## Contents

*Decisions of International Courts and Tribunals* xv

### I. DIMENSIONS OF REGIME CONFLICT

1. Culture is One Thing and Varnish is Another 3
   1. Introduction 3
   2. Regulating Trade in Cultural Products 6
      A. A definition of culture 6
      B. International legal rules 8
   3. Regime Conflict and the Fragmentation of International Law 15
   4. The Plan of this Book 19

2. Regime Conflict as Goal Conflict 21
   1. Introduction 21
   2. Toward a Heterarchy of Goal-specific Regimes 22
      A. Anthropological approaches to legal plurality 22
      B. Paradigms of international organization 27
         1. The 'Westphalian' paradigm of coexistence 27
         2. The hierarchical paradigm 31
         3. The heterarchical paradigm 35
         4. Regime conflict as legal pluralism 40
   3. Goal Conflicts Arising from Trade in Cultural Products 42
      A. Commodity flows: the case for free trade 47
         1. Cultural products as marketable commodities 47
         2. The challenge of market failures 48
         3. Avoiding unnecessary social costs of cultural regulation 53
         4. Trade in cultural products in the WTO system 57
      B. Communication flows: the case for cultural identity politics 59
         1. Identity construction as a starting point 60
         2. The emancipatory cultural identity justification 62
         3. The conservationist cultural identity justification 68
         4. Development and the north–south divide 70
         5. Cultural identity politics in the CDC 75
   4. Conclusion 76

3. Regime Conflict as Institutional Conflict and Power Struggle 79
   1. Introduction 79
   2. The Politics of Regime Formation and Regime Interaction 81
2. Unity of the legal order as a validity condition for norms 207
3. Unity as a substantive principle of law 212
4. Unity as an epistemological postulate 213

B. Variations within the unitary approach 220
1. Joost Pauwelyn’s ‘Conflict of Norms in Public International Law’ 220
2. The perspective of the International Law Commission (ILC) 223
3. Pierre-Marie Dupuy’s unite de l'ordre juridique international 228
4. Bruno Simma’s analysis of community interest in international law 230

IV. Conclusion 234

6. From Legal Unity to Communicative Compatibility 238
I. Introduction 238
II. International Law as a Regime-transcendent Grammar 240
A. Law as a 'special case' of communicative action 240
1. Doctrinal borrowing in the event of comparable legal concepts 244
2. Recourse to general international law 246
3. Common rules of treaty interpretation 248
B. The 'special weight' of arguments from coherence 250

III. Shared Background Assumptions of International Relations 255
A. The common lifeworld as a precondition of communicative action 258
1. The 'international society' as a lifeworld substitute? 260
2. Human rights as a lifeworld substitute? 262
B. Basic legal concepts as shared pre-understandings of the international system 264

IV. Conclusion 270

7. Conflict Management through Legal Interpretation 272
I. Introduction 272
II. A Theory of Harmonizing Interpretation 273
A. Understanding versus justification 275
1. Interpretation as understanding of meaning 276
2. Interpretation as justification of claims to rightness 281
B. Interpretation of one rule 'in light of' another rule 283
1. Article 31(1) of the Vienna Convention 284
2. Article 31(3)(c) of the Vienna Convention 287
3. General principle of harmonizing interpretation 293
4. Principle of default deference 294

III. Accommodating the Trade Regime, the Culture Regime, and Human Rights 298
A. The scope for manoeuvre under the different regimes 298
1. WTO rules amenable to a culture-conscious interpretation 298
2. CDC rules amenable to a trade-conscious interpretation 303
B. Advancing concurrently the goals of the different regimes 304
1. Cultural liberty as the key goal of the CDC 305
2. Cultural liberty as a goal of the human rights regime 312
3. Cultural liberty as a goal that is consistent with free trade principles 315
IV. Conclusion 316

8. Conflict Management through Priority Rules 318
   I. Introduction 318
   II. A Typology of Priority Rules 319
      A. Express conflict clauses 319
         1. Priority of the treaty 319
         2. Priority of the other treaty 319
         3. Priority of the treaty that grants greater protection 321
         4. Non-subordination clauses 321
      B. The lex specialis and lex posterior maxims 322
         1. Lex posterior 323
         2. Lex specialis 324
         3. Significance of the 'same subject matter test' 326
      C. Conflict of laws analogies 329
         1. Regime conflict as 'horizontal jurisdictional conflict' 329
         2. The principle of comparative impairment 331
         3. A comparative impairment test for adjudicating regime conflict 334
   III. Conflicts between the Trade Regime, the Culture Regime, and Human Rights 335
      A. Conflict clauses of the CDC 335
         1. Article 2(1) of the CDC 335
         2. Article 20 of the CDC 336
      B. Remaining conflict situations 341
   IV. Conclusion 343

German Summary 346
Bibliography 349
Index 373