

# Contents

|                                    |      |
|------------------------------------|------|
| Preface and Acknowledgements ..... | xiii |
| Bibliography                       |      |
| 1. Primary Sources .....           | 1    |
| 2. Secondary Sources.....          | 11   |

## PART I – INTRODUCTION

### Introduction

|  |    |
|--|----|
| 1. The Importance of the Bahirarthaparīkṣā<br>Chapter in the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> and the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....  | 41 |
| 2. Śubhagupta and the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> as<br>Introduced in the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> and the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i>  |    |
| 2.1 Quotations and Use of<br>Materials from the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> .....   | 48 |
| 2.2 Steinkellner’s Method of Classification:<br>The “Autocommentary” as <i>Citatum in Alio</i><br><i>Modo Referendi</i> (Where the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> is <b>T</b> )..... | 50 |
| 2.3 The Case of Haribhadra Sūri .....  | 52 |
| 2.4 The Intended and Ideal<br>Audience for Criticism of Śubhagupta .....   | 52 |
| 2.5 Śubhagupta’s Doctrinal Affiliation.....  | 54 |
| 3. The Examination of External<br>Objects of Perception in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā   |    |
| 3.1 Proof in Favor of<br><i>Vijñaptimātratā</i> in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā .....   | 56 |
| 3.2 The Dravyapadārthaparīkṣā:<br>The View of Externalism as a<br>Step Within the Cultivation of <i>Cintāmayī Prajñā</i> .....   | 59 |
| 3.3 Positions on the Nature of an<br>External Object: Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla .....  | 66 |
| 3.4 Theses on the Nature of an<br>External Object: Vasubandhu and Dīnnāga.....   | 67 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 4. The Apprehensibility of Atoms:<br>Śāntarakṣita, Kamalaśīla and Śubhagupta   |     |
| 4.1 Atoms and Their Proof Through Direct<br>Perception: The Vijñānavāda “Epistemic Proof”<br>in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā; * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i><br>kk. 35 and 44 as Quoted in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā..... | 71  |
| 4.2 Rebuttal of the Vijñānavāda<br>“Epistemic Proof” by Śubhagupta:<br>* <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 35 in Its Original Context.....  | 76  |
| 4.3 Apprehension with No Ascertainment:<br>The “Epistemic Proof” Disproven<br>in the Dravyapadārthaparīkṣā .....   | 78  |
| 4.4 Apprehension with No Ascertainment:<br>The “Epistemic Proof” Disproven in<br>* <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 36–37 .....  | 81  |
| 4.5 An Instance of Intentional “Misrepresenting”:<br><i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> 1974 and <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....   | 82  |
| 4.6 Atoms as Ultimately Real<br>in Terms of Being Causally Efficient:<br>* <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 39, 57 and 58 .....  | 84  |
| 5. Śāntarakṣita, Kamalaśīla and<br>Śubhagupta on the Singularity of Atoms  |     |
| 5.1 Proving the Unreality of Atoms:<br><i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> 1989–1991 and <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....  | 86  |
| 5.2 Vasubandhu’s Refutation of<br><i>Samhata</i> (Aggregated) Atoms as Objects of<br>Sense Cognitions: <i>Vimśikā</i> and <i>Abhidharmakośabhāṣya</i> .....  | 88  |
| 5.3 Śubhagupta’s Theory on the Aggregation of Atoms.....   | 92  |
| 5.4 Śubhagupta’s Response to the<br>“ <i>Digbhāgabhedavattva</i> ” Argument:<br>* <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> kk. 45cd, 46, 47, 48 .....  | 93  |
| 5.5 Temporal Continuity Versus Spatial<br>Continuity: Śubhagupta as Introduced in<br><i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā ad Tattvasaṅgraha</i> 1989–1991<br>and * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 50–51 .....                | 97  |
| 5.6 Kamalaśīla’s Response .....  | 99  |
| 5.7 <i>Grāhya</i> Proven as Illogical:<br>Conclusion of Argument A.....  | 103 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 6. Features of Cognition According to Śubhagupta   |     |
| 6.1 Śubhagupta as the Buddhist<br><i>Nirākāravādin par Excellence in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā</i> .....                             | 104 |
| 6.2 Nature ( <i>Svabhāva</i> ) of Cognition:<br><i>*Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> kk. 89, 84, 66, 81 .....                           | 106 |
| 6.3 Features of Cognition as Based on<br>the Ontological Nature of Its Object.....   | 111 |
| 6.4 Analogous Arguments Against the <i>Sākāravāda</i><br>in the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> and the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> ..... | 116 |
| 7. Conclusion – Defining Śubhagupta’s<br>Doctrinal Affiliation: <i>Kiṃ Prayojanam?</i> .....                                     | 118 |

## PART II – BAHIRARTHAPARĪKṢĀ

### Manuscripts and Editions of the

#### *Tattvasaṅgraha* and the *Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā*

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. Manuscripts of the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> .....        | 123 |
| 2. Manuscripts of the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> ..... | 132 |
| 3. Stemma Codicum.....                                   | 140 |
| 4. Printed Editions .....                                | 140 |

### Symbols and Abbreviations

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Sigla Related to the Sources Used in the Critical Edition..... | 143 |
| 2. Editorial Conventions: Symbols and Abbreviations.....          | 145 |

### Prolegomenon

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Critical Edition .....                           | 149 |
| 2. Tibetan Translations .....                       | 150 |
| 3. <i>Post Correctionem</i> .....                   | 151 |
| 4. Homographic <i>Akṣaras</i> and Orthography ..... | 151 |
| 5. Jk/Jp .....                                      | 152 |
| 6. Pk/Pp.....                                       | 152 |
| 7. K.....   | 152 |
| 8. Other .....                                      | 152 |
| 9. Pā/Gā.....                                       | 153 |
| 10. Parallel Passages .....                         | 153 |
| 11. Glosses .....                                   | 154 |

## Bahirarthaparīkṣā – Sanskrit Text

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. Introduction.....   | 155 |
| 2. Argument A: <i>Grāhyāyogāt</i>                                  |     |
| 2.1 Pūrvapakṣa .....   | 157 |
| 2.2 Refutation of External Objects as <i>Grāhya</i> .....          | 157 |
| 2.3 Proof Denying the Existence of Atoms .....                     | 166 |
| 3. Argument B: <i>Grāhyagrāhaka lakṣaṇavaidhuryāt</i> .....        | 173 |
| 3.1 Proof of the Self-Awareness of Cognitions.....                 | 174 |
| 3.2 Refutation of the <i>Nirākāravāda</i> .....                    | 175 |
| 3.3. Refutation of the <i>Sākāravāda</i> .....                     | 197 |
| 3.4 Refutation of the <i>Anyākāravāda</i> .....                    | 199 |
| 4. Rejection of the <i>Pramāṇas</i> Proving External Objects ..... | 204 |
| 5. Conclusion .....  | 217 |
| Glosses .....  | 223 |

## Investigation of External Objects – English Translation

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. Introduction.....   | 227 |
| 2. Argument A: <i>Grāhyāyogāt</i>                                  |     |
| 2.1 Pūrvapakṣa .....   | 230 |
| 2.2 Refutation of External Objects as <i>Grāhya</i> .....          | 230 |
| 2.3 Proof Denying the Existence of Atoms .....                     | 245 |
| 3. Argument B: <i>Grāhyagrāhaka lakṣaṇavaidhuryāt</i> .....        | 256 |
| 3.1 Proof of the Self-Awareness of Cognitions.....                 | 257 |
| 3.2 Refutation of the <i>Nirākāravāda</i> .....                    | 260 |
| 3.3. Refutation of the <i>Sākāravāda</i> .....                     | 292 |
| 3.4. Refutation of the <i>Anyākāravāda</i> .....                   | 296 |
| 4. Rejection of the <i>Pramāṇas</i> Proving External Objects ..... | 301 |
| 5. Conclusion.....   | 318 |

## PART III – \*BĀHYĀRTHASIDDHIKĀRIKĀ

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Appendix 1: Reuse of Materials from<br>the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> .....                       | 327 |
| Appendix 2: Survey of Previous Research<br>on Śubhagupta and the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> ..... | 333 |
| Introduction to Appendix 3 and 4:<br>* <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> by Śubhagupta .....               | 343 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Appendix 3: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> of Śubhagupta<br>Tibetan Text of kk. 2–8; 29; 32–58;<br>66; 68; 71–74; 77–92; 95; 101; 185.....        | 345 |
| Appendix 4: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> of Śubhagupta<br>English Translation of kk. 2–8; 29;<br>32–58; 66; 68; 71–74; 77–92; 95; 101; 185..... | 351 |
| Index of Works .....  | 359 |
| Index of Authors .....  | 362 |
| Index of Quoted Passages (and their Translations) .....   | 364 |
| Index of Terms .....  | 373 |