Contents

Preface and Acknowledgements ix

Introduction: A Great Reversal? 1

Part I How Kant Failed to Justify His Categorical Imperative

1 Justifying Morality 17
   The challenge of total egoism 17
   Prichard’s Dilemma 35
   Grasping the first horn? The inadequacy of egoistic justification 36
   Between the horns: turning to Kant 46

2 Groundwork III: An Enigmatic Text 52
   Preliminaries 52
   The Reciprocity Thesis 55
   The preparatory argument 58
   A hidden circle? 63
   Allison’s reading: two kinds of freedom 68
   Reciprocity revisited 68
   Why the preparatory argument needs completing: back to the circle 70
   The gap that remains 73

3 The Second Critique 76
   Introduction: the problem of the “fact of reason” 76
   Allison on the “fact of reason” 78
   From ordinary moral consciousness to the fact of reason 79
   From the fact of reason to transcendental freedom 81
   From transcendental freedom to the authority of the moral law 83
   Critique of the Critique: (1) the Reciprocity Thesis 91
   Critique of the Critique: (2) the moral argument for transcendental freedom 103

4 Rational Nature as an End in Itself? 106
   Groundwork II: the formula of the end in itself 106
   Korsgaard on the FEI 111
   Wood on the FEI 119
   Korsgaard on the publicity of reasons 124

Part II How Kant Should Have Justified His Categorical Imperative

Introduction: Reconstructing Groundwork III 129
5 From Rational Agency to Freedom 133
   Preliminaries 133
   The voluntariness of judgement 142
   The freedom of judgement 151
   Extending the argument: the freedom of the rationalized 186

6 From Freedom to the Non-Phenomenal 188
   Preliminaries 188
   Kant's Second Analogy argument 191
   The argument for MERP 213

7 From Non-Phenomenality to Universality 235
   Preliminaries 235
   Collingwood's argument 237
   The principium individuationis 240
   Kantian credentials? 245
   The problem of bodily action resolved 258
   Kantian compatibilism defended 264

8 The Identity of Persons 283
   Collingwood again 283
   The "greatest equivocation"? 288
   Kantian credentials in question again 294
   The complexity of self-consciousness 304
   The possibility of persons as universals 308
   Identity and self-concern: a Lockean objection? 318
   Memory and conscience 329

9 Recovering the Categorical Imperative 336
   Metaphysics and morality 336
   A new deduction 339
   Defending the deduction: moral motivation and the PMA 345
   Defending the deduction: from the PMA to morality 352
   What, really, has been recovered? 374

Notes 388

Bibliography 429

Index 441