

Contents

Preface	vii
About the Authors	xxi
Glossary	xxiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Objectives of the Book	1
1.2 Background Material	5
1.2.1 Inference from Data, Given a Model	5
1.2.2 Likelihood and Least Squares Theory	6
1.2.3 The Critical Issue: “What Is the Best Model to Use?”	13
1.2.4 Science Inputs: Formulation of the Set of Candidate Models	15
1.2.5 Models Versus Full Reality	20
1.2.6 An Ideal Approximating Model	22
1.3 Model Fundamentals and Notation	23
1.3.1 Truth or Full Reality f	23
1.3.2 Approximating Models $g_i(x \theta)$	23
1.3.3 The Kullback–Leibler Best Model $g_i(x \theta_0)$	25
1.3.4 Estimated Models $g_i(x \hat{\theta})$	25
1.3.5 Generating Models	26
1.3.6 Global Model	26

1.3.7	Overview of Stochastic Models in the Biological Sciences	27
1.4	Inference and the Principle of Parsimony	29
1.4.1	Avoid Overfitting to Achieve a Good Model Fit	29
1.4.2	The Principle of Parsimony	31
1.4.3	Model Selection Methods	35
1.5	Data Dredging, Overanalysis of Data, and Spurious Effects	37
1.5.1	Overanalysis of Data	38
1.5.2	Some Trends	40
1.6	Model Selection Bias	43
1.7	Model Selection Uncertainty	45
1.8	Summary	47
2	Information and Likelihood Theory: A Basis for Model Selection and Inference	49
2.1	Kullback–Leibler Information or Distance Between Two Models	50
2.1.1	Examples of Kullback–Leibler Distance	54
2.1.2	Truth, f , Drops Out as a Constant	58
2.2	Akaike’s Information Criterion: 1973	60
2.3	Takeuchi’s Information Criterion: 1976	65
2.4	Second-Order Information Criterion: 1978	66
2.5	Modification of Information Criterion for Overdispersed Count Data	67
2.6	AIC Differences, Δ_i	70
2.7	A Useful Analogy	72
2.8	Likelihood of a Model, $\mathcal{L}(g_i data)$	74
2.9	Akaike Weights, w_i	75
2.9.1	Basic Formula	75
2.9.2	An Extension	76
2.10	Evidence Ratios	77
2.11	Important Analysis Details	80
2.11.1	AIC Cannot Be Used to Compare Models of Different Data Sets	80
2.11.2	Order Not Important in Computing AIC Values	81
2.11.3	Transformations of the Response Variable	81
2.11.4	Regression Models with Differing Error Structures	82
2.11.5	Do Not Mix Null Hypothesis Testing with Information-Theoretic Criteria	83
2.11.6	Null Hypothesis Testing Is Still Important in Strict Experiments	83
2.11.7	Information-Theoretic Criteria Are Not a “Test”	84
2.11.8	Exploratory Data Analysis	84

2.12	Some History and Further Insights	85
2.12.1	Entropy	86
2.12.2	A Heuristic Interpretation	87
2.12.3	More on Interpreting Information-Theoretic Criteria	87
2.12.4	Nonnested Models	88
2.12.5	Further Insights	89
2.13	Bootstrap Methods and Model Selection Frequencies π_i	90
2.13.1	Introduction	91
2.13.2	The Bootstrap in Model Selection: The Basic Idea	93
2.14	Return to Flather's Models	94
2.15	Summary	96
3	Basic Use of the Information-Theoretic Approach	98
3.1	Introduction	98
3.2	Example 1: Cement Hardening Data	100
3.2.1	Set of Candidate Models	101
3.2.2	Some Results and Comparisons	102
3.2.3	A Summary	106
3.3	Example 2: Time Distribution of an Insecticide Added to a Simulated Ecosystem	106
3.3.1	Set of Candidate Models	108
3.3.2	Some Results	110
3.4	Example 3: Nestling Starlings	111
3.4.1	Experimental Scenario	112
3.4.2	Monte Carlo Data	113
3.4.3	Set of Candidate Models	113
3.4.4	Data Analysis Results	117
3.4.5	Further Insights into the First Fourteen Nested Models	120
3.4.6	Hypothesis Testing and Information-Theoretic Approaches Have Different Selection Frequencies	121
3.4.7	Further Insights Following Final Model Selection	124
3.4.8	Why Not Always Use the Global Model for Inference?	125
3.5	Example 4: Sage Grouse Survival	126
3.5.1	Introduction	126
3.5.2	Set of Candidate Models	127
3.5.3	Model Selection	129
3.5.4	Hypothesis Tests for Year-Dependent Survival Probabilities	131

3.5.5	Hypothesis Testing Versus AIC in Model Selection	132
3.5.6	A Class of Intermediate Models	134
3.6	Example 5: Resource Utilization of <i>Anolis</i> Lizards	137
3.6.1	Set of Candidate Models	138
3.6.2	Comments on Analytic Method	138
3.6.3	Some Tentative Results	139
3.7	Example 6: Sakamoto et al.'s (1986) Simulated Data	141
3.8	Example 7: Models of Fish Growth	142
3.9	Summary	143
4	Formal Inference From More Than One Model:	
	Multimodel Inference (MMI)	149
4.1	Introduction to Multimodel Inference	149
4.2	Model Averaging	150
4.2.1	Prediction	150
4.2.2	Averaging Across Model Parameters	151
4.3	Model Selection Uncertainty	153
4.3.1	Concepts of Parameter Estimation and Model Selection Uncertainty	155
4.3.2	Including Model Selection Uncertainty in Estimator Sampling Variance	158
4.3.3	Unconditional Confidence Intervals	164
4.4	Estimating the Relative Importance of Variables	167
4.5	Confidence Set for the K-L Best Model	169
4.5.1	Introduction	169
4.5.2	Δ_i , Model Selection Probabilities, and the Bootstrap	171
4.6	Model Redundancy	173
4.7	Recommendations	176
4.8	Cement Data	177
4.9	Pine Wood Data	183
4.10	The Durban Storm Data	187
4.10.1	Models Considered	188
4.10.2	Consideration of Model Fit	190
4.10.3	Confidence Intervals on Predicted Storm Probability	191
4.10.4	Comparisons of Estimator Precision	193
4.11	Flour Beetle Mortality: A Logistic Regression Example	195
4.12	Publication of Research Results	201
4.13	Summary	203
5	Monte Carlo Insights and Extended Examples	206
5.1	Introduction	206
5.2	Survival Models	207

5.2.1	A Chain Binomial Survival Model	207
5.2.2	An Example	210
5.2.3	An Extended Survival Model	215
5.2.4	Model Selection if Sample Size Is Huge, or Truth Known	219
5.2.5	A Further Chain Binomial Model	221
5.3	Examples and Ideas Illustrated with Linear Regression	224
5.3.1	All-Subsets Selection: A GPA Example	225
5.3.2	A Monte Carlo Extension of the GPA Example	229
5.3.3	An Improved Set of GPA Prediction Models	235
5.3.4	More Monte Carlo Results	238
5.3.5	Linear Regression and Variable Selection	244
5.3.6	Discussion	248
5.4	Estimation of Density from Line Transect Sampling	255
5.4.1	Density Estimation Background	255
5.4.2	Line Transect Sampling of Kangaroos at Wallaby Creek	256
5.4.3	Analysis of Wallaby Creek Data	256
5.4.4	Bootstrap Analysis	258
5.4.5	Confidence Interval on D	258
5.4.6	Bootstrap Samples: 1,000 Versus 10,000	260
5.4.7	Bootstrap Versus Akaike Weights: A Lesson on QAIC _c	261
5.5	Summary	264
6	Advanced Issues and Deeper Insights	267
6.1	Introduction	267
6.2	An Example with 13 Predictor Variables and 8,191 Models	268
6.2.1	Body Fat Data	268
6.2.2	The Global Model	269
6.2.3	Classical Stepwise Selection	269
6.2.4	Model Selection Uncertainty for AIC _c and BIC	271
6.2.5	An A Priori Approach	274
6.2.6	Bootstrap Evaluation of Model Uncertainty	276
6.2.7	Monte Carlo Simulations	279
6.2.8	Summary Messages	281
6.3	Overview of Model Selection Criteria	284
6.3.1	Criteria That Are Estimates of K-L Information	284
6.3.2	Criteria That Are Consistent for K	286
6.3.3	Contrasts	288
6.3.4	Consistent Selection in Practice: Quasi-true Models	289
6.4	Contrasting AIC and BIC	293
6.4.1	A Heuristic Derivation of BIC	293

6.4.2	A K-L-Based Conceptual Comparison of AIC and BIC	295
6.4.3	Performance Comparison	298
6.4.4	Exact Bayesian Model Selection Formulas	301
6.4.5	Akaike Weights as Bayesian Posterior Model Probabilities	302
6.5	Goodness-of-Fit and Overdispersion Revisited	305
6.5.1	Overdispersion \hat{c} and Goodness-of-Fit: A General Strategy	305
6.5.2	Overdispersion Modeling: More Than One \hat{c}	307
6.5.3	Model Goodness-of-Fit After Selection	309
6.6	AIC and Random Coefficient Models	310
6.6.1	Basic Concepts and Marginal Likelihood Approach	310
6.6.2	A Shrinkage Approach to AIC and Random Effects	313
6.6.3	On Extensions	316
6.7	Selection When Probability Distributions Differ by Model	317
6.7.1	Keep All the Parts	317
6.7.2	A Normal Versus Log-Normal Example	318
6.7.3	Comparing Across Several Distributions: An Example	320
6.8	Lessons from the Literature and Other Matters	323
6.8.1	Use AIC_c , Not AIC, with Small Sample Sizes	323
6.8.2	Use AIC_c , Not AIC, When K Is Large	325
6.8.3	When Is AIC_c Suitable: A Gamma Distribution Example	326
6.8.4	Inference from a Less Than Best Model	328
6.8.5	Are Parameters Real?	330
6.8.6	Sample Size Is Often Not a Simple Issue	332
6.8.7	Judgment Has a Role	333
6.9	Tidbits About AIC	334
6.9.1	Irrelevance of Between-Sample Variation of AIC	334
6.9.2	The G-Statistic and K-L Information	336
6.9.3	AIC Versus Hypothesis Testing: Results Can Be Very Different	337
6.9.4	A Subtle Model Selection Bias Issue	339
6.9.5	The Dimensional Unit of AIC	340
6.9.6	AIC and Finite Mixture Models	342
6.9.7	Unconditional Variance	344
6.9.8	A Baseline for $w_+(i)$	345
6.10	Summary	347

7	Statistical Theory and Numerical Results	352
7.1	Useful Preliminaries	352
7.2	A General Derivation of AIC	362
7.3	General K-L–Based Model Selection: TIC	371
	7.3.1 Analytical Computation of TIC	371
	7.3.2 Bootstrap Estimation of TIC	372
7.4	AIC _c : A Second-Order Improvement	374
	7.4.1 Derivation of AIC _c	374
	7.4.2 Lack of Uniqueness of AIC _c	379
7.5	Derivation of AIC for the Exponential Family of Distributions	380
7.6	Evaluation of $\text{tr}(J(\underline{\theta}_o)[I(\underline{\theta}_o)]^{-1})$ and Its Estimator	384
	7.6.1 Comparison of AIC Versus TIC in a Very Simple Setting	385
	7.6.2 Evaluation Under Logistic Regression	390
	7.6.3 Evaluation Under Multinomially Distributed Count Data	397
	7.6.4 Evaluation Under Poisson-Distributed Data	405
	7.6.5 Evaluation for Fixed-Effects Normality-Based Linear Models	406
7.7	Additional Results and Considerations	412
	7.7.1 Selection Simulation for Nested Models	412
	7.7.2 Simulation of the Distribution of Δ_p	415
	7.7.3 Does AIC Overfit?	417
	7.7.4 Can Selection Be Improved Based on All the Δ_i ?	419
	7.7.5 Linear Regression, AIC, and Mean Square Error	421
	7.7.6 AIC _c and Models for Multivariate Data	424
	7.7.7 There Is No True TIC _c	426
	7.7.8 Kullback–Leibler Information Relationship to the Fisher Information Matrix	426
	7.7.9 Entropy and Jaynes Maxent Principle	427
	7.7.10 Akaike Weights w_i Versus Selection Probabilities π_i	428
7.8	Kullback–Leibler Information Is Always ≥ 0	429
7.9	Summary	434
8	Summary	437
8.1	The Scientific Question and the Collection of Data	439
8.2	Actual Thinking and A Priori Modeling	440
8.3	The Basis for Objective Model Selection	442
8.4	The Principle of Parsimony	443
8.5	Information Criteria as Estimates of Expected Relative Kullback–Leibler Information	444
8.6	Ranking Alternative Models	446

8.7	Scaling Alternative Models	447
8.8	MMI: Inference Based on Model Averaging	448
8.9	MMI: Model Selection Uncertainty	449
8.10	MMI: Relative Importance of Predictor Variables	451
8.11	More on Inferences	451
8.12	Final Thoughts	454

References	455
-------------------	------------

Index	485
--------------	------------