

Contents

Abbreviations	15
Introduction	17
First Part: Mental Element in National Law	23
I Mental Element and the German <i>Völkerstrafgesetzbuch</i>	25
A. Types of Mental Element and Their Relationship with the Area of Risk	27
1. <i>Vorsatz</i>	27
2. <i>Fahrlässigkeit</i>	31
3. <i>Absicht</i> in Relation to an External Material Element	33
B. In Quest of a 'Default' Mental Element: Distinguishing <i>bedingter Vorsatz</i> from <i>bewusste Fahrlässigkeit</i>	34
1. Theory of Consent in the Legal Sense	35
2. Other Theories	40
3. From <i>bedingter Vorsatz</i> to a Third Type of Mental Element Intermediate Between Intent and Negligence?	44
C. Definitions of Core Crimes: Between Applicability and Non-Applicability of <i>bedingter Vorsatz</i>	47
1. The Broad Applicability of <i>bedingter Vorsatz</i>	48
2. <i>Absichtsdelikte</i> or <i>Delikte mit überschießender Innentendenz</i>	50
3. Attacks Against Protected Persons and Objects	53
4. Offences Qualified by the Result (<i>erfolgsqualifizierte Delikte</i>)	54
D. Mental Element and Group Criminality	56
1. The General Applicability of <i>bedingter Vorsatz</i> to Modes of Liability	56

a) Introductory Remarks on Modes of Liability in the German <i>Strafgesetzbuch</i> : Distinguishing Between Liability as a Principal (<i>Täterschaft</i>) and as a Secondary Party (<i>Teilnahme</i>)	56
b) Liability as a Principal by Proxy (<i>mittelbare Täterschaft</i>)	59
c) Liability as a Joint Principal (<i>Mittäterschaft</i>)	61
d) Abetting (<i>Anstiftung</i>)	63
e) Aiding (<i>Gehilfe</i>)	65
f) Responsibility of Military Commanders and Other Superiors (<i>Vorgesetztenverantwortlichkeit</i>)	66
2. Departures from <i>bedingter Vorsatz</i> : the Offences of Violation of the Duty of Supervision	70
E. Model Cases	72
1. Model Case No. 1	72
2. Model Case No. 2	73
3. Model Case No. 3	74
4. Model Case No. 4	75
F. Final Observations	76
II Mental Element and the US Federal Criminal Code	79
A. Types of Mental Element and Their Relationship with the Area of Risk	80
1. Intent, Including Wilful Blindness	80
2. Willfulness	83
3. Specific or Ulterior Intent	84
4. Recklessness	85
5. Gross Negligence	87
B. The Position of the US Supreme Court on a 'Default' Mental Element	88
C. Definitions of Crimes and Departures from the 'Default' Mental Element	91
1. Genocidal Intent	91
2. Torture (War Crime in Non-International Armed Conflict)	92
3. Murder and Mutilation (War Crimes in Non-International Armed Conflict)	93

4. Rape (War Crime in Non-International Armed Conflict)	95
D. Mental Element and Participation in Crime	96
1. Aiding and Abetting	96
2. Causing	101
3. Conspiratorial Liability	105
E. Model Cases	107
1. Model Case No. 1	107
2. Model Case No. 2	108
3. Model Case No. 3	110
4. Model Case No. 4	111
F. Final Observations	112
 Second Part: Mental Element in International Law	 115
 I Mental Element in the Jurisprudence of the <i>ad hoc</i> Tribunals and Other Recent Developments in Customary International Law	 117
A. The Notion of Intent and Its Relationship with the Area of Risk	117
1. Direct Intent, Including Wilful Blindness	118
2. Indirect Intent, Including a Discussion of Some Synonyms: <i>dolus eventualis</i> , Recklessness, Wilfulness, Wanton Act	120
a) Indirect Intent as Awareness of Result as Probable or (Substantially) Likely	120
b) Indirect Intent as Awareness of Result as Possible	122
c) Final Observations on Indirect Intent	125
B. Other Types of Mental Element	125
1. Specific Intent in Regard to an External Material Element, and Its Relationship with the Area of Risk	125
2. Negligence	127
C. Is There Such a Thing as a 'Default' Mental Element in Customary International Law?	128
D. Mental Element and Definitions of Core Crimes	133
1. The Broad Applicability of Indirect Intent	133
2. Specific Intent Crimes	138
3. Direct Intent Crimes	142
4. Is There Any Room for Negligence?	146

E.	Mental Element and Group Criminality	146
1.	Joint Criminal Enterprise	147
2.	Planning	154
3.	Instigating and Ordering	155
4.	Aiding and Abetting	156
5.	Superior Responsibility	161
	a) The <i>Čelebići</i> Case	161
	b) Subsequent Jurisprudence and Final Observations	166
F.	Model Cases	168
1.	Model Case No. 1	168
2.	Model Case No. 2	169
3.	Model Case No. 3	171
4.	Model Case No. 4	172
G.	Final Observations	173
II	Mental Element in the ICC Statute: the Early Jurisprudence of the ICC	175
A.	Interpretation of the Default Mental Element Pursuant to Art. 30 ICC Statute	175
1.	Intent in Relation to Conduct	177
2.	Intent in Relation to Result	179
	a) Literal and Systematic Interpretation	181
	b) <i>Travaux préparatoires</i>	186
3.	Intent in Relation to Attendant Circumstances	189
4.	Final Observations on Intent: Its Relationship with the Area of Risk	191
B.	Interpretation of the Opening Clause 'Unless Otherwise Provided' Pursuant to Art. 30 ICC Statute	192
C.	Definitions of Core Crimes: Between Applicability and Non-Applicability of Intent	197
1.	The Broad Applicability of Intent	197
2.	Crimes Requiring (Specific) Intent in Relation to an External Material Element	200
3.	Attacks Against Civilians and Civilian Objects	204

4. Is There Any Room for Culpability in the Area of Risk-Taking?	205
D. Mental Element and Group Criminality	207
1. Co-Perpetration or Commission of a Crime Jointly with Another Person	208
2. Indirect Perpetration or Commission of a Crime Through Another Person	212
3. Instigation, Including Ordering	214
4. Aiding, Abetting or Otherwise Assisting	216
5. Contributing to the Commission of a Crime by a Group	218
6. Superior Responsibility	221
E. Model Cases	226
1. Model Case No. 1	226
2. Model Case No. 2	227
3. Model Case No. 3	229
4. Model Case No. 4	230
F. Final Observations	232
Conclusions and Recommendations	235
A. Coming to Terms with the Relationship Between Risk and Mental Element: a Comparative Assessment of the Current Legal Landscape	235
B. Rethinking the Relationship Between Risk and Mental Element: What Perspectives for Legal Reform?	238
Appendix:	
Materials on (International) Criminal Law in the World Wide Web	243
Bibliography	245
Table of Cases	259