

Table of contents

Acknowledgments	9
General Introduction	11
Part 1: The Competition Enforcement System: Eu And The Usa – A Comparative View	33
Introduction	33
Chapter 1: Public Enforcement of Competition Law: Actors and Sanctions	35
Section I: The Public Enforcement of Competition Law: the Key Players	36
I. In the USA	36
1. The Antitrust Division	36
2. The Federal Trade Commission	43
3. The State Attorneys General	45
4. The Interplay between State and Federal Antitrust Law	47
II. In the EU	49
1. The European Commission	49
2. National Competition Authorities: the European Competition Network	53
Section II: The Nature of Competition Law Sanctions: Administrative vs Penal	57
I. Criminalization in the USA	58
II. The Legal Character of EU Fines	62
1. Under EU Law	62
2. Criminal Law Classification under Article 6 (1) of the European Convention on Human Rights: Court of Justice of the European Union vs European Court of Human Rights	66

Chapter 2: The Public Enforcement of Competition Law through Leniency Programmes	85
Section I: Leniency in Cartel Enforcement	86
I. Historical Background	87
II. The Benefits of Leniency	90
III. The Efficiency and Effectiveness of Leniency Programmes	94
IV. The Prisoner's Dilemma Model	96
Section II: The US Leniency Policy System	101
I. The Scope of the Programme	102
II. The Legal Basis of the US System	103
III. The Corporate Leniency Policy	104
1. Conditions for the Grant of Leniency	104
2. Corporate Conditional Leniency Letter	106
3. Leniency for Corporate Directors, Officers and Employees	110
IV. The Individual Leniency Policy	113
1. The Conditions for the Grant of Leniency to Individuals	114
2. The Individual Conditional Leniency Letter	114
V. Leniency Procedure Issues	117
1. The Marker System	117
2. The Leniency PLUS and Penalty PLUS	119
Section III: The EU Leniency System	120
I. The Scope of the Programme	120
II. The Legal Basis of the European Leniency Programme	121
1. The Commission Notice on Immunity from Fines and Reduction of Fines in Cartel Cases (the Leniency Notice)	125
2. The Commission Notice on Cooperation within the Network of Competition Authorities (the Network Notice)	128
3. The ECN Model Leniency Programme (the ECN MLP)	129

III. Conditions for the Grant of Immunity and Reduction of the Fine	133
1. Immunity from Fines	133
2. Reduction of the Fine	138
IV. Cooperation between Members of the ECN in the Application of Competition Rules	140
1. Allocation of Powers between the Commission and NCAs	141
2. Exchange of Information within the ECN	144
Section IV: National Leniency Programmes: Convergences and Divergences with the ECN MLP	147
I. Scope of the Leniency Programmes	148
II. Excluded Immunity Applicants	150
III. Thresholds for Immunity	151
1. Type 1 A Immunity: The Evidential Threshold	152
2. Type 1 B Immunity: the evidential threshold	153
IV. Reduction of Fines	155
V. “De facto” Partial Immunity	156
VI. Conditions Attached to Leniency	156
1. Obligation to End Involvement in the Cartel	157
2. Genuine Cooperation	158
3. Pre-Application Obligations	159
4. Failure to Comply	160
VII. Procedural Issues	161
1. Anonymous Approaches and Hypothetical Application	161
2. Marker for Immunity Applicant	161
3. Summary Application	164
4. The Procedure for Granting and Rejecting Immunity	165
5. The Procedure for the Reduction of Fines	166
6. Oral Procedure	166

Section V: Proposal for a Directive to Empower the Competition Authorities of the Member States	167
I. Problem: Divergences between Leniency Programmes	170
1. Summary Leniency Applications and Core Leniency Features	171
2. Protection of Leniency Material	171
3. Interplay between Corporate Leniency Programmes and Sanctions on Individuals	172
II. Potential Solutions: How to Achieve a Well-Designed Leniency Programme which Facilitates Leniency Applications in Multiple Jurisdictions	173
1. No EU Action	174
2. Soft Action	174
3. Legislative Action by the EU Complemented by Soft Action	175
4. Legislative Action by the EU	176
III. Objective: A Common Leniency Programme	177
1. Scope of the Programme	177
2. Excluded Immunity Applicants	178
3. Thresholds for Immunity	179
4. Reduction of Fine	179
5. “De Facto” Partial Immunity	180
6. Conditions Attached to Leniency	180
7. Procedural Issues	181
Conclusion	187
Part 2: The Protection Of Fundamental Rights And Principles In Leniency Programme	191
Introduction	191

Chapter 1: The Protection of Fundamental Rights while Enforcing Leniency Programme	193
Section I: Scope of the Programme – Ratione Materiae and Ratione Personae	193
I. The Principle of Equality Applied to the Scope of Application Ratione Materiae	194
II. The Principle of Legal Certainty and Equality Applied to the Scope of Application Ratione Personae	196
Section II: Procedural Issues	201
I. The Legal Uncertainty of the Fine Reduction Procedure: The Meaning of Significant Added Value	201
II. The Principle of Equality and the Fines Reduction Procedure: Timeframe and Justified Difference of Treatment between Subsequent Applicants	206
III. The Principle of Legal Certainty Applied to the Discretionary Marker System	212
Section III. Substantive Issues	217
I. The Protection of the Right of Defence and Legal Certainty during the Re-Allocation of the Leniency Applications within the ECN	217
II. The Privilege against Self-Incrimination	220
1. The Privilege against Self-Incrimination in Competition Proceedings before the EU Courts	222
2. The Privilege against Self-Incrimination in the European Convention	226
3. The Privilege against Self-Incrimination in Leniency Applications	231
III. The Presumption of Innocence	234
Chapter 2: The Right to Due Process	245
Section I: The Right to an Effective Judicial Protection from the Perspective of Leniency Applicants	253
I. The Right to an Independent and Impartial Tribunal	257

II.	The Requirement of Full Judicial Review	261
1.	The Assessment of the Significant Added Value	266
2.	The Evaluation of the Level of Cooperation	269
3.	The Requirement of Genuine Cooperation	273
4.	The Decision of Granting or Rejecting a Marker	275
III.	The Requirement of Reasonable Time	276
1.	The Re-allocation Period	278
2.	The Duration of the Leniency Procedure before the Commission	280
3.	The Duration of the Procedure before the General Court	282
IV.	The Right to an Oral Hearing	284
Section II:	The Right to an Effective Remedy from the Perspective of Victims of Competition Law Infringement	296
I.	The Relationship between Public and Private Enforcement	298
II.	The Right to Damages in Competition Law	300
III.	The Right of Access to Documents: Legal Framework	303
IV.	Access to Leniency Documents held by the Commission before the Entry into Force of the Damages Directive	305
1.	Access via Article 15 (1) of Regulation 1/2003	308
2.	Access via the Transparency Regulation	310
V.	The Access to Leniency Statements according to the Jurisprudence of the CJEU	313
VI.	The Damages Directive	320
1.	The Critics to the Ban of Disclosure of Leniency Statements	325
2.	The relation between Private and Public Enforcement in the USA	327

VII.A Potential Violation of Article 47	329
1. The Necessity of Disclosure of Corporate Leniency Statements	330
2. The Compatibility of Article 6 (6) of the Damages Directive with Article 47 of the CFR	333
3. Possible Alternatives to the Ban on Disclosure	337
Chapter 3: The Principle of Ne Bis In Idem	342
Section I: The Applicability of the Principle of Ne Bis in Idem to EU Competition Enforcement	344
I. The Principle of Ne Bis in Idem according to the ECHR	345
II. The Principle of Ne Bis in Idem according to the CFR	347
III. The Principle of Ne Bis in Idem in EU Competition Law: a Different Interpretation of Idem	349
1. Subsequent Intervention by an NCA after a Commission's Decision	353
2. Intervention by the Commission after a NCA's Decision	357
3. Parallel Prosecution of NCAs	361
Section II: The Applicability of the Principle of Ne Bis in Idem to the EU Leniency System	364
I. The Exchange of Information (and Risk of Parallel Investigation) within NCAs	365
II. The Current System of Leniency Applications	368
III. Previous Proposal for Avoiding Multiple Applications	371
IV. A New Proposal which combines the Mutual Recognition and a One-Stop Leniency Shop System	373
1. The Principle of Mutual Recognition	375
2. The One-Stop Leniency Shop	377
Conclusion	383

General Conclusion	390
Bibliography	397
Table of cases	413
Table of Legislation	429
List of Annexes	433