Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations 13
Abstract 17
Chapter One: General Introduction of the Study 19
A. Background of the Study 19
B. Statement of the Problem 21
C. Objectives of the Study 22
D. Significance of the Study 23
E. Methodological Approach 23
F. Scope of the Study 24
G. Definitions of Concepts used within the Chapters 25
Chapter Two: Historical Background to the Internecine Conflict in Rwanda 28
A. Introduction 28
B. Pre-Colonial Accounts of Rwandan History 29
   I. Origin of the Twa, Hutu and Tutsi 29
   II. The Relationship between Tutsi and Hutu 32
C. The Colonial Period 36
   I. The German Colonial Rule 36
   II. The Belgian Colonial Rule 39
   III. The Fall of the Tutsi Monarchy 42
D. Post-Colonial Period 46
   I. The First Republic 46
   II. The Second Republic 48
E. Formation of the Rwandese Patriotic Front (RPF) 50
F. The Genocide Period 53
Table of Contents

Chapter Three: The Legacy of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

A. Introduction 61

B. Generalities about the Tribunal 63
   I. Genesis of the ICTR 63
   II. Legal Basis of the ICTR 64
   III. Organization of the Tribunal 67
   IV. Relationship between Rwanda and the Tribunal 68

C. Status of the ICTR Cases 74

D. Analysis of Important Jurisprudence before the ICTR 76
   I. Prosecutor versus Akayesu 77
   II. Prosecutor versus Kayishema 79
   III. Prosecutor versus Kambanda 81
   IV. Prosecutor versus Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze 83
   V. Prosecutor versus Ntagerura, Bagambiki, and Imanishimwe 87
   VI. Prosecutor versus Colonel Bagosora 89
   VII. Prosecutor versus Nyiramasuhuko 91

E. Achievements of the Tribunal 93
   I. Development of International Criminal Law 94
   II. Accountability for Leaders 96
   III. Creation of a Historical Record 98

F. Major Shortcomings of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda 99
   I. Delayed Justice 100
   II. Location of the ICTR 102
   III. Limited Impact on Rwanda 104

Chapter Four: Prosecution of Genocide in National Courts 107

A. Introduction 107

B. Generalities on Rwanda National Courts 108
   I. Genesis of Genocide Prosecutions 108
   II. Organisation of Ordinary Courts 109
   III. Reparations 111

C. Status of Case Law within the Ordinary Court System 112
## D. Analysis of the National Court Case Law

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Prosecutor versus Captain Twagiramungu</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Prosecution versus Private Gataza</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Prosecutor versus Corporal Gatorano</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Prosecutor versus Major Nyirahazimana and Pasteur Ngorinshuti</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Prosecutor versus Harelimana et al.</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Prosecutor versus Nzirabatinyi</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Prosecutor versus Nzisabira</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Prosecutor versus Pandasi, Bugeri and Nzajyibwami</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Prosecutor versus Rurangirwa, Bimenyimana, and Ntawangaheza</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Prosecutor versus Sibomana</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## E. Achievements of National Court Trials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## F. Major Shortcomings of Domestic Prosecutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Congested Prisons and Insufficient Infrastructure</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Violation of Fair Trial Rights</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Right to Speedy Trial</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Principle of Presumption of Innocence</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Right to Counsel of One's Choice</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## G. Excursus: Prosecution of Genocide Suspects by Third States

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Extradition Matters</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Third State Prosecutions: Case of Rwabukombe in Germany</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter Five: The Traditional Gacaca Court System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Generalities on Grassroot Courts</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Evolution of Gacaca Courts</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Traditional Roots of Gacaca</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Legal Basis of Gacaca Courts</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. A Standard Gacaca Trial</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Status of Gacaca Case Law</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Analysis of the Gacaca Case Law</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Detailed Assessment of the above 16 Case Law</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

E. The Nature of Gacaca Courts: Are they Retributive or Restorative? 191
   I. Aims of Gacaca Courts 195
   II. Sentences 196
   III. Stakeholders 197
   IV. Evaluation 198

F. Achievements of Gacaca Courts 199
   I. Speedy Justice 199
   II. Reconciliatory Mechanism 201
   III. Affordable Justice 204
   IV. Enhancement of Local Transitional Justice Approaches 204

G. Shortcomings of Gacaca Courts 205
   I. Lack of Legal Representation 206
   II. Absence of Reparations 207
   III. Inadequate Protection of Witnesses 209
   IV. Corruption within the System 210
   V. Instability of Gacaca Laws 211
   VI. Non-Prosecution of all Crimes 212
   VII. Interim Remarks 214

Chapter Six: A Critical Analysis of the Relationship between the ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Courts 216

A. Introduction 216
B. Jurisdictional Relationship 217
C. Disparities among the Different Approaches 220
   I. Right to Legal Counsel 222
   II. Right to Silence 223
   III. Right to be tried without Undue Delay 224
   IV. Jurisdiction Disparities 226
   V. Discrepancy in Sentences 228
   VI. Unequal Detention Facilities 230

D. The Contribution of Different Trials to Reconciliation 232
   I. Meaning of Reconciliation 233
   II. The ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Contribution to Reconciliation 236
      1. Official Acknowledgement of the Crimes 236
      2. Individualization of Guilt 240
## Table of Contents

3. Truth  
   a) Personal and Narrative Truth  
   b) Factual and Forensic Truth  
III. Interim Conclusion

Chapter Seven: General Conclusions

A. General Conclusions

B. Overall Concluding Remarks and Optimal Approach

Bibliography