

# Contents

INTRODUCTION .....	21
1. General Background and Statement of the Problem .....	21
2. Circumstantiating the Problem in the Ethiopian Context .....	31
3. Research Questions .....	34
4. Literature Review .....	40
5. Purpose and Aim of the Study .....	45
6. Methodology .....	48
6.1. Analytical Approach: Vitality of Determining the Status of the Norms and the Rules of Interpretation .....	48
6.2. The Comparative Approach .....	50
6.3. Historical Approach .....	51
7. Limitations and Scope of the Study .....	52
8. Definition of Terms and Assumptions .....	54
8.1. Personal Liberty and Security .....	54
8.2. 'Terrorism' or 'Terrorist Act' .....	55
8.3. 'International Law Relating to Terrorism' .....	56
8.4. Human Rights as Constitutional Rights in the Ethiopian Context .....	57
9. Outline and Overview .....	58
CHAPTER 1 .....	63
Briefing the Post-1991 Ethiopian Politico-Legal Lineaments: Impetuses in Moulding the Extant Version of the Domestic 'Terrorism' Cliché	
1.1. Introduction .....	63
1.2. Ethiopia under the Current Government: A 'Feigning' Federalist State Hovering in the Hands of a 'One-Party' Authoritarian Regime .....	65
1.2.1. The Ethiopian Political Pandora since 1991: A Brief Backdrop .....	65
1.2.2. The FDRE Constitution and Its Content: A Synthesis of Trailblazing Values and the Divisive Normative and Institutional Quandaries .....	68

1.2.2.1. Ingenious Precepts of the Constitution .....	68
1.2.2.2. The Divisive Facets of the Constitution: A Mix of Normative and Institutional Quandaries .....	71
1.3. The Ensuing Taxonomy of the Ethiopian Regime Today .....	77
1.4. Two Façades of the Ethiopian Terrorism and Counterterrorism Discursive Plights: The International and the Domestic .....	83
1.5. Conclusion .....	88
 <b>CHAPTER 2 .....</b>	<b>93</b>
<b>The Quest for Human Rights Standardization in International Law Relating to Ter- rorism: Rethinking the ‘No Need of Compatibility’ Cliché in State’s Counterterrorism Obligations</b>	
<hr/>	
2.1. Introduction .....	93
2.2. The Place of Human Rights under the Extant Terrorism-Related Treaties. ....	95
2.2.1. The Rights of a Suspected Person under the Tokyo Convention on Offences and Certain Other Acts Committed On Board Aircraft. ....	97
2.2.2. Rights of the Suspect under the Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft .....	100
2.2.3. Rights of the Suspect under the Conventions Enacted for the Protection of the Safety of Special Potential Target Groups .....	102
2.2.4. Rights of the Suspect under the Treaties Enacted as Normative Tools for the Suppression of Potential Means and Methods of Perpetrating a Terrorist Act. ....	103
2.3. The Place of Human Rights under the Security Council Resolutions Relating to Terrorism .....	105
2.3.1. Concerns Shadowing the Security Council’s Counterterrorism Measures .....	107
2.3.2. Some Affirmative Prospects of the Resolutions on Human Rights: Magnifying the Invisible Aspect. ....	110
2.3.2.1. The Pre-9/11 Resolutions of the Council and Its Stand on Human Rights Complementarity .....	110
2.3.2.2. The Post-9/11 Resolutions and the Requisite of Human Rights Complementarity .....	111

2.4. Human Rights under the General Assembly Resolutions Relating to Terrorism: Signals of the Desired 'Political Will' .....	118
2.4.1. Human Rights under the Pre-9/11 General Assembly Resolutions on Terrorism .....	120
2.4.2. Human Rights in the Post-9/11 General Assembly Resolutions Related to Terrorism .....	122
2.4.3. Unlawful Deprivation of Liberty and the Requisite of Legality in Criminalization of Terrorism .....	125
2.4.4. Human Rights under the General Assembly Mega Strategies in Countering Terrorism.....	128
2.4.5. The UN Global Counterterrorism Strategy: Centring Human Rights as a Pillar .....	131
2.5. Conclusion .....	133

### CHAPTER 3 .....137

#### The Terrorism Discourse and Anchoring Its Definitional Lacuna in International Law: A Step in Appraising Ethiopia's 'Self-Guided' National Approach

---

3.1. Introduction .....	137
3.2. Tracing the Recent-Past Attempts in Pursuing the Legal Definitional Consensus .....	141
3.2.1. General Remarks .....	141
3.2.2. The Quest for Comprehensive Legal Definition of Terrorism in International Law .....	143
3.2.3. Earlier and Recent Bids for Comprehensive and Discrete Legal Definition of Terrorism .....	145
3.2.4. Recent Endeavours by the UN General Assembly .....	150
3.2.5. The 1994 UN General Assembly 'Working Definition' .....	155
3.3. UN Security Council and Its Contribution in the Definitional Discourse....	158
3.4. Existing International Treaties on 'Distinctive Acts of' or 'Related to' Terrorism.....	160
3.5. The Draft Comprehensive Convention and the Proposed Definition on 'Terrorism'.....	166
3.6. The Definitional Evolution Evocations under Customary International Law: International Crime of Terrorism? .....	170
3.7. The Definitional Outlook in the African Legal Frameworks against Terrorism	174

3.7.1. The Scope of the Convention's Application Versus Its Paradoxical Approach to the Right to Self-Determination.....	177
3.7.2. Further Snags Pertaining to the Definitional Elements of the Crime .....	181
3.7.2.1. Issue of Legality .....	183
3.7.2.2. Composite Elements of the Crime .....	184
3.7.2.3. The Protection Aspect to the 'Undefined' Subjects .....	184
3.8. Summary: Rooting a Human Rights-Based Approach to the Definitional Hole 186	
3.9. Conclusion: Proposed Definitional Guideline.....	191

#### CHAPTER 4 .....193

##### A Crime of 'Terrorist Act' under the Ethiopian Anti-Terrorism Law: A Critical Appraisal of its Definitional Scope in Light of the International Terrorism Law's Lensing Purview

---

4.1. Introduction .....	193
4.2. Ethiopia's Exposure to the Existing International Law Relating to Terrorism. ....	194
4.3. The Pre-2009 National Legislative Frameworks Addressing Terrorism .....	198
4.3.1. The 1957 Penal Code of Ethiopia.....	199
4.3.2. The 2004 Revised Ethiopian Criminal Code.....	202
4.4. The Post-2009 Terrorism and Related National Legislation.....	206
4.5. Glancing the Content and Structure of the Anti-Terrorism Proclamation .....	210
4.6. Criminalizing a Terrorist Act and Its Definition in the Proclamation .....	212
4.6.1. Actual Targets of the Crime Protected by the Definition .....	213
4.6.2. The Unlatched Scope of the Definition in Light of the International Standard .....	214
4.6.3. Imprecision of Terms and Immeasurable Thresholds .....	218
4.7. The Definition of a 'Terrorist Act' under Proclamation No 780/2013: A Lost Opportunity and Signal of Same-Old Reminisce. ....	220
4.8. Offences Pertaining to an Act of Terrorism.....	224
4.8.1. Incipient or Early-Stage Offences Related to a Terrorist Act .....	225
4.8.2. Support- and Participation-Related Terrorist Offences.....	230

4.9. Conclusion .....	235
-----------------------	-----

## CHAPTER 5 ..... 239

### Proscribing Groups as Terrorist Organizations: Whose Mandate Is It for That Matter? Assessing Ethiopia's 'Judiciary-Exclusion' Approach

---

5.1. Introduction .....	239
5.2. Proscription under the UN Security Council Scheme.....	241
5.2.1. The 1267 Sanctions Committee and Its Perplexing Aura of Infallibility .....	241
5.2.2. Challenges against the Sanctions Committee.....	243
5.2.3. Reforms in the Security Council Sanctioning Regime: A Far- Sighting Lens Spotting the Ethiopian Context.....	248
5.2.4. The 1373 Sanctioning Regime and Its Unauthenticated Upshot of Licensing Hysterical National Proscriptions: Exemplifying the Ethiopian Approach .....	250
5.3. The Proscription Regime in the Ethiopian Legal Framework .....	253
5.3.1. The Ethiopian 'De jure Legislative' and 'De facto Executive' Proscription Regime and Its Variegated Ammunition .....	256
5.3.1.1. Assuming Judicial Function through Usurpation of Legislative Power is Unconstitutional .....	260
5.3.1.2. The Parliamentary Voting System, 'Legislature-Executive', and 'Government-Party' Identity Fusion versus Impotent Institutional Competency.....	261
5.3.1.3. The Furphy Mantra of 'Whole-Inclusive' Metaphor of Terrorism versus the Right of People to Resist Oppressive Regime.....	264
5.3.2. Specific Rights Discarded under the Proscription Regime.....	271
5.3.2.1. Access to Justice and Its Confounding Fell in the Proclamation .....	271
5.3.2.2. The Justiciable Nature of Proscription as a Legal Matter. ....	274
5.3.2.3. The Absence of Any Reviewing or Appeal Mechanism against the Decision .....	276
5.3.2.4. Evidentiary Standards and 'One-Direction-Flown' Evidence for Proscription.....	277
5.4. Conclusion .....	279

<b>CHAPTER 6</b> .....	<b>283</b>
Countering Terrorism and the Pursuit of the Right to Liberty and Security of Person: International Human Rights Law as a Standard Legal Framework	
<hr/>	
6.1. Introduction .....	283
6.2. General Characters of the Right to Liberty and State's Legitimate Discretion in Restraining the Right .....	287
6.3. The Scope of the Right and Legitimate Deprivation of Liberty: Interpreting the Normative Contents .....	289
6.3.1. The Content and Scope of the Right as It Stands in the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights .....	290
6.3.2. Subjects of the Right to Liberty and Freedom from Arbitrary Detention .....	291
6.3.3. Substantive Elements of the Right .....	292
6.3.4. Arrest and Detention .....	293
6.3.5. The Legality Element and the Need for Probing Domestic Law .....	294
6.3.6. Outlawing Arbitrariness: The Demand beyond the Requisite of Legality .....	298
6.4. Prohibition of Arbitrary Arrest and Detention in International Customary Law 303	
6.5. Procedural Traits of the Right to Liberty: Outlawing Procedural Arbitrariness .....	307
6.5.1. The Right to be Informed of the Reasons for Arrest .....	307
6.5.2. Rights of the Person under Pre-Charge and Pretrial Detention .....	310
6.5.3. The Right to Challenge Unlawful or Arbitrary Detention .....	316
6.5.4. Victim's Right to Compensation: Redressing Unlawful or Arbitrary Deprivation of the Person's Liberty .....	318
6.6. The Right to Security of Person .....	320
6.7. The Scope and Content of the Right in the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights: A Regional Alternative Legal Fortification .....	325
6.7.1. Adherence to the Farsighted Reading of the Charter .....	326
6.7.2. The Right to Liberty, Security and 'Freedom'? Analysing its Content and Scope .....	328
6.7.3. Practical Application of the Right: Probing the Interpretational Views of the Commission .....	329

6.7.4.	The Right under the Jurisprudence of the African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights. ....	334
6.8.	The Content and Scope of the Right in the Ethiopian National Legal Framework .....	336
6.8.1.	The Right to Liberty and Security of Person in the FDRE Constitution: Contextualizing the General Human Rights Tenets ....	336
6.8.2.	Specific Constitutional Guarantees to the Right to Liberty and Security of Person .....	338
6.8.3.	Judicial Interpretation of the Right: Any Jurisprudence? .....	343
6.9.	Conclusion .....	344
<b>CHAPTER 7 .....</b>		<b>347</b>
Parsing the Content and Scope of the Right to Liberty and Security in the Context of Countering Terrorism Milieus		
<hr/>		
7.1.	Introduction .....	347
7.2.	Liberty and Security: Contextualizing the General Standards into the Legal Realm of Countering Terrorism .....	347
7.3.	Derogation from the Duty to Respect and Protect the Right to Liberty and Security .....	351
7.3.1.	Legal Norms Governing the States' Discretion of Suspending a Right Through Derogation.....	352
7.3.1.1.	Actual or Imminent Threat .....	354
7.3.1.2.	Threat Involving the Entire State .....	355
7.3.1.3.	The Requirement of Proportionality and Strict Necessity. ....	356
7.3.2.	Some Absolute Tenets of the Right to Liberty: Rights beyond the Reach of Derogation.....	357
7.4.	Diverse Practices of Detentions in the Course of Countering Terrorism vis-à-vis the Prohibition of Arbitrary Detention.....	361
7.4.1.	Preventive or Administrative Detention and Indefinite Detention .....	361
7.4.2.	Preventive Detention.....	362
7.4.2.1.	Legality of Preventive Detention for Reasons of Public Security and Intelligence Gathering .....	366
7.4.2.2.	Pre-Charge and Pretrial Detentions under the Preventive Framework .....	373

7.4.2.3. Blurring Concerns Relating to Evidentiary Bases for Detention and Burden of Proof. ....	376
7.5. The Setting of Preventive Detention in the Ethiopian Legal Framework .....	378
7.5.1. Preventive Detention under the FDRE Constitution. ....	379
7.5.1.1. Prohibition of Arrest and Detention Except within the Criminal Justice System .....	379
7.5.1.2. The Right to Bail: Principle or Exception?.....	380
7.5.2. Pre-Charge Detention and Bail under the General Criminal Procedure Code .....	389
7.5.3. Pre-Charge and Pretrial Detentions under the Anti-Terrorism Proclamation .....	393
7.6. Conclusion. ....	398
 <b>CHAPTER 8 .....</b>	<b>403</b>
Procedural Guarantees against Arbitrary Deprivation of Liberty in the Enforcement of the Criminal Justice System: Assessing the Normative Standards in the Ethiopian Anti-Terrorism Proclamation	
<hr/>	
8.1. Introduction .....	403
8.2. Police Power of Arrest and the Procedural Guarantees against Arbitrariness	404
8.2.1. The Legitimacy of Authority for Arrest without a Court Warrant ....	405
8.2.1.1. Arrest without Court Warrant under International Human Rights Law .....	405
8.2.1.2. The Constitutional Guarantee against Arrest without Court Warrant .....	409
8.2.1.3. Arrest with or without Warrant under the General Criminal Procedure Code .....	410
8.2.1.4. Unrestrained Power of Arrest without Court Warrant as It Stands in the Anti-Terrorism Proclamation .....	413
8.2.2. The Requirement and the Degree of Suspicion as a Ground for Arrest .....	415
8.2.2.1. The Standard Requirement of Suspicion in the Context of the Prohibition of Arbitrariness .....	416
8.2.2.2. The Degree of Suspicion Required under the Anti-Terrorism Proclamation .....	418



8.3. The Right to Prompt Judicial Review of Arrest and Detention .....	419
8.3.1. The Legal Protection of the Right under International Human Rights Law .....	420
8.3.2. The Context of the Right to Judicial Review of Arrest under the Ethiopian Legal System .....	421
8.3.2.1. Exclusion of the ‘Time Reasonably Required for the Journey from the Place of Arrest to the Court’ .....	422
8.3.2.2. Jurisdictional Puzzles Pertaining to the Competent Court to Review Arrest or Detention .....	423
8.3.2.3. Arrests Commanded by Authorities Other than the Police: Beyond the Reach of Judicial Review .....	427
8.3.2.4. Absence of Counteractive Action as a Consequence upon Failure to Comply .....	429
8.4. The Fundamental Right to ‘Trial within Reasonable Time’ and Limits to Continued Detention. ....	431
8.4.1. The ‘Reasonable Time’ Standard Under International Human Rights Law and Its Application in the Ethiopian Anti-Terrorism Legal Setup .....	432
8.4.2. The ‘Reasonable Time’ Standard in the FDRE Constitution .....	433
8.4.3. Detention and the ‘Reasonable Time’ Standard in the Anti-Terrorism Proclamation .....	436
8.5. Other Alarming Issues: Evidential Sources and Standards for Conviction, Self- Incrimination, and the Absence of any Remedial Compensation. ....	438
8.5.1. Evidential Sources and Standards for Criminal Conviction. ....	439
8.5.2. Absence of Remedial Compensation for Victims of Arbitrary Deprivation of Liberty .....	442
8.6. Conclusion .....	443
<b>CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>447</b>
1. Summary. ....	447
2. Final Remarks and Outlook. ....	450
2.1. The General International Terrorism and Counterterrorism Conundrums .....	450
2.2. The Ethiopian Terrorism and Counterterrorism Perplexities .....	453
<b>Bibliography. ....</b>	<b>459</b>