# Table of Contents

Introduction .................................................................................................................................. 1

1. The Central Theme: The Problem of Theodicy and Problems with Theodicies ........................................ 1

2. Between Good and Evil? Hermeneutical Considerations and Methodological Conclusions ....................... 5

3. The Structure and the Guiding Questions of this Study ................. 13
   A. The (Non)Presence of God’s Love ................................................................. 17
   B. God’s Love as an (Im)Possible Gift .............................................................. 18
   C. The Gift of God’s Presence as Love – A Phenomenon? .................. 20

Part I
Subjectivity and the Ambiguity of God’s Transcendence

1. The Relation between Transcendence and Immanence .............. 22
   1.1 Traditional Distinctions and Problems ..................................................... 23
      a) Gradual and Absolute Transcendence .................................................. 23
      b) Spatiotemporal Imagery and Dialectics of the Limit ....................... 24
      c) Transcendence of Thought – Transcending Thoughts? .......... 25
      d) God’s Transcendence vis-à-vis, in or Underlying the World? ....... 26

   1.2 Schleiermacher: God’s Presence as Transcendent
      Ground of Being and Thinking ................................................................. 27

2. Husserl’s Phenomenology and Divine Transcendence ............. 30
   2.1 The Intentionality of Consciousness ....................................................... 31
      a) The Constitution of Intentional Objects ............................................. 31
      b) Temporality and the Self-Givenness of Time-Consciousness .......... 33
      c) Conscious Co-Presence with God Transcendent?
         Husserl and Schleiermacher ................................................................. 36
      d) Constitution as an Intersubjectively Mediated Process .......... 37
      e) The Intersubjective Dimension of Husserl’s
         Philosophical Theology .................................................................. 40

Bibliografische Informationen
http://d-nb.info/987014064
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Divine Transcendence in Immanence — A Phenomenon?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. God’s Presence as Phenomenon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Dialectics of God’s Givenness and Hiddenness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Phenomenological Moment in German Idealism and the Problem of Theodicy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table of Contents**

2.2 Divine Transcendence in Immanence — A Phenomenon? ..........45  
   a) God’s Transcendence in Relation to Transcendental Subjectivity 45  
   b) Phenomenology and ‘Metaphysics’ .................................47  
   c) The Wonder of Rationality as Reference to God .................50  
   d) The Dipolarity of the Divine ....................................51  
   e) Divine Presence or Absence? .....................................54  

3. God’s Presence as Phenomenon ...........................................57  
   3.1 The (In)Adequacy of the Phenomenological Method ............57  
   3.2 The Experience of God’s Presence and Its Effect:  
       Re-orientation of Experience ......................................58  
   3.3 God’s Presence as Phenomenon-in-a-horizon and  
       the Horizon-of-all-horizons ....................................60  
   3.4 The Complexity of God’s Phenomenal Presence .................62  
   3.5 God’s Presence — Given only as a Gift? .........................62  

4. Dialectics of God’s Givenness and Hiddenness ......................64  
   4.1 Neither Present nor Absent? Modalities of Divine Distance 64  
   4.2 Absence as a Mode of God’s Presence? ...........................65  
       a) The Absence of the Creator as Agent-among-agents  
          and His Spiritual Presence ....................................65  
       b) Evil and Lack of Love .........................................67  
   4.3 God’s (Mis)Interpreted Transcendence ............................68  

5. The Phenomenological Moment in German Idealism and  
   the Problem of Theodicy .............................................70  
   5.1 Hegel’s Phenomenology and Divine Transcendence ..........71  
       a) The Absolute Spirit as Subject/Object of Consciousness 71  
       b) Dialectical Mediation of Transcendence with Immanence 74  
       c) History as Theodicy ...........................................76  
       d) Reconciled with Negativity:  
          Reason as ’The Rose in the Cross of the Present’ ..........78  
   5.2 Kant “On the Failure of All Philosophical Attempts  
   at Theodicy” .......................................................83
## Table of Contents

### Part II

Reasons for Having No Reason to Defend God – Kierkegaard’s and Rosenzweig’s Alternatives to Theodicy

### I. Kierkegaard

1. Explaining Experiences of God’s Absence, Distance or Hiddenness
   1.1 Searching for God’s Invisible Presence
   1.2 Sin and the Relational Self
   1.3 The Problem and Promise of Language
   1.4 The Limitations of Explanations and Prayer as a Lifelong Process of Transfiguration
   1.5 Provisional Result
   1.6 The Apophatic Dimension of Kierkegaard’s Theology
      1.6.1 The 1843 Discourses on James 1:17-22
         a) God’s (Non)Givenness as Self-Giving Gift
         b) The Absolute Good and Its Metaphorical Articulation
         c) The Logic of Gift – Logic of Mediation?
      1.6.2 Works of Love: Love’s Hidden Origin, Life and Works
         1.6.2.1 Divine Love as Reduplication
            a) Love Linking the Temporal and the Eternal
            b) Love’s Manifestation in Interiority and Its Hiddenness in Exteriority
         1.6.2.2 Like for Like
            a) The Relation between God and Self – Mediated by the Relation to the Neighbor
            b) The Relation between Self and Neighbor – in Relation to God as the ‘Middle Term’
            c) Love’s Infinitude and the Correspondence between Receiving and Giving

2. The Presence of God Transcendent Becoming Present to Us
   2.1 God’s Omnipresence and Omnipotence in Relation to Phenomenality
   2.2 God’s Presence in Trinitarian Differentiations
   2.3 God’s Presence in Relation to Human Action

3. Immanence and Transcendence
   3.1 Contrast or Dialectical Interrelation?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Works of Love – A Phenomenology of God’s Love as</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Phenomenology of Spirit”?</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Methodological Problems</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Kierkegaard and Hegel at the Crossroads</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.1 The Meaning of ‘Phenomenology of Spirit’</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Focus on Knowledge or Praxis?</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Divine Love – A Phenomenon?</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.2 The Meaning of the ‘Reduplication’ of God’s Love...</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Divine Love – A Dialectical Process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Including Negativity?</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Divine and Human Love –</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uniting and Identifying the Different?</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Self-Recuperation or Self-Expenditure without Return?...</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Preliminary Conclusion and Discussion:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kierkegaard – A Phenomenologist?</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. How to Transcend and Transform Negativity?</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Transcendence of Faith: Spiritual Contemporaneity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with God’s Eternal Presence</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Transcendence of Love: Eternity in Time</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Transcendence of Hope: Patiently Expecting the Future</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the Past</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Divine and Human Love</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Agapeistic Ethics Founded on Religion</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Commanded Love: Changelessly Love in All Its Changes...</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. How to Comprehend Incomprehensible Love?</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Works of Love – Virtue Ethics?</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Love – An Emotion?</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.1 Affirmation: Letting Oneself Be Moved</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.2 Opposition</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) The Priority of the God-Relationship:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love as Ground of Everything</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) The Priority of Action: Love as Fulfillment of the Law...</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) The Priority of Duty over Immediacy:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love Secured against Despair</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Love of the Neighbor and the Difference in Passion</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Elskov or Forkjerlighed versus Aandens Kjerlighed?</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Reasons for Having No Reason to Defend God</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Kierkegaard’s Interpretation of Job’s Story</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 The Impossibility of Theodicy</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Review and Evaluation</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
II. Rosenzweig ......................................................................................................................... 182

1. Explaining Experiences of God's Absence, Distance or Hiddenness ............................................... 184
   1.1 God's Hiddenness apart from and in Spite of Revelation .................................................. 184
       a) The Hiddenness of the Non-Revealed Metaphysical God ........................................ 184
       b) The Hiddenness of God's Essence in Revelation ..................................................... 187
       c) In Truth: The Dissolution of the Essence of the Revealed God ........................................ 189
   1.2 The Not-Yet of God's All-Love .................................................................................. 191
   1.3 The Revealing Role of Language ................................................................................ 193
   1.4 The Void of Love in the Sinner's View ........................................................................ 195

2. The Presence of God Transcendent .......................................................................................... 197
   2.1 God's Presence in Relation to Phenomenality: Manifestations in Human Language ...................... 197
       a) The Name .................................................................................................................. 197
       b) Love's Allegory: More than Allegorical – Ephemeral in Appearance, Eternal in Truth .... 200
   2.2 God's Timelessness and the 'Trinity' of His Temporal Relations to His Creatures ......................... 206
       a) The Past and the Continual Present of Creation ..................................................... 208
       b) The Present of Revelation in the Middle of Time .................................................... 208
       c) The Future and the Anticipated Present of Redemption .......................................... 210
       d) God's Temporalized and Timeless Eternity ............................................................. 210
   2.3 Phenomenality as Deception? God's Presence in Relation to Human Action ......................... 212

3. Immanence and Transcendence ............................................................................................... 215
   3.1 Changing Relations ........................................................................................................ 216
   3.2 The Star of Redemption – A Phenomenology of God's Love as 'Phenomenology of Spirit'? ............... 219
       3.2.1 The Spirit that Separates and the Love that Unites .............................................. 219
           a) Rosenzweig's Polemics against a Deified Spirit and a Spiritualized God .................... 220
           b) Rosenzweig's Acceptance of a Human Spirit of Transmission and Translation ............... 220
       3.2.2 How to Speak of God's Love? .............................................................................. 222
           a) Love's History: A Dialogical rather than a Dialectical Process .................................. 222
           b) Love's Relationality: Related to Alterity beyond Monistic Self-Relations ...................... 223
           c) Love's Experience: Praxis rather than Knowledge .................................................. 223
d) Love’s Phenomenalization and the Co-Appearance of the Horizon of Interpretation .................................................. 224

4. How to Transcend and Transform Negativity? .................................................. 225
   4.1 Jews and Christians in Relation to Time and Suffering ............................... 226
      a) The Eternity of the Jewish People – A Denial of Time? ......................... 226
      b) The Eternity of the Christian Peoples – A Rule over Time? ... 228
      c) The Sublimation of Suffering and the Parable of the Seed-Grain ........... 229
   4.2 Transcendence of Faith: The Power of Perseverance .............................. 233
   4.3 Love’s Eternity: Renewal of the Moment .............................................. 236
   4.4 Transcendence of Hope: Anticipating and Accelerating the Coming of the Kingdom .................................................. 238

5. Divine and Human Love ...................................................................................... 240
   5.1 God’s Love and Trusting Faith as Requited Love ...................................... 240
   5.2 Neighbor Love and Its Presupposition beyond Freedom ......................... 242

6. Love in Life – Not in Theory ........................................................................... 244
   6.1 Love – A Virtue? The Event of Momentary Self-Transformation .............. 244
   6.2 Love – An Emotion? .................................................................................. 245
   6.3 Commanded Love of Neighbor: Always a New Beginning ........................ 246
   6.4 Eternal Love – The Spirit that Unites? .................................................... 247

7. Reasons for Having No Reason to Defend God .............................................. 251
   7.1 The Job-Like Questions, the Voice of Job’s Wife, and the Error of his Friends .... 252
   7.2 Farewell to Theodicy? ............................................................................... 257
      7.2.1 Rosenzweig’s Interpretation of Hegel’s Theodicy through History .... 257
      7.2.2 Rosenzweig’s Alternative to Hegel’s Theodicy ................................. 261
         a) The Need for Redemption from History ........................................... 261
         b) Religion as Redemption from History in History ............................ 264
         c) Teleology toward Timelessness: A Never-Ending Happy Ending? ..... 267
   7.3 Review and Evaluation ............................................................................... 270
Table of Contents

Part III
From German Idealism to French Phenomenology

A. In Dialogue with Levinas: With(out) the Consolation of God's Presence

1. The Philosophical Background: Heidegger's Criticism of 'Metaphysics of Presence' ................................................................. 277
   a) The Presence of the Self-Conscious Subject ............................... 278
   b) The Presence of the Noema .................................................. 280

2. Levinas' Way of Dealing with the Problem of Theodicy ............... 282
   2.1 Explaining Experiences of God's Absence, Distance or Hiddenness ................................................................................. 286
      a) Enigma versus Phenomenon ................................................. 286
      b) Searching for an Absent God: Subjectivity as an Adieu in Desire and Distance ............................................................ 287
      c) God's Illeity and the Saying in Witness of His Trace ............. 288
      d) God's Absence - Sin of Omission? ....................................... 291
   2.2 God's (Non)Presence ................................................................. 293
      a) God's Transcendence in Relation to Time and Time-Consciousness ..................................................................................... 293
      b) God's Transcendence as Reference to the Proximity of the Neighbor .................................................................................. 294
   2.3 Absolute Transcendence? .............................................................. 297
   2.4 How to Transcend and Transform Negativity? ....................... 298
      a) Interhuman Phenomenology of Suffering and the Breakthrough of the Good ................................................................. 298
      b) Love and Justice .................................................................... 300
      c) God's Withdrawal and the Futurition of a Finite Future ........ 302
   2.5 Compelled to Goodness: Loving the Neighbor without Receiving God's Love ................................................................. 305
   2.6 Non-Erotic Love: Responsibility ............................................... 312
   2.7 Reasons for Having No Reason to Defend God ....................... 313
      a) Job's Suffering - Beyond the Morality of Reward and Punishment .................................................................................... 313
      b) Against Theodicy! .................................................................. 314
   2.8 Interlude: The Challenge of Comparing .................................. 317

3. With(out) the Consolation of God's Presence -
Synchrony versus Diachrony? ............................................................. 319
B. In Dialogue with Derrida: The Present of Love’s Transcendence – An Impossible Gift?

1. Derrida’s Criticism of ‘Metaphysics of Presence’ in Husserl’s Phenomenology ................................................................. 327

2. The Impossible Gift: A Present that Cannot be (a) Present .............. 329
   2.1 The Gift as a Non-Present ...................................................... 330
   2.2 The Gift versus Economy ................................................... 331
   2.3 How to Re-Present a Gift? Language as Counterfeit Money........ 331

3. The Problem of Gift and the Problem of Theodicy .......................... 332
   3.1 Present within or despite Appearances? ................................. 333
   3.2 Love as a Possible Gift ...................................................... 337
   3.3 Donation as Communication: The Economy of the Gift ............. 343

C. In Dialogue with Marion: Phenomenality and Revelation

1. Marion’s Project ........................................................................... 352
   1.1. “The Saturated Phenomenon” .............................................. 352
   1.2. “The Gift of God’s Presence” .............................................. 357

2. Marion’s Project in the Context of the French Debate ..................... 361
   2.1. Beyond the Limits of Husserl’s Phenomenology? .................... 361
   2.2. The Debate with Derrida: The (Im)Possibility of a Phenomenology of the Gift ......................................................... 362

3. Problems and Prospects ............................................................... 364
   3.1 Being Given and Becoming Gifted ......................................... 364
   3.2 Phenomenality and Revelation ............................................. 366
   3.3 A Vision of God? .................................................................. 370

Inconclusive Conclusion .................................................................. 375

1. Retrospection: Kierkegaard and Rosenzweig between
   German Idealism and French Phenomenology ................................ 375
2. Theology as Phenomenology of the Invisible ................................. 378
3. God’s (Non)Phenomenality and the Problem of Theodicy ............. 384

Bibliography .................................................................................... 389

Indexes ............................................................................................. 413