Contents

System of Abbreviations and Short Titles xvii

Introduction 3

1. Containment Analyticity and Kant’s Problem of Synthetic Judgment
   1.1 The Problem of Synthetic Judgment 3
   1.2 Kant’s Official Account of Analyticity
      1.2.1 How controversial is Kant’s distinction? 7
      1.2.2 Three definitions of analyticity 12
      1.2.3 The centrality of containment 16
   1.3 Logic, Methodology, Epistemology: Three Conceptions of Analyticity in Kant
      1.3.1 The analytic and synthetic as methods 23
      1.3.2 Analytic and synthetic as epistemological categories 26
      1.3.3 Analyticity as a logical notion 31
   1.4 Antecedents of Containment Analyticity 32
   1.5 Plan of Work 39

Part I. The Traditional Logic of Concept Containment and its (Alleged) Metaphysical Implications

2. Containment and the Traditional Logic of Concepts 45
   2.1 Worries about Containment 45
   2.2 Concept Containment in the Traditional Logic 49
   2.3 Kant’s Theory of Concepts and the Division Account of Containment 54
   2.4 Logical and Non-Logical Extensions in Kant’s Doctrine of the Concept 61
   2.5 Skepticism about Containment, Revisited 71

3. The Wolffian Paradigm 75
   3.1 The Logic of Containment in Wolff’s Metaphysical Picture 75
   3.2 The Importance of Containment Truth: Three Key Features of the Wolffian Paradigm 78
   3.3 Empirical Concepts in Syllogistic Science 88
   3.4 Conclusion 95

   4.1 The Narrowness of Containment 97
   4.2 Problems Accounting for Logical Truth 99
4.3 The Five Universals: Some Limits of the Wolffian Paradigm 108
4.4 Leibniz on Characteristic and Definition: Containment without Division? 114
4.5 Trade-Offs Facing Containment 122
  4.5.1 Trade-offs 122
  4.5.2 Consequences 124
4.6 Conclusion 130

Part II. A Difficult Birth: The Emergence of Kant’s Analytic/Synthetic Distinction 135

5. Three Versions of Analyticity 135
  5.1 The Difficult Birth 135
  5.2 Brief Outline of the Story 136
  5.3 Three Versions of Analyticity: A Reprise via Adickes and Beck 139
    5.3.1 The Adickes account of Kant’s development 139
    5.3.2 Lewis White Beck on making synthetic judgments analytic 141
    5.3.3 Three versions of analyticity: methodological, epistemological, logical 143
  5.4 An Alternative Story 146

6. Methodological Beginnings: Analysis and Synthesis in the Published Pre-Critical Works 149
  6.1 Introduction: General Skepticism about the Wolffian Paradigm 149
  6.2 Methodological Criticism in the System of 1762/3: The Inquiry 152
  6.3 The Real/Logical Distinction in 1762/3: The Only Possible Argument and Negative Magnitudes 157
  6.4 After the System of 1762/3: Conceptual Truth in the Inaugural Dissertation 168
  6.5 Conclusion 178

7. Making Synthetic Judgments Analytic: Kant’s Long Road Towards Logical Analyticity in the Reflexionen 179
  7.1 Locating the Origin of the Analytic/Synthetic Distinction 179
  7.2 The Epistemological Conception in the Late 1760s 183
    7.2.1 The analytic as objective cognition 183
    7.2.2 Analytic and synthetic as rational and empirical 186
    7.2.3 Turning synthetic judgments analytic: the Beck objection reconsidered 190
  7.3 Birth of the Critical Insight: The Herz Letter and Logical Analyticity in the Silent Decade 195
  7.4 Conclusion: A Two-Step Route to the Critique 202
Part III. Ineliminable Synthetic Truth in Elementary Mathematics

8. The Logic of Concepts and a “Two-Step” Syntheticity Argument 209
   8.1 Philosophy of Mathematics in the Context of Kant’s Critique of Metaphysics 209
   8.2 Logical and Phenomenological Interpretations of the Role of Intuition 214
   8.3 Conceptual Truth and Mathematical Knowledge 226

   9.1 Kant’s Philosophy of Geometry and the Failure of Wolff’s Reconstruction Program 233
   9.2 Kant’s Philosophy of Arithmetic 244
      9.2.1 Two bases of syntheticity: equivalence of non-identicals and non-reciprocity of content and extension 247
      9.2.2 Leibniz’s proof strategy and the nature of mathematical definition 256
      9.2.3 The role of intuition in arithmetic 259
   9.3 Conclusion 261

Part IV. The Poverty of Conceptual Truth and the Master Argument of the “Transcendental Dialectic”

10. The Master Argument 269
    10.1 Irreducible Syntheticity in Mathematics and in Metaphysics 269
    10.2 Framing the Master Argument 271
    10.3 The Master Argument in the “Dialectic” 277

11. The Soul and the World: The Master Argument in Kant’s “Paralogisms” and “Antinomy” 287
    11.1 On the “Paralogisms of Pure Reason”: The Critique of Rational Psychology 287
    11.2 On the “Antinomy of Pure Reason”: The Critique of Rational Cosmology 297

12. The Master Argument in the Critique of Rational Theology 306
    12.1 Kant’s Critique of the ens realissimum Concept 307
    12.2 Kant’s Critique of the Ontological Argument 316
    12.3 Conclusion to Part IV 326

Epilogue

13. Empirical Concept Formation and the Systematic Role of Logical Division 333
    13.1 Problems and Puzzles: Constraints on a Kantian Theory of Empirical Concept Formation 336
       13.1.1 Circularity 336
       13.1.2 Generality 342
       13.1.3 Corrigibility 348
       13.1.4 Concept identity, hierarchies, and analyticity 350