behind bars*), relatively short sentences and the use of basic conjunctions (*and, but*). This could be seen as one form of solidarisation of the newspaper with its readers – the tabloid expressed in simple terms what it expected its readers to think and feel about the crime. This aspect was further developed in the approach of speaking on behalf of the people ([the crime] *sickened many*) or on behalf of the entire nation (*brought*

[726] REID (07/05/10)
[727] ANONYMOUS (08/05/10)
[728] ANONYMOUS (07/05/10)

great shame on the whole country). At the same time, the tabloid also acted on behalf of the *two innocent Poles* by declaring that justice had been done with the guilty verdict. In a prominent position, at the end of the editorial, the *IS* declared that there was no place for Curran on Irish streets and that the incarceration would restore peace on these very same streets. From the point of view of *The Irish Sun* tabloid, Curran had violated society's consensus and no mitigating circumstances were accepted. On the contrary, his background of drug and alcohol abuse, having left school early was taken as further evidence of Curran belonging to a perceived underclass. Consequently, he was distanced from the core of Irish society having "forfeited the right to take part in the negotiation of the consensus about crime."[729] In Foucauldian biopolitical terms, this was a technique of casting the defendant as an undeserved member of society that needed to be eliminated. (also cf. below). Curran's co-accused Sean Keogh, on the other hand, almost disappeared from the media's radar and only reappeared on 20 May 2010 upon his sentencing. He was also framed as a thug (*thug, scrote*) although to a lesser extent than David Curran.[730]

The portrayal of Curran as a barbaric monster was less intense in the *Irish Independent* but some references such as *sadistic teen, teenage killer, sinister person*[731] were still evident. A letter to the editor published in the *Irish Independent* on 25 May 2010 very well illustrated that the thug frame went beyond the individual cases of Curran and Keogh. The newspapers had touched upon a perceived general fear of rising crime levels in parts of the public, utilising the consonance criterion of news values. The reader complained that Keogh's sentence was, in her eyes, too lenient:

> This sentence will not deter thugs
>
> […] I cannot understand our legal profession and judges who are passing down such lenient sentences for horrific crimes. Violent crimes are escalating out of control and these lenient sentences mean that there is no deterrent for such barbaric acts.
>
> It is another cruelty to the victims, their families and it is also not fair to gardai. They are putting their lives on the line dealing with these thugs, who are laughing at us all while continuing their reign of terror. It is time to overhaul the judicial system in this country.[732]

This letter illustrated that media coverage in the *Irish Independent* had in this reader triggered the familiar call for tougher sentences and the exclusion of undeserving subjects. She too, spoke on behalf of the people (*laughing at us all*) and the victims (*another cruelty to*

[729] For the idea of consensus in society cf. HALL (1981). Quote p. 69
[730] LYNOTT (20/05/10); REID (20/05/10)
[731] ANDERSON (08/05/10b)
[732] RYAN (25/05/10)

the victims). Even though the court had established in a long trial that Sean Keogh was guilty of a much lesser crime than David Curran and therefore received a distinctly shorter term in prison, the parallelisms employed in the portrayal of Curran and Keogh must have raised the impression that they were equally guilty.

Although *The Irish Times'* reporting style did not change and remained neutral in the portrayal of the culprits (*a young man, the five teenagers*), a similar letter was published in *The Irish Times* on 11 May 2010[733] discussing Curran's state of intoxication when he committed the murders. The reader identified himself as Dr Chris Luke, Consultant in Emergency Medicine, which cast a light of authority on him by pointing out his expert status. Thereby, his words were given additional credibility which usually makes it easier for readers to accept an opinion as fact. He too complained about "the upward trajectory of violent crime in this country, so closely mirroring our appetite for drugs of all sorts [...]". In the *Irish Independent's* case the letter was more in line with the newspaper's stance while the letter published in *The Irish Times* contradicted it, and had consequently to be seen as a balancing instrument in a pool of opinions. The *Irish Independent* hoped to meet the expectations of those readers who felt that there was a generally rising crime level in Ireland, which resulted in greater publicity as Greer explains:

> When crime victims come symbolically to represent a problem that resonates with and potentially affects many in society – school safety, racist violence, knife crime – mediatised campaigns, particularly when launched in the victim's name, are likely to garner high levels of public support.[734]

Official crime statistics showed that the combined number of murders and manslaughter had fallen from 84 in 2007 to 55 in 2008 and stayed around this lower level in the subsequent years. The statistics also showed that particularly the number of murder-threats and harassment offences had risen, but this might be explained by more cases of threats and assaults being reported due to higher public awareness. In any case, the 2010 figures certainly did not suggest violent crimes spiralling out of control.[735]

No article left the boundaries of the court case and addressed either how often Poles, and other immigrant groups, became the victims of assaults or discrimination and racism or undertook to investigate the social preconditions that first led the assailants into a vicious circle of alcohol, drugs and crime, and then did not allow them to leave it. Although such a crime could by no means be excused or relativised, the assailants belonged to a disadvantaged section

[733] LUKE (11/05/10)
[734] GREER (2007), p. 32
[735] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (g)

of society that had not benefitted from the economic boom, which brought material wealth to the majority of society (with all the problems associated to it). Such a report would have violated the newsworthiness factor of unambiguity, as it would have resulted in a broader range of more complex considerations.

Identifying ideal culprits at the margins of society who fulfilled all negative expectations (upbringing in a rough area, expelled from school, unemployed, history of criminal behaviour, in the case of Keogh father at a young age, drug abuse etc.) and who could be demonised was a guarantor for high public interest. "The communication not of information or analysis but of raw human experience"[736] ensured wide coverage of the trial with an emphasis on the day the verdict was delivered and the day the convict was sentenced in the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun*.

The newsworthiness theory helps to explain why the focus on the extraordinary nature of the crime and the framing of the defendants as thugs contributed to the close coverage of the trial in *The Irish Sun* and to some extent in the *Irish Independent*. I hold that the representation of the two Polish men as deserving victims (see below) was lower ranking than the first two factors because they assured that the event received such a great deal of attention in these newspapers. In fact, the *IS* reported more on the case after the verdict was delivered, and the *Irish Independent* published 14 articles before the verdict and 12 after, with a notable accumulation of articles and editorials on 07 May and 08 May 2010 in both papers. *The Irish Times*, in comparison, reported on the trial in 12 articles before the verdict and in 5 after. In relation to Galtung and Ruge's newsworthiness factors, frequency, consonance, reference to something negative and reference to persons were of particular importance, which does not mean that the other factors did not apply as well. As discussed above, the reference to something negative was expressed in the frequent reference to the violent nature of the crime and the screwdriver as the murder weapon. Framing the defendants as thugs was an example of reference to persons, which provided a field of negative projections. This went hand in hand with consonance or the creation of a mental matrix in readers in respect of imagined characteristics of members of a perceived underclass. The frequency criterion was relevant because a dramatic climax, the day the verdict was read, copper-fastened the initially implicit exclusion of David Curran and Sean Keogh from the core of society. Nevertheless, from the

[736] Iyengar and Kinder quoted in McGregor, p. 46

day of the verdict, the portrayal of the victims as innocent assured that the event would stay in the news for some more time.

Representation of the victims

Only the distancing of Curran and Keogh from the core of society to the very margins allowed the victims to move closer to the centre. Once the trial had ended, and David Curran was found guilty, part of the media turned towards the victims in order to keep the story running for some more time. The verdict allowed to make explicit what had been insinuated in an implicit fashion beforehand as the discussion of the opening sentence and the coverage of the first day of the trial showed (cf. above). Particularly *The Irish Sun* tabloid and to some degree the *Irish Independent* resorted to portraying the victims in such a way that the coverage resembled "[s]ome forms of news [that] have mutated into a passing parade of tear jerker stories that are variations on the theme of grief."[737] *The Irish Times*, on the other hand, did not join in this sentimentally motivated sensationalist reporting style.

In a murder case like this, victim impact statements are arguably always of an intense and emotionally charged nature. Through such statements the victims' families are given the opportunity to demonstrate the impact that the murder has had on the families. It is only natural that the families' statements express a great deal of grief. Against this background of the expression of private information, one might expect that the media should deal with that information responsibly although some newspapers act more responsibly than others. Whereas *The Irish Sun* editors decided to present the raw human experience in order to create a sensationalist effect, *The Irish Times* chose a decidedly more careful approach and abstained from sensationalising the victims' families' grief.

As established above, the opening sentence acted as a reliable indicator for the degree of sensationalism and nature of coverage in the subsequent article. *The Irish Times* opened with:

> THE FAMILIES of two Polish men who were murdered in Dublin two years ago have described their pain and sense of loss following the deaths.[738]

The use of a non-specific verb such as *describe* and the general nature of *pain* and *sense of loss* set the tone for a generally neutral and non-sensational coverage of the victim impact statements in this newspaper. Whereas the *IT* abstained from more detailed references of the

[737] McGregor
[738] Gartland (08/05/14)

pain and loss experienced by the families, *The Irish Sun* tabloid did decide to follow the sensationalist route:

> The devastated families of a Polish man murdered by teenage killer David Curran wept yesterday: You destroyed our lives![739]

There were several elements in this opening sentence that contributed to the sensational character. The use of the verb *weep* created a much more emotional impression than the rather neutral *describe* as employed in the *IT*. Rather than reporting on the event from a neutral and distanced point of view, weep was directed at the core of human sentiments and the "raw human experience" referred to above. The sentimental character was underlined by the contrasts created by the adjective *devastated* in the description of the victims' family and the verb *destroy* in the description of the effect that the murder had on the family. Both described extremes, and were of an ultimate nature, hardly allowing for the possibility that the families might learn to live with the loss. The *IT's* choice of words, on the other hand, did allow for regaining emotional strength and confidence with *pain* and *sense of loss* being both more neutral and referring to the momentary emotions of the families.

In a similar fashion to *The Irish Sun*, the *Irish Independent* opened by quoting a family member:

> THEIR son's death left them with "a screwdriver stuck through their hearts".[740]

Achieving a similar effect, the *II* entry into the coverage of the victim impact statements relied less on the choice of words as in the tabloid paper but rather on a quote that created a reference to the atrocious nature of the crime and the murder weapon.

However, the *Irish Independent* was not the only newspaper referring to the metaphor. Both *The Irish Times* and *The Irish Sun* made references to it albeit the frequency and the way it was employed differed a great deal. Both the *IT* and the *II* only made one reference each with the former embedding the quote in the parents' statement so that it did not create a sensationalist effect. As discussed above, the latter newspaper's employment of the metaphorical quote did create such an effect in the opening sentence. Yet, by measures of quantity, the degree of sensationalism was much less intense in the *Irish Independent* than in *The Irish Sun*. The tabloid exploited the metaphor in three different places in the article and in very large and bold print in the headline. This resembled repetitive allusions to the severity of the crime thereby underlining

[739] REID (08/05/10)
[740] ANDERSON (08/05/10a)

its newsworthiness through a reference to something negative (cf. newsworthiness factors above).

Another feature that illustrated the three papers' varying styles was the reference to Pawel Kalite's future plans. Apparently, before the murder the man had considered moving back to Poland and getting married. The presentation of these plans painted greatly differing pictures though. The *IT* wrote:

> He had spent his last holiday with his girlfriend skiing and they had planned to marry. He was to move home in June and two hours before his death had arranged to visit his aunt.

In the *Irish Independent* the reader learnt:

> Though happy here, he was homesick and always planned to return to Poland. Pawel and his girlfriend, Marcela, who he "dearly, deeply truly loved", were beginning to talk about marriage and building a future together. He was tentatively talking of a move back home that June.

Yet another account featured in *The Irish Sun*:

> Tragic Pawel was planning to move home and marry his girlfriend Marcella. Hours before he was murdered, he was on the phone to her making arrangements for the flat they would share.

In all three papers the wedding plans were mentioned and they also alluded to shared, cross-cultural expectation that this could be the happiest times in young people's lives, the point in life when two (young) people start a family of their own. Particularly in an Irish and Polish context, family values are regarded highly, which explains why the papers covered this aspect in different ways. As before, the reference to the wedding plans indicated a hierarchy in the quality of coverage. Whereas the *IT* only briefly mentioned them, the *II* underlined them with the quote of how much Mr Kalite loved his girlfriend, culminating in *The Irish Sun's* account of how Mr Kalite and his girlfriend had just been on the phone to finalise plans of sharing an apartment. This rising intensity (from *IT* to *IS*) implicitly created a rising contrast of plans of creating a family and the sudden and violent death of the victim. By presenting the intention to get married as a concrete plan in *The Irish Sun* (moving in), this newspaper also created the starkest and most emotional contrast.

Other shared characteristics included references to the victims as family people and the representation as hard working men. Although these characteristics represented a hierarchy in the same way as discussed above, most references to the victims and the families' expressions of grief had in common that they alluded to values that are part of the Irish consensus on society

and thus emphasised "the extent to which the Poles are like the Irish"[741]. On the one hand this represented the approximation of the victims to the core of Irish society and the emphasis of shared Polish and Irish cultural characteristics. On the other hand, the frequent irrelevant repetition of the victims' nationality in all three papers was a constant reminder that the two Poles were not seen as fully belonging to the core of Irish society. A search for *Pawel Kalite* (no nationality indicated) in *The Irish Times* and *Irish Independent* digital databases yielded 25 articles in the *IT* and 27 in the *II* for the peak months of April and May 2010. This shows that both papers made a reference to the victim's nationality in the majority of their articles but more so in the *Irish Independent* (*IT*: 17/25; *II*: 26/27). Their cultural proximity and higher ranking in the hierarchy of victimisation let them pass the threshold of newsworthiness initially, but the reasons for sustaining that high interest lay elsewhere. That the victims were of Polish origin was irrelevant in respect of the case staying in the news.

***

Poles had a higher chance of making it into the news as victims than other immigrant groups, but the preference of this group only made sure that they were lifted over the threshold of media attention initially. However, other factors such as the stark contrast of ideal culprits and (near) ideal victims in conjunction with the focus on negativity made sure that this case stayed in the news for a long time. At the same time, despite the emphasis of the cultural similarity of Poles and Irish, the two victims were never fully included in Irishness. As in the other chapters in this study, a hierarchy of quality of coverage was demonstrated.

9.2 Nigerian asylum seekers

9.2.1 Introduction

Between the 1930s and the mid-1990s, Ireland received only very small numbers of refugees and asylums seekers. Despite its closed door policy between 1933 and 1945, about 350 refugees fleeing from persecution in Germany or German occupied territories were allowed to stay in the Republic. Their impact, particularly in Irish academia, was "greater than the numbers alone would suggest."[742] Between the end of World War II and the late 1990s, Ireland received a small number of programme refugees from Hungary, Chile, Vietnam, Iran and Bosnia.[743] However, until the 1980s, the state failed to implement a proper reception and

[741] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2009), p. 7
[742] HOLFTER (2006b), p. 9
[743] FANNING (2002), pp. 92-3

resettlement programme. Support for refugees in terms of education (i.e. language classes) and integration into the labour market was minimal and relied heavily on the voluntary sector. Reacting to pressure by the EU, the state only changed its policy in the late 1980s so that the Bosnian refugees were the first group to benefit from a state-funded reception programme, which, however, "met with limited success in some areas" resulting in high unemployment rates amongst the Bosnian refugees. The first effective and successful programme was run for refugees from the Kosovo in the late 1990s (cf. p. 91).[744]

Having received virtually no applications for asylum from individuals until the late 1980s, numbers started rising in the mid-1990s. From a base of 31 applications in 1991, the figure rose to 424 in 1995 and was more than nine times as high the year after at 3,883. Asylum applications peaked in 2002 at 11,634, yet had fallen to 1,918 by 2010.[745] Initially, the drop reflected global trends, which saw a sharp fall in applications in 2005.[746] However, while the UNHCR recorded an annual increase in applications globally from 2006 – bar 2010 when there was a slight drop – the numbers in Ireland continued their downward trend.[747] In 2012 there were fewer than 1,000 applications, a level last seen before 1997.[748] Stricter immigration regulations were arguably responsible for such a sharp drop in people seeking refuge in Ireland. Unsurprisingly, the arrival of large numbers of asylum seekers was reflected in the media; in fact, *Asylum seeker* was the most frequent role in which Nigerians were represented.

9.2.2 Frequency and connotation across years and papers

Asylum seeker role allocations were found in all three immigrant groups at greatly varying frequencies. Members of the Polish community were least likely to be seen as asylum seekers.[749] Chinese living in Ireland were more likely to be portrayed as asylums seekers albeit at an overall low level, particularly in articles discussing only Chinese and no other immigrant groups.[750] On the other hand, in more than 2 out of 5 articles mentioning or discussing Nigerians, the primary role allocation was *Asylum* seeker, and at more than one in three, the

[744] FANNING (2002), pp. 91-5; quote p. 94
[745] For figures until 1999 cf. UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES GENEVA (2001); for 2000-2002 cf. UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES (2003); from 2003 cf. OFFICE OF THE REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER. Only new applications, not re-applications.
[746] UNHCR (2006)
[747] UNHCR (2013); UNHCR (2011). 'Globally' refers to Europe and selected non-European countries as defined in the UNHCR reports.
[748] REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER (2013)
[749] Group = 2 and Group = 22: 4.9 %. In articles discussing only Poles and no other immigrant group, there were only 3 role allocations or 1.0 %.
[750] 7.2 % in all articles discussing Chinese or Chinese and other immigrant groups and 3% in articles discussing Chinese solely.

figure was only slightly lower for articles discussing Nigerians exclusively. The next most frequent role allocation for all articles discussing Nigerians was the aggregate figure for *Perpetrator / Suspect* at 13 per cent. The large gap between most and second most frequent role allocations illustrated the media's disproportionate focus on Nigerian asylum seekers. These results confirmed findings by Haynes and Devereux that Nigerians and Romanians were the most referenced group in relation to asylum seekers.[751] What is more, when asked in the same study which nationalities sought asylum in the previous five years, 71 per cent of respondents identified Nigerians,[752] a figure suggesting that Nigerian asylum seekers were deeply embedded in public discourse. The vast majority of articles in the first group did not focus on Nigerian nationals but mentioned them as one group of asylum seekers amongst others such as Romanians or Chinese (92.7%). Although this study does not attempt to investigate the representation of asylum seekers per se, the constant link of people seeking refuge in Ireland and Nigerian nationals – both in public and media discourse – not only justifies the discussion here, but makes it necessary. This also allows establishing whether a difference in the portrayal of articles discussing Nigerians and other groups and Nigerians only can be identified.

The Irish Times covered Nigerian asylum seekers most frequently (155 articles) with the *Irish Independent* following at 116 articles. *The Irish Sun's* infrequent coverage at 16 articles in all four periods suggested very little differentiation, which in turn prompted the conclusion that this tabloid paper regarded asylum seekers from different countries of origin as a homogenous group, revealing a deindividualised view on migrants. Across all three newspapers, the frequency of coverage rose from 18 in 1997 to 93 in 2000 peaking at 109 in 2004 before dropping to 69 in 2010.

These overall figures suggest a peak interest in the year of the referendum on citizenship and the EU enlargement. This was clearly evident in the *II* but most pronounced in the *IS* with 13 of all 18 articles appearing in the 2004 issues of the tabloid. Yet, the analysis of peak periods above presented a more varied picture. Although the mean numbers of articles were higher than in any other period, the statistical peak fell into the months of August and October of 2004 i.e. well after the referendum on citizenship. In the weeks and months just before and after 11 June 2004 (referendum day), the coverage remained at about the same level in both the *IT* and the *II* with only *The Irish Sun* showing a higher coverage in April. Hence, a campaign against Nigerian asylum seekers across the board of newspapers could not be demonstrated in the

[751] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2009), p. 8
[752] HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2009), p. 7

temporal vicinity of the referendum. *The Irish Times*, however, did not follow the general trend. All articles taken into consideration, the *IT* coverage peaked in 2000 with a considerable drop in 2004 and a subsequent rise in 2010 (Table 62). When only articles discussing Nigerian asylum seekers and no other group were taken into consideration, there was no peak with interest steadily rising (Table 63).

The nature of coverage varied a great deal between newspapers. Not only did *The Irish Times* have the least absolute number of articles with a negative connotation throughout all periods, they were also at a comparatively low relative level. In 1997, 4 out of 10 articles in the *IT* on Nigerian asylum seekers received a negative connotation, but this dropped to just very little more than 1 in five of 5 (21 %) in all subsequent periods. What is more, in all four periods the number of articles raising a critical question clearly outweighed negative ones in this newspaper. The same could not be said for the *Irish Independent.* Its count of negative connotations was usually more than double that of the *IT*, whereas articles taking a stand for Nigerian asylum seekers by pointing out deficiencies (i.e. raising a critical question) could in no period offset negative coverage. *The Irish Sun* played in a different league altogether with almost entirely negative coverage at very low absolute numbers. Whereas these results confirm my hypothesis that a hierarchy in the quality of coverage between the individual newspapers could be shown (D1 – D 3), a consistent period-by-period improvement could not be demonstrated for any one newspaper (E 1 – E 3; Table 58). However, despite the analysis of the *Connotation* category, the count of quantitative data can only reveal a general and limited impression of the portrayal of Nigerian asylum seekers. Therefore, the following paragraphs investigate in greater detail whether the assertion that the arrival of asylum seekers was seen as a crisis could be confirmed for the representation of Nigerian asylum seekers, and how Nigerians were discussed in letters to the editor.

9.2.3 Nigerian asylum seekers: posing a threat?

There is a general consensus amongst academics that the media have contributed to representing the arrival of asylum seekers in relatively large numbers as a crisis. Fanning argued

> [a]sylum seekers were depicted as welfare scroungers, in competition with indigenous groups for welfare resources. This state discourse was widely echoed in the media with the consequence that an administrative 'crisis' was represented as a crisis for Irish society.[753]

[753] FANNING (2012), p. 97

> [t]he sudden and rapid arrival of asylum-seekers into the State in the mid-1990s led to a reactive and restrictive discourse premised on the notion of a 'crisis' that functioned as a moral panic.[754]

Similar arguments were brought forward by Lentin or Haynes and Devereux.[755] Usually, asylum seekers and refugees were discussed in more general terms and not as individual nationalities although there was some differentiation in Lentin's and Haynes and Devereux's articles. The angle taken here was different insofar as in the content analysis the search term was Nigerian and not asylum seeker. Hence, the analysis in this study was based on nationality rather than legal status. Nevertheless, as noted above, *Asylum seeker* was by far the most frequent role allocation for Nigerians and far more frequent than asylum seeker roles for the other two immigrant groups. In order to investigate whether the arrival of Nigerian asylum seekers was construed as a crisis in the same way as with asylum seekers in general, the analysis resorted to the use of flood metaphors and the two most frequent topics, *Immigration Policy* and *Deportations* (Table 65).

Flood metaphor – creating a crisis?

As defined in the code book, a flood metaphor was recorded when an article referred to an influx or wave of asylum seekers without putting the number into perspective so that the impression was given that the arrival of asylum seekers posed a threat to Irish society. Therefore, the frequency of the use of a flood metaphor acted as an indicator of whether the media presented the arrival of Nigerian asylum seekers as a crisis.

When all articles in which Nigerians were mentioned were taken into consideration, a flood metaphor was used in about 1 in 6 articles on Nigerian asylum seekers with this category being much more prominent in Nigerians and other groups. The difficulty was, of course, that there was no agreed threshold that defined a crisis. However, a comparison to the frequency of flood metaphors across roles allocated to Nigerians, Poles and Chinese put this figure into perspective. The result for all Nigerian role allocations was distinctly lower at less than 1 in 10 articles, but the results for Chinese were even clearer. A flood metaphor was not used at all for Chinese asylum seekers and in only 2.5 per cent across all roles. For Poles the result was more differentiated. Whereas 5 out of 18 articles used a flood metaphor for asylum seekers in *Poles*

[754] LOYAL (2011), p. 82
[755] LENTIN (2003), p. 313 and HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006), p. 104

and other immigrant groups, there were none in *Poles* only (Table 59). Across all primary roles allocated to Poles, a flood metaphor was used in 3.5 per cent of all articles (Table 59, Table 60).

A breakdown into the individual years showed that the use of flood metaphors did not positively correlate with the number of asylum seekers arriving in the country. While 1997 saw a use of the flood metaphor in just under 2 out of 5 articles, this had dropped to about a quarter in 2000, a little more than 1 in 10 in 2004 and 6 per cent in 2010 (Table 61). Between the individual newspapers some differences emerged. Overall, *The Irish Times* was least likely to be using a flood metaphor; yet, in 1997 and 2000 even this quality paper made a not insignificant contribution to the creation of a crisis (Table 62). The *Irish Independent* had a higher average across the years but also the steepest drop. While in 1997 5 out of all 6 articles on Nigerian asylum seekers employed a flood metaphor, this had fallen to 29 per cent in 2000 and further to 14 and 5 per cent in 2004 and 2010 respectively, making it even marginally less likely to use a flood metaphor than the *IT* in the last period. It appeared as if the *Irish Independent* had undergone a change in its attitude towards Nigerian asylum seekers following an initial shock-reaction in 1997. While a proportion of almost 1 in 3 in 2000 was still high, the drop from more than 80 per cent 3 years earlier was remarkable and showed that this daily took a more differentiated approach following the first period. Further analysis will show whether this only applied to the frequency of the flood metaphor or whether the *Irish Independent's* quality of coverage improved generally. An evaluation of *The Irish Sun* data was difficult because of the low number of 18 articles across all four periods. An average of 1 in 3 articles making use of the flood metaphor indicated a higher proportion than in the other two papers though. These results suggested that at varying levels all newspapers contributed to the construction of the arrival of Nigerian asylum seekers as a crisis by employing flood metaphors in 1997 and 2000. However, in 2004 and 2010 the frequency of flood metaphors had dropped to such low numbers that they arguably no longer contributed to the creation of a crisis.

Official Ireland's reaction to the arrival of larger numbers of asylum seekers from the late 1990s was one of creating deterrents, thereby lowering its attractiveness for potential new arrivals, following earlier examples of other Western European countries.[756] Welfare benefits were restricted, the direct provision system was introduced in 2000, carrier liability came into effect, a Supreme Court decision removed the until then common practice of granting parents of Irish children residency rights in 2003, before the Referendum on Citizenship in 2004 replaced jus soli with jus sanguinis altogether. At the time of writing, the Immigration,

[756] NEUMAYER (2005a), p. 48

Residence and Protection Bill suggested further restrictions. Lentin evaluated the state's reaction in the following way:

> Side by side with multi-culturalist policies, the response of the Irish state to the increase in asylum applications has been a gradual process of distancing, beginning with psychological distancing (calling asylum-seekers 'bogus refugees', 'illegal immigrants' and/or 'economic migrants' and thus discrediting them), going on to physical distancing (dispersing asylum-seekers to direct provision hostels), and finally to the last stage, when asylum-seekers are psychologically and physically distanced, namely deportation.[757]

When Lentin published her analysis in 2003, the number of effected deportations was comparatively high but had subsequently fallen until 2007. However, effected deportations have steadily risen since except for a drop in 2011.[758] Recent developments underlined the current government's (in office since February 2011) ambition to resolve the 'asylum crisis' as outlined in the Minister for Justice, Equality and Defence's outlook for the government's policy in 2013:

> The initiatives I will be prioritising in 2013 are both ambitious and progressive. These measures will strike a balance between facilitating those who wish to come here and contribute positively to our economy and our communities, as well as providing State protection to persons who are in genuine need of such protection, while at the same time dealing firmly and fairly with those who attempt to abuse and take advantage of the immigration system.[759]

While in 2006 9.4 per cent of applications for asylum were granted (excluding appeal cases), this figure fell in all subsequent years. The most tremendous drops were seen when economic recession had set in at recognition rates of 2.5 per cent in 2009 and as low as 1.1 per cent in 2010. A slight upward tendency was seen in 2011 with 4.2 per cent of applications granted.[760] For comparison, in 2009 the EU27 figure of positive decisions at first instance was 27 per cent.[761] The sharp fall in recognised cases in Ireland could partially be explained with Neumayer's argument that "[...] the unemployment rate in destination countries [was] negatively associated with the recognition rate for full refugee protection status"[762] As illustrated in Alan Shatter's outlook, the justification for more restrictive legislation was usually a dichotomy of deserving genuine refugees and undeserving bogus applicants attempting to skim the welfare system. Such a line of argumentation in effect criminalised people in search

[757] LENTIN (2003), p. 305
[758] For deportation statistics cf. LOYAL (2011), p. 75; THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE (2012); DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE AND EQUALITY (2012)
[759] DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE AND EQUALITY (2012)
[760] OFFICE OF THE REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER
[761] EUROSTAT (2010)
[762] NEUMAYER (2005a), p. 44

of refuge.[763] According to this reading, undeserving immigrants were those who were allegedly not willing to make a contribution to the economy. At the same time, Shatter failed to point out that Irish legislation denied asylum seekers the right to work, thus manoeuvring them into a state of dependency in which they were not (or only to a very limited extent) able to take responsibility for their own lives. Moreover, under the direct provision scheme, asylums seekers were housed in residential institutions in which they were subject to very restrictive rules, limited privacy and a weekly allowance of €19.10 per adult.[764] Arguably, these were hardly attractive prospects for generally well educated applicants[765] for refugee status.

In contrast to government discourse, the media were more reluctant to call Nigerian immigrants illegals or abusers of the welfare system. Although, as quoted above, Fanning argued that asylum seekers were widely portrayed as welfare scroungers, this could not be confirmed for Nigerian asylum seekers in this study. Both in primary and secondary topics, they were infrequently portrayed as a burden to the state or as exploiting the welfare system. Readers of the *IT* were even less exposed to such representations, while they were found more often in the *Independent* and the tabloid. The highest relative counts were found in *Nigerians and other immigrant groups* in *The Irish Sun* and the *Irish Independent*, and the lowest in *Nigerians* in *The Irish Times*. However, even the higher relative counts in the first two papers did not allow the conclusion that Nigerian asylum seekers were *widely* represented as milking the Irish state (Table 65, Table 66). Likewise, Lentin's proposition of physically distancing asylum seekers by calling them illegals could not be confirmed as a frequent phenomenon for Nigerian nationals in the three papers discussed here. Overall, in only 2.6 per cent of primary roles (Table 8) and 2.4 per cent of secondary roles (Table 9) were Nigerians represented as illegals. These results suggested that more individualised coverage – for example by stating the nationality – was less negative than the portrayal of asylum seekers in general.

As Table 65 illustrates, the most frequent primary topics linked to Nigerian asylum seekers were *Deportation* (71), *Court Case* (55) and *Immigration Policy* (40). These topics will be discussed in detail in the subsequent sections. However, the majority of articles in *Court Case*

[763] For the discussion of the illegitimacy frame and the deserving/undeserving dichotomy also see e.g. HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006), p. 104; UGBA.
[764] For a description and critique of the direct provision system cf. for example NASC - THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE (b)
[765] According to a study by Feldman et al., 85 per cent of Nigerians were in employment before coming to Ireland with more than a quarter in managerial and executive positions. In a study by the European Union Sub-Saharan Africans belonged to those with the longest years in education. FELDMAN (2008), p. 87; EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2009), p. 108

were linked to *Deportation* as secondary topics (Table 68) so that the *Deportation* and *Court Case* categories will be discussed together.

Immigration Policy

Although *Immigration Policy* was clearly the third most frequent primary topic in total, no consistent picture of coverage emerged in a breakdown into the individual publications. There was, for example, not a single article in *The Irish Sun* discussing Nigerian asylum seekers and immigration policy, whereas this topic was almost on par with the second most frequent topic in *The Irish Times*. In the broadsheets there was a clear peak in 2000 (Peak 2) reflecting that the government's intentions to introduce more restrictive immigration policies heightened media awareness.

The analysis of the *Connotation* category suggested that the nature of coverage was quite different in the two broadsheets with the *Irish Independent* being much more likely to support government discourse on immigration policy and *The Irish Times* raising critical questions in almost half of all its articles (Table 69). While the *Irish Independent* tended to welcome more restrictive legislation, *The Irish Times* was more likely to point out deficiencies in the system with only few articles having received a negative connotation. These ranged from criticising the new dispersal policy to more isolated areas of Ireland to the actual processing of applications and the recommendations made by the authorities. Fintan O'Toole's editorial of 03 October 2000 may serve as an example. In his commentary, O'Toole addressed Ireland's

> rush to separate economic migrants from what the Minister for Justice and the Taoiseach like to call "genuine asylum-seekers", it is often forgotten that the world is a vicious place and that it produces millions of people whose fear of persecution is all too well founded.[766]

He went on to expose Ireland's approach to accepting asylum seekers as hypocritical and cynical, and to be in contradiction to international law. He argued that the official position, "even by those who take a dim view of immigration in general" to support people in need was not put into practice by referring to a number of cases in which,

> [t]he official attitude seems to be that evidence of state violence against citizens in far-off places is to be treated with such extreme scepticism that even the physical scars of torture can be obliterated if the victim tells an inconsistent story.[767]

What is more, he did not present these as isolated cases, i.e. as a deviation from the norm but explicitly stated that his impression was that this was happening on a frequent basis. He

[766] O'TOOLE (03/10/00)
[767] O'TOOLE (03/10/00)

based his allegations that Ireland was disregarding international law on clearly identified, reliable sources such as the United Nations and Amnesty International. Therefore, his line of argumentation remained transparent, giving readers and critics the chance to retrace it. Although not explicitly stated, the exposure of what seemed to be unjust decisions to reject applications for political protection left no doubt that Fintan O'Toole strongly disagreed with Ireland's immigration practice.

The *Irish Independent*, on the other hand, published an article on 20 March 2000[768] on new restrictions on asylum seekers that were to be introduced:

> O'Donoghue planning new measures for refugees
>
> GOVERNMENT ministers will be asked to back a comprehensive package of measures to deal with asylum seekers and refugees within the next two weeks. [...]
>
> Almost 2,000 people arrived in Ireland in January and February seeking asylum, more than 50pc of them from Nigeria and Romania.
>
> Last year, 2,711 Romanians and 2,491 Nigerians sought political asylum compared with 131 from Iraq and 204 from Angola. [...]
>
> And it also emerged that Fraud Squad officers are arresting at least two Nigerian asylum seekers a day in Dublin over alleged credit cards scams.
>
> The number of arrests has grown to 1,300 since November 1998, including 227 in the first 10 weeks of the year. According to figures published yesterday there are 4,500 Nigerians staying in Ireland while their applications for asylum are being determined.
>
> One-quarter of these have been arrested by the Garda Bureau of Fraud Investigation, who believe that Ireland is being targeted by sophisticated Nigerian fraud syndicates.
>
> The frauds involve credit card skimming and bogus social welfare claims which could cost the country millions of pounds and damage the credibility of genuine asylums seekers. [...]
>
> According to Gardai sources, several of the Nigerians arrested in Ireland and claiming to be asylum seekers, are UK citizens. They fly back and forth to Nigeria despite telling officers in Ireland that they are seeking political asylum here because of persecution at home.[769]

This article was particularly interesting because of the accumulation of negative representations of Nigerians. The headline *O'Donoghue planning new measures for refugees* may have appeared startling to the (informed) reader at first glance because of the minister's alleged plans to introduce legislation for *refugees*, whereas these measures were actually directed at *asylum seekers.* The conflation of the two terms was a first indicator for uninformed and uncritical coverage of the topic. So, according to the *Independent*, the minister intended to

[768] DOWLING and REID (20/03/00)
[769] DOWLING and REID (20/03/00)

introduce *comprehensive legislation to deal with asylum seekers and refugees within the next two weeks*. *Comprehensive* indicated that, in the government's opinion, extensive regulations seemed necessary and that this piece of legislation would have far-reaching effects. The topic received further urgency by pointing out a deadline of two weeks, adding to an atmosphere of crisis in which the country allegedly found itself by the introduction of a perceived temporal limit. The use of the verb *deal* in this context further underlined a perceived crisis as in this situation asylum seekers needed to be dealt with like a problem needs to be dealt with. Hence, people in search of refuge were problematised rather than supported. It could be shown that the euphemism *measures* barely masked the *Independent's* welcoming attitude towards more restrictive legislation.

When the authors turned towards the number of asylum seekers arriving, this further fuelled the construction of a crisis. They pointed out that in the first two months of the year, 2,000 people seeking asylum had arrived in Ireland, more than half of those from Nigeria and Romania. Their point of reference was the previous year in which, according to the authors, 2,491 asylum seekers from Nigeria, 131 from Iraq and 204 from Angola had arrived. The comparison to Iraq and Angola was no coincidence. Whereas the former was under the rule of Saddam Hussein, a civil war was waged in the latter. Both facts were certainly well known to the general readership. In this context, the authors alluded to circumstances serving as legitimate reasons to apply for asylum, and yet the number of asylum seekers from these countries remained comparatively low. Political oppression and human rights violations in Nigeria, however, were not accepted in the same way since the number was implicitly portrayed as too high. Hence, the reference to these figures was an example of how a flood metaphor was employed to discriminate between deserving and undeserving asylum seekers. It came as no surprise that the authors' line of argumentation was misleading. Just because there were only few applications for asylum by Iraqis in Ireland, this did not mean that there were few people desiring to leave the country. In fact, there were 25,300 applications for asylum by Iraqis in the EU in 1999.[770] As shown above, such a use of the flood metaphor was still quite common in the *Irish Independent* in 2000, and, to a lesser extent, even in *The Irish Times*. Yet, in the case of the latter newspaper, this needed to be seen in a context of much more critical reporting on government policy alongside some negative coverage.

The article then took a turn towards framing Nigerian asylum seekers as criminals in the remainder of the article, representing about half of the total length. When the authors stated that

[770] UNHCR (2003)

it also emerged yesterday that Fraud Squad officers are arresting at least two Nigerian asylum seekers a day in Dublin over alleged credit card scams, the source of this piece of information remained obscure so that the linking of Nigerian asylum seekers to criminal activities had to be considered unreferenced. Yet, the impression that official figures confirmed Nigerian asylum seekers' involvement in criminal activities was raised. Later, an allegedly rising number of arrests was linked to official statistics, which, however, stated the number of Nigerians living in Ireland. Both elements (number of arrests and number of Nigerians living in Ireland) were unrelated, but again, this obviously racist claim created the impression that it was backed by official sources. It came as no surprise that the next claim that one quarter of Nigerian asylum seekers were arrested in relation to fraud investigations remained unreferenced entirely. In fact, studies showed that "there is no evidence that the rate of crime is higher amongst asylum-seekers or refugees than in the population as a whole."[771] The following extension of the catalogue of offences was suitable to add to a perceived asylum crisis, now in the guise of an insurmountable burden on resources.[772]

However, although a constant link of Nigerian asylum seekers to criminality has been suggested by a number of academics,[773] such links were rarely observed in this study, which made this *Irish Independent* article an exception to the rule in this regard.[774] When all Nigerian role allocations were taken into account though, a link to criminality could be demonstrated at about the same level as Poles and at a slightly higher level than Chinese.[775] Therefore, whereas Nigerian asylum seekers were unlikely to be represented as criminals, Nigerians were not. This was further investigated in the chapter on *Perpetrator / Suspect* roles above.

[771] NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM; UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES. Also cf. studies by Bell et al. or Papadopolous: BELL and MACHIN (2011); PAPADOPOULOS (2010)

[772] "The number of arrests has grown from to 1,300 since November 1998, including 277 in the first 10 weeks of this year. According to figures published yesterday there are 4500 Nigerians staying in Ireland while their applications for asylum are being determined. One quarter of these have been arrested by the Garda Bureau of Fraud Investigation, who believe that Ireland is being targeted by sophisticated Nigerian fraud syndicates. The frauds involve credit card skimming and bogus social welfare claims which could cost the country millions of pounds and damage the credibility of genuine asylum seekers." DOWLING and REID (20/03/00)

[773] Cf. for example LOYAL (2011), p. 9 or FANNING (2012), p. 97 or HAYNES, DEVEREUX and BREEN (2006), p. 111

[774] The primary role allocation *Asylum seeker* received the secondary role allocation *Suspect* in 1.4 % of articles and *Perpetrator* in 1.4 % (Table 67). For primary role allocations *Suspect* and *Perpetrator* there were 10 secondary role allocations of *Asylum seeker* (10.6 %); Table 39)

[775] Combined figures for primary role allocations *Suspect* and *Perpetrator* were 11.2 % (Poles), 13 % (Nigerians) and 9.4 % (Chinese): (Table 8: Primary role by Group).

Deportations

Deportations as the physical removal of unwanted immigrants from the state are the ultimate culmination of a chain of events in construing a crisis. Applying Foucault's concept of governmentality and biopolitics,[776] they are the (metaphorical) killing of the undesired, the sanitation of society. In this study, deportations emerged to be the most frequent topic linked to Nigerian asylum seekers, reflecting high media attention. In this section, the Irish government's position on removals from the state shall be analysed first before the attention shall be turned to media representations of the topic.

In his address at the launch of the original version of the Immigration, Residence and Protection Bill, the then Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform Dermot Ahearn made ample use of the deserving – undeserving dichotomy, leaving no doubt that undesired immigrants had to be deported from Ireland:

> Ireland is in competition with other countries for people with sought-after skills and qualifications, we need this status, statutorily guaranteed, in order to be able to tailor immigration packages that make Ireland an even more attractive destination for medium-term and long-term migration. [...] Very many of those applying for refugee status are in reality, economic migrants. [… and …] unlawful presence brings with it the obligation on the person to leave the State. A person found unlawfully in the State will be liable to be removed without notice, and may be detained for the purpose of ensuring removal from the State.[777]

Against the backdrop of the economic side of his speech, the deserving – undeserving dichotomy had to be read desired – undesired. As noted before, asylum seekers did not have a right to work in Ireland and were thus deprived of the opportunity to make an economic contribution to the state (although many asylum seekers volunteered because they wished to make a contribution to Irish society).[778] Putting an "economic migrant" stamp on asylum ignored that the EU itself in part created the very conditions from which people were fleeing. Neumayer showed that economic conditions in countries of origin were significant determiners in the decision making process to leave the country. Many European markets, though, remained closed to many countries from which asylum seekers originated, thereby contributing to their economic hardships. He further concluded that political regimes, human rights abuse, dissident

[776] FOUCAULT (2003a), pp. 237-264
[777] AHEARN (2008)
[778] NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM; UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES

political violence, civil and / or ethnic warfare and state failure as well as external conflicts were important determiners as well and concluded that

> our results put the perception that the aggregate numbers of asylum seekers coming to Western Europe are merely determined by economic conditions in the countries of origin into great doubt.[779]

Additionally, the UNHCR outlined the changing nature of conflict in today's world with agents of violence having multiplied against the backdrop that the UNHCR was established when wars were waged between states.[780] The UNHCR has also criticised the inconsistent nature of asylum legislation in individual countries. Dermot Ahearn's speech did not take multi-facetted push-factors into account and resorted to rather traditional, often mono-causal explanations as to why people were forced to leave their home countries. In this light, deporting people on the ground that they were *in reality, economic migrants* raised questions. But how did the media portray deportations from Ireland?

As in the *Immigration Policy* category, the three newspapers presented varying frequencies and points of view on deportations. Most articles (primary topic) were found in *The Irish Times* (38) with the *Irish Independent* following at 28 and *The Irish Sun* far behind at 5 (Table 65). Secondary topics supported this picture (Table 66). In both absolute and relative numbers, the *IT* broadsheet had the least negative coverage at a great margin, the highest neutral count, and was critical of deportations in more than half of its articles. The *Irish Independent* covered deportations in a negative fashion in well over 2 out of 5 articles only surpassed by *The Irish Sun* at 3 out of 5 articles having a negative connotation (Table 70). These findings were generally in line with connotations discussed in the *Immigration Policy* category.

A closer inspection of *Deportation* articles suggested a difference in connotation and topics between articles that discussed individual high-profile cases of (possible) deportations and articles discussing deportation in a more general manner. However, the data coded so far only allowed for limited conclusions. A cross tabulation of groups and connotations only revealed that critical questions were higher for *Nigerians* whereas the number of negative articles was about the same for both groups (Table 71). This result was merely showing a tendency and lacking substance for more general conclusions. Therefore, three new subcategories were defined for all articles on deportations (primary topic). *Individual case* (yes / no) allowed for

[779] NEUMAYER (2005b), p. 405
[780] UNHCR (2012), p. 6

the differentiation of articles that discussed individual cases while *Subtopic A* and *Subtopic B* showed in more detail what was discussed (cf. code book).

The results were quite revealing. Almost 2 out of 5 articles focused on individual cases with some of the 27 articles following the same deportation case over a period of time (Table 72). Ultimately, a very small number of high-profile cases were almost exclusively portrayed in a sympathetic light.[781] This was expressed through either implicit or explicit criticism of the government's deportation policy (48 %), by featuring stories of looming or effected deportations of children holding Irish citizenship or spouses of Irish citizens and references to public support of deportees challenging the minister's decision (Table 73). Although most of these articles arguably carried a human interest element, the media did contribute to bringing the fate of individual deportees and their families to public attention. They gave failed asylum seekers a voice, if to a very limited number, which refuted the argument that the media *generally* regarded asylum seekers as undesired alien subjects.

As expected, the picture changed drastically when the coverage of deportations was of a more general nature. Across the range, newspapers became less critical, in the case of the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun* almost to the point of being non-critical (Table 74, Table 75). Thereby it did not matter whether the article focused on Nigerians or not. This trend towards negative coverage was distinctly more pronounced in the *Irish Independent* than in *The Irish Times*. To name just one example, only one article in the *IT* criminalised failed asylum seekers but 7 did so in the *II* (Table 74, Table 75), implying that the *Irish Independent* contributed to framing (failed) Nigerian asylum seekers as illegitimate by equating deportees with illegals and thus denigrating people forced to leave the country because they did not match the government's definition of a person in need of protection. Resorting to Foucault again, power created the very categories that it longed to regulate. Not being recognised by the Irish state as a refugee did not mean that a person did not feel persecuted or did indeed not run at risk of being persecuted if deported to Nigeria. As discussed above, Western European states often failed to take into account the changed nature of sources of persecution. They created categories that suited their needs, namely deportation.

9.2.4 "Nigerians are happy people" – Letters to the editor

As early as in 1997 when comparatively few Nigerian asylum seekers had arrived in Ireland, a heated debate unfolded in the media, culminating in June of that year in *The Irish*

[781] There was only one article supporting deportations and having a negative connotation: ANONYMOUS (30/07/10)

Times. In response to media reports on asylum seekers arriving in Ireland, Edwin E. Edobar, Charge d'Affaires at the Nigerian embassy, published a letter in which he declared his view on the issue:

> Sir, I wish to refer to your several articles referring to Nigeria as one of the countries with a huge number of asylum seekers in Ireland and to say that the situation in Nigeria does not warrant its citizens to seek refugee status outside the country. Those seeking refugee status are obviously economic migrants who have the illusion of greener pastures outside the country and concoct tales of torture, harassment and humiliation.
>
> The Nigerian Government has in the past alerted countries about the activities of these economic migrants who seek to secure resident status through the aid of other collaborators in various European countries under the guise of their activities in championing the cause for human rights and the restoration of democracy in the country.
>
> I want to use this opportunity to reiterate the fact that there is no persecution of any nature nor reign of terror in Nigeria as may have been alleged by such persons. Nigerians are happy people and are moving about freely and unmolested.[782]

This letter was published in the *Irish Independent* on 03 June and in *The Irish Times* on 04 June 1997. Not only did Edobar present Nigerian asylums seekers as fraudsters attempting to exploit Ireland's immigration system (*concoct tales of torture, under the guise of their activities in championing the cause for human rights and the restoration of democracy in the country, such people*), he was also in outright denial of any abuse of human rights in Nigeria (*the fact that* […]*, Nigerians are happy people and are moving about freely and unmolested* in a prominent position at the end of the letter).

The reaction in the two dailies could not have been more different. For more than a week, general readers, members of various NGOs, the Nigerian embassy, a Nigerian national and an academic exchanged opinions on the contentious matter in *The Irish Times*. As the debate unfolded, it became more detailed in nature and more professional in terms of its participants. The original reaction consisted of three letters published on 07 June 1997. A reader in a private function, who was not named as a member of a charity or any other organisation, challenged Edobar's assertion that there was no persecution in Nigeria:

> A chara, How can Edwin E. Edobar (June 4th) say that there is "no persecution of any nature" in Nigeria? Such a statement cannot go unchallenged. The climate of terror and repression in Nigeria is well documented, and sadly it is no surprise that asylum seekers from Nigeria seek refuge from the torment in their homeland [...].[783]

[782] EDOBAR (04/06/97); EDOBAR (03/06/97)
[783] Ó CUANACHAIN (07/06/97)

This view was supported by another private individual who concluded

> [i]t is beyond me how Mr Edobar can be so bare faced as to suggest that such abuses are "concoctions". If Nigerians are such "happy people" why are they so anxious to leave his country?

These private opinions clearly disagreed with Edobar's point of view and suggested that there were human rights violations taking place in Nigeria and that, consequently, applications for refugee status from Nigerians were valid. Both letters also cited the case of Ken Saro-Wiwa, who had been executed in 1995. Saro-Wiwa was a Nigerian writer and activist, who devoted himself to the protection of Ogoniland, where oil production, in a joint venture of Shell and the Nigerian government, had caused severe environmental pollution. He was arrested several times and eventually put on trial together with 8 other Ogoni leaders. According to various reports, the court proceedings were in violation of the Nigerian constitution and violating international human rights. All nine accused were hanged in November 1995.[784] Apart from these private opinions, this initial set of replies also included a letter written on behalf of Amnesty International, discussing the absence of the freedom of opinion and the persecution of journalists who openly challenged the government's position in Nigeria.[785]

On 10 June 1997 three further letters were published. In the first one, Edwin E. Edobar attempted to refute the opinions aired in the letters of 07 June:

> Contrary to the author's imagination, Ken Saro-Wiwa was tried, convicted and executed for his role in the murder of four Ogoni Chiefs [...] whose families, in spite of being the principal victims of the brutal killings, continue to stay in Nigeria and even open to reconciliation with other community members.
>
> The Special Tribunal which tried Ken Saro Wiwa [sic] was not without precedents. Nor is death penalty, as a punishment, peculiar to Nigerian legal system alone.[786]

In this apologetic, trivialising approach Edobar denied any wrong doing in the trial of Saro-Wiwa despite the fact that human rights organisation had documented the violation of human rights in the trial. Furthermore, his claims that the *Special Tribunal was not without precedents* and that Nigeria was not the only country to carry out the death sentence were further attempts to invalidate the letters of 07 June and to present Nigeria as a democratic country that was governed by the rule of law. This point of view masked the fact that Nigeria was a military dictatorship until 1998 and that, unknown to the writers at the time of writing of course, the

[784] Cf. CLEAN THE NIGER DELTA (2010) or RIGHT LIVELIHOOD
[785] Cf. GROOCOCK (07/06/97)
[786] EDOBAR (10/06/97)

(slow) transition to civilian rule did not start before 1999. As the authors of the letters to the editor of 07 June 1997 had pointed out, it was well established that

> [t]he Abacha regime ignored due process of law, press freedom, individual liberty, and human rights. The government used violence as a weapon against its opponents and critics. [...] Trade union movements were suspended and protesters were killed, yet opposition to the government, particularly outside of the country, did not abate. Abacha and his loyalists again used the state as an instrument of personal gain.[787]

What is more, the absence of the rule of law in Nigeria did not only come to light after military dictatorship had ended, but concerns had been publicised much earlier, for example when Amnesty International protested against Saro-Wiwa's unfair trial.[788] At the end of the letter, Edobar challenged

> …Colm Ó Cuanachain and his collaborators to produce the list, for public scrutiny, so as to ascertain the individual claims which are related to the picture painted of Nigeria.[789]

The use of *collaborators*, an allusion to a plot against the portrayal of Nigeria by a number of allegedly dubious figures, in Edobar's final paragraph left no doubt that the Charge d'Affairs saw Nigeria as a victim of false representations in the media. As if he had anticipated such a challenge, Frank Jennings, writing on behalf of Amnesty International, did exactly that. In his lengthy reply to Edobar's original letter he described the general nature of persecution of opponents and gave a detailed, though not exhaustive, list of what composed human rights violations.

> The government of General Sani Abacha has faced more national and international criticism than previous military governments in Nigeria, primarily because of frustration over the abortive "transition to civilian rule" of 1987 to 1993, the increased level of human rights violations and the barely disguised threat of force against the new human rights and pro-democracy community which has developed in Nigeria in the past 10 years.
>
> The government has refused meaningful dialogue with opposition groups within Nigeria or the international community and has shown no sign of restoring the rule of law. A state of impunity has resulted, in which senior military officials have openly displayed contempt for court orders which seek to restrain their abuse of human rights. There is not sufficient space for full details but Amnesty International remains concerned about the following areas in which human rights are still violated in Nigeria:
>
> - the continued detention without charge or trial of prisoners of conscience and their imprisonment after grossly unfair political trials;
> - the torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment of prisoners;

[787] ENCYCLOPEDIA BRITANNICA
[788] Cf. AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL (1995)
[789] EDOBAR (10/06/97)

- the continued use of the death penalty, especially after trials by special courts,
- further allegations of extrajudicial executions.

[...]

The government's continuing harsh repression has therefore led many to seek asylum outside of Nigeria.[790]

Supported by a similar letter by Mary Sweeney on behalf of Trócaire, an Irish NGO, Edobar's presentation of Nigeria as a country governed by the rule of law was challenged in a quite detailed analysis of why people from Nigeria were forced to seek refuge outside the country. This showed that the *IT* gave holders of opposing views ample space to present their ideas, thus functioning as a platform for political exchange at a national level. This function was further illustrated by a letter writer of 11 June 1997,[791] claiming the majority of asylum seekers in Ireland were only posing as Nigerians since the situation in his country of origin – the composer was a Nigerian national living in Ireland – did not warrant any claims of political oppression. Stating his nationality served the function of adding authority to his statements. The hidden message was that as a Nigerian national he must have known what the situation in his native country was like, thereby positioning himself above and calling into disregard non-governmental organisations that took a view opposing his own.

The climax of the debate was formed by a UCD lecturer in international human rights law who, in a step-by-step fashion, dismantled Edobar's crude attempt of masking oppression and torture in Nigeria.[792] Although not the last letter to the editor – there was another, relatively short one arguing for Ireland's humanitarian obligation three days later – this contribution had to be seen as the final word in this verbal exchange. Suzanne Egan as an expert on the subject was given much room – more than to any of the previous letters, which were already quite lengthy. Citing from sessions of the Human Rights Committee concerning Nigeria, she challenged Edobar's assertion that

> [a]t the conclusion of the visit, the Federal Government of Nigeria was actually commended for its openness and transparency in inviting a neutral UN fact-finding mission to Nigeria [in 1996]. While human rights abuse was not the issue, the government was, nevertheless committed to the promotion of human rights by the establishment of a human rights commission.[793]

[790] JENNINGS (10/06/97)
[791] NWOSU (11/06/97)
[792] EGAN (13/06/97)
[793] EDOBAR (10/06/97)

Egan made clear that the very committee had been deeply concerned about the human rights situation in the country, the application of the death penalty and public executions, politically motivated death sentences as in the case of Saro-Wiwa or the freedom of the press.

> The foregoing are just some of the principal subjects of concern expressed by the committee, notwithstanding the establishment of the new Nigerian Human Rights Commission. No doubt your readers will draw their own conclusions as to whether the picture painted above by an independent body of experts on human rights would be capable of producing a refugee applicant on our shores.[794]

The orchestration of this debate showed that *The Irish Times* did not contribute to the mis-information of the Irish public on the subject of Nigerian asylum seekers. The use of the term orchestration is not an attempt to call into doubt that a genuine exchange of opinions had taken place. It is rather an expression of the editor's considerations whether to and when to publish letters sent to him or her. As established in the coverage of racism, the publication of articles that had received a negative connotation because they were suitable to raise negative perceptions of Nigerian asylum seekers had to be seen in the context of airing differing opinions on a contested subject. Apart from the fact that negative contributions were clearly outweighed by critical ones in *The Irish Times*, the selection of contributions by private individuals, diplomats, members of NGOs and a university lecturer illustrated that this newspaper attempted to provide a broad discussion of the topic that took varying opinions from various walks of life into account. It avoided one-sided, biased portrayals of Nigerian asylum seekers although the quality and quantity of contributions presented in support of asylum seekers suggested that this paper had a generally supportive tendency in its reporting style. Consequently, it did not contribute to the othering of Nigerian nationals and by providing background information on asylum seekers' motives for leaving their home country, it did not represent them as undesired immigrants that, arguing with Foucault's biopolitics, needed to be removed.

On the other hand, such an exchange of opinions did not take place in the *Irish Independent*. In this newspaper only one reply was recorded in this study. It was the same letter sent to *The Irish Times* by a member of Trócaire on 10 of June 1997.[795] Interestingly, the contributor was presented in a private role by the omission of the name of the NGO that she represented, which arguably gave her contribution less weight. The small likelihood of Edobar's letter in the *Irish Independent* being entirely unnoticed by non-governmental organisations and academia, and the relative muteness in this regard suggested a deliberate editorial decision not to publish dissenting letters to the same extent as in the *IT*. This assumption was further

[794] EGAN (13/06/97)
[795] SWEENEY (10/06/97)

supported by the generally more negative reporting style in the *Irish Independent*, particularly in the earlier periods. Consequently, a differing approach to the discussion of asylum seekers in the two broadsheet papers emerged.

***

The findings on the representation of Nigerian asylum seekers were of a somewhat ambivalent nature. A common assumption that the media contribute to construing the arrival of asylum seekers in Ireland as a crisis could only be shown for Nigerian nationals in the first two periods but not in 2004 and 2010. Moreover, notable differences in the quality of coverage could be demonstrated between *The Irish Times* and the *Irish Independent* with *The Irish Sun* playing a marginal role due to its very limited number of articles. Articles on deportations revealed a selective approach to the topic; whereas individual high-profile cases of looming removals from the state were generally seen in a sympathetic light, more general articles on deportations tended towards negative coverage, though much more frequently in the *Irish Independent* than in *The Irish Times*. The nature of an exchange of opinions on the arrival of asylum seekers from Nigeria in the letter to the editor sections of these newspapers confirmed this.

Apart from confirming the hypotheses that there were specific sets of roles and topics to be identified in the representation of immigrants, these results support hypothesis D1 stating that *The Irish Times* reports in a more positive fashion than the *Irish Independent*, but they give only limited information in relation to the quality of coverage in *The Irish Sun* because of the low number of articles in this tabloid.

9.3 Chinese students

9.3.1 Introduction

Between 2002 and 2011, the number of Chinese nationals in Ireland increased from 5,842 to 10,896 with a peak of 11,161 in 2006.[796] In a study carried out by Feldman et al. in 2008, more than 4 in 5 Chinese respondents stated that they came for educational reasons.[797] Wang names the intention to learn English and the ease of obtaining student visa as motivating factors – among others – for coming to Ireland.[798] Hence, it is safe to say that the large majority of

[796] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 7. The more realistic number of Chinese living in Ireland is estimated at 40,000 (see chapter on Chinese immigrants).
[797] FELDMAN (2008), p. 63
[798] WANG (2006), pp. 23-4

Chinese arriving after 2001, the year in which the work-study visa was introduced, came into Ireland on a student status. The work-study visa allowed students to work for up to 20 hours a week and eased some of the financial constraints that many Chinese students had experienced prior to 2001.[799] This chapter examines to what extent and how Chinese students were represented in the print media.

In all 320 articles in which Chinese living in Ireland were mentioned in *The Irish Times* and the *Irish Independent,*[800] there were 53 (16.6 %) primary and 22 (6.9 %) secondary role allocations as students. In the primary role category, the *Immigrant in general*-role was marginally more frequently allocated than *Student* at 56 counts, but they played almost no role in secondary role allocations with 3 samples noted (Table 76, Table 77). Moreover, when the attention was turned to articles that discussed only Chinese and no other immigrant groups, the primary S*tudent*-role featured most strongly (Table 78). These results clearly show that the representation of Chinese immigrants as students belonged to the most frequent role allocations, calling for their discussion here.

9.3.2 'Chinese migrants are also big business' – the framing of Chinese students as a source of income

In about one quarter of all articles discussing Chinese students, *Third Level Education* was the primary topic and at that by far the most frequent one (Table 79). The large number of language school students, however, was not reflected in media coverage (only 3 articles on *Further Education*). The link between the *Student*-role and *Third Level Education* did not come unexpectedly, but the data yielded even more interesting results when topics linked to secondary roles were taken into account. In half of all cases in which students were linked to higher education, they were seen as contributing to the economy (Table 80). In a further 10 articles students were directly linked to this topic (primary topic: Table 79). Hence, a total of 19 out of 75 articles (25 per cent) saw Chinese students either directly or indirectly as a contributory factor in the Irish economy. Out of these, a clear majority of 14 articles presented Chinese students as a source of income be it for the Irish education system or as customers outside the education system, reducing international students to economic units (Table 81). If the revenue frame had been part of the original code book design, it would have had a high chance to become one of the most frequent topics. The observation that Chinese students were seen as a source of

[799] SUN (2001), p. 37
[800] There was no *Student*-role in *The Irish Sun*.

income rather than as individuals who could contribute to society in a multitude of ways was already discussed by King-O'Riain:

> [Chinese migrants] are also big business (both as consumers and as streams of revenue for universities) and worth recruiting to come to Ireland. Chinese migrants are not framed in these media accounts in terms of what they add to society by way of multiculturalism, global social networks or diversification, but just as economic units, as potential links to China (not that many are willing to learn to speak Chinese from them) or doing jobs the Irish don't want to do.[801]

The following sections will investigate to which extent King-O'Riain's findings can be supported in this study. In terms of distribution amongst newspapers, *The Irish Times* employed the revenue frame slightly more often than the *Irish Independent* (8 and 6 articles). At the same time, only the *IT* also published articles that did not make use of the revenue frame when it linked Chinese students to the economy (Table 81). Regarding the distribution across years, no clear trend could be identified with articles being spread relatively evenly between 2000, 2004 and 2010. However, there was no case of the revenue frame recorded in 1997, which was hardly surprising because of only few students arriving prior to the introduction of work-study visas in 2001 (Table 82). In order to support these quantitative findings, two examples from two different periods, 2000 and 2010 shall illustrate how the revenue frame was employed in *The Irish Times* and the *Irish Independent*.

The first article was an editorial that appeared in *The Irish Times* on 14 September 2000.[802] It was set in the context of then Minister Harney's trade mission to Asia, which was aimed at strengthening business ties with Asian economies. The importance that was put on this mission was illustrated by the *IT* devoting a relatively long editorial (477 words) to the topic. The opening words set the tone by informing the reader that this editorial would focus on *business* and *China.* Although other Asian countries were mentioned, the focus was clearly on China. In the first paragraph the editor continuously resorted to business terminology (*efforts* […] *will be repaid by growing trade and investment*) or when referring to recent successes (*Trade has doubled both ways*).

Paragraph 2 opened with a direct quotation of the chief executive of Enterprise Ireland, warning that China should not be ignored or that there may be dire consequences for Ireland. Citing the chief executive added importance, bestowing an authoritative air on the quote and increasing its acceptance amongst readers.[803] The implied urgency was contrasted with a

[801] MEADE (2008), p. 211
[802] ANONYMOUS (14/09/00)
[803] FANNING and MUTWARASIBO (2007)

laudation of the Irish government's Asia Strategy that rapidly increased "diplomatic, trade and commercial resources". The context of the editorial was thereby extended to include non-economic fields by way of making a reference to diplomacy, i.e. politics.

The political context was continued in the third paragraph, which suggested that there could be no doubt that the Chinese human rights record was going to be set straight. The Chinese Prime Minister, Zhu Rongji, was introduced as

> a straight talker, who clarified his government's intention to sign two UN human rights conventions and hinted that it would support Ireland for a Security Council seat. This suggests that, despite the disparities of size between the two countries, Chinese leaders are intent on developing the relationship.[804]

Characterising the PM as a *straight talker*, the double strategy of portraying the PM as a man who would keep his word (*straight talker*) and using the verb *clarify*, which invoked an unambiguous perception, presented the Chinese government's *intention* as fact. This in turn implied that human rights violations no longer prevented Ireland from engaging in business relations with China. What is more, in the very same paragraph the issue of human rights was mentioned in conjunction with an unrelated topic, Ireland's wish to obtain a seat in the UN Security Council. This served as further evidence that human rights violations in China should not be considered an obstacle in the development of the economic and political relations between the two countries. Considering that *The Irish Times* was quite outspoken in the case of two Chinese students who studied at an Irish university and were prevented from returning to Ireland by Chinese authorities because of their membership in the Falun Gong movement (see below), the uncritical interpretation of the human rights situation in China in this editorial presented quite a stark contrast to generally disapproving views on this matter in *The Irish Times*.

Only now, in the fourth paragraph, did the reader learn that

> Minister Harney has a large group of business and educational representatives travelling with her. They have signed a variety of agreements across the span of industrial sectors. There is particular interest in software and high technology communications. There is also much enthusiasm to develop closer relations between educational institutions. Already many Chinese students have come to this country and there are plans to develop placement arrangements for young graduates similar to the successful ones pioneered by FÁS in Japan.[805]

[804] ANONYMOUS (14/09/00)
[805] ANONYMOUS (14/09/00)

The enumeration of representatives who had accompanied Mary Harney was interesting in two ways. First, educational representatives were placed in second position after business people, which represented a lower position in the hierarchy. Second, they were subsumed under *the span of industrial sectors*. Hence, education was not seen as a sector in its own right, but it was reduced to its economic function as an industry that contributed to the Irish economy. The statements *that there is much enthusiasm to develop closer relations between educational institutions* and *that many Chinese students have come to this country* remained ambiguous as to the benefits of a closer relationship. The context in which the educational sector was presented in this editorial left no doubt that the benefits referred to were of an economic nature in ignorance of the cultural gains of international exchange.

The business setting was reinforced in the final paragraph, in which the economic gains were reiterated:

> The lesson from all this activity is that the commitment of extra diplomatic staffing and resources can be repaid with increased economic interaction if planning is well researched and focused.[806]

This conclusion further supported the economic setting under which education was subsumed. The use of *all* in an inclusive way suggested that all aspects introduced in the previous paragraphs (economic, political and educational) could potentially lead to *increased economic interaction*. In summary, not only was education introduced at a very late stage and in a position that suggested less importance, ample use of business vocabulary and missing references to cultural gains clearly showed that education was solely discussed as an industry in disregard of cultural and social benefits. The primacy of the economy was an indicator for a shift in the definition of education. Not the exchange of knowledge, ideas and culture with the students' country of origin but the instantaneous economic benefit was foregrounded. It may be objected that in this case education was mentioned in a business editorial and therefore the business aspects of the educational sector had to be highlighted. Yet, the manner in which education was presented here strongly suggested that education was solely seen as an industry rather than as a field that *also* yielded economic benefits through its internationalisation. As a consequence, Chinese students were reduced to (potential) customers and de-individualised economic units, whose sole purpose was to further fuel the Irish economy.

The revenue frame equally applied to an article that appeared in the *Irish Independent* on 14 May 2010,[807] only that it was employed in a less subtle fashion. The headline straight away

[806] ANONYMOUS (14/09/00)
[807] ANONYMOUS (14/05/10)

framed international students in terms of *a boost to [the] economy*, which was reinforced in the article's opening sentence:

> EVERY full-time overseas student spends EUR 11,000 on accommodation and other living expenses on average annually, a new report reveals.[808]

The exact figure of 430 million euro further directed attention towards their economic 'value' away from international students as individuals. Despite the fact that this article appeared in the *National News* section and not in the *Business* section, the content remained to be of a solely economic nature in the third paragraph.

> The report from Enterprise Ireland shows that international students are generating almost EUR430m for the economy in the current academic year --EUR192m in fees and the rest in living costs. But Enterprise, Trade and Innovation Minister Batt O'Keeffe says more must be done to capture a greater share of the market.

Particularly Batt O'Keeffe's remark that Ireland should *capture a greater share of the market*, illustrated that international students, including those from China, were still seen as economic units a decade after such views were published in *The Irish Times* editorial above. This became particularly clear in two ways. First, the trade minister's thoughts on the report were published whereas no reference was made to the education minister. Therefore, the author of the article did not even attempt to investigate non-economic benefits of international students. This was supported by the use of *market*, a clear reference to the economic side of education.

In the fourth paragraph, some background information on the courses taken by international students was given.

> The report has found that nearly a quarter (23pc) of the international students in Ireland are studying at post-graduate level. Of these, 8pc, or more than 2,000 students, are taking PhDs. Post-graduate students are mainly taking science subjects, although significant numbers are studying humanities, engineering, computer science and medicine.[809]

Yet, the reference to international students at postgraduate-level carried a covert economic notion as well. At post-graduate level non-EU students were usually charged almost twice the fees EU-students paid.[810] This could be assumed as common knowledge amongst many *II* readers, even if they may not have known the details of the Irish university fee structure. Hence,

[808] ANONYMOUS (14/05/10)
[809] ANONYMOUS (14/05/10)
[810] For postgraduate fees cf. for example TRINITY COLLEGE DUBLIN (2012).

highlighting international students' share at post-graduate level implicitly alluded to the financial gain that could be expected from this group.

The final paragraph entitled *Important* detailed a list of countries from which international students came. Apparently, the importance attributed to countries was established by the number of students it supplied. Again, international students were represented as customers rather than individuals who could contribute to the cultural exchange between countries. There was no reference to transfer of knowledge, raising intercultural awareness or other benefits of internationalisation at all in the entire article.

These exemplary articles illustrated how Irish media often uncritically reflected official government policy. In the Irish government's *Asia Strategy,* Enterprise Ireland – "the government organisation responsible for the development and growth of Irish enterprises in world markets"[811] – "identified the economic sectors in priority Asian countries [...] for particular marketing attention on behalf of indigenous Irish companies."[812] One of the economic sectors was *Education Services* with China leading the list of targeted "priority countries."[813] Although Bertie Ahern, at the time Taoiseach of Ireland, identified "the development of political, economic and *cultural* relations between Ireland and Asia"[814] as aims of the *Asia Strategy* in the foreword to a review of the same, the remainder of the document only reflected on political and economic developments. An entire chapter was devoted to the internationalisation of institutes of higher education in Ireland. However, this chapter, like the articles employing the revenue frame in a perfunctory manner, was a one-sided interpretation of the internationalisation of education exclusively built on economic considerations. Already in 1995, Knight and de Wit discussed rationales for internationalisation. Apart from economic and political ones, they also highlighted cultural and educational benefits. According to their analysis, internationalisation could contribute to the "individual development [...] through a confrontation with other cultures" although they conceded that in Europe this was "seen more as an added value."[815] Other rationales included an international dimension to research and teaching, institution building and the improvement to the quality of education and research, gaining access to international networks or improved institutional policy making.[816]

[811] ENTERPRISE IRELAND
[812] REPUBLIC OF IRELAND (2004), p. 17
[813] REPUBLIC OF IRELAND (2004), p. 17
[814] REPUBLIC OF IRELAND (2004), Foreword; my emphasis
[815] DE WIT and KNIGHT (1995), pp. 12-3
[816] DE WIT and KNIGHT (1995), pp. 12-4 and International Association of Universities (2012)

These findings showed that none of the educational rationales or social benefits was discussed in the media. Out of all articles discussing Chinese students in third level education, cultural contributions, a multicultural Ireland or integration were not once mentioned (Table 80). In a European perspective, Ireland was not alone in considering the economic benefits of the internationalisation of education. However, when the German Academic Exchange Service published a press release in relation to a study that showed the financial benefits of international students for Germany and a number of other European countries, it also included a quote by the German Education Minister Johanna Wanka:

> Wir freuen uns, dass immer mehr Studierende nach Deutschland kommen. Sie sind uns willkommen, weil sie zum Austausch von Wissen, Ideen und Erkenntnissen beitragen. Die Studie zeigt aber auch: Ausländische Studierende bringen uns ganz handfeste volkswirtschaftliche Vorteile. Sie investieren, konsumieren, zahlen Steuern und sichern Arbeitsplätze. Studentinnen und Studenten aus aller Welt für Deutschland zu gewinnen und sie nach ihrem Abschluss bei uns zu halten, erfordert Investitionen in unsere Hochschulen, die sich schnell lohnen. Deshalb haben die Länder und der Bund sich das Ziel gesetzt, ihre Zahl weiter zu steigern.[817]

Although the fact that this study was commissioned by the German Academic Exchange Service demonstrated that economic considerations did play a role in attracting international students to Germany, the response showed that financial gain was not the only aspect, particularly against the backdrop that international students did not have to pay fees in Germany. Minister Wanka first mentioned the cultural and academic benefits and only then pointed out the economic ones. Hence, economic gains were seen as benefits amongst others such as cultural and academic ones. Furthermore, she demanded investments in the education sector by the federal states to further attract international students. Considering that Chinese students formed the biggest group of international students in Germany,[818] this snapshot impression suggested that Germany took a different, more comprehensive approach to Chinese students than Ireland. A more in-depth comparison of varying evaluations of the role of economic benefits in the internationalisation of education could be the subject of further research.

It has been shown that the revenue frame was repeatedly used between 2000 and 2010 either in a covert fashion as applied in *The Irish Times* or in a more overt manner as applied in

[817] GERMAN ACADEMIC EXCHANGE SERVICE (2014)
We are pleased that the number of students coming to Germany is increasing. They are welcome because they contribute to the exchange of knowledge, ideas and academic findings. However, the study also shows: International students bring concrete economic benefits. They invest, consume, pay taxes and secure jobs. Therefore, to attract students from all over the world to Germany and to make sure that they stay in Germany after they graduate requires Germany must invest in third level education. These will pay off quickly. Hence, the federal government and federal states aim at increasing their number further. (My translation)
[818] BUNDESMINISTERIUM FÜR BILDUNG UND FORSCHUNG

the *Irish Independent*. The quantitative analysis revealed that in most cases the frame was not restricted to Chinese students, but was employed for international students in general. Nevertheless, Chinese students were frequently linked to articles that reduced international students to economic units and thus de-individualised if not de-humanised them, confirming similar observations by King-O'Riain (cf. above). However, it needs to be noted that only *The Irish Times* also presented Chinese students outside the revenue frame, which acted as a further indicator for the assertion that the *IT* generally reported in a more balanced fashion than both the *II* and *IS*, as noted in previous chapters in this study.

9.3.3 Coverage of Falun Gong members

Between early 2000 and November 2004, *The Irish Times* followed the fate of three Chinese students who had been studying at Irish institutes of higher education and were not allowed to return to Ireland after a home visit to China. In November 2000, the coverage even formed a statistical peak (cf. ch. 7.1.3). The students were later arrested in China because of their membership in Falun Gong, which was considered a dangerous cult by the Chinese government.[819] The Falun Gong coverage was identified in articles that were coded in the *Information on Country of Origin*-category – the second most frequent topic in articles discussing Chinese students (Table 79). Out of the 17 articles that were identified in this category,[820] 14 were devoted to the arrested Falun Gong members. It was remarkable that the vast majority of articles was found in one newspaper (12 *IT* vs. 2 *II*) and that the coverage extended over a time span of four years. A spot check in *The Irish Times ProQuest Archive* indicated an even higher coverage in the years 2001 to 2003 and thus suggested continued interest in the subject outside the periods defined in this study.[821]

Falun Gong was founded around 1992 and is based on Quigong, a breathing meditation practice, and the teachings of Li Hongzhi, who has enriched elements of the Buddhist and Taoist religions with his own and extra-terrestrial ideas. Despite sometimes bizarre claims by 'Master Li' – Falun Gong members can become immortal, he claims – the movement sees itself as apolitical, non-violent and focuses on the cultivation of virtue, attracting around 70 million followers in China and 30 million abroad. Amongst them are intellectuals, members of the security forces and allegedly even party officials as well as members of the Chinese government circles. However, the organising power and Falun Gong followers' withdrawal

[819] EMBASSY OF THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA IN IRELAND
[820] Role A or Role B = student; Topic A or Topic B or Topic C = Information on country of origin
[821] Search term = Falun Gong AND Chinese AND student; 83 hits between 01/01/01 and 31/12/03

from society pose a threat to the single party rule in China and may be interpreted as an expression of a societal crisis.[822] Some authors see Falun Gong quite critically because of Li Hongzhi's unchallenged rule and the nature of some of his ideas.[823] In Germany it was considered a sect by the Regional Appeal Court Dresden (AZ 14U 265/05) in 2005.[824]

Generally speaking, the coverage in *The Irish Times* was in favour of the Chinese students to the extent that it highlighted their situation and later criticised the Irish government for delays in processing the visa application of one student, who wished to return to Ireland after his release from prison in China. The coverage of the case in the *Irish Independent* did not reach the same momentum both in terms of quantity and quality of coverage, as only the *IT* championed the cause from January 2000 when it brought the issue to public attention:

> THREE Chinese students taking courses in Dublin have been prevented from returning from China to Ireland after the New Year holiday, apparently because of activities as practitioners of the Falun Gong movement.
>
> One has been detained by police, and two are under house arrest, according to a Dublin-based Falun Gong member, Ms Dai Dongxue from Shandong Province, a Microsoft employee in Dublin.
>
> [...]
>
> Details of the three students' cases were given by Ms Dai in a letter to the Department of Foreign Affairs on January 20th. "We want the Irish Government to ask the Chinese government to let them come back to study in Ireland and keep a normal life," she said yesterday in Dublin.
>
> A department official said: "These are Chinese citizens at home in China and we have no jurisdiction in the matter."
>
> However, the Department had raised concerns about the treatment of Falun Gong in the context of bilateral exchanges, he said, most recently in December when a senior Department official, Mr Tom Bolster, met Chinese officials in Dublin.
>
> [...]
>
> The student held in prison is Ms Yang Fang, an accountancy student in a Dún Laoghaire college, was arrested [sic] by police on December 19th when staying in a friend's home in Beijing with three other Falun Gong practitioners from the UK. […][825]

In contrast to the anonymous coverage of Chinese students as economic units, this article gave them a face by presenting their individual fates and at the same time giving them a voice. At the beginning of the article, the students' nationality was mentioned, but in this case it was not irrelevant because their status as Chinese nationals played a part in the Irish government's

[822] For a background on Falun Gong cf. e.g. BBC h2g2 (2004); BBC NEWS (1999) or HEBERER (2001)
[823] HEBERER (2001)
[824] FOCUS MAGAZIN (2005)
[825] O'CLERY (25/01/00)

reluctance or inability to officially object to the treatment of the three students. All three students were later introduced by their names and as students at Irish institutes of higher education as the example of Yang Fang above illustrated. Supported by a letter to the editor by the Students' Union President of Trinity College Dublin, the students were portrayed in a much more inclusive way than in distanced referrals to economic benefits of international students as demonstrated above:

> Mr Ming studies in Trinity College as a postgraduate in the networks and telecommunications group of our computer science department and is a valuable and respected member of our postgraduate community.[826]

Such an explicit inclusion of Chinese students in part of the Irish society – TCD's postgraduate community, was rare in the portrayal of Chinese nationals in Ireland. What is more, despite the coverage of individual fates, the article did not present human interest stories reduced to "tear jerkers,"[827] which acted as an indicator for factual, non-sensationalist coverage of the case. The sample article above also showed, that Dai Dongxue was presented in an expert role and that her account of the event was not supported by a quotation by a member of the in-group. Hence, she was portrayed as the holder of information, thereby bestowing authority in her position. This pattern was confirmed throughout all articles covering the event with an almost balanced quotation pattern of 8 quotes by members of the in-group and 7 quotes by members of the out-group respectively.

In later articles, some elements of positive self-representation could be identified, for example when there was a focus on reporting that Irish students marched in support for "jailed Zhao" while the co-organisers, Amnesty International and Falun Gong followers, were only named towards the end of the article.[828] Another example was the laudation of the role which the Irish government allegedly played in the release of the students:

> [Mr Feng Liu] had subsequently been detained in a labour camp by the Chinese authorities. As a result of pressure, in which the Irish Government had played a part, he had been released. Mr Liu wished to return to Ireland, with his wife, to resume his life and his studies here.[829]

Another point of somewhat ambivalent coverage was the introduction of Falun Gong, which interchangeably was referred to as "[combining] breathing exercises with elements of

[826] MADIGAN (28/01/00)
[827] MCGREGOR
[828] HUMPHREYS (20/11/00)
[829] WALSH (09/07/04); CULLEN (22/05/04)

Buddhism,"[830] a "Buddhist movement,"[831] an "outlawed spiritual movement"[832] or simply "a religion".[833] None of these references was wrong, but they all failed to give an inclusive definition. Furthermore, not a single article addressed the questionable role of the leader, Li Hongzhi. On the other hand, by not paying attention to the more bizarre elements of Falun Gong (e.g. supernatural powers and immortality[834]), the three Chinese students were not represented as alien subjects following an obscure cult. Irrespective of the more questionable characteristics, the *IT* had chosen to support the campaign to highlight human rights breaches in China on the basis that those affected had been studying in Ireland. Through this support, the newspaper allowed the three students to move closer to the centre of Irishness than many of their anonymous compatriots, thus giving the often "invisible and distant"[835] Chinese a voice.

Despite some shortcomings, *The Irish Times* did take an almost unique position in making public the dire situation of three Chinese living and studying in Ireland. The nature of coverage supported earlier findings in this study that individual high-profile cases were usually presented in a sympathetic light (cf. ch. 9.1). On the other hand, this case was different to earlier examples because individual accounts of Chinese immigrants usually did not have a high chance of making it into the news, to which the silence in the *II* and *IS* testified. What is more, the fact that *The Irish Times* followed the story over a time span of four years demonstrated a genuine interest in the fate of the students. The case also illustrated that access to the media played a major role in migrants' chances to be portrayed as individuals, which in this example had a direct influence on migrants' life chances. Without slipping into the realm of speculation, if *The Irish Times* had not decided to give a voice to the supporters of the three students, the Irish public may never have learnt about their imprisonment and the campaign may have taken a less successful turn. Ultimately, the nature of coverage in the Falun Gong case in the *IT* contributed to the verification of hypotheses D 1 and D 2, stating that *The Irish Times'* coverage was of a higher quality than that of the *Irish Independent* and *The Irish Sun*.

9.4 Chinese immigrants – a model minority?

In comparison with the other two immigrant groups covered in this study, Chinese clearly had the smallest chance of finding access to the media. Across all four periods they were mentioned in 320 articles whereas Nigerians accounted for 720 and Poles for 431. Particularly

[830] O'CLERY (25/01/00)
[831] HUMPHREYS (11/05/00)
[832] ANONYMOUS (28/11/00); ANONYMOUS (11/10/00); CULLEN (22/05/04); BRÉADÚN (12/05/04)
[833] ORAM (27/11/04)
[834] HEBERER (2001), pp. 6 and 13
[835] WANG

in *The Irish Sun* tabloid this immigrant group was hardly discussed at all (Table 12). According to King-O'Riain, the low interest in this group could be explained by the assertion that Chinese were a quiet, hard-working model minority that remained unnoticed by members of the in-group:

> […] portrayals of both Chinese people in Ireland and of China itself cast the Chinese in Ireland as a 'model minority' (Chou and Feagin 2008). This image of a quite [sic], polite, hardworking, but exploitable population dehumanizes Chinese migrants and pits them against other migrants in Ireland. This image in Ireland may be shifting as Chinese migration to Europe has shifted in the last ten years with increasing migration flows that are unregulated and associated commercially with poor working conditions and trafficking in Europe such as the case in Morecambe Bay in the UK (Pieke 2007). This myth, however, casts Chinese migrants as the 'model' for other migrants to follow, allows for an implicit and racializing comparison between 'deserving' (Chinese) and 'undeserving' (Nigerian) migrants in Ireland.[836]

This characterisation borrows from Foucault's biopolitics insofar as it claims that Nigerians are cast as undeserving migrants and therefore elements from which society has to be protected (also cf. above) whereas Chinese as deserving migrants enjoy the privilege of being ascribed positive characteristics although they are not awarded full membership in Irishness. As discussed earlier, the *Student* role often represented Chinese as economic units, but did not link them to diligent work or similar frames that were suitable for a characterisation as a model minority. Chinese students only arrived in large numbers after 2001, though, after the Irish government had introduced work-study visas and actively encouraged Chinese to come and study in this country (see above). These findings indicated that the image of Chinese may indeed have been shifting as King-O'Riain has noted. I therefore wondered whether the model minority frame could be found in roles that were more closely linked to the working world. In that case, the resulting deserving-undeserving dichotomy could potentially confirm my general hypothesis that some immigrant groups were presented in a more positive light than others (Hypotheses G 1 to G 3).

In order to test the model minority hypothesis, those articles in which Chinese were linked to the working world were extracted. This was the case when they were portrayed as either employees / labourers or business people. Since both primary and secondary roles were considered, the large number of Chinese students who worked in part-time jobs was included. In addition to roles, business related topics (*Contribute to Economy, Employed in Public Sector, Economic Need for Migration and Exploitation / Working Conditions*) found consideration as well. The articles thus extracted were examined for the use of the model minority frame, which

[836] KING-O'RIAIN (2011), p. 205-6

was found to be evident when Chinese were stereotypically presented as being quiet, polite, hardworking and / or exploitable. However, if a member of the Chinese community was mentioned as an employee in the service industry without any further attributes, the model minority frame was not coded since such a representation did not set members of the Chinese community apart from members of other immigrant communities (such as Poles employed in the service industry).

Ultimately, the model minority frame could be identified in 7 articles or just little over 2 per cent of all articles concerning Chinese. The closest application was found in a Kevin Myers editorial in *The Irish Times* which represented a racist rant on the travelling community in Ireland. In crude generalisations and one-sided views on members of the travelling community he used techniques of othering and portrayed Travellers as an undeserving "category of people" who exploited the Irish welfare system with the support of the state.[837] In a twist of the frame in an Irish setting, he contrasted the Chinese community as a positive example:

> Nearly three quarters of Traveller men are officially unemployed, yet Dublin has imported 30,000 Chinese people in the past five years – not one of whom, I bet, is on the dole.[838]

The juxtaposition of Travellers and Chinese served the purpose of characterising Chinese as deserving immigrants who, in a Foucauldian sense, belonged to those who through their economic contribution to society set themselves apart from the undesired, from those who needed to be killed (cf. above). Yet, this inclusion in Irishness was based on the condition that they contributed to society and could therefore be removed anytime, for example when Chinese would find themselves in a situation in which they required society's support (i.e. unemployment benefit). Moreover, this application of the model minority frame resorted to the hard-working model minority frame and represented the Chinese community as a homogenous mass devoid of any individual characteristics. The brevity of his reference also underlined the portrayal of Chinese as an "invisible and distant group."[839] Yet, this portrayal had little to do with real life experiences of Chinese immigrants in Ireland, particularly the newer arrivals who came on work-study visas. These were allowed to work for a maximum of 20 hours per week during term time.[840] However, non-EEA students did not qualify for social welfare payments

[837] The travelling community in Ireland is one of the most socially excluded minorities. Unemployment is high and educational achievement is low. They have a very low standard of living and a considerably lower life expectancy than the settled Irish majority. Support groups such as Pavee Point call for a more concerted approach to support the travelling community and increase their life chances. Cf. for example PAVEE POINT TRAVELLER'S CENTRE (2010)
[838] MYERS (13/10/04)
[839] WANG, p. 4
[840] Cf. for example WANG (2006), pp. 23-4 or FELDMAN (2008), p. 63

and therefore, naturally, could not appear in official statistics. Thus, Myers's reference was exposed as an unfitting, ill-informed and de-humanising portrayal of Chinese immigrants. At the same time, the quantitative analysis has shown that this was a rare and untypical representation of the Chinese community in Ireland.

In four of the remaining articles a reference to the model minority frame was made, but the overall portrayal was more differentiated so that the articles in their entirety qualified the frame and were consequently not de-humanised characterisations of Chinese immigrants. For example, in its *The new Irish* series in 2004, *The Irish Times* presented the biggest immigrant groups in Ireland, portraying Chinese in Ireland on 18 May 2004.[841] The article opened with a member of the second generation Chinese reflecting on the early years when there were only few Chinese in Ireland, which was a reference to those Chinese immigrants who came in the 1950s and 1960s. Placing 'old' Chinese immigrants at the beginning of the article gave them more prominence and thus counteracted the assumed invisibility of that group.[842] On the other hand, it confirmed the invisibility of the old Chinese generation because only then, with the arrival of large numbers of students, did this immigrant group awaken the media's interest. The article went on to introduce the more recent arrivals, mainly students who wanted to learn English and work.

> These days there are between 40,000 and 50,000 Chinese in Ireland, making them one of the largest ethnic minorities in the country. Most of the new arrivals are Chinese students on work-study visas. They plan to stay for a few years, learn English and earn money in mostly low paid-jobs in the service industry.[843]

Mostly was used as a modifier that tried to avoid an over-generalisation, and left room for Chinese being employed in different lines of work, thereby acting as an indicator for the author's considerate approach to the portrayal of newer Chinese arrivals. A differentiated portrayal of the Chinese community in Ireland was further supported in the next paragraph in which a Chinese general practitioner in her role as founder of the Irish Chinese Information Centre was quoted in relation to her experience with Chinese students in Ireland:

> In the basement offices of the Irish Chinese Information Centre, on Fitzwilliam Square in Dublin, a steady stream of students arrive for advice on accommodation, visas and other issues. "For most of them it's their first time leaving home and their first time abroad," says Dr Katherine Chan Mullen, a GP and a founder of the centre.[844]

[841] O'BRIEN (18/05/04)
[842] YAU (2007), p. 57
[843] O'BRIEN (18/05/04)
[844] O'BRIEN (18/05/04)

This double characterisation in her professional role as GP and volunteer in the information centre was unusual. In all 166 articles focusing on Chinese solely, only 9 primary and 2 secondary representations of Chinese as professionals or experts could be identified. On the other hand, in comparison with the other two immigrant groups considered in this study, Chinese had the highest chance of being portrayed as experts in primary roles, albeit at overall low absolute figures. In 154 articles in which Chinese and other immigrant groups were discussed, there were 1 primary and 4 secondary role allocations as experts / professionals. The discussion of volunteers in all 320 articles combined was even lower with 2 primary role allocations and no secondary one (Table 8). As the number of articles was very low, generalisations were difficult; however, primary role allocations as expert and / or professionals were more frequent in 2004 (4) and 2010 (4) with only 1 each in 1997 and 2000 (Table 83). Although the low number of articles did not allow the identification of a general trend, these results may have been a hint towards more media attention being paid to Chinese in professional roles and in academia with the arrival of the considerably larger group of Chinese on study-work visas and the accompanying media interest.

Only then did the article resort to the model minority frame. A Chinese student at University College Dublin was giving her thoughts on how she adapted to and felt about life in Ireland:

> Under the work-study visas Chinese students are entitled to work for up to 20 hours a week. They are now a common sight across counters in Spars, Centras, pubs and takeaways in Dublin and cities around the country.
>
> "I think we work very hard," she says. "In China competition is very tough, so people will always work hard. I sometimes hear that maybe Irish students working in part-time jobs might come to work late and maybe be a little lazy," she laughs. "Compared with China you can earn a lot of money here, so we don't mind working hard."[845]

Two aspects in this use of the model minority frame were striking: the use of a quote and the Chinese – Irish divide with both aspects being interlinked. By using a quote, the responsibility for mentioning that the Chinese may have been more diligent than the Irish was transferred to the Chinese student who had been interviewed. Furthermore, four moderators were used in the quote: *think*, *sometimes*, *maybe* and *a little*. It could be argued that this was a literal quote of the Chinese student's words, but there was no way to verify or falsify this. If this was the case, either the student's politeness or hesitance stopped her from being more direct; if not, the author of the article used a mitigation technique to make this statement easier

[845] O'BRIEN (18/05/04)

to digest for an Irish readership, allowing every reader not to feel addressed. Yet, the decisive aspect was that the author decided to use a quote since he could just as well have used a reporting style omitting agency. Moreover, he decided to use this snippet from the interview with the student, which was a conscious decision to portray her in this way. The use of the verb *think* made the statement a personal opinion, reinforcing the transfer of responsibility to the one who was quoted. The student was framed as criticising the Irish work ethos, and in turn the Chinese were implicitly blamed for working too hard.

The issue of Chinese employees working too hard could also be identified in an *Irish Independent* article:

> Legislation allows foreign students to work 20 hours a week but it's not uncommon for cash-strapped Chinese students to double-job, often for less than minimum wage … While asylum seekers are derided by many for not working, the hard-working young Chinese people here are disliked for the opposite reason, for working too hard, with some of them taking on numerous jobs.[846]

This section of the article was ambivalent as it did not become clear whether Chinese were blamed for double-jobbing and working for less than minimum-wage or whether the intention was to reveal the often deplorable working conditions in the low-pay sector. Neither was the link between low wages and the economic need to accept several jobs discussed. The opposition of Irish legislation and 'reality' placed Chinese students outside the law and criminalised them. What is more, by setting Chinese against asylum seekers, we find a further interpretation of the model minority frame and a confirmation of the hierarchisation of races.

However, in both articles the use of the model minority frame was, at least partially, qualified in subsequent paragraphs. In *The Irish Times* article a third generation Chinese, at the time a student at Portobello College, was given the opportunity to voice his opinion.

> But for David Lee's Irish-born son Edwin, a 20-year-old student at Portobello College, the sight of young Chinese in almost exclusively low-paid jobs does not always sit easy.
>
> "I feel a little embarrassed," he says. "It does give the impression that all Chinese are good for are [sic] these jobs. I do feel bad about it, especially when I'm on the other side of the counter to them at McDonald's or wherever." And the Chinese work ethic, combined with the language barrier, often means workers are open to exploitation.[847]

In this portrayal of the third generation Chinese-Irish student, the author remained ambivalent. The interviewee conceded that many Chinese were employed in the low paid service industry, but he was also adamant that this was a mis-representation of the Chinese

[846] ANONYMOUS (20/01/04)
[847] O'BRIEN (18/05/04)

community. He even felt *embarrassed* about the impression that all Chinese worked in the low-paid service industry. This statement alone raised the impression that he distanced himself from the newer immigrant generation by setting himself apart. This was a phenomenon already described by Yau:

> It was vital for those of the second generation who had connections with Hong Kong to emphasise this and draw a distinction between people with origins in the Mainland, who were often represented in a negative light.[848]

The interviewee was in a position that allowed him to feel embarrassed about those employed in the service industry. His social position gave him the opportunity to be "proud to identify with both the Irish and Chinese community." On the one hand such illustrations of hybrid identities could be interpreted as successful integration and membership in Irishness. On the other hand, they showed that newer arrivals did not have the same chance of being included and therefore remained more distant from the core of society. Yet, the same paragraph also contained a reference to the possible exploitation of newer arrivals from China, but the source of the information remained unreferenced. If the student was the source, this reference was suitable to qualify his previous remark of feeling embarrassed. If not, it added to the divide between older and newer generations of Chinese immigrants.

The references to David Lee, his son and Dr Chan Mullen testified to more multifaceted portrayals of Chinese in Ireland instead of solely stereotypical representations; and although the model minority frame was referred to at various points in the article, it was not so determinative that it was characteristic for the article in its entirety, which was representative for the more general results of the test of the model minority frame. The quantitative analysis has shown that the model minority frame was only rarely employed. Moreover, when it was used, it was often qualified. A general dichotomy of deserving Chinese and undeserving other immigrant groups (e.g. Nigerians) as suggested by King-O'Riain could not be established in this part of the study.

***

The results in this chapter delivered an ambivalent picture of the portrayal of Chinese immigrants in Ireland, and in terms of power relations and a suspected hierarchy of races, it seems difficult to assess where Chinese migrants are to be positioned. Chinese were predominantly portrayed as students, and in this role the revenue frame featured frequently,

[848] YAU (2007)

reducing them to de-individualised economic units. Only in *The Irish Times* was this portrayal somewhat countered in the coverage of three Falun Gong members, which showed a genuine interest in the fate of Chinese individuals. Moreover, a stereotypical portrayal of the Chinese community as a model minority could not be demonstrated in this study, and Chinese had the highest chance of being represented as experts amongst all three immigrant groups, albeit at very low overall numbers. At the same time, Chinese were clearly least likely to attract media attention, particularly in *The Irish Sun* tabloid, in which Chinese immigrants did virtually not appear.

Although the representation of Chinese students as economic units did not render them undeserving migrants, they remained generally excluded from the core of Irishness and membership was limited to a serving function within the revenue frame at the margins of societal consensus. The lower frequency of coverage of Chinese in general and particularly the frequent limitation of Chinese students to a business context represented a form of limited access to communication and thus created a form of domination that could not be compensated by the very few portrayals as experts. In conclusion, a hierarchy of races (hypothesis D) could not be demonstrated in an unambiguous fashion. Hypotheses C and D, relating to a hierarchy of frequency of coverage and hierarchy of quality of coverage, were verified, though.

10 Conclusion

This study has shown that there was by no means an unambiguous and definitive, mono-causal answer to the question of power relations in Irish society. With recourse to Foucault, truth is not the result of liberal, independent thought but each society accepts certain types of discourse which construct truth.[849] Within a state, there is a multiplicity of discourses by a variety of actors, amongst them the media, whose intersections and ruptures form what is accepted as truth. In this study, this multiplicity of discourses was exposed in the differing portrayals of the three immigrant groups considered but also by the varying approaches in the three newspapers.

10.1 Portrayal of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in the Irish media

As expected in hypotheses A and B, specific roles and topics in which the individual immigrant groups were frequently portrayed could be identified in this study. Although the frequency of these roles and topics informed the discussion of how Poles, Nigerians and Chinese were presented in the Irish print media, the interpretation was not always a straight forward affair because seemingly positive roles did not automatically lead to the creation of a more favourable image as the focus on the revenue frame in Chinese students demonstrated. Nevertheless, in line with hypothesis G, the portrayal of immigrants in the three newspapers did suggest a hierarchy of races to be evident albeit not as a desired – undesired dichotomy but rather as gradations on a scale. In analogy to Foucault's assertion that the modern state in its attempt to optimise life has construed a hierarchy of races in which some are worthy of protection and others are to be eliminated,[850] media discourse placed visible minorities at the lower end whereas the non-visible minority enjoyed a more favourable portrayal. However, notwithstanding the confirmation of a hierarchy of races, none of the three immigrant groups was portrayed in an exclusively favourable fashion and none was awarded unconditional, full membership in Irishness. This was most pronounced in *The Irish Sun* tabloid and least pronounced in *The Irish Times* broadsheet. Power relations, according to Foucault, are relations of actions upon free, acting subjects. Arguably, all members of the three immigrant groups considered in this study were free subjects. Yet, apart from questions of representations as outlined above, migrants' economic disposition also played a decisive role in determining their

[849] FOUCAULT (1980), p. 131
[850] FOUCAULT (2003a), pp. 255-6

degree of freedom and chances of taking part in and contributing to society.[851] In this respect, Poles could be considered the freest immigrant group, followed by Chinese and Nigerians.

Poles as a non-visible minority had a much higher, but by no means exclusive, chance of being represented in a sympathetic light than Nigerians or Chinese as illustrated in the disproportionate portrayal in victim roles or the higher chance of emotional coverage in resident roles. Moreover, they were rarely framed in racist representations and their arrival was virtually never presented as a crisis. Despite the fact that the allocation of the victim status was conditional and that Poles were over-represented as (potential) criminals (albeit to a lesser extent than Nigerians) in conjunction with an over-representation of person crimes, they, as the perceived culturally closest immigrant group, had the highest chance of being considered worthy migrants and the lowest chance of being cast as undeserving. At the same time, the overall mostly positive portrayal of this immigrant group failed to recognise the problems which immigrants faced. Media discourse therefore construed an image of Poles that emphasised similarities between the Irish and Poles without sufficiently approaching critical aspects in the majority group's position on this immigrant group.

Nigerians were predominantly portrayed in the negatively perceived role of asylum seekers.[852] Moreover, particularly in the first two periods, the arrival of Nigerian asylum seekers was frequently framed as a flood and thus presented as a crisis and an insurmountable burden to the Irish state, if to varying degrees in different newspapers. Yet, in contrast to earlier studies on asylum seekers, a media campaign of casting Nigerian asylum seekers as welfare scroungers could not be demonstrated. This result was in line with the general observation that media coverage tended to be more favourable when individuals or individual members were covered and less favourable when it focused on immigrants as an anonymous mass. The replacement of social welfare entitlements with the direct provision system perhaps influenced the portrayal. Nigerians were also more likely to be represented as (potential) criminals than Poles or Chinese, and although a direct link of asylum seekers from Nigeria to criminal roles could not be demonstrated, perpetrator / suspect roles were most frequent when the number of Nigerian asylum seekers arriving in Ireland peaked. Hence, an indirect link was certainly evident. Nigerians were also most likely to be linked to racist coverage but under-represented as victims both of racism and person or property crimes. Despite frequent representations of Nigerians as

[851] Cf. for example Monika Albrecht who is an advocate of a position that the economic disposition alongside culture determines power relations and people's life chances: ALBRECHT (2008)
[852] Cf. PRIETO RAMOS (2004)

undeserving, as objects that had to be eliminated through deportation in an attempt to sanitise society,[853] not all coverage was of such a negative nature. *The Irish Times'* much more balanced portrayal, as evidenced in the critical approach to Ireland's deportation policy or the critical investigation of racism in society following the death of Toyosi Shittabey, demonstrated that media discourse did not generally support (negative) government discourse.

Finally, Chinese immigrants had the smallest chance of being covered by the media and the nature of their portrayal in the most frequent role was less overt than in Poles and Nigerians. In this regard, the assumption of a distant and invisible minority could be confirmed.[854] As students in third level education and as residents, the revenue frame cast them in economic terms, welcoming international students and immigrants not for the benefits of cultural contributions but for the income they generated, resulting in a de-humanised representation as economic units. On the other hand, the truncated, stereotypical portrayal as a model minority could not be demonstrated in this study. A focus on high-profile individual cases as found in both other groups was limited to the coverage of the fate of three Falun Gong members in *The Irish Times*. Additionally, notwithstanding the fact that the Chinese community has been present in Ireland for half a century, only the arrival of Chinese students in greater numbers in the early 2000s turned the media interest towards the long established Chinese community. Overall, the portrayal of Chinese in Ireland rendered them neither deserving nor undeserving, but positioned them in a serving function that did not extend full membership in Irishness.

10.2 Newspapers

In addition to the varying chances of the three immigrant groups to be portrayed in a favourable light, the findings in this study also suggested that the approach to covering members of an out-group depended a great deal on the newspaper in which an article was published. This became evident in the varying frequencies of coverage of immigrants, the differing likelihoods of racist coverage and, consequently, the diverging quality of reporting in the three newspapers, generally confirming hypotheses C, D and F.

The Irish Times was found to be covering Poles, Nigerians and Chinese most frequently although the gap between the *IT* and the *II* followed a converging trend in the last two periods. At the same time, this newspaper was also least likely to employ othering techniques as expressed in the likelihood of using a flood metaphor or to engage in racist coverage. It was

[853] Cf. Foucault's concept of biopolitics: FOUCAULT (2003a)
[854] WANG

clearly most likely to investigate contentious topics in a critical, usually non-sensationalist manner and received the lowest share of articles with a negative connotation. Moreover, articles with a negative connotation had to be seen in a context of providing a platform for the presentation and exchange of various opinions, which was particularly evident in its letters to the editor section. Confirming Mac Éinrí's findings of 2001, the *IT* could be characterised as "present[ing] a fair, balanced and critical coverage of immigration issues".[855]

The same could not be said for the *Irish Independent*, the second broadsheet in this study, whose general quality of coverage fell short of the *IT's*. Within the quality paper genre, the *II* was only moderately more likely to employ a flood metaphor or to engage in racist coverage than the *IT*, but it had a distinctly higher chance of receiving a negative connotation and showed little enthusiasm for critical journalism, both supported by a more sensationalist style. Moreover, the selection of letters to the editor did not suggest that this paper provided the opportunity for open debate as in *The Irish Times* and raised the impression that editors gave anti-immigrant views a higher preference. This quality paper was therefore more prepared to present migrants as undeserving and less willing to extend Irishness to members of an out-group.

Notwithstanding the differences between the two newspapers in the quality genre, the divide between the broadsheets and the tabloid *Irish Sun* was far more pronounced. This newspaper frequently presented the arrival of immigrants as a crisis and every fifth article held racist views. Furthermore, the coverage in the tabloid was reduced to those events that provided a high potential for sensationalist exploitation, eschewing the critical exploration of contested issues almost entirely. The portrayal of immigrants remained truncated, one-sided, often xenophobic and supported exclusionary practices.

These differences in the portrayal of immigrants and immigrant related issues in the individual newspapers demonstrated that there was not one unalterable image of immigrants but that the application of exclusionary practices, and thus expressions of domination, varied depending on the immigrant group and the newspapers' general stances.

10.3 Outlook

The results in this study have shown that only the combination of quantitative and qualitative approaches produced meaningful results, confirming the general research design.

[855] MAC ÉINRÍ (2001a)

Nevertheless, some aspects that seemed suitable for the aims and requirements of this study may require adaption for future projects. Since 2010, the last period considered in this study, unemployment has remained high and public debt has soared as a consequence of the bank bailout scheme and the ensuing recession.[856] The setup of immigrant groups has also changed since the start of this study. Whereas the number of Nigerians and (documented) Chinese has remained relatively stable, Indians are now the largest Asian group in the country, and Poles have passed the British as the largest immigrant group overall.[857]

Moreover, this study was devised in such a way that the time span covered early net immigration through to the initial years of recession. Although this design delivered results that traced the development of the coverage of all three immigrant groups, in the case of Polish migrants the picture seems to be incomplete. At the start of this study it could not be foreseen that Poles would be the largest immigrant group, even ahead of the British, by 2011. Moreover, the low coverage of this group in 2004 compared to the emphasis on Poles in 2010 resulted in findings that did not represent longitudinal developments to the same extent as in the case of Nigerians and Chinese. Therefore, analysing the portrayal of this immigrant group in the years following this study may yield a more inclusive picture.

In a potential follow-up study I would expect Poles to be portrayed in a more varied fashion than in the present one. Since the strong emphasis on Poles as victims was a result of the enormous media coverage of the murder trial following the deaths of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos, this portrayal is expected to be a once-off effect. Furthermore, despite their status as a culturally close, non-visible minority, Poles, who are predominantly employed in the low to medium skilled sector, will certainly be the subject of more critical if not (latently) racist coverage. Against the backdrop of a slow economic recovery and continuing high unemployment rates in conjunction with the ensuing competition for economic resources, calls for Poles "to go home" will presumably no longer be the expressions of individuals only.[858]

Although Nigerians remain to be the largest African immigrant group in Ireland, I expect less intense media coverage of this immigrant group in the future because of the distinctly lower

[856] THE ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RESEARCH INSTITUTE (2010)
[857] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 7. These statistics do not consider the considerable number of unregistered Chinese living in Ireland.
[858] In the introduction to their book on Polish-Irish relations, Sabine Egger and John McDonagh argued that Poles who stayed in Ireland despite the financial crisis and increasing unemployment "are seen as taking advantage of Irish social welfare, provoking calls from public figures that they should be 'sent home'". However, this claim is based on demands by a single politician in one newspaper article. EGGER and MCDONAGH (2011), p. x

number of Nigerian asylum seekers arriving in the country. On the other hand, I do not see many signs that would warrant a generally more positive portrayal of this visible minority group in the immediate and medium-term future, supporting a stable level of latent racism in the country. Merely the nature of negative and racist coverage will be less overt as the development in the *Irish Independent* in the latter periods has shown.

Likewise, there is little to suggest that the portrayal of Chinese immigrants will be subject to change. What is more, if the same research design was followed, Indians as the now largest Asian immigrant group would have to be included in a follow-up project. Because of their different economic disposition being employed in the high-skill sector of Human Health and Social Work Activities,[859] it is unlikely that this visible immigrant group will be the target of exclusionary portrayals to the same extent as Chinese or Nigerians.

The established pattern of newspaper characteristics is also unlikely to change. Although a converging trend in the quality papers was demonstrated in this study, differences are expected to remain. As indicated in the analysis of the latter periods, the *Irish Independent's* coverage will presumably be of a less overtly negative nature although racist notes and exclusionary strategies are expected to prevail in subtle undercurrents. In contrast, *The Irish Times* will continue to present the overall most balanced coverage of immigrant related matters in Ireland. In the tabloid section, the stable sensationalist nature of the *The Irish Sun's* coverage in the present study suggests that this will continue to be a hallmark of its future reporting style.

Judging from the results of this research project, the chance-or-crisis character will vary reflecting the established hierarchy of standard. Yet, no paper will be likely to redefine the rules of belonging in such a way that it extends unconditional, full membership in Irishness to any of the newer migrant groups.

[859] CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a), p. 20

11 Code book and coding instructions

11.1 Code book

Identification number	SPSS name	Code	Coding instruction
Identification number	ID		Number assigned to each sample
Newspaper	Paper	1	Irish Times
		2	Irish Independent
		3	Irish Sun
Date	Date		dd.mm.yy
Type of article	Type	1	Article
		2	Editorial / opinion
		3	Letter to the editor
		4	Front page
		5	Reference on front page
Length of article	Length	1	Short - <100 words
		2	Medium - 101-300 words
		3	Long - 301-500 words
		4	Extensive - >501 words

Variable	SPSS name	Code	Coding instruction
Group	Group	1	Polish
		2	Nigerian
		3	Chinese
		11	Polish and other groups
		22	Nigerians and other groups
		33	Chinese and other groups

Role allocated	SPSS name	Code	Coding instruction
Primary role	RoleOutA	1	Refugee
Secondary role	RoleOutB	2	Asylum seeker
		3	Economic migrant
		4	Illegal immigrant
		5	Immigrant general
		6	Politician
		8	Administrative body
		9	Guard
		10	Judiciary
		11	Union
		12	Employer
		13	Employee /general worker, labourer
		14	Activist / volunteer
		15	Expert / professional
		16	Church
		17	Entrepreneur / business people
		18	Member of the public / resident
		19	Student
		20	Perpetrator
		21	Victim
		22	Suspect
		23	Journalist
		24	Artists etc.
		25	Prostitutes
		26	Homeless
		27	Unemployed
		99	Other

Variable	SPSS name	Code	Coding instruction
Primary topic	TopA	1	Cultural contribution
Secondary topic	TopB	2	Discrimination
Tertirary topic	TopC	3	Identity
		4	Racism and xenophobia
		5	Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland
		6	Need for majority group to change
		7	Contribution to social welfare
		8	Exploitation of welfare system
		9	Living conditions general
		10	Burden to the state
		11	Call for more restrictive legislation
		12	Call for more liberal legislation
		15	Contribute to economy
		16	Employed in public sector
		17	Economic need for immigration
		18	Exploitation / working conditions
		19	Crime / illicit behaviour / misconduct
		20	Court cases
		21	Deportation
		22	Education (primary / secondary level)
		23	Third level education
		24	Further education
		25	Student performance
		26	Immigration policy
		27	Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants
		28	Wrong doing Irish side
		29	Entry to the state
		30	Rejection of immigrants at border
		31	Accidents
		32	Prostitution
		99	Other

Variable	SPSS name	Code	Coding instruction
Headline	Head	1	Positive
		2	Negative / focus on a problem
		3	Neutral / Undecided
		4	Raising a critical question
		5	Undecided / no headline
Relevant group focus of article	Focus	1	Yes
		2	No
		3	Undecided
Racism	Racist	1	Yes
		2	No
		3	Undecided
Flood Metaphor	Flood	1	Yes
		2	No
Quotation pattern	QuotIn	0	0 quotes
	QuotOut	1	1 quote
		2	2 quotes
		3	3 quotes
		4	4 quotes
		5	5 quotes
		Etc.	Etc.
Evaluation	Eval		
		1	Positive
		2	Negative / focus on a problem
		3	Neutral / balanced
		4	Raising critical questions
		5	Undecided
Irrelevant reference to nationality	Nat		
		1	Yes
		2	No

11.2 Coding instructions

ID

Every article is assigned a unique identification number starting with 1 and counted consecutively in steps of 1.

Newspaper

The Irish Times refers to all editions (Monday – Saturday) of the national newspaper of the years 1997, 2000, 2004 and 2010 published in Dublin as archived in the *ProQuest* database.

The *Irish Independent* refers to all editions (Monday – Saturday) of the national newspaper of the years 1997, 2000, 2004 and 2010 published in Dublin as archived in the *Irish National Newspaper Archive.*[860]

The Irish Sun refers to all editions of the Irish subsidiary of the *The Sun* UK national newspaper of the years 1997, 2000, 2004 and 2010 as archived in the National Library in Dublin on microfiche.

If an article is illegible due to a bad scan or a missing / faulty link, this article is disregarded.

Date

The date of publication of each article is to be recorded in the dd.mm.yy format.

Type of Article

Article in this study means any editorial content other than *Editorial* and *Letter to the editor*. The length of the article is specified separately. If an article appears on the front page, *Front Page* is to be coded. If there is a short reference (less than ca. 20 words) to an article on the front page, *Reference on front page* is to be coded.

Editorial refers to all articles that are clearly marked as opinion pieces. An indicator for an opinion piece could be an opinion marker, the clear inclusion of a photo and the name of the contributor and an added e-mail address at the bottom of the contribution that invites replies. Generally though, the style of the piece shall serve as an indicator for opinion pieces.

[860] At the time of data collection, the Irish National Newspaper Archive did not hold *Irish Independent* copies for 2004. By the time of publication they were included.

Letters to the editor refers to all contributions made by readers as published in the specified section.

Length

Length refers to the length of an article measured by word count.

Group

Polish is to be recorded when there is a clear focus on Polish nationals living and / or working in Ireland, editorial or letter to the editor. This also applies to Irish residents of Polish origin but not to Irish citizens of Polish origin. However, the latter shall not apply to Irish citizens whose family moved to Ireland in the distant past unless these Irish citizens are clearly portrayed as Polish or Polish-Irish.

Nigerian national is to be recorded when there is a clear focus on Nigerian nationals living and / or working in Ireland, editorial or letter to the editor. This also applies to Irish residents of Nigerian origin. However, the latter shall not apply to Irish citizens whose family moved to Ireland in the distant past unless these Irish citizens are clearly portrayed as Nigerian or Nigerian-Irish.

Chinese national is to be recorded when there is a clear focus on Chinese national living and / or working in Ireland is mentioned in the article, editorial or letter to the editor. This also applies to Irish residents of Chinese origin. However, the latter shall not apply to Irish citizens whose family moved to Ireland in the distant past unless these Irish citizens are clearly portrayed as Chinese or Chinese-Irish.

(Polish OR Nigerian OR Chinese national) AND other immigrant groups is to be recorded when the articles focuses on more than one immigrant group.

For all groups only articles clearly relating to immigrants in modern day Ireland shall be considered. Therefore, references to deceased relatives who migrated to Ireland a long time ago shall be disregarded. Cases of foreign infant adoption by Irish parents shall not be considered. Likewise, endeavours to recruit foreign workers in Poland, Nigeria or China will not be considered unless actual migration from these countries is a result of these efforts.

Actors out-group

This category should depict the role that is allocated to the group in question. If the article focuses on more than one group (group code 11, 22, 33), the role allocation should refer to Polish, Nigerian or Chinese immigrants. The role allocated to other immigrant groups shall be neglected in this study.

Refugee is to be recorded when a refugee from Poland, Nigeria or China is mentioned in the article, editorial or letter to the editor regardless of whether the term is used correctly i.e. in correspondence to the definition outlined above or not.

Asylum seeker is to be recorded when an asylum seeker from Poland, Nigeria or China is mentioned in the article, editorial or letter to the editor regardless of whether the term is used correctly or not.

Economic migrant is to be recorded when a reference is made to economic migrants from Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor regardless of whether the term is used correctly or not.

Illegal immigrant is to be recorded when a reference is made to an allegedly illegal migrant from Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor regardless of whether the term is used correctly or not. This also applies when it is suggested that an immigrant, regardless of status, is a 'bogus' asylum seeker / refugee i.e. that he / she should not apply for refugee status.

Immigrant general is to be recorded when a reference is made to immigrants but none of the above categories can apply.

Politician is to be recorded when a reference is made to a Polish, Nigerian or Chinese national acting as a politician in Ireland in the article, editorial or letter to the editor. This excludes Polish, Nigerian or Chinese diplomats to Ireland.

Administrative body is to be recorded when a reference is made to an administrative staff whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Guard is to be recorded when a reference is made to a guard whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Judiciary is to be recorded when a reference is made to a member of the judiciary whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Member of Union is to be recorded when a reference is made to union member whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Employer is to be recorded when a reference is made to an employer whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Employee / General Worker / Labourer is to be recorded when a reference is made to an employee whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Activist is to be recorded when a reference is made to an activist in an NGO or similar group whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Expert / Professional is to be recorded when a reference is made to an expert such as academics or professionals etc. whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor. A person whose expertise is sought to support a point shall generally be regarded as the expert. This could, for example, be an academic or member of a NGO. This indicator shall also apply when immigrants' third level degrees are mentioned

Church is to be recorded when a reference is made to a church authority whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China in the article, editorial or letter to the editor.

Entrepreneur / Business People is to be recorded when a reference is made to a Polish, Nigerian or Chinese immigrant who is conducting business in Ireland in the article, editorial or letter to the editor. This excludes business people who are on a business trip to Ireland and usually operate from Poland, Nigeria and China.

Member of the Public / Resident / Citizen is to be recorded when immigrants are not portrayed as immigrants but rather as a member of the public, as a resident or as an Irish citizen. This could be a vox pop on a general issue etc.

Student is to be recorded when a reference is made to a student at any level of education whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China.

Perpetrator is to be recorded when a person whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China is presented as a perpetrator. The nature of the crime or illegal activity is irrelevant.

Victim is to be recorded when a person whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China is presented as a victim. The kind of victim is irrelevant.

Suspect is to be recorded when a person whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China is presented as a suspect. This could, for example, be a formulation such as "xx has come to the attention of the Gardaí".

Journalist is to be recorded when a reference is made to journalist whose country of origin is Poland, Nigeria or China.

Other is to be recorded when a person does not fit any of the above groups.

Topics

The discussion of topics is essential for various reasons. First and foremost, topics are what

> discourses are (globally) about; they are mostly intentional and consciously controlled by a speaker; they embody the (subjectively) most important information of a discourse, express the overall 'content' of mental models of events [...] and perhaps most importantly, they represent the meaning or information most readers will memorize best of a discourse.[861]

The underlying consideration in the selection of topics was influenced by previous studies that have shown that immigrants tend to be associated with topics that have a negative connotation such as welfare abuse or criminality.[862] This view is supported by Bloor & Bloor who point out that people generally regard their own behaviour as natural and consider alien practices aberrant.[863] However, the categorical indicators have been designed in such a way that this assumption can be falsified by allowing for the inclusion of topics that have a positive connotation e.g. the cultural contribution of the immigrant community.

There are three topic categories: Topic A, Topic B and Topic C. While A, B and C do not necessarily represent a scale, Topic A might be considered the main topic of an article whereas Topic B and Topic C might be considered sub-topics.

A main difference to role allocation is that even topics that are not directly related to Polish, Nigerian and Chinese immigrants shall be recorded. For example, if the salient topic of an article is welfare exploitation but Chinese immigrants are presented in relation to third level education, Topic A would receive value 8 (Exploitation of welfare system) and Topic B would

[861] DIJK (2009), p. 68
[862] Cf. study by Harmann and Husband cited in DIJK (2008), pp. 58-9 or PRIETO RAMOS (2004)
[863] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 128. Aberrant in this case is to be seen in a negative light.

receive value 23 (Third level education). This is done because even if Chinese students in Ireland are presented as such, the connotation to exploitation of the welfare system is still evoked in the reader. Only if the group in question is explicitly excluded shall this principle not be applied.

Culture and Society

Cultural Contribution – Immigrants contribute to the cultural life in such a way that they participate in Irish culture or enrich the same through their own cultural background etc. Cultural contribution shall be considered a comprehensive term. Thus, if for example a Nigerian is politically active, this is considered a positive cultural contribution.
Identity – The article deals with immigrants' identity in modern Ireland and attempts to shed light on the immigrants' place in society.
Discrimination –Discrimination of immigrants by the majority group or (another) minority group in Ireland is discussed in an article.
Racism and xenophobia – Racism or xenophobia in Ireland is discussed explicitly in the article.
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland – Ireland is presented as a renewed, progressive country that welcomes immigrants as part of same. Likewise, the need or call for a multicultural Ireland shall be recorded.
Need for majority group to change – The article concedes that the majority group needs to change in order to become a truly multicultural society in which immigrants are genuinely accommodated and welcomed.

Social Welfare, Health

Contribution to Social Welfare – As tax payers immigrants make a contribution to the Irish social welfare system.
Exploitation of Welfare System – Immigrants are portrayed in such a way that the impression is given that immigrants attempt to exploit the Irish welfare system.
Living Conditions general – The article sheds light on the living conditions of immigrants. This could be housing, accommodation, the financial situation, work permits etc.
(Economic) Burden – Immigrants are portrayed in such a way that the impression is given that they are a burden to the Irish state and the Irish tax payer. This could be a reference to the costs invoked by refugees and asylum seekers but also an administrative burden. However, if a reference to the costs involved is made in a neutral fashion so that the article does not give the impression that the costs are a burden to the Irish state, this category shall not be recorded.

Politics and Policy

More Restrictive Legislation – The article gives a voice to or covers demands that call for more restrictive legislation in order to be able to deal with immigration – regardless of who the source is.
More Liberal Legislation – The article gives a voice to or covers demands that more liberal legislation is needed in relation to immigration – regardless of who the source is.

Business

Contribute to Economy – Immigrants make a contribution to Irish economy.
Employed in Public Sector – The article covers the employment of immigrants in the public sector.
Economic Need for Immigration – Immigrants are needed to keep the Irish economy going.
Exploitation / Working Conditions – The article covers the exploitation of immigrant workers at the workplace or the working conditions of same.

Legal Matters

Crime / Illicit Behaviour – The article links immigrants to a crime, illicit behaviour regardless of whether as victims or perpetrators.

Court Case – The articles links immigrants to court cases regardless of whether as plaintiff or defendant.
Deportation – This indicator shall be recorded if the article covers the deportation of (failed) asylum seekers and / or illegal immigrants and / or immigrants in general.

Education

School Education – The article covers immigrants or immigrants' children respectively in the primary and secondary school system.
Third Level Education – The article covers Polish, Nigerian or Chinese students in third level at institutes of higher education.
Further Education – The article covers Polish, Nigerian or Chinese students in further education. Further education may include areas such as FÁS courses, night classes, language classes etc.

Student Performance – The article deals with student performance at all levels.

Immigration

Immigration Policy – The article covers or comments on Ireland's immigration policy.
Information on Country of Origin / Situation of Immigrants – The article gives information on the immigrants' situation in their home country i.e. it may explain reasons why people have decided to come to Ireland.
Wrong Doing Irish Side – The article highlights situations in which the Irish side has made an incorrect decision that affected the situation of immigrants. This could be the case when a court overrules a minister's decision or when Irish legislation is in breach of EU regulations etc.
Entry to the State – This includes all aspects in relation to (attempted) entries to the state.
Rejection of Immigrants – This includes all cases of rejection of immigrants be it right at the border or later on but excludes deportations.
Accident – Immigrants are linked to an accident – be it at the workplace, a traffic accident or indeed any accident in general. This sub-category would usually, but not exclusively, be expected to correlate with the role indicators victim, perpetrator, suspect.
Prostitution / Sex Trade – immigrants are linked to prostitution or the sex industry.
Other – The article deals with a topic that has not been defined above.

Headline

It is to be decided whether a headline is positive, negative / focusing on a problem, neutral or raising a critical question. A headline would usually be negative, if topic, negative wording or bold print emphasising a problem are present. The discussion in the evaluation section below can give further hints in relation to the evaluation of the headline.

Relevant Group Focus of Article

Under this category it is to be decided whether the author focuses on the relevant group. If so, *Yes* is to be encoded. However, if the relevant group is only mentioned as one of other (immigrant) groups, *No* should be encoded.

Racism

Here I attempt to establish whether (c)overt racism can be revealed in articles covering immigrants. If this category is coded *Yes*, this does not necessarily mean that the author's writing is racist by all means. However, in such a case the article may contain a statement by a politician etc. that shows a racist tendency that may not have been uncovered as such. As explained below, these racist tendencies may pass unnoticed by the journalist but contribute to the manifestation of anti-immigrant attitudes in society. Teun van Dijk has worked extensively on indicators that carry racist tendencies. These indicators will be explained below.

In *Discourse & Power* Teun van Dijk elaborates on racism in the media. In his understanding the system of racism entails a social and a cognitive subsystem. The social subsystem relates to discriminatory practices at the micro level and to power abuse by dominant groups at the macro level. As was shown above, both micro and macro levels are relevant to media analysis since discriminatory practices as well as power abuse can be carried out through discourse. The cognitive subsystem of racism entails the less visible, less obvious mental basis of racism. While not always intentional, discriminatory practices "presuppose socially shared and negatively oriented mental representations of US about Them". Due to the learnt nature of prejudices, it is even more important for the analyst to uncover the expressions of the underlying negative *Us* and *Them* representations in the media. By pointing out these expressions, members of the dominant society can be made aware of them and eventually this may contribute to changing the mind-set of the members of the (dominant) society.[864]

The decision whether an article contains elements of covert or overt racism is based on two factors. On the one hand, the UN definition of racial discrimination shall be considered:

> In this Convention, the term "racial discrimination" shall mean any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, colour, descent, or national or ethnic origin which has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing the recognition, enjoyment or exercise, on an equal footing, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural or any other field of public life.[865]

Therefore, if an article disadvantages any immigrant group based on race, colour, descent, national or ethnic origin, (*Hidden) racism* shall apply. According to Foucault's biopolitics, the

[864] For the social and cognitive subsystem of racism cf. DIJK (2008), 103
[865] Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights

modern state categorises and singles out the deviant in order to protect society.[866] Therefore, such classificatory practices need to be revealed.

Below is a list of indicators that, according to van Dijk, reveal racism in newspaper reporting. However, despite his extensive work on the subject, they need to be taken with a pinch of salt. In the chapter on methodology, I already discussed some of the controversial aspects of CDA, and van Dijk's categorical use of indicators is certainly part subject of the critique. In this study van Dijk's indicators shall sharpen the senses but factors such as context need to be taken into account as well.[867]

The article focuses on **topics** such as

- Individual cases of racism (as opposed to racism in society as a whole)
- Focus on extremist parties and groups (thus deviating from society as a whole)

- **Semantics**
  - If immigrants are represented in stereotypical ways, this is done in great detail.
  - If racism in society is covered, this is done at a general level.
- **Intertextual** dimension
  - References of members of the dominant group are presented as more trustworthy.
  - Statements about racism of members of the out-group are accredited by an in-group expert.
  - Statements of out-group members about racism are downgraded.
  - Use of the flood metaphor
- **Denial of racism** (Denying racism is a tactic of positive self presentation. This technique is usually employed by those members of the dominant group who are fully

[866] FOUCAULT (2003a), p. 256
[867] For the representation of racist views in media articles cf. DIJK (2008), pp. 106-128 and PRIETO RAMOS (2004)

aware that they may be breaking social norms when uttering negative statements about immigrants. Therefore, negative statements are often accompanied by denial techniques.)

- ‘Act-denial’ (Denying to have said / done something)
- ‘Control-denial’ (Something was said not on purpose or accidentally)
- ‘Intention-denial’ (Something was not intended to be understood in a racist way)
- ‘Goal-denial’ (Something was not said in order to achieve a racist outcome)

- Author uses **mitigation** techniques (for positive self presentation and negative presentation of the out-group)
  - Use of euphemisms
  - Use of distance markers when discussing racism (indicating that racism is a taboo topic in society)
- Justification, excuse, reversal
  - Special circumstances led to a negative act
  - The victim is provoked and / or blamed
  - Anti-racist activists and groups are being blamed for not being tolerant and allowing alternative views in society

Instances of hidden and overt racism as well as denial strategies shall contribute to a negative evaluation of an article. On the other hand, if an article addresses and / or discusses racism as a problem of society at large, the article shall be considered positive or, if applicable, raising a critical question.

Flood Metaphor

In relation to the number of foreigners arriving in Ireland, the author resorts to a flood metaphor such as influx, wave, high number etc. This category shall be recorded if a high number of asylum seekers is mentioned without putting that number into context or discussing it critically i.e. if that number is not qualified. The use of the flood metaphor in such a way that a threat is created contributes to the negative evaluation of an article. This could, for example, be the case if an article points out an influx, a wave or an apparently high number of immigrants arriving in the state, typically in conjunction with topics such as burden on the state or welfare abuse etc. In contrast, an article that dispels the myth of a flood of immigrants arriving in Ireland shall not be coded in this category despite the term being mentioned.

Quotation Pattern

This category tries to establish how many different sources are quoted in an article. Due to practical constraints, the design of this category is simplified. A source is recorded only once, irrespective of the length and number of quotations by that source in the article.[868] Ultimately, the quotation pattern shall give an indication to whom preferential access is given in the media. Preferential access to the media is one of the key conditions for social manipulation,[869] which makes it so important to study.

QuotIn refers to all quotations made by a member of the in-group whereas *QuotOut* refers to all members of the out-group. Members of the in-group are usually politicians, authorities and members of the public (i.e. Irish born citizens). Members of the out-group can generally be considered either immigrants or people who engage in pro-immigration activities. This would usually be members of NGOs etc. In this context, a quote shall also refer to indirect quotes.

Solicitors acting for immigrants are to be recorded as members of the in-group. This decision has been made as most solicitors are acting in a professional capacity and do so for a living. By no means does this definition claim that solicitors acting for immigrants are not genuinely acting in the interest of their clients. While it can be assumed that solicitors act in their clients' best

[868] Length and number of quotations are certainly indicators that can reveal a great deal of how immigrants are presented in the media. However, in the context of this study the manageability of the approach would seriously be compromised if these indicators were to be included. Hence, a simplified approach has been chosen albeit the validity of the results will be somewhat limited.
[869] Cf. for example DIJK (2008), p. 214

interest, it cannot be established what their motives for doing so are. A solicitor can, theoretically, act on behalf of a client without sharing the client's point of view.

Apart from the indicators discussed further down, the balance of quotations shall give a first hint at how an article is to be evaluated. An imbalance in favour of the in-group may contribute to a negative evaluation. However, as explained above, further indicators will be considered in the evaluation process.

Connotation

The aim of the connotation category is to provide data to decide whether newspapers report in a positive, negative or balanced fashion or whether it raises a critical question. It does so by incorporating the data in other categories (i.e. flood metaphor, racist) and by exposing underlying, often latent, ideologies in an article. At that, it is perhaps the most ambivalent category of all since indicators for a category are not easily identifiable and need to be deduced. On the one hand, this category heavily relies on the coder's interpretive skills; on the other hand, the coding instructions need to be defined in such a way that the results are reproducible. The decision on whether an article is to receive a *positive, negative, balanced* or *undecided* connotation is informed by a multitude of indicators at textual, sentence and word level (cf. ch. 3.3 to 3.3.3 for details).

If the article links immigrants to topics such as burden to the state, crime or welfare abuse, it shall be recorded as negative (unless the author clearly criticises e.g. the link of immigrants to welfare abuse). On the other hand, if the article links immigrants to topics such as cultural or economic contribution, it shall be recorded as positive.[870] If the article discusses, for instance, Ireland's immigration policy in a critical way, it shall be recorded as raising a critical question. Moreover, if a newspaper accounts for different interpretations of an event and endeavours to present views that challenge the majority group, for example by demanding a change of the dominant cultural practices, it speaks for the minority group. Consequently, it would either be recorded as positive or raising a critical question (depending on other variables). If the article discusses more than one group, for example Nigerian and Pakistani doctors, the evaluation shall be based on the representation of the groups investigated in this study (Polish, Nigerian and Chinese). The quantitative analysis of the number of articles that have been recorded as positive, negative or raising a critical question can help to shed light on the question whether Irish society can be characterised as conservative (settled) or progressive (unsettled) in terms of immigration

[870] FAIRCLOUGH (1995), pp. 64-6

and attitudes towards immigrants. It may also be employed to verify or falsify Bloor & Bloor's predication that "most discourse regarding immigration focuses on negative aspects."[871] Two further points to consider are Fairclough's chain and choice relations and how they are employed. A deviation from what actually happened to what is reported that contributes to the negative representation of immigrants shall contribute to the negative evaluation of an article.

In terms of quotations, it should be taken into account to whom access has been given to the media. The key consideration here is whether journalists allow (in-group) experts to be the sole holders of information.[872] For the out-group one further point of consideration is important. If members of the out-group are quoted as experts, it should be investigated whether their quote is supported by a member of the in-group. In such a case the out-group member's quote would be discredited, which would be a strong indicator for the application of an excluding practice. This, in turn, would contribute to coding a negative connotation. In analogy to the quotation pattern above, an article that is to receive a positive evaluation would have a balanced range of sources that also allows for contradicting views. If sources are one-sided, a negative evaluation of the articles is more likely. At the same time, the position of quotes needs to be taken into account. If out-group quotes are placed in prominent positions, this shall contribute to a positive connotation. If, out-group quotes are placed in unprominent positions, this shall contribute to a negative connotation. Likewise, if much prominence is given to the out-group in the first part of an article with contradicting in-group voices being dominant in the second part of the article, it only *appears* to be balanced and objective, which in turn would be conducive to a negative evaluation of the article. The use of non-attributed quotations or reporting verbs that have a negative connotation contribute to a negative evaluation of the article.

Further aspects are tone and register. A colloquial tone may signal solidarity with the reader or simply populist coverage that focuses on entertainment rather than reporting. In such a case a negative evaluation of the article may be justified. A high register and more formal tone could indicate a more unbiased approach to reporting and may justify a positive evaluation. A positive evaluation, however, can only be justified if the evaluation of the other categories does not suggest only apparent positive reporting with hidden bias.[873]

When it comes to authorial stance, any form of biased reporting and prejudice should be carefully analysed as it may be a contributing factor to a negative evaluation of an article.

[871] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 127
[872] For a discussion of intertextuality cf. for example BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 51-65
[873] FAIRCLOUGH (1995), p. 68-74; BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 116

Vice versa, open-minded and critical reporting where authorial stance is clearly evident as well as unbiased reporting shall be considered positive.

At sentence and word level, connotation is "a major factor in manipulating opinion" and must hence be considered in the evaluation of an article.[874] If attributions evoke a negative connotation in the reader, this would in turn be part of a negative evaluation of an article, and vice versa. In a similar fashion, the use of war (i.e. *battle* against bogus asylum seekers) and flood metaphors (i.e. *influx* of foreigners), contribute to a negative evaluation of articles.[875]

If strategies of derogation are evident in referencing, i.e. the dichotomy of self and other, the article may[876] receive a negative evaluation. Furthermore, the use of hedging and euphemisms contributes to a negative evaluation of an article.

Irrelevant Reference to Nationality

This category shall be recorded if the nationality is mentioned without an imminent reason to do so. A justifiable reference may be a case in which the article gives background information on Nigerian, Polish or Chinese asylum seekers in order to give an insight into their motives. Another such case may be the focus on the multitude of different nationalities in modern Ireland. In contrast, when a victim of a crime or a traffic accident is identified as e.g. a Polish national, this constitutes an irrelevant reference to nationality because the statement whether the victim was foreign or not does not hold any relevant informative value. Unless the reference to nationality bears importance in relation to the topic of the article, it shall contribute to a negative evaluation of the article.

Summary connotation

The following table gives an overview of the indicators in the individual categories that contribute to a positive, negative or raising a critical question connotation. As I have mentioned above, there is no singular reason to attribute a positive or negative etc. connotation to an article. That is why I frequently used modals such as *may*or might although I identified them as elements in hedging techniques (see above). Categories must be considered as interfering each other and as inter-dependent. If an article, for instance, links immigrants to a negative topic, indicators in other categories need to be cross-checked to ensure that a negative evaluation is

[874] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), pp. 129-30. Quotation p. 129
[875] BLOOR and BLOOR (2007), p. 69 For the creation of a crisis cf. HALL (1981)
[876] The use of *may* here and elsewhere in this section is used because the connotation of an article is not mono-causal and depends on a variety of indicators. Therefore, this does not present hedging.

justified. It could just as well be possible that the journalist wants to highlight that immigrants are often linked to negative topics. If indicators in other categories suggest that the journalist takes a critical approach to this issue, raising a critical question should be encoded. In other words: context is crucial.

Category	Indicator	Positive evaluation	Negative evaluation	Raising a critical question
	Cultural Contribution	A. highlights cultural contribution	Immigrants' contribution to culture is downplayed or negated.	
	Discrimination		Discrimination of immigrants is repudiated or downplayed.	A. highlights discrimination of immigrants in Ireland
	Identity	A. discusses immigrants' identity in a non-stereotypical way. Immigrants' identities are considered in an inclusive way i.e. they are not reduced to an immigrant identity.	Immigrants' identities are reduced to their stereotypical representation of immigrants.	Stereotypical portrayal of immigrants' identities is questioned and critically discussed.
	Racism and Xenophobia	The article assumes that there is racism in Ireland, whether conscious or subconscious and demands that this problem be taken seriously and that action be taken against it.	Racism and xenophobia are negated or played down (also see *Evaluation*)	A. discusses (uncovers) racism and xenophobia in a critical manner
	Multicultural Ireland	Multicultural Ireland is embraced as a positive virtue. Multiculturalism is not reduced to the economic benefit of immigrants working in Ireland.	Multicultural Ireland is met with scepticism and / or put off as a utopian / unrealistic idea	
	Need for Majority Group to change		Need for majority group to change is denounced	A. expressed a need for the majority group to change (multiculturalism as a two way process)
	Contribution to Social Welfare	Immigrants' contribution to social welfare is clearly pointed out	Immigrants' contribution to social welfare is not acknowledged and / or negated	
	Exploitation of Social Welfare System	Exploitation of welfare system is exposed as a myth / scaremongering	Exploitation of welfare system is presented as a serious problem to the state.	
	Living Conditions		Living conditions are portrayed in such a way that the impression is caused that immigrants live in luxury at the expense of the Irish tax payer.	If living conditions of immigrants are intolerable, this is highlighted as a problem. The question is raised what needs to be done by (e.g. by the state) to remedy this.

	Burden to the State	It is made clear that immigrants are not a burden to the state.	Immigrants are presented as being a burden to the state.	Claim that immigrants are a burden to the state is critically discussed.
	Call for more Restrictive Legislation	Call for more restrictive legislation is clearly denounced.	Legislative action is required by the state in order to stop / reduce immigration	A. discusses negative consequences of more restrictive legislation.
	Call for more Liberal Legislation	Legislative action is required by the state in order to improve procedures in relation to immigration and / or to make entry to the state easier.	Call for more liberal legislation is clearly denounced. The article tries to demonstrate negative consequences if immigration to Ireland was made easier.	
	Contribute to Economy	Immigrants are presented as contributors to the Irish economy across all areas i.e. not restricted to menial work and beyond the mere fact that the Irish economy depends on foreign labour. It values the expertise of non-Irish experts.		It is discussed to what extent the Irish economy and society would suffer if the expertise by non-Irish workers was lost.
	Employed in Public Sector	It is considered beneficial to Irish society at large if more immigrants were employed in the public sector.	(More) immigrants employed in the public sector are to the disadvantage of Irish society at large.	A. critically discusses the small number of immigrants employed in the public sector.
	Economic Need for Immigration	Economic need for immigration is considered an opportunity for Ireland to develop towards a multicultural society.	There is an economic need for immigration but immigrants are not welcomed as new citizens / residents. They are reduced to their role as labourers.	Critical discussion of Ireland's obligations to cater for immigrants who came because of economic need for migration.
	Exploitation / Working Conditions		Intolerable immigrants' working conditions and / or exploitation at the work place is denied or played down.	Critical discussion of immigrants' working conditions and / or exploitation at the work place.
	Crime	"Criminal nature" of immigrants is exposed as a myth.	(Repeated) linking of immigrants to crime is enforced	Repeated linking of immigrants to crime is exposed and discussed in a critical manner.
	Court Case	A court case marks a major improvement in the situation of immigrants. Strengthening of immigrants' situation is welcomed	Immigrants are presented as "trouble makers". They take to court to gain an (unfair) advantage.	(Unfair) rulings in court are exposed and discussed in a critical manner.
	Deportation	A change in the deportation policy is demanded so that fewer people are deported / deportations are carried out in a more humane way (i.e. not at midnight out of public sight).	Deportations are welcomed in order to remove 'illegal' immigrants from the state.	Necessity of deportations / the way deportations are carried out are discussed in a critical manner.
	School Education	Successful integration of immigrants in the Irish school system is highlighted. Integration is to be understood as a two way process to the (cultural) benefit of Ireland.	Immigrants are causing trouble in schools and / or are a burden to the education system"	Shortcomings in the education system to the disadvantage of immigrants are highlighted.

	Third Level Education	Successful integration of immigrants in the Irish third level education system is highlighted. Integration is to be understood as a two way process to the (cultural) benefit of Ireland. Immigrants' expertise is valued.	Immigrants are causing trouble in the third level education system and / or are a burden to the education system The benefit of foreign students is reduced to an economic benefit to the Irish third level institutes.	Shortcomings in the education system to the disadvantage of immigrants are highlighted.
	Student Performance	Students' performance contributes to the advancement of science in Ireland. Immigrants are portrayed as good / top performers.	Immigrants are portrayed as weak performers / trouble makers.	If immigrants are weak performers, a variety of possible causes are investigated. Systemic disadvantage could be one of the causes.
	Immigration Policy		Current immigration policy is considered to have a negative effect on Ireland.	Shortcomings of current immigration policy (i.e. to the disadvantage of immigrants) are highlighted.
	Information on Country of Origin / Situation of Immigrants	Motivation for immigrants to leave their home country is presented in a non-stereotypical way.	Information on countries of origin is incomplete, lacking accuracy or wrong.	Wrong perceptions of immigrants' motivation to leave their home countries are exposed as such.
	Wrong Doing Irish Side	Wrong behaviour on Irish side is revealed and a change of policy etc. is demanded.	Wrong behaviour on Irish side is negated or played down.	Wrong behaviour on Irish side is revealed in discussed in a critical manner.
	Entry to the State	Claims of immigrants 'overrunning' the country are clearly exposed as myths.	Immigrants entry to the state is presented in such a way that the impression is caused that they are 'overrunning' the country.	Claims of immigrants 'overrunning' the country are qualified.
	Rejection of Immigrants	Unjustified rejection of immigrants is clearly considered wrong. An end of (unfair) rejection is demanded.	Rejection of immigrants is unconditionally welcomed.	Reasons for rejecting immigrants are carefully investigated and ambivalent causes are discussed in a critical way.
	Accidents		Immigrants are presented as victims of accidents. This category would usually correspond to irrelevant mentioning of nationality.	
	Prostitution	Forcing immigrants to work in prostitution is clearly condemned and attributed to exploitation.	Immigrants are being portrayed as prostitutes without qualification. It is claimed that they engage in prostitution for personal (financial) gain.	The article discusses the exploitation of immigrants in prostitution in critical manner.
Headline		Wording, normal size, little use of exclamation marks and topic contribute to a positive impression.	Wording, large and / or bold print, use of exclamations marks, use of inverted commas create a negative impression	
Relevant Group Focus of Article		The article differentiates between individual immigrant groups (and within one immigrant group) and does not treat immigrants with various backgrounds as one homogenous group.	The article does not differentiate between immigrant groups (and within immigrant groups) and looks as immigrants with various backgrounds as one homogenous group.	
(Hidden) Racism			Semantics, intertextual dimension, denial of	The article discusses latent / subconscious racism in

			racism and mitigation techniques suggest that there is racist notion underneath the surface.	society in a critical way. Semantics, denial of racism, mitigation techniques are exposed.
Flood Metaphor			The use of the flood metaphor suggests that there is a large, unmanageable number of immigrants entering Ireland. A threat (scare) is created.	
Quotation Pattern		The number of quotes by members of the in-group and members of the out-group is balanced. Quotes by out-group members are not confirmed by the in-group members, are placed in prominent positions and framing is not evident. The use of reporting verbs does not suggest a negative connotation.	There are more quotes by members of the in-group than by members of the out-group. Quotes by members of the out-group are confirmed by members of the in-group. Quotes by members of the out-group are placed in unprominent positions and / or framing is evident. The use of reporting verbs creates a negative impression.	
Irrelevant Reference to Nationality			The nationality is mentioned even though it is irrelevant in relation to the content of the article. The article would still make good sense if the nationality was not mentioned.	
	Discursive Variability	The article demonstrates an open-minded, welcoming attitude towards foreigners. The topic deviates from mainstream reporting and caters for a niche audience.	The article is not welcoming immigrants and the topic suggests a negative stereotypical representation of immigrants.	
	Chain Relations	It can be assumed that there has been no or little transformation from what happened to what is reported.	It seems evident that the article has interpreted what happened in such a way that a sensationalist or negative effect is achieved.	
	Quotations	Direct quotes are introduced by (relatively) neutral reporting verbs. Little use of indirect quotes.	Use of indirect quotes suggests a (negative) interpretation of what was said. Use of reporting verbs that suggest a negative connotation.	
	Register / Tone	Register and tone are high and formal respectively.	Register and tone are low and colloquial respectively so as to create an effect of solidarisation with the reader. Entertainment is put before information i.e. populist coverage is in the foreground.	
	Authorial Stance	In non-commentary pieces the authorial stance is made clear if the author voices an opinion. There is no hidden authorial stance in reports.	In non-commentary pieces the authorial stance is hidden so that an opinion is presented as fact.	

	Use of Metaphors		The use of e.g. war metaphors creates a sense of threat and / or panic. A negative attitude towards immigrants is evoked. Nominalised structures obscure agency (grammatical metaphor)	
	Reference		Positive presentation of 'we' and negative presentation of 'them'	
	Hedging	The use of approximators and modals is not evident or very limited.	The use of approximators and modals decreases the degree of directness and present negative statements in a more positive light	

11.3 Amendments

During the analysis of the results, the need for further coding arose in some instances which could not have been foreseen in the original design of the code book. In order to provide for a transparent coding process, the code book had to be amended to cater for the categories and indicators that emerged during analysis.

Polish Victims – Subtopic A

This category established whether articles made a reference to specific cases that had been identified. The following indicators were used:

Double murder trial – The article discussed the murders of Pawel Kalite and Marius Szwajkos, who were stabbed to death in February 2008 and / or made a reference to the trials of David Curran and Sean Keogh that took place in April and May 2010

Other Case – The article did not refer to any of the specified cases defined here

Rzeszutko assault – The article refers to the fatal assault on Lukasz Rzeszutko, who was on his way to work when he was attacked on 02 October 2010. If the name is not mentioned, the article may still be coded if a connection to the assault can safely be made (fish processing plant, 27-year-old victim, 5 am in the morning). The victim later died in hospital

Rape case – The article refers to the trial of Russell Murray, who had attempted to rape a Polish woman on 08 April 2009. A 'rape kit' prepared by the assailant may also be mentioned.

Cegielka assault – The article refers to the assault on Ariel Cegielka, who was attacked on Lower Oliver Plunkett Street on 17 April 2010. The victim may have been attacked with a bottle. The victim later died in hospital.

Urbaniak assault – The article refers to the assault on Bartlomiej Urbaniak, who was stabbed in the early hours of 11 December 2010. There may be references to the victim's age (29), Naas, Co. Kildare, where he lived, to the Wright Venue nightclub in Dublin, to an apartment on Richmond Road or to the man socialising with a group of friends before the attack. The victim later died in hospital.

Morowski assault – The article refers to the assault on Mr Morowski, who was stabbed to death in his home at Moorefield Park, Newbridge, Co. Kildare at 5.30 am on 20 July 2010. There may be references to a single stab wound to the heart, to a row outside the house earlier or to the Gardaí calling to the house earlier about two hours prior to the discovery of the dead man.

Hammer assault – The article refers to the assault on Joanna Benko, who received serious injuries when she was lying in her bed at her home. There may be references to her three-year-old son Philip, to the celebration of her 32nd birthday on that day or to a hammer with which the assault was allegedly carried out.

Polish / Nigerian / Chinese Victims – Subtopic B

Person crime – The authors of the EU-Midis study on minorities as victims of crime defined an in-person crime as "assault or threat, and serious harassment."[877] This definition shall be applied here.

Property crime – The authors of the EU-Midis study on minorities as victims of crime defined property crime as "comprising vehicle crime, burglary and theft."[878] This definition shall be applied here.

No crime – The article makes no reference to a crime (e.g. when the article discusses and accident or a death of natural causes.

Other – The article makes a reference to a misdemeanour rather than a crime. This may include unfair treatment for example as found in the preferred treatment of white Irish in a job interview.

[877] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 11
[878] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 11

Polish / Nigerian Victims – Involvement

Yes – When a Pole or Nigerian becomes a victim of a crime, the article indicates that the crime was carried out by a member of an immigrant group.

No – 'Yes' does not apply

Nigerian Asylum Seekers – Individual case

Yes – The article reports on individual cases of deportations, either focusing on one person or a group of persons.

No – The article reports on deportations and / or Ireland's immigration policy in general. It does not focus on individual cases of racism.

Nigerian Asylums Seekers – Subtopic A / B

Criticising deportation policy – The article is clearly critical of deportations and / or Ireland's immigration policy.

Welcoming deportations – The article is clearly supportive of deportations and / or Ireland's deportation policy.

Focus on Irish citizens – If Irish citizens are deported, the articles puts a strong emphasis on the nationality. This could be the case if dependent children holding Irish citizenship are deported together with their parents, who do not hold Irish citizenship and whose application was turned down.

Regularising deportations – The article considers deportations the norm rather than an exception.

Criminalising failed asylum seekers – The article presents deportees in such a way that failed asylum seekers are criminalised. The article is doubting that the applicants had legitimate reasons to apply for protection even if they were not recognised by Irish authorities.

Public support – The article reports on those cases of imminent deportation that have generated a great deal of public support.

Racist Articles and Year 2004 – Subtopic C

In the analysis of racist articles it emerged, that the majority of these was published in 2004. In order to investigate these articles further, I introduced a category, which was to give information on whether the article referred to the Citizenship referendum, the EU enlargement or other topics / events.

Referendum – The article makes a clear reference to the Referendum on Citizenship accepted on 11 June 2004. A claim that Nigerian women are coming to Ireland for the sole reason of obtaining Irish citizenship is also an indicator for this category.

EU-enlargement – The article makes a clear reference to the enlargement of the European Union on 01 May 2004.

Other – The article does not make a clear reference to any of the above events.

Topic A or Topic B or Topic C = Racism and Xenophobia – Subtopic D / Type of Racism

Individual case – The article refers to an individual case of racism and does not make a reference to racism being a general problem in society. This is also true if several cases of racism are discussed but presented as the problem of a localised area.

General – The article refers to racism as a general problem. It could also highlight an individual case or individual cases but must make a reference to how widespread racism is in Ireland generally.

Unsure – It cannot be determined for sure whether an article refers to an individual case or racism in general

Topic A or Topic B or Topic C = Racism and Xenophobia AND Racist = 1– Subtopic D / Extent of Racism

Partially racist – The article quotes a racist remark without qualifying it but the sample as a whole is not of a racist nature. This might be a racist utterance by a member of the public or a politician without highlighting the racist nature.

Entire article racist – The entire article is of a racist nature.

Unsure – It cannot be determined for sure whether an article is partially or in its entirety racist.

Perpetrator / Suspect – Subtopic E

Person crime – A crime including, assault, threat, physical harm to a person.

Fraud – The crime is of a fraudulent nature i.e. dealing with forged cheques.

Property crime – The authors of the EU-Midis study on minorities as victims of crime defined property crime as "comprising vehicle crime, burglary and theft."[879] This definition shall be applied here.

Immigration – The crime is related to immigration such as entering the country "illegally" e.g. with a false passport. However, dealing with false passports is a fraudulent crime and has to be coded there.

Drug related crimes – The crime includes dealing with and the consumption of illegal substances.

Other – Any other crime / misdemeanour

Perpetrator / Suspect – Subtopic F

Circumcision case – The article refers to a circumcision carried out by a Nigerian national in which the baby died of complications of the procedure

Death of Malawi woman – The article refers to the death of a young woman whose decapitated body was found next to a river and who was the daughter of the chief justice of Malawi.

Other – Any other case

Perpetrator / Suspect – Subtopic G

Money fraud – The articles refers to any fraud involving financial matters such as credit card fraud, cheque fraud or bank fraud.

Document fraud – The article refers to any fraud involving documents such as forged or stolen passports.

Other – Any other fraud

[879] EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS (2012), p. 11

Perpetrator / Suspect – Subtopic H

Death of toddler – The article refers to Monika Paczkowska who was charged with unlawfully killing her three year old daughter.

Love rival case – The article refers to the trial of Michal Kurowski who was accused of killing Michal Skotak.

Other – Any other topic

Resident – Subtopic I

Missing children – The article refers to children that have been reported missing.

Baby Jacob – The article refers to Jacob Nowak, who was born without eyes.

Plane crash Polish government – The article covers the plane crash of 10 April 2010 near Smolensk in which members of the Polish government died

Arrest case – The article refers to trial of two gardai accused of assaulting and falsely arresting Sunny Akpabot because of his skin colour.

Other – Any other topic

What is right is right – The article refers to the report entitled "Why don't they apply for visas? What is right is right" of 08 May 2004 in *The Irish Times*

Resident – Subtopic K

Yes – The article covers trivialises immigrants.

No – The article does not trivialise immigrants.

Unsure – It cannot with certainty established whether immigrant are trivialised or not.

Trivial topics cover everyday aspects of life in general. Such articles would by no means be essential in discussing the state of the country or the role of immigrants in Ireland. They would usually be most likely to cover curious events, or festivals that might be of some interest to the readership. A human interest character would often be found in such articles. However, articles cannot be considered trivial if the events on which a newspaper reports have serious (negative) economic and / or personal consequences for the people involved.

Chinese Students – Revenue Frame

Yes – Based on King-O'Riain's explanation of framing students as economic units, this category should be coded if Chinese students are presented as consumers, opening opportunities for business links with China, or as a source of income for the Irish education system.[880]

No – The revenue frame does not apply

Unsure – It cannot be established for sure whether the revenue frame applies.

[880] MEADE (2008), p. 211

Appendix

Hypotheses

A) There is a set of roles to which immigrants are predominantly linked in the coverage of the Irish print media.

A 1) There is a set of roles to which Polish immigrants are predominantly linked.

A 2) There is a set of roles to which Nigerian immigrants are predominantly linked.

A 3) There is a set of roles to which Chinese immigrants are predominantly linked.

B) There is a set of topics to which immigrants are predominantly linked in the coverage of the Irish print media.

B 1) There is a set of topics to which Polish immigrants are predominantly linked.

B 2) There is a set of topics to which Nigerian immigrants are predominantly linked.

B 3) There is a set of topics to which Chinese immigrants are predominantly linked.

C) There is a hierarchy of frequency of coverage of immigrants in the Irish print media.

C 1) *The Irish Times* has a higher frequency of coverage on immigration than the *Irish Independent* in all four periods.

C 2) The *Irish Independent* has a higher frequency of coverage on immigration than *The Irish Sun* in all four periods.

D) There is a hierarchy of the quality of coverage of immigrants in the Irish print media.

D 1) *The Irish Times* reported in a more positive fashion than the *Irish Independent*.

D 2) *The Irish Times* reported in a more positive fashion than *The Irish Sun*.

D 3) The *Irish Independent* reported in a more positive fashion than *The Irish Sun* in.

E) The quality of coverage of immigrants in Ireland improved on a period by period basis.

E 1) The quality of coverage in *The Irish Times* improved on a period by period basis.

E 2) The quality of coverage in the *Irish Independent* improved on a period by period basis.

E 3) The quality of coverage in the *Irish Independent* improved on a period by period basis.

F) The coverage of immigrants in Irish newspapers contains racist elements at varying levels.

F 1) *The Irish Times* coverage of immigrants contains the least amount of racist elements.

F 2) The *Irish Independent* coverage of immigrants contains more racist elements than *The Irish Times*' coverage.

F 3) *The Irish Sun* coverage of immigrants contains more racist elements than the *Irish Independent*'s coverage of racism.

G) A hierarchy of races can be shown in the coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese.

G 1) A hierarchy of races can be shown in the coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in *The Irish Times*.

G 2) A hierarchy of races can be shown in the coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in the *Irish Independent*.

G 3) A hierarchy of races can be shown in the coverage of Poles, Nigerians and Chinese in *The Irish Sun*.

Tables of results

NB: Differences between total and sum of individual values = missing value.

Tables marked with an * are collated from SPSS and PSPP data

Role allocation A	*Group*						Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	Polish and other groups	Nigerians and other groups	Chinese and other groups	
0	,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Refugee	1,00	13,00	,00	,00	14,00	1,00	29,00
Asylum seeker	3,00	136,00	5,00	18,00	152,00	18,00	332,00
Economic migrant	7,00	1,00	,00	12,00	,00	2,00	22,00
Illegal immigrant	2,00	7,00	8,00	2,00	12,00	10,00	41,00
Immigrant general	21,00	18,00	13,00	26,00	44,00	43,00	165,00
Politician	,00	25,00	,00	,00	7,00	1,00	33,00
Guard	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00	2,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	20,00	11,00	6,00	33,00	4,00	12,00	86,00
Activist, volunteer	1,00	5,00	2,00	,00	7,00	,00	15,00
Expert, professional	6,00	8,00	9,00	4,00	4,00	1,00	32,00
Church	1,00	1,00	,00	1,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Entrepreneur / business people	1,00	3,00	5,00	,00	2,00	1,00	12,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	36,00	37,00	20,00	12,00	15,00	27,00	147,00
Student	1,00	3,00	37,00	5,00	10,00	16,00	72,00
Perpetrator	19,00	45,00	13,00	5,00	7,00	5,00	94,00
Victim	149,00	37,00	36,00	5,00	24,00	5,00	256,00
Suspect	22,00	21,00	5,00	2,00	21,00	7,00	78,00
Journalist	,00	2,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Artist	6,00	9,00	4,00	,00	8,00	2,00	29,00
Prostitute	,00	1,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	2,00
Homeless	2,00	,00	1,00	1,00	,00	,00	4,00
Unemployed	1,00	,00	,00	2,00	,00	,00	3,00
Adopted	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	2,00	2,00
Other	3,00	1,00	2,00	,00	,00	,00	6,00
Total	302,00	388,00	166,00	129,00	332,00	154,00	1471,00

Table 8: Primary role by Group

Role allocation B	*Group*						Total
	Polish	**Nigerian**	**Chinese**	**Polish and other groups**	**Nigerians and other groups**	**Chinese and other groups**	
0	256,00	303,00	110,00	115,00	239,00	131,00	1154,00
Refugee	,00	3,00	,00	,00	6,00	,00	9,00
Asylum seeker	2,00	16,00	1,00	,00	19,00	1,00	39,00
Economic migrant	2,00	6,00	,00	2,00	2,00	1,00	13,00
Illegal immigrant	,00	2,00	1,00	2,00	15,00	1,00	21,00
Immigrant general	3,00	2,00	1,00	4,00	9,00	2,00	21,00
Politician	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Administrative body	,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Guard	,00	,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Employer	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	1,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	11,00	4,00	4,00	1,00	,00	3,00	23,00
Activist, volunteer	,00	3,00	,00	,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Expert, professional	1,00	10,00	2,00	3,00	10,00	4,00	30,00
Church	3,00	3,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	6,00
Entrepreneur / business people	1,00	,00	2,00	,00	,00	,00	3,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	4,00	7,00	3,00	,00	1,00	,00	15,00
Student, pupil	,00	6,00	16,00	,00	5,00	6,00	33,00
Perpetrator	2,00	4,00	2,00	1,00	1,00	1,00	11,00
Victim	8,00	16,00	20,00	1,00	11,00	2,00	58,00
Suspect	4,00	2,00	2,00	,00	3,00	1,00	12,00
Prostitutes	,00	,00	,00	,00	7,00	,00	7,00
Homeless	2,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	2,00
Unemployed	3,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	3,00
Other	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00	,00	2,00
Total	302,00	388,00	166,00	129,00	332,00	154,00	1471,00

Table 9: Secondary role by Group

Topic A	*Group*						Total
	Polish	**Nigerian**	**Chinese**	**Polish and other groups**	**Nigerians and other groups**	**Chinese and other groups**	
Cultural contribution	9,00	35,00	10,00	3,00	23,00	5,00	85,00
Discrimination	2,00	1,00	4,00	2,00	3,00	2,00	14,00
Identity	,00	,00	1,00	,00	2,00	3,00	6,00
Racism and xenophobia	1,00	19,00	2,00	3,00	19,00	5,00	49,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	5,00	2,00	4,00	4,00	8,00	8,00	31,00
Integration / Need for majority group to change	,00	2,00	2,00	2,00	9,00	2,00	17,00
Exploitation of welfare system	2,00	5,00	,00	4,00	17,00	3,00	31,00
Living conditions general	12,00	6,00	4,00	12,00	29,00	7,00	70,00
Burden to the state	,00	3,00	,00	3,00	16,00	3,00	25,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	1,00	1,00	,00	,00	3,00	,00	5,00
Call for / welcoming more liberal legislation	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Contribute to knowledge	1,00	,00	2,00	,00	,00	,00	3,00
Contribute to economy	13,00	5,00	9,00	19,00	1,00	8,00	55,00
Employed in public sector	,00	,00	,00	2,00	,00	1,00	3,00
Economic need for immigration	3,00	,00	,00	4,00	1,00	1,00	9,00
Exploitation / working conditions	1,00	,00	1,00	6,00	5,00	3,00	16,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	48,00	45,00	22,00	1,00	32,00	10,00	158,00
Court cases	120,00	140,00	44,00	7,00	12,00	15,00	338,00
Deportation	1,00	53,00	1,00	3,00	28,00	5,00	91,00
School education (primary, secondary)	,00	,00	3,00	3,00	8,00	2,00	16,00
Third level education	,00	1,00	14,00	1,00	,00	6,00	22,00
Further education	,00	,00	3,00	,00	,00	2,00	5,00
Student performance	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Immigration policy	3,00	15,00	7,00	14,00	55,00	31,00	125,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	1,00	21,00	10,00	2,00	3,00	,00	37,00
Wrong doing Irish side	,00	2,00	,00	,00	2,00	1,00	5,00
Entry to the state	4,00	1,00	6,00	15,00	28,00	15,00	69,00
Rejection of immigrants at border	,00	,00	,00	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Accidents	30,00	1,00	6,00	1,00	,00	1,00	39,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	,00	5,00	,00	1,00	12,00	4,00	22,00
Adoption	1,00	,00	,00	2,00	,00	1,00	4,00
Other	44,00	25,00	11,00	14,00	13,00	10,00	117,00
Total	302,00	388,00	166,00	129,00	332,00	154,00	1471,00

Table 10: Primary topic by Group

Topic B	*Group*						Total
	Polish	**Nigerian**	**Chinese**	**Polish and other groups**	**Nigerians and other groups**	**Chinese and other groups**	
0	156,00	118,00	63,00	57,00	88,00	56,00	538,00
Cultural contribution	,00	8,00	9,00	3,00	9,00	5,00	34,00
Discrimination	,00	6,00	,00	2,00	3,00	1,00	12,00
Identity	,00	1,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	2,00
Racism and xenophobia	2,00	21,00	1,00	,00	11,00	6,00	41,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	,00	8,00	4,00	4,00	12,00	7,00	35,00
Need for majority group to change	2,00	7,00	2,00	5,00	14,00	10,00	40,00
Contribution to social welfare	1,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	2,00
Exploitation of welfare system	1,00	5,00	,00	4,00	15,00	1,00	26,00
Living conditions general	3,00	11,00	3,00	7,00	17,00	5,00	46,00
Burden to the state	2,00	10,00	2,00	5,00	15,00	8,00	42,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	,00	5,00	1,00	7,00	26,00	6,00	45,00
Call for / welcoming more liberal legislation	,00	,00	1,00	1,00	1,00	,00	3,00
13	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Contribute to economy	3,00	1,00	7,00	7,00	1,00	8,00	27,00
Economic need for immigration	1,00	,00	1,00	1,00	,00	1,00	4,00
Exploitation / working conditions	1,00	3,00	2,00	4,00	5,00	2,00	17,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	111,00	69,00	32,00	9,00	14,00	4,00	239,00
Court cases	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Deportation	3,00	56,00	3,00	3,00	9,00	1,00	75,00
School education	1,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Third level education	,00	,00	6,00	,00	1,00	,00	7,00
Further education	,00	,00	2,00	,00	,00	1,00	3,00
Student performance	,00	,00	,00	,00	3,00	,00	3,00
Immigration policy	2,00	12,00	8,00	3,00	28,00	16,00	69,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	5,00	12,00	8,00	1,00	12,00	3,00	41,00
Use of flood metaphor	1,00	23,00	4,00	3,00	23,00	5,00	59,00
Entry to the state	,00	3,00	3,00	1,00	8,00	5,00	20,00
Rejection of immigrants at border	,00	,00	,00	,00	5,00	,00	5,00
Accidents	3,00	4,00	,00	1,00	,00	,00	8,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	1,00	3,00	2,00	,00	10,00	3,00	19,00
Other	1,00	1,00	1,00	1,00	,00	,00	4,00
Total	302,00	388,00	166,00	129,00	332,00	154,00	1471,00

Table 11: Secondary topic by Group

Group	Year	Newspaper			Total
		Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Polish	**1997**	2,00	3,00	,00	5,00
	2000	3,00	5,00	,00	8,00
	2004	5,00	16,00	8,00	29,00
	2010	103,00	119,00	38,00	260,00
Total		113,00	143,00	46,00	302,00
Nigerian	**1997**	18,00	6,00	,00	24,00
	2000	38,00	20,00	3,00	61,00
	2004	82,00	96,00	26,00	204,00
	2010	52,00	36,00	11,00	99,00
Total		190,00	158,00	40,00	388,00
Chinese	**1997**	16,00	11,00	1,00	28,00
	2000	18,00	9,00	,00	27,00
	2004	36,00	38,00	3,00	77,00
	2010	16,00	17,00	1,00	34,00
Total		86,00	75,00	5,00	166,00
Polish and other groups	**2000**	11,00	13,00	,00	24,00
	2004	20,00	19,00	4,00	43,00
	2010	27,00	31,00	4,00	62,00
Total		58,00	63,00	8,00	129,00
Nigerians and other groups	**1997**	5,00	10,00	2,00	17,00
	2000	73,00	38,00	2,00	113,00
	2004	59,00	49,00	15,00	123,00
	2010	53,00	23,00	3,00	79,00
Total		190,00	120,00	22,00	332,00
Chinese and other groups	**1997**	3,00	3,00	,00	6,00
	2000	8,00	14,00	,00	22,00
	2004	49,00	33,00	5,00	87,00
	2010	23,00	16,00	,00	39,00
Total		83,00	66,00	5,00	154,00

Table 12: Year by Newspaper by Group

Year	Group			Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	
2000	,00	3,00	,00	3,00
2004	1,00	14,00	7,00	22,00
2010	19,00	8,00	2,00	29,00
Total	20,00	25,00	9,00	54,00

Table 13: Year by Group

Topic A	*Group*						Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	Polish and other groups	Nigerians and other groups	Chinese and other groups	
Cultural contribution	,00	1,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	2,00
Discrimination	,00	1,00	2,00	,00	,00	,00	3,00
Racism and xenophobia	,00	9,00	1,00	,00	2,00	1,00	13,00
Exploitation of welfare system	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Living conditions general	,00	1,00	1,00	1,00	4,00	,00	7,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Exploitation / working conditions	,00	,00	,00	1,00	4,00	1,00	6,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	42,00	21,00	15,00	1,00	6,00	1,00	86,00
Court cases	86,00	17,00	22,00	1,00	3,00	1,00	130,00
School education (primary, secondary)	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Third level education	,00	,00	2,00	,00	,00	,00	2,00
Immigration policy	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	1,00	2,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	,00	,00	5,00	,00	,00	,00	5,00
Entry to the state	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Accidents	29,00	1,00	6,00	1,00	,00	1,00	38,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	,00	2,00	,00	1,00	10,00	1,00	14,00
Other	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00	,00	2,00
Total	157,00	53,00	56,00	6,00	35,00	7,00	314,00

Table 14: Victim (primary and secondary roles) - Primary topic by Group

Topic B	*Group*						Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	Polish and other groups	Nigerians and other groups	Chinese and other groups	
0	66,00	14,00	18,00	3,00	5,00	3,00	109,00
Cultural contribution	,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Racism and xenophobia	,00	9,00	,00	,00	2,00	,00	11,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Need for majority group to change	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	1,00
Living conditions general	2,00	1,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	4,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Exploitation / working conditions	,00	1,00	,00	,00	3,00	,00	4,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	82,00	9,00	21,00	1,00	4,00	1,00	118,00
Court cases	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Deportation	1,00	1,00	,00	,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Third level education	,00	,00	2,00	,00	,00	,00	2,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Use of flood metaphor	1,00	1,00	1,00	1,00	1,00	,00	5,00
Accidents	3,00	3,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	6,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	,00	,00	,00	,00	5,00	,00	5,00
Other	,00	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	156,00	42,00	42,00	5,00	24,00	5,00	274,00

Table 15: Victim (primary and secondary roles) and Court case - Secondary topic by Group

Year	Group			Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	
1997	,00	,00	11,00	11,00
2000	1,00	5,00	3,00	9,00
2004	7,00	10,00	18,00	35,00
2010	141,00	22,00	4,00	167,00
Total	149,00	37,00	36,00	222,00

Table 16: Victims only (primary roles) - Year by Group

Year	Group			Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	
1997	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
2000	,00	1,00	3,00	4,00
2004	1,00	8,00	13,00	22,00
2010	7,00	6,00	4,00	17,00
Total	8,00	16,00	20,00	44,00

Table 17: Victims only (secondary roles) - Year by Group

Newspaper	Length of article	Group			Total
		Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	
Irish Times	**Short - <100 words**	9,00	4,00	9,00	22,00
	Medium - 101-300 words	18,00	5,00	7,00	30,00
	Long - 301-500 words	8,00	8,00	5,00	21,00
	Extensive - >501words	15,00	2,00	,00	17,00
Total		50,00	19,00	21,00	90,00
Irish Independent	**Short - <100 words**	11,00	2,00	7,00	20,00
	Medium - 101-300 words	26,00	2,00	5,00	33,00
	Long - 301-500 words	15,00	3,00	1,00	19,00
	Extensive - >501words	16,00	2,00	1,00	19,00
	5	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total		69,00	9,00	14,00	92,00
Irish Sun	**Short - <100 words**	17,00	1,00	1,00	19,00
	Medium - 101-300 words	4,00	2,00	,00	6,00
	Long - 301-500 words	6,00	1,00	,00	7,00
	Extensive - >501words	3,00	5,00	,00	8,00
Total		30,00	9,00	1,00	40,00

Table 18: Victims only - Length by Group by Newspaper

Group	Newspaper			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Polish	50,00	69,00	30,00	149,00
Nigerian	19,00	9,00	9,00	37,00
Chinese	21,00	14,00	1,00	36,00
Total	90,00	92,00	40,00	222,00

Table 19: Victims only (primary roles) - Group by Newspaper

Subtopic A	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Polish Murder Case	17,00	24,00	17,00	58,00
Other Case	4,00	9,00	,00	13,00
Cork murder case	2,00	2,00	,00	4,00
Nightclub murder case	,00	,00	1,00	1,00
Total	23,00	35,00	18,00	76,00

Table 20: Polish victims and Peak 2010 - Event by Newspaper

Subtopic A	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Toyosi Shittabey	7,00	3,00	7,00	17,00
Other case	11,00	6,00	1,00	18,00
Sex slave	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	19,00	9,00	8,00	36,00

Table 21: Nigerian victims only and Peak 2010 - Event by Newspaper

Year	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
2004	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
2010	19,00	14,00	7,00	40,00
Total	19,00	15,00	7,00	41,00

Table 22: Polish perpetrators / suspects (Poles only / primary roles) - Year by Newspaper

Year	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
1997	3,00	3,00	,00	6,00
2000	6,00	8,00	2,00	16,00
2004	14,00	24,00	1,00	39,00
2010	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Total	26,00	37,00	3,00	66,00

Table 23: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (Nigerians only /primary roles) - Year by Newspaper

Year	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
2000	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
2004	3,00	7,00	1,00	11,00
2010	3,00	2,00	1,00	6,00
Total	6,00	10,00	2,00	18,00

Table 24: Chinese perpetrators / suspects (Chinese only / primary roles) - Year by Newspaper

Topic A	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Cultural contribution	52,00	31,00	2,00	85,00
Discrimination	8,00	6,00	,00	14,00
Identity	4,00	2,00	,00	6,00
Racism and xenophobia	32,00	14,00	3,00	49,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	19,00	12,00	,00	31,00
Integration / Need for majority group to change	10,00	7,00	,00	17,00
Exploitation of welfare system	16,00	12,00	3,00	31,00
Living conditions general	46,00	23,00	1,00	70,00
Burden to the state	7,00	13,00	5,00	25,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	2,00	1,00	2,00	5,00
Call for / welcoming more liberal legislation	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Contribute to knowledge	,00	3,00	,00	3,00
Contribute to economy	31,00	23,00	1,00	55,00
Employed in public sector	,00	3,00	,00	3,00
Economic need for immigration	1,00	7,00	1,00	9,00
Exploitation / working conditions	6,00	8,00	2,00	16,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	68,00	64,00	26,00	158,00
Court cases	139,00	158,00	41,00	338,00
Deportation	46,00	38,00	7,00	91,00
School education (primary, secondary)	8,00	7,00	1,00	16,00
Third level education	15,00	7,00	,00	22,00
Further education	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Student performance	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Immigration policy	76,00	48,00	1,00	125,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	31,00	6,00	,00	37,00
Wrong doing Irish side	3,00	1,00	1,00	5,00
Entry to the state	30,00	34,00	5,00	69,00
Rejection of immigrants at border	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Accidents	16,00	21,00	2,00	39,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	7,00	6,00	9,00	22,00
Adoption	,00	3,00	1,00	4,00
Other	43,00	62,00	12,00	117,00
Total	720,00	625,00	126,00	1471,00

Table 25: Victim roles only - Primary topic by Newspaper

Topic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
0	228,00	262,00	48,00	538,00
Cultural contribution	22,00	8,00	4,00	34,00
Discrimination	9,00	3,00	,00	12,00
Identity	2,00	,00	,00	2,00
Racism and xenophobia	31,00	10,00	,00	41,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	23,00	11,00	1,00	35,00
Need for majority group to change	19,00	21,00	,00	40,00
Contribution to social welfare	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Exploitation of welfare system	10,00	12,00	4,00	26,00
Living conditions general	35,00	9,00	2,00	46,00
Burden to the state	19,00	17,00	6,00	42,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	11,00	29,00	5,00	45,00
Call for / welcoming more liberal legislation	,00	3,00	,00	3,00
13	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Contribute to economy	12,00	15,00	,00	27,00
Economic need for immigration	2,00	2,00	,00	4,00
Exploitation / working conditions	10,00	5,00	2,00	17,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	93,00	113,00	33,00	239,00
Court cases	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Deportation	41,00	27,00	7,00	75,00
School education	3,00	,00	,00	3,00
Third level education	3,00	4,00	,00	7,00
Further education	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Student performance	1,00	1,00	1,00	3,00
Immigration policy	44,00	23,00	2,00	69,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	28,00	13,00	,00	41,00
Use of flood metaphor	46,00	9,00	4,00	59,00
Entry to the state	10,00	10,00	,00	20,00
Rejection of immigrants at border	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Accidents	4,00	3,00	1,00	8,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	7,00	6,00	6,00	19,00
Other	1,00	3,00	,00	4,00
Total	720,00	625,00	126,00	1471,00

Table 26: Victim roles only and Court case - Secondary topic by Newspaper

Subtopic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Person crime	38,00	50,00	27,00	115,00
No crime	12,00	16,00	2,00	30,00
Total	50,00	66,00	29,00	145,00

Table 27: Polish victims only (primary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper

Subtopic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Person crime	3,00	2,00	3,00	8,00
Total	3,00	2,00	3,00	8,00

Table 28: Polish victims only (secondary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper

Subtopic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Person crime	15,00	6,00	8,00	29,00
No crime	3,00	3,00	,00	6,00
Other	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	19,00	9,00	8,00	36,00

Table 29: Nigerian victims only (primary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper

Subtopic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Person crime	8,00	2,00	4,00	14,00
No crime	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	9,00	2,00	4,00	15,00

Table 30: Nigerian victims only (secondary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper

Subtopic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Personal crime	14,00	9,00	1,00	24,00
Property crime	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
No crime	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Other	2,00	2,00	,00	4,00
Total	21,00	14,00	1,00	36,00

Table 31: Chinese victims only (primary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper

Subtopic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Person crime	8,00	2,00	4,00	14,00
No crime	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	9,00	2,00	4,00	15,00

Table 32: Chinese victims only (secondary roles) - Type of crime by Newspaper

Subtopic A	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Polish Murder Case	17,00	26,00	17,00	60,00
Other Case	17,00	26,00	4,00	47,00
Rzeszutko murder	4,00	8,00	3,00	15,00
Rape kit	1,00	1,00	1,00	3,00
Cork murder case	4,00	2,00	,00	6,00
Nightclub murder case	2,00	2,00	1,00	5,00
Morowski Newbridge death	3,00	3,00	3,00	9,00
Hammer attack assault	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Total	50,00	69,00	29,00	148,00

Table 33: Polish victims only (primary roles) - Event by Newspaper

Role allocation A	*Year*	*Newspaper* Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	Total
Perpetrator	**1997**	2,00	2,00	,00	4,00
	2000	9,00	6,00	1,00	16,00
	2004	15,00	22,00	2,00	39,00
	2010	16,00	13,00	6,00	35,00
Total		42,00	43,00	9,00	94,00
Suspect	**1997**	1,00	1,00	,00	2,00
	2000	2,00	6,00	1,00	9,00
	2004	10,00	20,00	6,00	36,00
	2010	16,00	12,00	3,00	31,00
Total		29,00	39,00	10,00	78,00

Table 34: Perpetrator / Suspect (primary roles) - Year by Newspaper

	Group						
Year	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	Polish and other groups	Nigerians and other groups	Chinese and other groups	Total
1997	,00	6,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	6,00
2000	,00	16,00	1,00	,00	8,00	,00	25,00
2004	1,00	39,00	11,00	,00	15,00	9,00	75,00
2010	40,00	5,00	6,00	7,00	5,00	3,00	66,00
Total	41,00	66,00	18,00	7,00	28,00	12,00	172,00

Table 35: Perpetrator / Suspects (primary roles) - Year by Group

Group	*Type of crime*	*Newspaper* Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	Total
Polish	**Violent crime**	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Total		,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Nigerian	**Violent crime**	11,00	9,00	5,00	25,00
	Fraud	5,00	11,00	,00	16,00
	Drug related crime	3,00	4,00	,00	7,00
	Other	1,00	4,00	1,00	6,00
Total		20,00	28,00	6,00	54,00
Chinese	**Violent crime**	2,00	7,00	1,00	10,00
	Fraud / Property crime	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
	Drug related crime	2,00	3,00	,00	5,00
	Immigration	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
	Other	,00	2,00	1,00	3,00
Total		5,00	13,00	2,00	20,00

Table 36: Perpetrator / Suspect (primary roles) 2004 - Type of crime by Newspaper by Group

Case	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Circumcision case	4,00	1,00	,00	5,00
Death of Malawi women	5,00	5,00	5,00	15,00
Other	2,00	3,00	,00	5,00
Total	11,00	9,00	5,00	25,00

Table 37: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) 2004 - Event by Newspaper

Type of fraud	*Newspaper*		Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	
Money fraud	3,00	7,00	10,00
Document fraud	1,00	2,00	3,00
Other	1,00	,00	1,00
Total	5,00	9,00	14,00

Table 38: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) 2004 - Type of fraud by Newspaper

Role allocation B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
0	28,00	39,00	4,00	71,00
Refugee	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Asylum seeker	5,00	3,00	2,00	10,00
Illegal immigrant	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Immigrant general	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Expert, professional	2,00	,00	,00	2,00
Student, pupil	2,00	2,00	,00	4,00
Victim	1,00	,00	2,00	3,00
Total	40,00	46,00	8,00	94,00

Table 39: Nigerian perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) - Secondary role by Newspaper

Mont	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
1	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
2	1,00	4,00	,00	5,00
3	,00	4,00	,00	4,00
5	2,00	3,00	,00	5,00
6	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
7	1,00	4,00	,00	5,00
8	1,00	3,00	3,00	7,00
9	1,00	1,00	,00	2,00
10	3,00	3,00	1,00	7,00
11	1,00	4,00	,00	5,00
12	2,00	3,00	1,00	6,00
Total	17,00	32,00	5,00	54,00

Table 40: Nigerian perpetrator / suspect (primary roles) 2004 - Month by Newspaper

Type of crime	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Person crime	11,00	12,00	6,00	29,00
Property crime	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Drug related crimes	1,00	1,00	1,00	3,00
Other	6,00	3,00	1,00	10,00
Total	21,00	18,00	8,00	47,00

Table 41: Polish perpetrators / suspects 2010 - Type of crime by Newspaper

Case	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Death of toddler	4,00	4,00	3,00	11,00
Sligo stabbing	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Love rival case	3,00	1,00	2,00	6,00
Wexford murder	2	3	,00	5,00
Other	2,00	3,00	1,00	6,00
Total	9,00	9,00	6,00	29,00

Table 42: Polish perpetrators / suspects 2010 in Person crimes - Event by Newspaper

TyCr	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Violent crime	1,00	5,00	1,00	7,00
Property crime	1,00	2,00	,00	3,00
Drug related crime	2,00	3,00	,00	5,00
Immigration crime	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Other	,00	3,00	1,00	4,00
Total	5,00	13,00	2,00	20,00

Table 43: Chinese perpetrators / suspects (primary roles) 2004 - Type of crime by Newspaper

Focus	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Yes	24,00	27,00	3,00	54,00
No	18,00	17,00	4,00	39,00
Total	42,00	44,00	7,00	93,00

Table 44: Resident (immigrant group only) - Focus by Newspaper

Triviality	*Group*			Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	
Yes	4,00	1,00	5,00	10,00
No	15,00	24,00	4,00	43,00
Undecided	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	20,00	25,00	9,00	54,00

Table 45: Residents - Triviality by Group

Year	*Group*			Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	
2000	,00	3,00	,00	3,00
2004	1,00	14,00	7,00	22,00
2010	19,00	8,00	2,00	29,00
Total	20,00	25,00	9,00	54,00

Table 46: Residents - Year by Group

Connotation	*Group*			Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	
Positive	4,00	1,00	4,00	9,00
Negative	1,00	2,00	,00	3,00
Neutral	14,00	17,00	5,00	36,00
Raising a critical question	1,00	5,00	,00	6,00
Total	20,00	25,00	9,00	54,00

Table 47: Residents - Connotation by Group

Newspaper	Hidden racism		Total
	Yes	No	
Irish Times	36,00	684,00	720,00
	5,00%	95,00%	100,00%
Irish Independent	52,00	573,00	625,00
	8,32%	91,68%	100,00%
Irish Sun	27,00	99,00	126,00
	21,43%	78,57%	100,00%
Total	115,00	1356,00	1471,00
	7,82%	92,18%	100,00%

Table 48: Newspaper by Racism

Role allocation A	Newspaper			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Refugee	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Asylum seeker	12,00	20,00	8,00	40,00
Economic migrant	,00	1,00	3,00	4,00
Illegal immigrant	4,00	7,00	3,00	14,00
Immigrant general	6,00	6,00	5,00	17,00
Politician	,00	,00	2,00	2,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	2,00	3,00	,00	5,00
Expert, professional	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Entrepreneur / business people	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	2,00	2,00	1,00	5,00
Student	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Perpetrator	3,00	7,00	2,00	12,00
Victim	3,00	2,00	2,00	7,00
Suspect	,00	,00	1,00	1,00
Artist	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	36,00	52,00	27,00	115,00

Table 49: Racist articles - Primary role by Newspaper

Newspaper	Group						Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	Polish and other groups	Nigerians and other groups	Chinese and other groups	
Irish Times	1,00	14,00	1,00	1,00	13,00	6,00	36,00
Irish Independent	3,00	23,00	1,00	2,00	18,00	5,00	52,00
Irish Sun	6,00	8,00	,00	2,00	9,00	2,00	27,00
Total	10,00	45,00	2,00	5,00	40,00	13,00	115,00

Table 50: Racist articles - Newspaper by Group

Newspaper	Year				Total
	1997	2000	2004	2010	
Irish Times	4,00	13,00	14,00	5,00	36,00
Irish Independent	6,00	12,00	21,00	13,00	52,00
Irish Sun	1,00	2,00	21,00	3,00	27,00
Total	11,00	27,00	56,00	21,00	115,00

Table 51: Racist articles - Newspaper by Year

Newspaper	*Subtopic C*			Total
	Referendum	**EU enlargement**	**Other**	
Irish Times	7,00 50,00%	,00 ,00%	7,00 50,00%	14,00 100,00%
Irish Independent	3,00 15,00%	,00 ,00%	17,00 85,00%	20,00 100,00%
Irish Sun	4,00 19,05%	5,00 23,81%	12,00 57,14%	21,00 100,00%
Total	14,00 25,45%	5,00 9,09%	36,00 65,45%	55,00 100,00%

Table 52: Racist articles 2004 - Newspaper by Reference to event

Newspaper	*Type of article*				Total
	Article	**Editorial / opinion**	**Letter to the editor**	**Front page**	
Irish Times	9,00 64,29%	3,00 21,43%	2,00 14,29%	,00 ,00%	14,00 100,00%
Irish Independent	9,00 42,86%	,00 ,00%	12,00 57,14%	,00 ,00%	21,00 100,00%
Irish Sun	15,00 71,43%	3,00 14,29%	,00 ,00%	3,00 14,29%	21,00 100,00%
Total	33,00 58,93%	6,00 10,71%	14,00 25,00%	3,00 5,36%	56,00 100,00%

Table 53: Racist articles 2004 - Newspaper by Type of article

Newspaper	*Type of article*				Total
	Article	**Editorial / opinion**	**Letter to the editor**	**Front page**	
Irish Times	214,00	14,00	10,00	13,00	251,00
Irish Independent	225,00	4,00	18,00	4,00	251,00
Irish Sun	52,00	5,00	,00	4,00	61,00
Total	491,00	23,00	28,00	21,00	563,00

Table 54: 2004 - Newspaper by Type of article

	Newspaper	**1997**	**2000**	**2004**	**2010**	**Total**
Primary topic	**IT**	2	13	10	7	32
	II	--	3	7	4	14
	IS	--	--	3	--	3
Secondary topic	**IT**	1	9	9	12	31
	II	--	1	5	4	10
	IS	--	--	--	--	--
Tertiary topic	**IT**	--	3	8	6	17
	II	--	1	3	5	9
	IS	--	--	--	2	2

Table 55: Racism (primary, secondary, tertiary topic) - Newspaper by Year*

Newspaper	*Type of racism*			Total
	Individual case	**General**	**Unsure**	
Irish Times	33,00 41,25%	46,00 57,50%	1,00 1,25%	80,00 100,00%
Irish Independent	16,00 48,48%	14,00 42,42%	3,00 9,09%	33,00 100,00%
Irish Sun	2,00 40,00%	2,00 40,00%	1,00 20,00%	5,00 100,00%
Total	51,00 43,22%	62,00 52,54%	5,00 4,24%	118,00 100,00%

Table 56: Racism (primary, secondary, tertiary topic) - Newspaper by Category of racism

Newspaper	*Extent of racism*			Total
	Partially racist	**Entire article racist**	**Undecided**	
Irish Times	8,00 61,54%	5,00 38,46%	,00 ,00%	13,00 100,00%
Irish Independent	2,00 33,33%	4,00 66,67%	,00 ,00%	6,00 100,00%
Irish Sun	1,00 50,00%	,00 ,00%	1,00 50,00%	2,00 100,00%
Total	11,00 52,38%	9,00 42,86%	1,00 4,76%	21,00 100,00%

Table 57: Racism (primary, secondary, tertiary topic) - Newspaper by Extent of racism

Year	Newspaper	Positive	Negative	Neutral	Raising critical question	Undecided	Total
1997	**IT**	--	4	--	6	--	10
	II	--	5	--	1	--	6
	IS	--	2	--	--	--	2
2000	**IT**	7	12	18	22	--	59
	II	1	16	10	4	--	31
	IS	--	2	--		--	2
2004	**IT**	--	8	17	13	--	38
	II	1	20	26	9	2	58
	IS	--	9	1	3	--	13
2010	**IT**	--	10	21	16	--	47
	II	--	10	7	4	--	21
	IS	--	1	--	--	--	1

Table 58: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Connotation by Year*

Flood metaphor	*Group*						Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	Polish and other groups	Nigerians and other groups	Chinese and other groups	
Yes	,00	10,00	,00	5,00	36,00	,00	51,00
No	3,00	126,00	5,00	13,00	116,00	18,00	281,00
Total	3,00	136,00	5,00	18,00	152,00	18,00	332,00

Table 59: Asylum seekers (primary roles) - Flood metaphor by Group*

Flood metaphor	*Group*						Total
	Polish	Nigerian	Chinese	Polish and other groups	Nigerians and other groups	Chinese and other groups	
0	1,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00
Yes	3,00	14,00	2,00	12,00	53,00	6,00	90,00
No	298,00	374,00	164,00	117,00	279,00	148,00	1380,00
Total	302,00	388,00	166,00	129,00	332,00	154,00	1471,00

Table 60: Flood metaphor by Group*

	Newspaper	Yes	No	Total
1997	**IT**	2	8	10
	II	5	1	6
	IS	--	2	2
	All	7	11	18
2000	**IT**	12	47	59
	II	9	22	31
	IS	2	0	2
	All	23	69	92
2004	**IT**	0	38	38
	II	8	50	58
	IS	4	9	13
	All	12	97	109
2010	**IT**	3	44	47
	II	1	20	21
	IS	0	1	1
	All	4	65	69

Table 61: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Year by Flood by Newspaper*

Newspaper	*Flood metaphor*	*Year* 1997	2000	2004	2010	Total
Irish Times	**Yes**	2,00	12,00	,00	3,00	17,00
	No	8,00	47,00	38,00	44,00	137,00
Total		10,00	59,00	38,00	47,00	154,00
Irish Independent	**Yes**	5,00	9,00	8,00	1,00	23,00
	No	1,00	22,00	50,00	20,00	93,00
Total		6,00	31,00	58,00	21,00	116,00
Irish Sun	**Yes**	,00	2,00	4,00	,00	6,00
	No	2,00	,00	9,00	1,00	12,00
Total		2,00	2,00	13,00	1,00	18,00

Table 62: Nigerian asylum seekers - Flood metaphor by Year by Newspaper

Newspaper	*Flood metaphor*	*Year* 1997	2000	2004	2010	Total
Irish Times	**Yes**	1,00	1,00	,00	1,00	3,00
	No	8,00	9,00	22,00	26,00	65,00
Total		9,00	10,00	22,00	27,00	68,00
Irish Independent	**Yes**	1,00	1,00	3,00	1,00	6,00
	No	1,00	3,00	35,00	14,00	53,00
Total		2,00	4,00	38,00	15,00	59,00
Irish Sun	**Yes**	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
	No	,00	,00	7,00	1,00	8,00
Total		,00	,00	8,00	1,00	9,00

Table 63: Nigerian asylum seekers only - Flood metaphor by Year by Newspaper

Role allocation A	*Newspaper* Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	Total
0	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Refugee	17,00	8,00	2,00	27,00
Asylum seeker	154,00	116,00	18,00	288,00
Economic migrant	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Illegal immigrant	4,00	14,00	1,00	19,00
Immigrant general	40,00	18,00	4,00	62,00
Politician	19,00	7,00	6,00	32,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	5,00	10,00	,00	15,00
Activist, volunteer	9,00	3,00	,00	12,00
Expert, professional	8,00	4,00	,00	12,00
Church	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Entrepreneur / business people	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	25,00	21,00	6,00	52,00
Student	8,00	4,00	1,00	13,00
Perpetrator	28,00	23,00	1,00	52,00
Victim	32,00	15,00	14,00	61,00
Suspect	12,00	23,00	7,00	42,00
Journalist	3,00	,00	,00	3,00
Artist	10,00	7,00	,00	17,00
Prostitute	,00	,00	2,00	2,00
Other	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Total	380,00	278,00	62,00	720,00

Table 64: Nigerian - Primary roles by Newspaper

Topic A	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Cultural contribution	4,00	1,00	,00	5,00
Racism and xenophobia	8,00	1,00	,00	9,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Integration / Need for majority group to change	5,00	1,00	,00	6,00
Exploitation of welfare system	6,00	4,00	2,00	12,00
Living conditions general	13,00	8,00	,00	21,00
Burden to the state	4,00	9,00	1,00	14,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	1,00	,00	2,00	3,00
Contribute to economy	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Exploitation / working conditions	,00	,00	1,00	1,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	1,00	2,00	1,00	4,00
Court cases	27,00	27,00	1,00	55,00
Deportation	38,00	28,00	5,00	71,00
School education (primary, secondary)	,00	,00	1,00	1,00
Immigration policy	26,00	14,00	,00	40,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	8,00	2,00	,00	10,00
Wrong doing Irish side	2,00	,00	1,00	3,00
Entry to the state	9,00	14,00	,00	23,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	,00	,00	3,00	3,00
Other	2,00	3,00	,00	5,00
Total	154,00	116,00	18,00	288,00

Table 65: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Primary topic by Newspaper

Topic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
0	25,00	25,00	3,00	53,00
Cultural contribution	1,00	2,00	,00	3,00
Discrimination	2,00	,00	,00	2,00
Identity	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Racism and xenophobia	1,00	1,00	,00	2,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	3,00	1,00	,00	4,00
Need for majority group to change	4,00	2,00	,00	6,00
Exploitation of welfare system	1,00	8,00	,00	9,00
Living conditions general	13,00	3,00	1,00	17,00
Burden to the state	7,00	7,00	2,00	16,00
Call for / welcoming more restrictive legislation	4,00	10,00	4,00	18,00
Exploitation / working conditions	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	5,00	6,00	,00	11,00
Deportation	28,00	21,00	2,00	51,00
Student performance	,00	,00	1,00	1,00
Immigration policy	16,00	8,00	1,00	25,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	9,00	7,00	,00	16,00
Use of flood metaphor	27,00	5,00	3,00	35,00
Entry to the state	3,00	6,00	,00	9,00
Rejection of immigrants at border	3,00	2,00	,00	5,00
Prostitution / Sex industry	1,00	1,00	1,00	3,00
Total	154,00	116,00	18,00	288,00

Table 66: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Secondary topic by Newspaper

Role allocation B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
0	120,00	92,00	12,00	224,00
Refugee	3,00	3,00	1,00	7,00
Economic migrant	3,00	5,00	,00	8,00
Illegal immigrant	5,00	10,00	,00	15,00
Immigrant general	2,00	,00	,00	2,00
Politician	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Activist, volunteer	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Expert, professional	7,00	,00	,00	7,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Student, pupil	2,00	,00	1,00	3,00
Perpetrator	2,00	2,00	,00	4,00
Victim	5,00	1,00	3,00	9,00
Suspect	2,00	2,00	,00	4,00
Prostitutes	1,00	,00	1,00	2,00
Total	154,00	116,00	18,00	288,00

Table 67: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Secondary role by Newspaper

Topic B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Crime / illicit behaviour	1,00	5,00	,00	6,00
Deportation	25,00	20,00	1,00	46,00
Immigration policy	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Use of flood metaphor	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Total	27,00	27,00	1,00	55,00

Table 68: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) - Court case by Secondary topics

Connotation	*Newspaper*		Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	
Negative	5,00	8,00	13,00
Neutral	9,00	3,00	12,00
Raising a critical question	12,00	3,00	15,00
Total	26,00	14,00	40,00

Table 69: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Immigration policy - Connotation by Newspaper

Connotation	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Negative	6,00	12,00	3,00	21,00
Neutral	12,00	10,00	,00	22,00
Raising a critical question	20,00	5,00	2,00	27,00
Undecided	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Total	38,00	28,00	5,00	71,00

Table 70: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Connotation by Newspaper

Connotation	*Group*		Total
	Nigerian	Nigerians and other groups	
Negative	11,00	10,00	21,00
Neutral	15,00	7,00	22,00
Raising a critical question	20,00	7,00	27,00
Undecided	1,00	,00	1,00
Total	47,00	24,00	71,00

Table 71: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Connotation by Group

	Newspaper			
Individual Case	**Irish Times**	**Irish Independent**	**Irish Sun**	**Total**
Yes	17,00	8,00	2,00	27,00
No	21,00	20,00	2,00	43,00
Total	38,00	28,00	4,00	70,00

Table 72: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Individual case by Newspaper

	Individual Case		
Subtopic A	**Yes**	**No**	**Total**
Criticising deportations (policy)	13,00	6,00	19,00
Welcoming deportations	1,00	10,00	11,00
Focus on Irish citizens	7,00	7,00	14,00
Regularising deportations	,00	13,00	13,00
Criminalising failed asylum seekers	,00	5,00	5,00
Public support	6,00	1,00	7,00
Total	27,00	42,00	69,00

Table 73: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Subtopic A by Individual case

	Newspaper			
Subtopic A	**Irish Times**	**Irish Independent**	**Irish Sun**	**Total**
Criticising deportations (policy)	14,00	4,00	1,00	19,00
Welcoming deportations	4,00	7,00	,00	11,00
Focus on Irish citizens	10,00	4,00	,00	14,00
Regularising deportations	5,00	6,00	2,00	13,00
Criminalising failed asylum seekers	,00	5,00	,00	5,00
Public support	4,00	2,00	1,00	7,00
Total	37,00	28,00	4,00	69,00

Table 74: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Subtopic A by Newspaper

	Newspaper			
Subtopic B	**Irish Times**	**Irish Independent**	**Irish Sun**	**Total**
Criticising deportations (policy)	9,00	8,00	1,00	18,00
Welcoming deportations (policy)	1,00	3,00	,00	4,00
Focus on Irish citizens	3,00	1,00	2,00	6,00
Regularising deportations	5,00	6,00	,00	11,00
Criminalising failed asylum seekers	1,00	2,00	,00	3,00
Public support	3,00	,00	,00	3,00
Total	22,00	20,00	3,00	45,00

Table 75: Nigerian asylum seekers (primary roles) and Deportation - Subtopic B by Newspaper

Role allocation A	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
Refugee	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Asylum seeker	15,00	8,00	,00	23,00
Economic migrant	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Illegal immigrant	10,00	8,00	,00	18,00
Immigrant general	31,00	20,00	5,00	56,00
Politician	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Guard	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	8,00	10,00	,00	18,00
Activist, volunteer	1,00	1,00	,00	2,00
Expert, professional	5,00	5,00	,00	10,00
Entrepreneur / business people	1,00	4,00	1,00	6,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	30,00	17,00	,00	47,00
Student	31,00	22,00	,00	53,00
Perpetrator	4,00	11,00	3,00	18,00
Victim	22,00	18,00	1,00	41,00
Suspect	6,00	6,00	,00	12,00
Artist	3,00	3,00	,00	6,00
Homeless	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Adopted	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Other	,00	2,00	,00	2,00
Total	169,00	141,00	10,00	320,00

Table 76: Chinese - Primary role by Newspaper

Role allocation B	*Newspaper*			Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	Irish Sun	
0	122,00	112,00	7,00	241,00
Asylum seeker	2,00	,00	,00	2,00
Economic migrant	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Illegal immigrant	1,00	1,00	,00	2,00
Immigrant general	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Guard	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Employer	1,00	,00	,00	1,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	6,00	1,00	,00	7,00
Expert, professional	3,00	3,00	,00	6,00
Entrepreneur / business people	,00	1,00	1,00	2,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	3,00	,00	,00	3,00
Student, pupil	15,00	7,00	,00	22,00
Perpetrator	2,00	1,00	,00	3,00
Victim	10,00	10,00	2,00	22,00
Suspect	1,00	2,00	,00	3,00
Other	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Total	169,00	141,00	10,00	320,00

Table 77: Chinese - Secondary role by Newspaper

Role allocation A	*Group*		Total
	Chinese	Chinese and other groups	
Refugee	,00	1,00	1,00
Asylum seeker	5,00	18,00	23,00
Economic migrant	,00	2,00	2,00
Illegal immigrant	8,00	10,00	18,00
Immigrant general	13,00	43,00	56,00
Politician	,00	1,00	1,00
Guard	,00	1,00	1,00
Employee, general worker, labourer	6,00	12,00	18,00
Activist, volunteer	2,00	,00	2,00
Expert, professional	9,00	1,00	10,00
Entrepreneur / business people	5,00	1,00	6,00
Member of the public / resident / citizen	20,00	27,00	47,00
Student	37,00	16,00	53,00
Perpetrator	13,00	5,00	18,00
Victim	36,00	5,00	41,00
Suspect	5,00	7,00	12,00
Artist	4,00	2,00	6,00
Homeless	1,00	,00	1,00
Adopted	,00	2,00	2,00
Other	2,00	,00	2,00
Total	166,00	154,00	320,00

Table 78: Chinese - Primary role by Group

Topic A	*Newspaper*		Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	
Cultural contribution	1,00	,00	1,00
Identity	1,00	,00	1,00
Racism and xenophobia	1,00	1,00	2,00
Multicultural Ireland / A new Ireland	,00	1,00	1,00
Integration / Need for majority group to change	,00	2,00	2,00
Exploitation of welfare system	1,00	,00	1,00
Living conditions general	2,00	,00	2,00
Contribute to knowledge	,00	1,00	1,00
Contribute to economy	7,00	3,00	10,00
Exploitation / working conditions	,00	1,00	1,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	3,00	,00	3,00
Court cases	4,00	3,00	7,00
School education (primary, secondary)	1,00	2,00	3,00
Third level education	13,00	5,00	18,00
Further education	3,00	2,00	5,00
Immigration policy	,00	1,00	1,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	7,00	1,00	8,00
Entry to the state	1,00	3,00	4,00
Accidents	,00	1,00	1,00
Other	1,00	2,00	3,00
Total	46,00	29,00	75,00

Table 79: Chinese students - Primary topic by Newspaper

Topic B	*Newspaper*		Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	
0	1,00	1,00	2,00
Call for / welcoming more liberal legislation	,00	1,00	1,00
Contribute to economy	6,00	3,00	9,00
Crime / illicit behaviour	1,00	,00	1,00
Further education	2,00	,00	2,00
Information on country of origin / situation of immigrants	3,00	,00	3,00
Total	13,00	5,00	18,00

Table 80: Chinese students and Third level education - Secondary topic by Newspaper

Group	*Revenue frame*	*Newspaper*		Total
		Irish Times	Irish Independent	
Chinese	**Yes**	4,00	2,00	6,00
	No	4,00	,00	4,00
Total		8,00	2,00	10,00
Chinese and other groups	**Yes**	4,00	4,00	8,00
	No	1,00	,00	1,00
Total		5,00	4,00	9,00

Table 81: Chinese students and Contribution to economy - Revenue frame by Newspaper by Group

Newspaper	*Year*			Total
	2000	2004	2010	
Irish Times	2,00	3,00	3,00	8,00
Irish Independent	2,00	3,00	1,00	6,00
Total	4,00	6,00	4,00	14,00

Table 82: Chinese students and Revenue frame - Newspaper by Year

Year	*Newspaper*		Total
	Irish Times	Irish Independent	
1997	,00	1,00	1,00
2000	,00	1,00	1,00
2004	2,00	2,00	4,00
2010	3,00	1,00	4,00
Total	5,00	5,00	10,00

Table 83: Chinese experts (primary role) - Year by Newspaper

Newspaper	*Connotation*	*Year*				Total
		1997	**2000**	**2004**	**2010**	
Irish Times	**Positive**	5,00	27,00	20,00	28,00	80,00
	Negative	13,00	31,00	61,00	87,00	192,00
	Neutral	15,00	43,00	109,00	109,00	276,00
	Raising a critical question	11,00	50,00	61,00	50,00	172,00
Total		44,00	151,00	251,00	274,00	720,00
Irish Independent	**Positive**	8,00	8,00	16,00	25,00	57,00
	Negative	19,00	45,00	100,00	62,00	226,00
	Neutral	5,00	36,00	96,00	139,00	276,00
	Raising a critical question	1,00	9,00	35,00	16,00	61,00
	Undecided	,00	1,00	4,00	,00	5,00
Total		33,00	99,00	251,00	242,00	625,00
Irish Sun	**Positive**	,00	1,00	1,00	,00	2,00
	Negative	2,00	4,00	35,00	11,00	52,00
	Neutral	1,00	,00	19,00	43,00	63,00
	Raising a critical question	,00	,00	5,00	3,00	8,00
	Undecided	,00	,00	1,00	,00	1,00
Total		3,00	5,00	61,00	57,00	126,00

Table 84: Connotation by Year by Newspaper

Connotation	*Group*						Total
	Polish	**Nigerian**	**Chinese**	**Polish and other groups**	**Nigerians and other groups**	**Chinese and other groups**	
Positive	18,00	33,00	32,00	12,00	33,00	11,00	139,00
Negative	97,00	130,00	48,00	26,00	127,00	42,00	470,00
Neutral	177,00	142,00	63,00	71,00	92,00	70,00	615,00
Raising a critical question	10,00	75,00	23,00	20,00	83,00	30,00	241,00
Undecided	,00	5,00	,00	,00	,00	1,00	6,00
Total	302,00	385,00	166,00	129,00	335,00	154,00	1471,00

Table 85: Connotation by Group

Bibliography

Corpus articles selected for in-depth analysis

Irish Times

ANONYMOUS: Brother of Dead Woman Appeals for Help. *The Irish Times* (04/08/04).

ANONYMOUS: Chinese Student's Release Sought. *The Irish Times* (11/10/00).

ANONYMOUS: Opening Asian Doors. *The Irish Times* (14/09/00).

ANONYMOUS: Support for Boy's Fund Welcomed. *The Irish Times* (16/03/10).

ANONYMOUS: TCD Protests for Chinese Dissident. *The Irish Times* (28/11/00).

ANONYMOUS: Teenager Stabbed Two Men in the Head, Trial Told. *The Irish Times* (15/04/10).

BRAMHILL, Nick; HOLLAND, Kitty: Baby Born with no Eyes Takes First Steps. *The Irish Times* (14/12/10).

BRÉADÚN, Deaglán: Chinese Dissident Tells of Rights Abuse. *The Irish Times* (12/05/04).

CAREY, Sarah: Maids Are Easy Prey for Middle Class Racists. *The Irish Times* (28/04/10).

CHONAILL, Brid Ni: Race Pressure Points No Longer Can Be Ignored. *The Irish Times* (09/04/10).

CHONAILL, Áine Ní: The Benefits of Immigration. *The Irish Times* (26/08/04).

CULLEN, Paul: Cases of Falun Gong Practitioners Raised. *The Irish Times* (22/05/04).

DOWNEY, Jack: Only Slagging? *The Irish Times* (27/09/00).

EDOBAR, Edwin: Nigeria and Refugees. *The Irish Times* (10/06/97).

EDOBAR, Edwin: Nigeria and Refugees. *The Irish Times* (04/06/97).

EGAN, Suzanne: Nigeria and Refugees. *The Irish Times* (13/06/97).

GARTLAND, Fiona: 'What a Sentence to Have to Go to Your Son's Grave'. *The Irish Times* (08/05/14).

GROOCOCK, Dorene: Nigeria and Refugees. *The Irish Times* (07/06/97).

HUMPHREYS, Joe: Students Prevented from Returning to Ireland. *The Irish Times* (11/05/00).

HUMPHREYS, Joe: Students to March for Jailed Zhao. *The Irish Times* (20/11/00).

JENNINGS, Frank: Nigeria and Refugees. *The Irish Times* (10/06/97).

JORDAN, Tony: The New Irish. *The Irish Times* (24/05/04).

LALLY, Conor: Woman Held over Death of Malawian. *The Irish Times* (14/10/04).

LUCEY, Anne: Mother Charged over her Child's Death. *The Irish Times* (22/01/10a).

LUCEY, Anne: Mother Jailed over Killing of Daughter. *The Irish Times* (20/05/10b).

LUCEY, Anne: Woman Admits Ill-Treating Daughter (3). *The Irish Times* (13/05/10a).

LUKE, Chris: Drug Links to Violent Crime. *The Irish Times* (11/05/10).

MADIGAN, Richard A.: Falun Gong Detentions. *The Irish Times* (28/01/00).

MCGREEVY, Ronan: 'RIP Toyosi, I'm Never Going to Forget You Because You Were One of the Nicest People'. *The Irish Times* (06/04/10).

MCGREEVY, Ronan: Garda appeal for Calm Following Fatal Stabbing of Teenage Boy. *The Irish Times* (05/04/10).

MCGREEVY, Ronan: Rally Today in Dublin to Mark Life of Toyosi. *The Irish Times* (10/04/10).

MCGREEVY, Ronan; SHERIDAN, Kathy: 'Toy Thought He Was Safe Here'. *The Irish Times* (10/04/10).

MYERS, Kevin: An Irishman's Diary. *The Irish Times* (13/10/04).

NWOSU, N. E.: Nigeria and Refugees. *The Irish Times* (11/06/97).

O'BRIEN, Carl: One Man Still Held over Death of Malawian. *The Irish Times* (19/08/04).

O'BRIEN, Carl: The New Irish. *The Irish Times* (08/05/04).

O'BRIEN, Carl: The New Irish. *The Irish Times* (18/05/04).

O'CLERY, Conor: Chinese Prevent Students With Falun Gong Links From Returning to Ireland. *The Irish Times* (25/01/00).

O'HALLORAN, Marie: 38,000 Visit Smithfield's Chinatown. *The Irish Times* (26/01/04).

O'TOOLE, Fintan: Torture Not Grounds for Asylum Here. *The Irish Times* (03/10/00).

OGBOGOH, Mary: The New Irish - What You Thought about the Series. *The Irish Times* (24/05/04).

ORAM, Hugh: Lobby for Human Rights. *The Irish Times* (27/11/04).

SHERIDAN, Kathy: The New Irish: 'Why Don't They Apply for Visas? What Is Right is Right'. *The Irish Times* (08/05/04).

SMYTH, Jamie: Poles Gather for Mass in Dublin to Mourn Crash. *The Irish Times* (12/04/10).

STAUNTON, Denis: Chinese Mother and Irish Baby 'Entitled to Live in EU'. *The Irish Times* (19/05/04).

WALSH, Jimmy: Chinese Man's Case 'Quite Remarkable'. *The Irish Times* (09/07/04).

Irish Independent

ANDERSON, Nicola: Peace-Loving Victims Hoped to Return Home. *Irish Independent* (08/05/10a).

ANDERSON, Nicola: Takeaway Row Led to the Killing of Polish Men With a Screwdriver, Court Hears. *Irish Independent* (15/04/10).

ANDERSON, Nicola: Sadistic Teen Gets Life for Screwdriver Double Murder. *Irish Independent* (08/05/10b).

ANONYMOUS: Chinatown Comes to Dublin. *Irish Independent* (20/01/04).

ANONYMOUS: International Students in EUR 430 Million Boost to Economy. *Irish Independent* (14/05/10).

ANONYMOUS: Rally for Fugitive Teen Facing Deportation. *Irish Independent* (30/07/10).

ANONYMOUS: €1.5m Settlement for Brain-Damaged Child. *Irish Independent* (29/01/04).

DOWDALL, Anne Marie: Too Little Too Late. *Irish Independent* (03/05/04).

DOWLING, Brian; REID, Lorna: O'Donoghue Planning New Measures for Refugees. *Irish Independent* (20/03/00).

DUGGAN, Barry: Mother Jailed for Four Years over Little Girl's Fatal Beating. *Irish Independent* (20/05/10).

DUGGAN, Barry: Pidgin Polish Required to Reunite Missing Parrot With Loving Family. *Irish Independent* (09/01/10).

EDOBAR, Edwin: Reply from Nigeria. *Irish Independent* (03/06/97).

HICKEY, Shane: Screams of Grief for 'Toy'. *Irish Independent* (09/04/10).

LUCEY, Anne: Girl (3) Died of Brain Injuries after Mother 'Flipped' and Beat Her. *Irish Independent* (13/05/10b).

LUCEY, Anne: Mum Charged over Killing Daughter. *Irish Independent* (22/01/10b).

LYONS, Tom: Meteor Card Scheme Targets Chinese Users. *Irish Independent* (16/10/04).

MURPHY, Sarah: Murdered Woman Was 'Full of Joy' Says Shocked Brother. *Irish Independent* (04/08/04).

MYERS, Kevin: To Be a Villain in Ireland Does One Have to Be Irish, White, Middle-Class, Male and Christian? *Irish Independent* (26/05/10).

QUINN, Michael: Garda Plea for Help in Woman's Death Probe. *Irish Independent* (14/08/04).

REID, Natasha: Thug Who Attacked Dying Pole Was Out on Bail at Time. *Irish Independent* (20/05/10).

RIEGEL, Ralph: Boy Born With No Eyes Needs €300,000 for Vital Treatment. *Irish Independent* (10/03/10).

RIEGEL, Ralph: Single to Raise Funds for Baby Jacob Is a Huge Hit. *Irish Independent* (07/06/10).

RYAN, Mary: This Sentence Will Not Deter Thugs. *Irish Independent* (25/05/10).

SWEENEY, Conor: Residency Bombshell for Europe. *Irish Independent* (20/10/04).

SWEENEY, Mary: Human Rights and Nigeria. *Irish Independent* (10/06/97).

Irish Sun

ANONYMOUS: Evil Savage. *The Irish Sun* (08/05/10).

ANONYMOUS: Justice for Poles. *The Irish Sun* (07/05/10).

LUCEY, Anne: Just 4 Years Jail for Mum Who Beat Her Bed-Wetting Girl to Death. *The Irish Sun* (20/05/10a).

LUCEY, Anne: Mother 'Hit Her 3-Yr-Old So Hard She Died'. *The Irish Sun* (13/05/10c).

LUCEY, Anne: Mother Is Accused of Killing Her Tot, 3. *The Irish Sun* (22/01/10c).

LYNOTT, Laura: The Scroting Dad. *The Irish Sun* (20/05/10).

MAY, Mark: Toyosi Loved Ireland, He Wanted to Play Beside Robbie Keane. *The Irish Sun* (07/04/10).

MCELGUNN, Joanne: Pavel Was Stabbed in the Head Twice. The Screwdriver Pierced His Skull to the Brain Stem. *The Irish Sun* (15/04/10).

MCNAMARA, James: Body-In-Bag Suspect May Still Be Here. *The Irish Sun* (12/08/04).

MCNAMARA, James: We'll Hunt Down Body-In-Bag Killer. *The Irish Sun* (06/08/04).

REID, Natasha: He's Stuck a Screwdriver in Our Hearts. *The Irish Sun* (08/05/10).

REID, Natasha: Screwdriver Yob Found Guilty of Pole Murders. *The Irish Sun* (07/05/10).

REID, Natasha: Stab Teen Stoned on Drink & Drugs. *The Irish Sun* (30/04/10).

Statistics and general information available online

AHEARN, Dermot: *Address by Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform at the Launch of the Immigration, Residence and Protection Bill 2008.* *h*ttp://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/Address%20by%20the%20Minister%20for%20Justice,%20Equality%20and%20Law%20Reform%20at%20the%20launch%20of%20the%20Immigration,%20Residence%20and%20Protection%20Bill%202008 (last accessed 03/05/13).

BUNDESMINISTERIUM FÜR BILDUNG UND FORSCHUNG: *Deutschland ist für ausländische Studierende erste Wahl.* http://www.bmbf.de/press/3563.php (last accessed 19/07/14).

CENTRAL BANK OF IRELAND: *Government Guarantee Scheme.* http://www.centralbank.ie/regulation/industry-sectors/credit-institutions/pages/governmentguaranteescheme.aspx (last accessed 03/04/14).

CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY: *The World Factbook: Poland / Economy.* https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/pl.html (last accessed 05/02/14).

CENTRAL STATISTICAL OFFICE (Poland): *Demographic Yearbook of Poland.* Available at http://www.stat.gov.pl/cps/rde/xbcr/gus/sy_demographic_yearbook_2013.pdf (last accessed 07/02/14).

CENTRAL STATISTICAL OFFICE (Poland): *Size of Population, Vital Statistics and Migration in 1946-2006.* Available at http://www.stat.gov.pl/gus/5840_646_ENG_HTML.htm (last accessed 07/02/14).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE: *Census 2002.* Dublin: Stationary Office, 2003.

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE: *Census 2006 Volume 5 - Ethnic or Cultural Background.* Dublin: Stationary Office, 2008a.

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE: *Census 2006 - Non-Irish Nationals Living in Ireland.* Dublin: Stationary Office, 2008b.

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (a): *Profile 6 Migration and Diversity (Census 2011).* Available at http://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/census/documents/census2011profile6/Profile,6,Migration,and,Diversity,entire,doc.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (b): *Population and Migration Estimates.* Available at http://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/census/documents/populationestimates2012/popmig_2012.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (c): *Persons, Males and Females Usually Resident and Present in the State on Census Night, Classified by Nationality, 2002.* http://census.cso.ie/Census/TableViewer/tableView.aspx?ReportId=1079 (last accessed 02/03/14).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (d): *Components of the Annual Population Change, 1987-2013.* http://www.cso.ie/en/releasesandpublications/er/pme/populationandmigrationestimatesapril2013/ (last accessed 03/03/14).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (e): *Seasonally Adjusted Standardised Unemployment Rates (SUR).* http://www.cso.ie/en/statistics/labourmarket/principalstatistics/seasonallyadjustedstandardisedunemployementratessur/ (last accessed 04/03/14).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (f): *Historical Reports.* http://www.cso.ie/en/census/census20021996resultsandearliercensuses/historicalreports/ (last accessed 29/09/13).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (g): *Crime and Justice - Principal Statistics.* http://www.cso.ie/en/statistics/crimeandjustice/ (last accessed 22/06/13).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (h): *Census 2006 Volume 4.* Available at http://www.cso.ie/en/census/census2006reports/census2006volume4-usualresidencemigrationbirthplacesandnationalities/ (last accessed 29/09/13).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE (i): *Census 2011: Profile 3 - At Work.* Available at http://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/census/documents/census2011profile3/Profile,3full,doc,for,web,sig,amended.pdf (last accessed 09/10/13).

CENTRAL STATISTICS OFFICE: *Population Classified by Religion for Relevant Censuses from 1881 to 2006.* Available at http://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/census/census2006results/volume13/tables-1-10.pdf (last accessed 29/09/13).

CITIZENS INFORMATION BOARD: Employment Permits. In: *Relate - The Journal of Developments in Social Services, Policy and Legislation.* Vol. 36 (2009) Issue 10, pp. 1-2.

CITIZENS INFORMATION: *EU Stabilisation Mechanisms.* http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/government_in_ireland/european_government/euro_area/eu_stabilisation_mechanisms.html (last accessed 04/03/14).

CITIZENS INFORMATION: *Green Card Permits.* www.citizensinformation.ie/en/employment/migrant_workers/employment_permits/green_card_permits.html (last accessed 02/08/13).

CITIZENS INFORMATION: *Work Permits.* www.citizensinformation.ie/en/employment/migrant_workers/employment_permits/work_permits.html (last accessed 02/08/13).

CITIZENS INFORMATION: *Services and entitlements for people seeking asylum*. http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/moving_country/asylum_seekers_and_refugees/services_for_asylum_seekers_in_ireland/direct_provision.html (last accessed 11/02/16)

COUNTRYECONOMY.COM: *Ireland GDP - Gross Domestic Product.* http://countryeconomy.com/gdp/ireland (last accessed 03/03/14).

DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE AND EQUALITY: *Immigration in Ireland - 2012 in Review.* Available at http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PR13000002 (last accessed 23/09/13).

DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE AND EQUALITY: *Minister Dermot Ahern Announces End of Year Asylum Statistics.* Available at http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/2010-asylum-stats (last accessed 03/04/13).

DEPARTMENT OF JOBS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION: *Statistical Tables and Company Listings for the Employment Permits Section.* http://www.djei.ie/labour/workpermits/statistics.htm (last accessed 02/02/14).

ENTERPRISE IRELAND: *Home Page.* http://www.enterprise-ireland.com/en/About-Us/ (last accessed 13/03/13).

EUROPEAN UNION: *Modular Vocational Education and Training in Poland.* Available at http://www.emcet.net/download/products/description/pdf/modular_education_and_training_in_poland.pdf (last accessed 08/02/14).

EUROSTAT: *Asylanträge in der Europäischen Union.* http://epp.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/cache/ITY_OFFPUB/KS-SF-07-110/DE/KS-SF-07-110-DE.PDF (last accessed 19/01/11).

EUROSTAT: *Asylum decision in the EU27.* Available at http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_STAT-10-89_en.htm (last accessed 23/09/13).

EXPERT GROUP ON FUTURE SKILLS NEEDS AND FORFÁS: *Skills Needs in the Irish Economy: The Role of Migration.* Available at http://www.forfas.ie/media/egfsn051027_role_of_migration.pdf (last accessed 20/02/14).

FINFACTS IRELAND: *Irish Newspaper Readership 2007.* http://www.finfacts.ie/finfactsblog/2007/03/irish-newspaper-readership-2007.html (last accessed 05/01/14).

GAELIC ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION: *History Timeline.* http://www.gaa.ie/about-the-gaa/gaa-history/history-timeline/ (last accessed 01/06/10).

GERMAN ACADEMIC EXCHANGE SERVICE: *Ausländische Studierende - ein Gewinn für Deutschland.* https://www.daad.de/portrait/presse/pressemitteilungen/2014/25387.de.html (last accessed 19/07/14).

GNADE, Simon: *Problemgebiet Banlieue: Konflikte und Ausgrenzung in den französischen Vorstädten.* http://www.bpb.de/internationales/europa/frankreich/152511/problemgebiet-banlieue (last accessed 30/08/13).

GUIDER, Ian: *Sales of Irish Newspapers Continue to Fall.* http://www.newstalk.ie/reader/47.301.343/12996/0/ (last accessed 04/01/14).

HANCOCK, Ciarán: *Newspaper Sales Decline in First Half of this Year.* http://www.irishtimes.com/business/sectors/media-and-marketing/newspaper-sales-decline-in-first-half-of-this-year-1.1502427 (last accessed 05/01/14).

HIGHER EDUCATION AUTHORITY: *Domiciliary of Origin of Full-time Students in All HEA-Funded Institutions 2011/12.* http://www.hea.ie/en/statistics/2011-2012/student-details (last accessed 02/08/13).

IMMIGRANT COUNCIL OF IRELAND: *The Immigration, Residence and Protection Bill 2010 - A Critical Overview.* Available at http://www.immigrantcouncil.ie/images/stories/ICI_critical_overview_-_IRP_Bill_2010_final_0910.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

INDEPENDENT NEWS & MEDIA PLC: *Home Page.* http://www.inmplc.com/operations/ireland (last accessed 05/09/13).

IRISH NATURALISATION AND IMMIGRATION SCHEME: *Policy for 5 Year Workers and Redundant Workers.* http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/Policy%20for%205%20year%20workers%20and%20redundant%20workers (last accessed 03/03/14).

IRISH PRISON SERVICE: *Annual Report 2004.* Available at http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/ThirdAnnualRpt.pdf/Files/ThirdAnnualRpt.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

IRISH PRISON SERVICE: *Annual Report 2010.* Available at http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Irish_Prison_Service_2010_Annual_Report.pdf/Files/Irish_Prison_Service_2010_Annual_Report.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

MAC ÉINRÍ, Piaras: The Challenge of Migrant Integration in Ireland. In: *International Journal on Multicultural Societies.* Vol. 9 (2007) Issue 1, pp. 75-90.

MAC ÉINRÍ, Piaras: *Current Immigration Debates in Europe: Ireland.* Available at http://www.migpolgroup.com/public/docs/141.EMD_Ireland_2005.pdf (last accessed 26/01/11).

MAC ÉINRÍ, Piaras: *Immigration and the Irish Media.* Available at http://migration.ucc.ie/section2.htm (last accessed 10/05/13).

MAC ÉINRÍ, Piaras: *Immigration into Ireland: Trends, Policy Responses, Outlook.* Available at http://migration.ucc.ie/irelandfirstreport.htm (last accessed 03/08/10).

NATIONAL CRIME COUNCIL: *Crime and Victimisation Surveys.* http://www.crimecouncil.gov.ie/statistics_cri_victim.html (last accessed 11/06/14).

NATIONAL NEWSPAPERS OF IRELAND: *Circulation Statistics.* http://www.nni.ie/v2/broad/portal.php?content=./_includes/circulation.php (last accessed 05/09/13).

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF IRELAND, Galway: *Fees & Finance.* www.nuigalway.ie/international-students/fees-and-finance.html (last accessed 02/08/13).

O'CONNELL, Philip; MCGINNITY, Frances: *Immigrants at Work.* Available at http://www.equality.ie/Files/Immigrants%20at%20Work%20%20Ethnicity%20and%20Nationality%20in%20the%20Irish%20Labour%20Market.pdf (last accessed 15/02/15).

OFFICE FOR NATIONAL STATISTICS: *Crime Survey for England and Wales.* http://www.crimesurvey.co.uk/ (last accessed 11/06/14).

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (Ireland): *Constitution of the Irish Free State (Saorstát Eireann) Act, 1922.* http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/1922/en/act/pub/0001/sched1.html (last accessed 27/04/10).

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (b): *Broadcasting Authority (Amendment) Act, 1976.* http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/1976/en/act/pub/0037/sec0016.html#sec16

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (a): *Broadcasting Authority Act, 1960.* http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/1960/en/act/pub/0010/sec0031.html (last accessed 10/01/14).

OFFICE OF THE HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS: *International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.* http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CERD.aspx (last accessed 12/10/13).

OFFICE OF THE REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER: *Home Page.* http://www.orac.ie/website/orac/oracwebsite.nsf/page/orac-stats-en (last accessed 23/09/13).

REBUBLIC OF IRELAND: *Aliens Act, 1935.* http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/1935/en/act/pub/0014/index.html (last accessed 18/01/11).

REFUGEE APPLICATIONS COMMISSIONER: *Monthly Statistical Report January 2013.* Available at http://www.orac.ie/website/orac/oracwebsite.nsf/page/CAOF-95HK391432225-en/$File/2013%2001%20January%20ORAC%20monthly%20report.pdf (last accessed 22/04/13).

REILLY, Gavan: *Newspapers record falls in circulation in second half of 2012.* http://www.thejournal.ie/newspaper-circulation-h2-2012-804258-Feb2013/?r_dir_d=1 (last accessed 10/01/14).

REPUBLIC OF IRELAND: *A Decade of the Asia Strategy 1999-2009.* Available at http://www.dfa.ie/uploads/documents/asia%20strategy.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

REPUBLIC OF IRELAND: *Employment Permits Act 2003.* Available at http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/2003/en/act/pub/0007/ (last accessed 18/10/13).

REPUBLIC OF IRELAND: *Refugee Act, 1996.* Available at http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/1996/en/act/pub/0017/sec0002.html#sec2 (last accessed 18/01/11).

SHATTER, Alan: *Immigration in Ireland - 2012 in Review.* www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PR13000002 (last accessed 02/08/13).

STATISTISCHES BUNDESAMT: *Zensus 2011.* www.zensus2011.de (last accessed 01/08/2013).

TASK FORCE ON POLICY REGARDING EMIGRANTS: *Ireland and the Irish Abroad.* Available at http://www.embassyofireland.org/uploads/documents/task%20force%20on%20policy%20regarding%20emigrants.pdf (last accessed 27/02/14).

THE ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RESEARCH INSTITUTE: *Irish Economy.* Available at http://www.esri.ie/irish_economy/ (last accessed 09/10/13).

THE INTEGRATION CENTRE: *Affiliated Organisations.* http://www.integrationcentre.ie/Our-Work/Network/Affiliated-Organisations.aspx (last accessed 08/02/14).

THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE: *PQ: Deportations - Costs and Numbers 209-2012.* http://www.nascireland.org/latest-news/pq-deportations-costs-and-numbers-2009-2012/ (last accessed 23/09/13).

THE WORLD BANK: *Nigeria Overview.* http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/nigeria/overview (last accessed 02/02/14).

TRINITY COLLEGE DUBLIN: *Fees*. http://www.tcd.ie/Treasurers_Office/fees/PG_Fees_2012-13.pdf (last accessed 13/03/13).

UK DATA SERVICE: *Offending, Crime and Justice Survey.* http://discover.ukdataservice.ac.uk/series/?sn=2000042 (last accessed 11/06/14).

UNHCR: *2005 Asylum statistics for industrialized countries.* http://www.unhcr.org/print/441aa01916.html (last accessed 20/04/13).

UNHCR: *Asylum Levels and Trends in Industrialized Countries 2010.* Available at http://www.unhcr.org/4d8c5b109.html. (last accessed 18/10/13).

UNHCR: *Asylum Trends 2012.* Available at http://www.unhcr.org/5149b81e9.html (last accessed 18/10/13).

UNHCR: *Convention and Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees.* http://www.unhcr.org/protect/PROTECTION/3b66c2aa10.pdf (last accessed 18/01/11).

UNHCR: *Iraqi Refugee and Asylum-Seeker Statistics.* Available at http://www.unhcr.org/3e79b00b9.pdf (last accessed 25/09/13).

UNHCR: *Refugees and Asylum-Seekers from China -- Main Countries of Asylum.* Available at http://www.unhcr.org/4641836f0.html (last accessed 12/02/14).

UNHCR: *Statistical Yearbook.* http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/page?docid=44e5c76b0 (last accessed 21/01/10).

UNHCR: *The State of the World's Refugees - A Synthesis.* Available at http://www.unhcr.org/4fc5ceca9.html (last accessed 18/10/13).

UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES GENEVA: *Asylum Applications in Industrialized Countries: 1980-1999.* Available at http://www.unhcr.org/3c3eb40f4.pdf (last accessed 20/10/13).

UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES: *Asylum Applications Lodged in Industrialized Countries: Levels and Trends, 2000-2002.* Available at http://www.unhcr.org/3e705bb24.html (last accessed 20/10/13).

Ó CUANACHAIN, Colm: Nigeria and refugees. *The Irish Times* (07/06/97).

Research literature - print resources

AGAMBEN, Giorgio: *Homo Sacer.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998.

ALBRECHT, Monika: *"Europa ist nicht die Welt".* Bielefeld: Aisthesis-Verlag, 2008.

ALLEN, Kieran: Neo-Liberalism and Immigration. In: FANNING, Bryan (ed.): *Immigration and Social Change in the Republic of Ireland.* Manchester et al.: Manchester University Press, 2007, pp. 84-98.

BELL, Brian; FASANI, Francesco; MACHIN, Stephen: *Crime and Immigration: Evidence from Large Immigrant Waves.* Dublin, 2010

BLOOR, Meriel; BLOOR, Thomas: *The Practice of Critical Discourse Analysis.* London: Hodder Arnold, 2007.

BLOOR, Thomas; BLOOR, Meriel: *The Functional Analysis of English.* London et al.: 2nd ed. Arnold, 2004.

BREEZE, Ruth: Critical Discourse Analysis and Its Critics. In: *International Pragmatics Association.* Vol. 21 (2011) Issue 4, pp. 493-525.

BREITSPRECHER, Roland; HAU, Rita: *Pons-Globalwörterbuch.* Stuttgart: 2nd ed. Klett, 1987.

BURKART, Roland: Medienwirkungsforschung - ein Einblick. In: *Medienimpulse. Beiträge zur Medienpädagogik.* Vol. 46 (2003) Issue 03, pp. 5-8.

BURZAN, Nicole: *Quantitative Methoden der Kulturwissenschaften.* Konstanz: UVK Verl.-Ges, 2005.

CANNY, Nicholas P.: *Making Ireland British, 1580-1650.* Oxford: 1st publ. in paperback ed. Oxford University Press, 2003.

CARROLL, Clare; KING, Patricia: *Ireland and Postcolonial Theory.* Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003.

CLARKE, Aidan: The Colonisation of Ulster and the Rebellion of 1641. In: MOODY, Theodore William; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 153-64.

CLARKE, Aidan: The Government of Wentworth, 1632-40. In: COSGROVE, Art et al. (eds.): *Early Modern Ireland, 1534-1691.* Oxford [England]; New York: Oxford University Press, 2009, pp. 243-69.

CONNOLY, S. J.: Mass Politics and Sectarian Conflict, 1823-30. In: BYRNE, F. J. et al. (eds.): *A New History of Ireland, volume 5, Ireland Under the Union 1801-70.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010, pp. 74-107.

CORISH, Patrick J.: The Cromwellian Regime, 1650-60. In: COSGROVE, Art et al. (eds.): *Early Modern Ireland, 1534-1691.* Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 2009, pp. 353-86.

COSGROVE, Art: The Gaelic Resurgance and the Geraldine Supremacy. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 125-38.

DALY, Mary E.: Reviewed work(s): Jews in Twentieth-Century Ireland: Anti-Semitism and the Holocaust by Dermot Keogh. In: *The Journal of Modern History.* Vol. 72 (2000) Issue 2, pp. 526-27.

DAVIES, Pamela; FRANCIS, Peter; GREER, Chris: Victims, Crime and Society. In: DAVIES, Pamela (ed.): *Victims, Crime and Society.* Los Angeles, Calif., et al.: Sage, 2007, pp. 1-19.

DE PAOR, Liam: The Age of the Viking Wars. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 67-80.

DE WIT, Hans; KNIGHT, Jane: Strategies for the Internationalisation of Higher Education. A comparative study of Australia, Canada, Europe and the United States of America. In: DE WIT, Hans (ed.): Amsterdam: EAIE Secretariat, 1995.

DEVEREUX, Eoin; HAYNES, Amanda; POWER, Martin J.: At the Edge: Media Constructions of a Stigmatised Irish Housing Estate. In: *Journal of Housing and the Built Environment.* Vol. 26 (2011) Issue 2, pp. 123-42.

DIJK, Teun Adrianus van: Critical Discourse Studies: a sociocognitive approach. In: WODAK, Ruth (ed.): *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis.* Los Angeles, Calif. et al.: SAGE, 2009, pp. 62-86.

DIJK, Teun Adrianus van: *Discourse and Power.* Basingstoke et al.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.

DITTMAR, Jakob F.: *Grundlagen der Medienwissenschaft.* Berlin: 2nd ed. Universitätsverlag der TU Berlin, 2010.

DOWNING, Lisa: *The Cambridge Introduction to Michel Foucault.* Cambridge et al.: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

DUFFY, Patrick J.; MORAN, Gerard: *To and from Ireland.* Dublin: Geography Publications, 2004.

EGGER, Sabine; MCDONAGH, John: *Polish-Irish Encounters in the Old and New Europe.* Oxford et al.: Peter Lang, 2011.

EICHHORN, Wolfgang: *Agenda-Setting-Prozesse.* München (digital edition): 2005.

ELLIS, Steven G.: *Ireland in the Age of the Tudors 1447 - 1603.* London et al.: Longman, 1998.

ELVERT, Jürgen: *Geschichte Irlands.* München: 3rd rev. ed. Dt. Taschenbuch-Verlag, 1999.

EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS: *Minorities as Victims of Crime.* Vienna: 2012.

FAIRCLOUGH, Norman: A Dialectical-Relational Approach to Critical Discourse Analysis in Social Research. In: WODAK, Ruth (ed.): *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis.* Los Angeles, Calif. et al.: SAGE, 2009, pp. 162-86.

FAIRCLOUGH, Norman: *Discourse and Social Change.* Cambridge: 1st publ. ed. Polity Press, 1993.

FAIRCLOUGH, Norman: *Language and Power.* Harlow: 2nd ed. Longman, 2001.

FAIRCLOUGH, Norman: *Media Discourse.* London et al.: Arnold, 1995.

FANNING, Bryan: *Immigration and Social Change in the Republic of Ireland.* Manchester et al.: Manchester University Press, 2007.

FANNING, Bryan: *Immigration and Social Cohesion in the Republic of Ireland.* Manchester et al.: 1st publ. ed. Manchester University Press, 2011.

FANNING, Bryan: *Racism and Social Change in the Republic of Ireland.* Manchester et al.: 2nd ed. Manchester University Press, 2012.

FANNING, Bryan: *Racism and Social Change in the Republic of Ireland.* Manchester et al.: Manchester University Press, 2002.

FANNING, Bryan; MUTWARASIBO, Fidele: *Nationals/Non-Nationals: Immigration, Citizenship and Politics in the Republic of Ireland.* 2007.

FITZGERALD, Patrick; LAMBKIN, Brian K.: *Migration in Irish History, 1607-2007.* New York: Basingstoke / Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.

FITZPATRICK, David: *Irish Emigration 1801-1921.* Dublin: Economic and Social History Society of Ireland, 1985.

FLANNERY, Eóin: *Ireland and Postcolonial Studies.* New York (et al.): Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

FOUCAULT, Michel: The Subject and Power. In: *Critical Inquiry.* Vol. 8 (1982) Issue 4, pp. 777-95.

FOUCAULT, Michel: *Die Ordnung des Diskurses.* Frankfurt/M: Fischer, 1991a.

FOUCAULT, Michel: *Discipline and Punish.* London et al.: Repr. ed. Penguin Books, 1991b.

FOUCAULT, Michel: *Power/Knowledge.* New York: Pantheon Books, 1980.

FOUCAULT, Michel: *Society Must Be Defended.* New York: 1st ed. Picador, 2003a.

FOUCAULT, Michel: *The Archaeology of Knowledge.* London: Tavistock, 1972.

FRÜH, Werner: *Inhaltsanalyse.* Konstanz: 6th rev. ed. UVK Verlags-Gesellschaft, 2007.

GALTUNG, John; RUGE, Marie Holmboe: The Structure of Foreign News. In: *Peace Research.* Vol. 2 (1965) Issue 1, pp. 64-90.

GAVENTA, John: Civil Society and Power. In: EDWARDS, Michael (ed.): *The Oxford Handbook of Civil Society.* Oxford et al.: Oxford University Press, 2011, pp. 416-28.

GIELER, Wolfgang; FRICKE, Dietmar: *Handbuch Europäischer Migrationspolitiken.* Münster: 2004.

GILLESPIE, Raymond: *Seventeenth-Century Ireland.* Dublin: Rev. ed. Gill & Macmillan, 2006.

GRAY, Breda: Governing Integration. In: FANNING, Bryan; MUNCK, Ronaldo (eds.): *Globalization, Migration and Social Transformation - Ireland in Europe and the World.* Farnham, Surrey; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011, pp. 93-106.

GREEN, E.R.R.: The Great Famine. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 218-27.

GREER, Chris: News Media, Victims and Crime. In: DAVIES, Pamela (ed.): *Victims, Crime and Society.* Los Angeles: Sage, 2007, pp. 20-49.

GROSSBERG, Lawrence: Der Cross Road Blues der Cultural Studies. In: HEPP, Andreas; WINTER, Rainer (eds.): *Kultur - Medien - Macht - Cultural Studies und Medienanalyse.* Wiesbaden: Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, 2008, pp. 23-40.

GUERIN, Patrick: Racism and the Media in Ireland: Setting the Anti-Immigration Agenda. In: MCVEIGH, Robbie; LENTIN, Ronit (eds.): *Racism and Anti-Racism in Ireland.* Belfast: BTP Publications, 2002, pp. 91-101.

GURDGIEV, Constantin (2007): Migration and EU Enlargement: The Case of Ireland v Denmark. In: *Romanian Journal of European Studies*. (2006) Issue 4.

GWYNN, Robin: Government Policy towards Huguenot Immigration and Settlement in England and Ireland. In: CALDICOTT, C. E. J. (ed.): *The Huguenots and Ireland - Anatomy of an Emigration.* Dublin: Glendale Press, 1987, pp.

HALL, Stuart: Racist Ideologies and the Media. In: MARRIS, Paul; THORNHAM, Sue (ed.): *Media Studies - a Reader.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996, pp. 160-68.

HALL, Stuart: The West and the Rest. In: HALL, Stuart et al. (ed.): *Formations of Modernity.* Cambridge: Polity Press, 1992, pp. 275-317.

HALL, Stuart: *Policing the Crisis.* London et al.: Macmillan, 1981.

HALLENBERGER, Gerd: Meinungsbildung durch Fernsehen. In: *TV Diskurs 64 - Medien und Politik.* (2013). Issue 02, pp. 72-3.

HARCUP, Tony; O'NEILL, Deirdre: What Is News? Galtung and Ruge revisited. In: *Journalism Studies.* Vol. 2 (2001) Issue 2, pp. 261-80.

HARRIS, Tim: Restoration Ireland - Themes and Problems. In: DENNEHY, Coleman A. (ed.): *Restoration Ireland - Always Settling and Never Settled.* Aldershot, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2008, pp. 1-17.

HASEBRINK, Uwe; SCHMIDT, Jan-Hinrik: *Informationsrepertoires der deutschen Bevölkerung.* Arbeitspapiere des Hans-Bredow-Instituts Nr. 24

HAUGHEY, Nuala: Media and Racism. In: FARRELL, Fintan; WATT, Philip (eds.): *Responding to Racism in Ireland.* Dublin: Veritas, 2001, pp. 127-36.

HAYES-MCCOY, G.A.: The Tudor Conquest. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 139-51.

HAYNES, Amanda; DEVEREUX, Eoin; BREEN, Michael, J.: Fear, Framing and Foreigners: The Othering of Immigrants in the Irish Print Media. In: *International Journal of Critical Psychology.* (2006) Issue 16, pp. 100-21.

HAYNES, Amanda; POWER, Martin J.; DEVEREUX, Eoin (2010): *How Irish Politicians Construct Transnational EU Migrants.* Limerick: Doras Luimni.

HEPP, Andreas; WINTER, Rainer: Cultural Studies als transdisziplinäres Projekt kritischer Kulturanalyse. In: HEPP, Andreas; WINTER, Rainer (eds.): *Kultur - Medien - Macht - Cultural Studies und Medienanalyse.* Wiesbaden: Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, 2008, pp. 9-22.

HOARE, Quintin; NOWELL SMITH, Geoffrey: *Antonio Gramsci.* London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1982.

HOLFTER, Gisela: *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* Amsterdam et al.: Rodopi, 2006a.

HOLFTER, Gisela: Overview and Background. *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* In: HOLFTER, Gisela (ed.): *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* Amsterdam et al.: Rodopi, 2006b, pp. 1-20.

HOLFTER, Gisela: Ernst Scheyer. In: HOLFTER, Gisela (ed.): *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* Amsterdam et al.: Rodopi, 2006c, pp. 149-70.

HOLOHAN, Emma: *Immigrant Victims of Crime in Ireland: The Experience of Victim Support Service Providers in Providing Support to Immigrants.* Dublin, 2011.

HOLT, Eddie: Newspapers, Provincial. In: LALOR, Brian (ed.): *The Encyclopedia of Ireland.* Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2003, p. 779.

HORGAN, John: *Irish media: a Critical History Since 1922.* Kindle edition, 2001.

HORGAN, John; O'CONNOR, Barbara; SHEEHAN, Helena: *Mapping Irish Media.* Dublin: University College Dublin Press, 2007.

HOWE, Stephen: *Ireland and Empire.* Oxford et al.: Oxford University Press, 2000.

HYLTON, Raymond: Elites and Assimilation: The Question of Leadership within Dublin's Corps du Refuge, 1642-1740. In: VIGNE, Randolph (ed.): *From Strangers to Citizens - the Integration of Immigrant Communities in Britain, Ireland and Colonial America; 1550 - 1750; [proceedings of a conference convened in London on April 5 - 7, 2001 by the Huguenot Society of Great Britain and Ireland].* Brighton et al.: Sussex Academic Press, 2001, pp. 427-34.

HYLTON, Raymond: The Huguenot Settlement at Portarlington, 1692-1771. In: CALDICOTT, C. E. J. (ed.): *The Huguenots and Ireland - Anatomy of an Emigration.* Dublin: Glendale Press, 1987, pp. 297-320.

HYLTON, Raymond: *Ireland's Huguenots and their Refuge, 1662 - 1745.* Brighton et al.: Sussex Academic Press, 2005.

HYMAN, Louis: *The Jews of Ireland.* Shannon: Irish University Press, 1972.

IMMIGRANT COUNCIL OF IRELAND (2009): *Directory of Migrant Led Organisations.* Dublin.

JÄGER, Siegfried; MAIER, Florentine: Theoretical and Methodological Aspects of Foucauldian Critical Discourse Analysis and Dispositive Analysis. In: WODAK, Ruth (ed.): *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis.* Los Angeles, Calif. et al.: SAGE, 2009, pp. 34-61.

JONES, Steve: *Antonio Gramsci.* London et al.: Routledge, 2008.

JURT, Joseph: Pierre Bourdieu - Eine Soziologie der symbolischen Güter. In: HOFMANN, Martin Ludwig et al. (eds.): *Culture Club - Klassiker der Kulturtheorie.* 2004, pp. 204-19.

KEELEY, Brian: *Internationale Migration.* Bonn: Bundeszentrale für Politische Bildung, 2010.

KELLY, Mary: Censorship, Broadcasting. In: LALOR, Brian (ed.): *The Encyclopedia of Ireland.* Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2003, pp. 180-1.

KENNY, Colum: Finding a Voice or Fitting in? Migrants and Media in the New Ireland. In: *Media, Culture, Society* Vol. 32 (2010) Issue 2, pp. 311-22.

KEOGH, Dermot: Irish Refugee Policy, Anti-Semitism and Nazism at the Approach of World War Two. In: HOLFTER, Gisela (ed.): *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* Amsterdam et al.: Rodopi, 2006, pp. 37-74..

KEOGH, Dermot: *Jews in Twentieth-Century Ireland - Refugees, Anti-Semitism and the Holocaust.* Cork: Cork University Press, 1998.

KING-O'RIAIN, Rebekka Chiyoko: Media Perspectives on Chinese Migrants in Ireland. In: FANNING, Bryan; MUNCK, Ronaldo (eds.): *Globalization, Migration and Social Transformation - Ireland in Europe and the World.* Farnham, Surrey; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011, pp. 205-216.

KOCKEL, Ullrich: Countercultural Migrants in the West of Ireland. In: KING, Russell (ed.): *Contemporary Irish Migration.* Dublin: Geographical Society of Ireland, 1991, pp. 70-82.

KRIPPENDORFF, Klaus: *Content Analysis.* Thousand Oaks et al.: 2nd ed. SAGE, 2004.

LEITCH, Vincent B.: *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism.* New York et al.: 2nd ed. Norton, 2010.

LENTIN, Ronit: Pregnant Silence: (En)gendering Ireland's Asylum Space. In: *Patterns of Prejudice.* Vol. 37 (2003) Issue 3, pp. 301-22.

LENTIN, Ronit: *The Expanding Nation: Towards a Multi-Ethnic Ireland.* Proceedings of a conference held in Trinity College Dublin, 22-24 September 1998. Dublin: Trinity College Dublin, Department of Sociology, 1998.

LENTIN, Ronit; MCVEIGH, Robbie: *After Optimism? Ireland, Racism and Globalisation.* Dublin: 2006.

LENTIN, Ronit; MCVEIGH, Robbie: *Racism and Anti-Racism in Ireland.* Belfast: BTP Publications, 2002.

LIVINGSTONE, Sonia: The Work of Elihu Katz: Conceptualizing Media Effects in Context. In: CORNER, J.; SCHLESINGER, P.; SILVERSTONE, R. (eds.): *International Media Research: A Critical Survey.* London: Routledge, 1997, pp. 18-47.

LORIMER, Rowland: *Mass Communications.* Manchester et al.: Manchester University Press, 1994.

LOYAL, Steven: *Understanding Immigration in Ireland.* Manchester et al.: Manchester University Press, 2011.

LYDON, J. F.: The Medieval English Colony. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 113-24.

MARTIN, F. X.: Allies and an Overlord, 1169-72. In: COSGROVE, Art (ed.): *A New History of Ireland - Vol. 2: Medieval Ireland, 1169-1534.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008, pp. 67-97.

MARTIN, F. X.: The Normans: Arrival and Settlement. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 95-112.

MAYRING, Philipp: *Qualitative Inhaltsanalyse.* Weinheim et al.: 10th rev. ed. Beltz, 2008.

MCCOMBS, Maxwell E.; SHAW, Donal L.: The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media. In: *The Public Opinion Quarterly.* Vol. 36 (1972) Issue 2, pp. 176-87.

MCCORMACK, Anthony M.: The Social and Economic Consequences of the Desmond Rebellion of 1579-83. In: *Irish Historical Studies.* Vol. 34 (2004) Issue 133, pp. 1-15.

MCDOWELL, R. B.: The Protestant Nation. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 190-203.

MCDOWELL, R. B.: *Ireland in the Age of Imperialism and Revolution, 1760-1801.* Oxford: Clarendon, 1979.

MCGRATH, Charles Ivar: Securing the Protestant Interest: The Origins and Purpose of the Penal Laws of 1695. In: *Irish Historical Studies.* Vol. 30 (1996) Issue 117, pp. 25-46.

MCGURK, John: The Flight of the Earls: Escape or Strategic Regrouping? In: *History Ireland.* Vol. 15 (2007) Issue 4, pp. 16-21.

MCGURK, John: The Irish in European Armies (sixteenth to eighteenth centuries). In: O'SULLIVAN, Patrick (ed.): *The Irish World Wide - Patterns of Migration.* Leicester et al.: 1992, pp. 13-35.

MEADE, Rosie: Mayday, Mayday! Newspaper Framing Anti-Globalizers! A Critical Analysis of the Irish Independent's Anticipatory Coverage of the 'Day of the Welcomes' Demonstrations. In: *Journalism.* Vol. 9 (2008) Issue 3, pp. 330-52.

MERTEN, Klaus: Medienanalyse in der Mediengesellschaft. In: WÄGENBAUR, Thomas (ed.): *Medienanalyse - Methoden, Ergebnisse, Grenzen.* Baden-Baden: Nomos, 2007, pp. 21-50.

MEYEN, Michael: Massenmedien. In: HÜTHER, Jürgen; SCHORB, Bernd (eds.): *Grundbegriffe Medienpädagogik.* München: kopaed, 2005, pp. 228-33.

MILLER, Kerby A.: Revenge for Skibbereen: Irish Emigration and the Meaning of the Great Famine. In: GRIBEEN, Arthur (ed.): *The Great Famine and the Irish Diaspora in America.* Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1999, pp. 180-95.

MOODY, T. W.: The Treatment of the Native Population under the Scheme for the Plantation in Ulster. In: *Irish Historical Studies.* Vol. 1 (1938) Issue 1, pp. 59-63.

MUCHITSCH, Wolfgang: Austrian Refugees in Ireland 1938-1945. In: HOLFTER, Gisela (ed.): *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* Amsterdam et al.: Rodopi, 2006, pp. 75-88.

MÜHLAU, Peter; KALISZEWSKA, Monika; RÖDER, Antje (a): *Polonia in Dublin.* Preliminary Report of Survey Findings, Report No. 1, Demographic Overview. Trinity Immigration Initiative Parallel Societies or Overlapping Identities Project. Dublin: Trinity College.

MÜHLAU, Peter; KALISZEWSKA, Monika; RÖDER, Antje (b): *Polonia in Dublin: Polish migrants' percepetions of quality of life, earnings and work.* Report of Survey Findings, Report No. 2. Trinity Immigration Initiative Parallel Societies or Overlapping Identities Project. Dublin: Trinity College.

NEUENDORF, Kimberly A.: *The Content Analysis Guidebook.* Thousand Oaks et al.: Sage, 2002.

NEUMAYER, Eric: Asylum Recognition Rates in Western Europe. In: *Journal of Conflict Resolution.* Vol. 49 (2005a) Issue 1, pp. 43-66.

NEUMAYER, Eric: Bogus Refugees? The Determinants of Asylum Migration to Western Europe. In: *International Studies Quarterly.* Vol. 49 (2005b) Issue 3, pp. 389-409.

NOETZEL, Thomas: *Geschichte Irlands.* Darmstadt: Primus-Verlag, 2003.

O'CONNOR, Patrick J: *People Make Places - the Story of the Palatines.* Newcastle West: Oireacht na Mumhan Books, 1989.

O'DAY, Alan: Newspapers and Periodicals. In: LALOR, Brian (ed.): *The Encyclopedia of Ireland.* Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2003, p. 779.

O'FLAHERTY, Eamon: Ecclesiastical Politics and the Dismantling of the Penal Laws in Ireland, 1774-82. In: *Irish Historical Studies.* Vol. 26 (1988) Issue 101, pp. 33-50.

O'RIORDAN, Manus: *The Sinn Fein Tradition of Anti-Semitism.* Dublin: Labour History Workshop, 1982.

O'SULLIVAN, Patrick: *The Irish World Wide.* Leicester et al.: Leicester University Press, 1992.

PRIETO RAMOS, Fernando: *Media und Migrants.* Oxford et al.: Lang, 2004.

RABINOW, Paul; ROSE, Nikolas: *The Essential Foucault.* New York et al.: New Press, 2003.

RASCHE, Hermann: Pfälzer in Irland. Deutschstämmige Siedlungen in der Grafschaft Limerick. In: FISCHER, Joachim (ed.): *Deutsch-irische Verbindungen - Geschichte - Literatur - Übersetzung; Akten der 1. Limericker Konferenz für Deutsch-Irische Studien, 2. - 4. September 1997 = Irish-German connections.* Trier: Wissenschaftlicher Verlag Trier, 1998, pp. 47-54.

RENZING, Rüdiger: *Pfälzer in Irland.* Kaiserslautern: Institut für Pfälzische Geschichte und Volkskunde, 1989.

RIFFE, Daniel et al.: Effectiveness of Random, Consecutive Day and Constructed Week Sampling. In: KRIPPENDORFF, Klaus; BOCK, Mary Angela (eds.): *The Content Analysis Reader.* Thousand Oaks, Calif. et al.: Sage, 2009, pp. 54-9.

ROBINSON, Philip: *The Plantation of Ulster.* Belfast: Ulster Historical Foundation, 2000.

RUBERTO, Laura E.: *Gramsci, Migration, and the Representation of Women's Work in Italy and the U.S.* Lanham, Md. et al.: Lexington Books, 2007.

SAID, Edward: Afterword: Reflections on Ireland and Postcolonialism. In: CARROLL, Clare; KING, Patricia (eds.): *Ireland and Postcolonial Theory.* Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003, pp 177-185.

SHOEMAKER, Pamela J.: News and Newsworthiness: A Commentary. In: *Communications.* Vol. 36 (2006), Issue 1, pp. 105-11.

SIEV, Raphael V.: The Admission of Refugees into Ireland between 1933 and 1945. In: HOLFTER, Gisela (ed.): *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* Amsterdam et al.: Rodopi, 2006, pp. 109-18.

SIMMS, J. G.: The Establishment of Protestant Ascendancy, 1691-14. In: MOODY, Theodor W.; VAUGHAN, W. E. (eds.): *A New History of Ireland. Eighteenth Century Ireland, 1691-1800.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009c, pp. 1-30.

SIMMS, J. G.: The Restoration and the Jacobite War. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001a, pp. 165-75.

SIMMS, J. G.: The Restoration, 1660-85. In: COSGROVE, Art et al. (eds.): *Early Modern Ireland, 1534-1691.* Oxford [England]; New York: Oxford University Press, 2009a, pp. 420-53.

SIMMS, J.G.: The War of the Two Kings, 1685-91. In: COSGROVE, Art et al. (eds.): *Early Modern Ireland, 1534-1691.* Oxford [England]; New York: Oxford University Press, 2009b, pp. 478-508.

SUN, Da-Wen: The Experience of Chinese Postgraduate Students: Academic Advantages and Disadvantages; Practical and Personal Difficulties. In: COX, Wendy; CAMERON, David (eds.): *Chinese Students in Ireland: New Opportunities, New Needs, New Challenges.* International Council for International Students, 2001, pp. 33-38.

TITLEY, Gavan; KERR, Aphra: Polish Migrants and Media Transnationalism. In: FANNING, Bryan; MUNCK, Ronaldo (eds.): *Globalization, Migration and Social Transformation - Ireland in Europe and the World.* Farnham, Surrey; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2011, pp. 193-204.

VIZEUM: *What's in store for Irish Media in 2013?* Dublin.

WALES, Gerard of: *The History and Topography of Ireland.* Harlow: Penguin Classics, 1983.

WALKER, Colin: Robert Weil. In: HOLFTER, Gisela (ed.): *German-Speaking Exiles in Ireland 1933-1945.* Amsterdam et al.: Rodopi, 2006, pp. 133-48.

WALL, Maureen: The Age of the Penal Laws. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 176-89.

WARD, Eilis: A Big Show-Off to Show What We Could Do: Ireland and the Hungarian Refugee Crisis of 1956. In: *Irish Studies in International Affairs.* Vol. 7 (1996), pp. 131-41.

WHELAN, Kevin: Between Filiation and Affiliation - The Politics of Postcolonial Memory. In: CARROLL, Clare; KING, Patricia (eds.): *Ireland and Postcolonial Theory.* Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003, pp. 91-108.

WHYTE, J. H.: Age of Daniel O'Conell. In: MOODY, Theodore W.; MARTIN, Francis X. (eds.): *The Course of Irish History.* Dublin: Mercier Press, 2001, pp. 204-18.

WODAK, Ruth; MEYER, Michael: Critical Discourse Analysis: History, Agenda, Theory and Methodology. In: WODAK, Ruth; MEYER, Michael (eds.): *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis.* Los Angeles, Calif. et al.: SAGE, 2009, pp. 1-33.

ZÖLLER, Michael: Max Weber. In: MAIER, Hans (ed.): *Klassiker des Politischen Denkens.* München: Beck, 2001, pp. 205-22.

Ó GRÁDA, Cormac: *Jewish Ireland in the Age of Joyce.* Princeton, NJ et al.: Princeton University Press, 2006.

Research literature available online

AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL: *Nigeria: Amnesty International Condemns Death Sentences Imposed on Ken Saro-Wiwa and other Ogoni Detainees after Blatantly Unfair Trials.* http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AFR44/026/1995/en/0a910fab-eb2c-11dd-92ac-295bdf97101f/afr440261995en.pdf (last accessed 14/07/14).

BARNADOS: *Separated Children.* http://www.barnardos.ie/what-we-do/campaign-and-lobby/separated-children.html (last accessed 02/09/13).

BARRETT, Alan: EU Enlargement and Ireland's Labour Market. In: OECD (ed.): *Free Movement of Workers and Labour Market Adjustment: Recent Experiences from OECD Countries and the European Union.* OECD Publishing. http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264177185-6-en.

BATALOVA, Jeanne; TERRAZAS, Aaron: *US in Focus.* www.migrationinformation.org/feature/display.cfm?ID=818 (last accessed 01/08/13).

BBC h2g2: *Falun Gong - an Evil Cult?* http://www.bbc.co.uk/dna/ptop/A2922644 (last accessed 18/03/13).

BEWS AFRICA: *Nigeria's Boko Haram: Why You Need to Know.* http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-14906615 (last accessed 02/02/14).

BBC NEWS ASIA: *Country Profile China.* http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-asia-pacific-13017879 (last accessed 16/02/14).

BBC News: *Falun Gong: A New Cult Emerges.* http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/asia-pacific/330367.stm (last accessed 18/03/13).

BBC: *The Mystery of Ireland's Worst Driver.* http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/7899171.stm (last accessed 12/06/13).

BELL, Brian; MACHIN, Stephen: *The Impact of Migration on Crime and Victimisation.* Available at https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/257233/lse-consulting.pdf. (last accessed 10/10/13).

BRANDI, Silvia: Unveiling the Ideological Construction of the 2004 Irish Citizenship Referendum: A Critical Discourse Analytical Approach. In: *Translocations.* Vol. 2 (2007) Issue 1, pp. 26-47, E-Journal.

BUSINESS & LEADERSHIP: *Chinedu Onyejelem wins fourth David Manley Media award.* http://www.businessandleadership.com/leadership/item/39184-chinedu-onyejelem-wins-four (last accessed 02/02/14).

C&N YOUR COMMUNITY PLATFORM: *Sun Emerald Chinese News.* http://www.hushbay.com/pages/Sun-Emerald-Chinese-News--Dublin-363.html (last accessed 16/02/14).

CARDIFF UNIVERSITY: *Max Weber - Class, Status and Power.* http://www.cf.ac.uk/socsi/undergraduate/introsoc/weber11.html (last accessed 10/01/14).

CLEAN THE NIGER DELTA: *Who Was Ken Saro-Wiwa?* http://www.cleanthenigerdelta.org/index.php/whowaskensarowiwa (last accessed 16/05/13).

CONNOLLY, Maeve; Ging, Debbie; Malcolm, Jackie: *Report on the Forum on Media and Interculturalism*. Dublin City University. http://www.dcu.ie/communications/index.shtml#conclusions. (last accessed 14/04/2010).

CONWAY, Brian: Who Do We Think We Are? Immigration and the Discursive Construction of National Identity in an Irish Daily Mainstream Newspaper, 1996-2004. In: *Translocations.* Vol.1 (2006) Issue 1, pp. 76-93, E-Journal.

DEFAOITE, Dara: *Town Elects First Black Mayor.* http://www.independent.ie/irish-news/town-elects-first-black-mayor-26300693.html (last accessed 16/04/13).

DOUGLAS, Torin: *Forty Years of the Sun.* http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk_news/magazine/3654446.stm (last accessed 12/01/14).

EDMONDS, Rick: *The State of the News Media 2013.* Available at http://stateofthemedia.org/2013/newspapers-stabilizing-but-still-threatened/ (last accessed 18/07/13).

EMBASSY OF THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA IN IRELAND: *Falun Gong.* http://ie.china-embassy.org/eng/ztlt/FalunGongCult/ (last accessed 18/03/13).

ENCYCLOPEDIA BRITANNICA: *Nigeria - The Second Republic.* http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/414840/Nigeria/214177/The-Second-Republic (last accessed 18/07/14).

EUROPEAN COMMISSION: *Impact of EU Membership on Ireland.* http://ec.europa.eu/ireland/ireland_in_the_eu/impact_of_membership_on_ireland/index_en.htm (last accessed 04/07/2013).

EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS: *European Union Minorities and Discrimination Survey.* Available at http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/414-EU-MIDIS_GLANCE_EN.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

EUROPEAN UNION AGENCY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS: *Minorities in selected newspapers of six EU Member States: a pilot project.* http://fra.europa.eu/en/publication/2012/minorities-selected-newspapers-six-eu-member-states (last accessed 12/01/13).

FAGAN, Paula: *Migrant Women and Domestic Violence in Ireland: The Experience of Domestic Violence Service Providers.* http://www.ucd.ie/werrc/Paulafaganresearch.pdf (last accessed 15.01.11).

FEELEY, Pat: *Aspects of the 1904 Pogrom.* Available at http://www.limerickcity.ie/media/Media,3959,en.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

FELDMAN, Alice et al: *Getting On - From Migration to Integration: Chinese, Indian, Lithuanian and Nigerian Migrants' Experiences in Ireland.* Available at http://www.immigrantcouncil.ie/research-publications/archive/268-getting-on-from-migration-to-integration-chinese-indian-lithuanian-and-nigerian-migrants-experiences-in-ireland. (last accessed 20/01/13).

FERNUNI HAGEN: *Zur Geschichte der Medienwissenschaft.* http://www.fernuni-hagen.de/KSW/bakwmfs/pdf/3535_Hahn_L2.pdf (last accessed 10/01/14).

FISHER, Jonah: *Why Can't Nigeria Defeat Boko Haram?* http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-15690981 (last accessed 02/02/14).

FLYNN, Rosanna: After Toyosi. In: *Red Banner Magazine.* (2010) Issue 41, pp. 2-6, Online Journal.

Focus Magazin: *Falun Gong: Offizielle Sekte.* http://www.focus.de/magazin/archiv/falun-gong-offizielle-sekte_aid_210386.html (last accessed 18/03/13).

FOCUS MIGRATION: *Internal Migration in China - Opportunity or Trap?* Available at http://www.bpb.de/gesellschaft/migration/151359/internal-migration-in-china (last accessed 16/02/14).

FOLEY, Michael: *Media Landscapes: Ireland.* http://ejc.net/media_landscapes/ireland (last accessed 03/01/14).

GAVENTA, Jonathan (2013): *Power after Lukes: An Overview of Theories of Power since Lukes and Their Application to Development.* http://www.powercube.net/wp-content/uploads/2009/11/power_after_lukes.pdf (last accessed 10/01/14).

GLUCKSMAN LIBRARY: *The Limerick Chronicle.* http://ulir.ul.ie/handle/10344/220 (last accessed 10/01/14).

GROENENDIJK, Kees: *Local Voting Rights for Non-Nationals in Europe: What We Know and What We Need to Learn.* Available at http://www.migrationpolicy.org/transatlantic/docs/Groenendijk-final.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

HAYNES, Amanda; DEVEREUX, Eoin; BREEN, Michael J.: In the Know? Media, Migration and Public Belief. In: *Translocations: Migration and Social Change.* Vol. 5 (2009) Issue 1, E-Journal.

HEBERER, Thomas (2001): *Falungong - Religion, Sekte oder Kult?* Available at: https://www.uni-due.de/in-east/fileadmin/publications/gruen/paper36.pdf (last accessed 15/02/15).

Human Rights Watch: *World Report 2013 - China.* http://www.hrw.org/world-report/2013/country-chapters/china?page=1 (last accessed 11/02/14).

IFS DORTMUND: *Aspekte und Inhalte verschiedener Definitionen des Medienbegriffs.* http://miteb.ifs-dortmund.de/medio/ab16/v-info2.htm (last accessed 14/01/14).

IGLICKA, Krystyna; ZIOLEK-SKRZYPCZAK, Magdalena: *EU Membership Highlights Poland's Migration Challenges.* http://www.migrationinformation.org/Profiles/display.cfm?ID=800 (last accessed 05/02/14).

IMMIGRATION CONTROL PLATFORM: *Home page.* http://www.immigrationcontrol.org/ (last accessed 08/07/13).

INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF UNIVERSITIES: *Affirming Academic Values in Internationalization of Higher Education: A Call for Action.* Available at http://www.iau-aiu.net/sites/all/files/Affirming_Academic_Values_in_Internationalization_of_Higher_Education.pdf (last accessed 13/03/13).

INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR MIGRATION: *Mapping Exercise Nigeria.* Available at http://www.iomdublin.org/sites/default/files/Nigeria%20mapping%20%282010%29.pdf (last accessed 20/01/15)

IRISH SPORTS COUNCIL: *Social and Economic Value.* Available at http://www.irishsportscouncil.ie/Research/Social_Economic_Value_2005_/Social_Economic_Value.pdf (last accessed 15/05/13).

JOHNSTON, Ruth: *Your Place & Mine - Belfast Newsletter.* http://www.bbc.co.uk/northernireland/yourplaceandmine/belfast/newsletter.shtml (last accessed 10/01/14).

KROPIWIEC, Katarzyna; KING-O'RIAIN, Rebecca Chiyoko: *Polish Migrant Workers in Ireland. National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI), Community Profiles Series.* http://www.nccri.ie/publications-other.html (last accessed 20/01/13).

LACZKO, Frank: *Europe Attracts More Migrants from China.* http://www.migrationinformation.org/Feature/display.cfm?ID=144 (last accessed 05/02/14).

LATHAM, Kevin; WU, Bin: *Chinese Immigration into the EU: New Trends, Dynamic and Implications.* Available at http://www.euecran.eu/Long%20Papers/ECRAN%20Chinese%20Immigration %20into%20the%20EU_%20Kevin%20Latham%20and%20Bin%20Wu.pdf (last accessed 15/02/14).

LEMKE, Thomas: *An Indigestible Meal? Foucault, Governmentality and State Theory.* Available at http://www.thomaslemkeweb.de/publikationen/IndigestibleMealfinal5.pdf (last accessed 22/08/13).

LONDRAS, Fiona de: *The Murder of Toyosi Shittabey and Racial Tension in Dublin.* http://humanrights.ie/criminal-justice/the-murder-of-toyosi-shittabey-and-racial-tension-in-dublin/ (last accessed 27/06/13).

MARCHELEWSKA, Emilia; FORUM POLONIA: *Polish Community in Post Boom Ireland. 2010.* Available at http://www.tcd.ie/immigration/css/downloads/Marchelewska.pdf (last accessed 08/02/14).

MBERU, Blessing U.; PONGOU, Roland: *Nigeria: Multiple Forms of Mobility in Africa's Demographic Giant.* http://www.migrationinformation.org/Profiles/display.cfm?ID=788 (last accessed 02/02/14).

MCALEER, Marie-Claire: *Time to Go?* Available at http://www.youth.ie/sites/youth.ie/files/NYCI_Youth_Emigration_Report.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

MCGINNITY, Frances et al.: *Annual Monitoring Report on Integration 2012.* Available at http://www.integrationcentre.ie/getattachment/eda7574b-b459-4045-be11-123b74bcdb0d/Annual-Monitoring-Report-on-Integration-2012.aspx (last accessed 18/10/13).

MCGREGOR, Judy: *Restating News Values: Contemporary Criteria for Selecting the News.* Available at http://www.hss.bond.edu.au/ANZCA/papers/JMcGregorPaper.pdf (last accessed 15/01/13).

MCMANUS, John: *Quality Gap between Newspapers and Television Newscasts Widens in BayArea, Researchers Find.* http://news.stanford.edu/pr/03/grade924.html (last accessed 03/09/13)

MIGRATION NEWS: *Ireland: Foreign Workers.* https://migration.ucdavis.edu/mn/more.php?id=55_0_4_0 (last accessed 04/03/14).

MÜLLNER, Birgit Kirsten; SVEC, Barbara: *Länderbericht Nigeria August 2004.* Available at http://www.ecoi.net/file_upload/hl56_ACCORD_Landerbericht_Nigeria_.pdf (last accessed 16/08/14).

MURPHY, Antoin, E.: *The 'Celtic Tiger' - An Analysis of Ireland's Economic Growth Performance.* Available at http://www.eui.eu/RSCAS/WP-Texts/00_16.pdf (last accessed 15/10/2011).

NASC - THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE (a): *Hidden Cork.* Available at http://www.nascireland.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/dp_report.pdf (last accessed 15/02/15).

NASC - THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE (b): *Campaign for Change - Direct Provision.* http://www.nascireland.org/campaigns-for-change/direct-provision/ (last accessed 27/02/14).

NASC – THE IRISH IMMIGRANT SUPPORT CENTRE (c): *The State's Double Standard on Undocumented Migrants.* http://www.nascireland.org/latest-news/the-states-double-standard-on-undocumented-migrants/ (last accessed 08/08/14).

NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM: *Incidents Reports.* http://www.nccri.ie/incidents-reports.html (last accessed 03/07/13).

NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM: *Reported Incidents Related to Racism and Strategic Responses from the NCCRI.* Available at http://www.nccri.ie/pdf/RacistIncidentsJuly-Dec08.pdf (last accessed 13/10/13).

NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM: *Seeking Advice and Redress against Racism in Ireland.* Available at http://www.nccri.ie/pdf/ROI-Guidebook.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE ON RACISM AND INTERCULTURALISM; UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES: *Challenging Myths and Misinformation about Asylum-Seekers and Refugees.* Available at http://www.nccri.ie/pdf/MythsRefugees-AsylumSeekers.pdf (last accessed 14/10/13).

NATIONAL UNION OF JOURNALISTS: *NUJ Guidelines on Race Reporting.* http://ethicaljournalisminitiative.org/en/contents/nuj-guidelines-on-race-reporting (last accessed 15/01/13).

NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL OF IRELAND: *Asylum Seekers, Refugees and Other Migrants - Key Definitions.* http://www.intercultural.ie/content/asylum-seekers-refugees-and-other-migrants-key-definitions (last accessed 15/01/11).

NWAGWUAGWU, Chinyere Victor: Experiences of Asylum Seekers in the Cork Area: the Persistence of Exclusion. In: *Translocations: Migration and Social Change.* Vol. 7 (2011) Issue 1, E-Journal.

O'FARRELL, Claire: *Key Concepts.* http://www.michel-foucault.com/concepts/ (last accessed 06/07/13).

O'REILLY, Emily: *Dealing with Asylum Seekers: Why Have We Gone Wrong?* http://www.ombudsman.gov.ie/en/News/Speeches-Articles/2013/Asylum-Seekers-Wrong.html (last accessed 20/02/14).

PAPADOPOULOS, Georgios: *Property Crime and Immigration in England and Wales. Evidence from the Offending, Crime and Justice Survey.* Paper presented at the 'Economics of Culture, Institutions, and Crime Conference'. Available at http://www.feem.it/userfiles/attach/2010118173754418_Papadopoulos_paper.pdf (last accessed 07/01/16)

PARNELL SOCIETY: *Programme Summer School 2010.* http://www.parnellsociety.com/pa_summer.htm (last accessed 05/06/10).

PAUER, Nina et al.: *Die große Vergiftung.* http://www.zeit.de/2013/21/internet-teilhabe-debattenkultur (last accessed 20/05/13).

PAVEE POINT TRAVELLER'S CENTRE: *Pre-Budget Submission for Budget 2011.* Available at http://www.socialjustice.ie/sites/default/files/file/Budget/Budget%202011/Pre-Budget%20Submissions/Pavee%20Point%20Pre%20Budget%202010.pdf (last accessed 01/03/13).

PAVEE POINT: *Home Page.* http://paveepoint.ie/ (last accessed 10/07/13).

POWERCUBE: *Bourdieu and 'Habitus'.* http://www.powercube.net/other-forms-of-power/bourdieu-and-habitus/ (last accessed 11/01/14).

PROJECT ATLAS: *China's Students Overseas.* http://www.iie.org/Services/Project-Atlas/China/Chinas-Students-Overseas (last accessed 12/02/14).

RABINOW, Paul; ROSE, Nikolas: *Thoughts on the Concept of Biopower Today.* Available at http://www.lse.ac.uk/sociology/pdf/RabinowandRose-BiopowerToday03.pdf (last accessed 15/02/15).

REENTS, Edo: *Auf der Damentoilette wurde ein Ring gefunden.* www.faz.net/-gsb-7aa28 (last accessed 19/06/13).

RIGHT LIVELIHOOD: *Ken Saro-Wiwa.* http://www.rightlivelihood.org/saro-wiwa.html (last accessed 16/05/13).

RUHS, Martin: *Ireland: A Crash Course in Immigration Policy.* http://www.migrationinformation.org/Feature/print.cfm?ID=260 (last accessed 31/01/09).

RUHS, Martin: *Ireland: From Rapid Immigration to Recession.* http://www.migrationinformation.org/Feature/display.cfm?ID=740 (last accessed 02/08/13).

SARMA, Kiran: Chasing a Rainbow? Victimisation and the Gay and Lesbian Community in Ireland. In: *Irish Journal of Applied Social Studies.* Vol. 5 (2004) Issue 1, Article 5. Available at http://arrow.dit.ie/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1035&context=ijass (last accessed 15/02/15).

SEIFERT, Wolfgang: *Migrations- und Integrationspolitik.* http://www.bpb.de/politik/grundfragen/deutsche-verhaeltnisse-eine-sozialkunde/138018/migrations-und-integrationspolitik (last accessed 30/08/13).

STANLEY, John: *Irish Immigration Law: An Introduction for Non-Governmental Organisations.* Available at http://pelorous.totallyplc.com/media_manager/public/138/john_stanley_immigration_law_pila.pdf (last accessed 18/10/13).

TANNER, Arno: *The Roma of Eastern Europe: Still Searching for Inclusion.* http://www.migrationinformation.org/Feature/display.cfm?ID=308 (last accessed 05/02/14).

THE IRISH TIMES: *The Story of Why - The Irish Times.* Available at http://www.youtube.com/watch?feature=player_embedded&v=zQMCvzCuFMQ (last accessed 09/01/14).

UGBA, Abel: *Mapping Minorities and their Media: The National Context - Ireland.* http://www.lse.ac.uk/collections/EMTEL/Minorities/reports.html (last accessed 11/10/10).

United Nations Economic and Social Council: *Measures to Improve the Situation and Ensure the Human Rights and Dignity of All Migrant Workers.* http://www.unhchr.ch/Huridocda/Huridoca.nsf/TestFrame/e696166bf66373f3c12566180046b9c6 (last accessed 15/01/11).

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE CORK: *Narratives of Migration and Return.* http://migration.ucc.ie/nmr/bibliography.html (last accessed 27/02/14).

WANG, Ying Yun: *Chinese Students in Ireland. National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI), Community Profiles Series.* http://www.nccri.ie/publications-other.html (last accessed 20/01/13).

WANG, Ying Yun: *The Chinese Earthquake Appeal Network in Ireland.* Available at http://www.tcd.ie/immigration/css/downloads/chineseearthquake26.05.09.pdf (last accessed 10/01/13).

WEINAR, A.: *Emigration from Poland in the Historical Perspective.* http://migrationeducation.de/25.1.html?&rid=20&cHash=8d83ad503e621157d24ff01e7e3289cb (last accessed 04/02/14).

YAU, Nicola: Celtic Tiger, Hidden Dragon: Exploring Identity among Second Generation Chinese in Ireland. In: *Translocations.* Vol. 2 (2007) Issue 1, pp. 48-69, E-Journal.